
Alastair G. Staffen
University of Windsor, staffena@uwindsor.ca

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholar.uwindsor.ca/major-papers

Part of the Cultural History Commons, and the European History Commons

Recommended Citation
https://scholar.uwindsor.ca/major-papers/44

This Major Research Paper is brought to you for free and open access by Scholarship at UWindsor. It has been accepted for inclusion in Major Papers by an authorized administrator of Scholarship at UWindsor. For more information, please contact scholarship@uwindsor.ca.
Amateur Against Professional:

by

Alastair Staffen

A Major Research Paper
Submitted to the Faculty of Graduate Studies
through the Department of History
in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for
the Degree of Master of Arts at the
University of Windsor

Windsor, Ontario, Canada

© 2018 Alastair Staffen
Amateur Against Professional

by

Alastair Staffen

APPROVED BY:

____________________________________
A. Pole
Department of History

____________________________________
M. Wright, Advisor
Department of History

May 10, 2018
DECLARATION OF ORIGINALITY

I hereby certify that I am the sole author of this thesis and that no part of this thesis has been published or submitted for publication.

I certify that, to the best of my knowledge, my thesis does not infringe upon anyone’s copyright nor violate any proprietary rights and that any ideas, techniques, quotations, or any other material from the work of other people included in my thesis, published or otherwise, are fully acknowledged in accordance with the standard referencing practices. Furthermore, to the extent that I have included copyrighted material that surpasses the bounds of fair dealing within the meaning of the Canada Copyright Act, I certify that I have obtained a written permission from the copyright owner(s) to include such material(s) in my thesis and have included copies of such copyright clearances to my appendix.

I declare that this is a true copy of my thesis, including any final revisions, as approved by my thesis committee and the Graduate Studies office, and that this thesis has not been submitted for a higher degree to any other University or Institution.
ABSTRACT

This paper argues that from the early 19th century there existed a strong push by middle-class reformers to eliminate traditional regional pastimes and identities, and repurpose organised sport with the aim of reinforcing notions of respectability. Despite the initial success of the middle-class in popularizing association football in Scotland, these modernisers ultimately met with failure as the institutions that they created became increasingly subservient to economic realities of popular sport and to the demands of a working-class consumer base. Finally, the success of the middle-class in eliminating pastimes and the corresponding regional identities created the need for new sources of identity which were provided by the increasingly divided and sectarian Old Firm Clubs.

Utilizing the Victorian periodical press, specifically the Scottish sporting journals the Scottish Athletic Journal, The Scottish Umpire, Scottish Sport, and the Scottish Referee, this paper defines the notions of Victorian respectability and Muscular Christianity that became core tenants of mid-nineteenth century middle-class pastimes. It then examines middle-class attempts to reshape Scottish leisure culture more broadly, with a focus on the elimination of traditional pastimes and the establishment of the new mechanisms of popular sport. Finally, this paper illustrates the challenges and debates surrounding middle-class amateur sport, and the eventual failure of middle-class reformers to assert complete control over popular leisure in the face of increasingly modern, mass consumer sport.
DEDICATION

To my Grandfather, whose love of history inspired my own.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to thank my advisor, Doctor Adam Pole for his support and patience during this project. His mentorship provided a source of direction and motivation throughout. I would also like to thank Doctor Miriam Wright for her feedback and guidance during the final stages of writing. The guidance of these individuals was invaluable throughout the many stages of this paper.

In addition, I would like to acknowledge Richard McBrearty and the staff of the Scottish Football Museum, who provided access to the *Scottish Athletic Journal* and *Scottish Sport*. Without their assistance, this project would not have been successful.

Finally, I would like to thank my family, friends, and the University of Windsor Department of History for their continued support during the research and writing of this paper.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Declaration of Originality ......................................................... iii
Abstract ...................................................................................... iv
Dedication .................................................................................... v
Acknowledgments ......................................................................... vi
List of Figures .............................................................................. viii
Introduction ................................................................................... 1
Chapter I: The Formation of Modern Leisure ............................... 9
Chapter II: Muscular Christianity and Victorian Respectability ........ 21
Chapter III: Redefining the Game: The Modernisation of Sport ........ 33
Chapter IV: The Rise of Association Football in Britain ................. 39
Chapter V: Modernisation Out of Control .................................... 46
Conclusion ..................................................................................... 61
Bibliography .................................................................................. 63
Vita Auctoris .................................................................................. 67
LIST OF FIGURES

Fig. 1 – ‘Nothing Succeeds Like Success’ See: Murray, W.H. *The Old Firm: Sectarianism, Sport and Society in Scotland* (Edinburgh: John Donald Publishers, 1984), 38.
INTRODUCTION

An article in the November 5\textsuperscript{th}, 1888 edition of the Scottish sporting periodical the \textit{Scottish Referee}, noted that “within recent years, athletics, football and other outdoor activities have assumed an importance in the general affairs of life which a decade ago was undreamt.”\textsuperscript{1} Accompanying this surge in football’s popularity were the attempts of a small but vocal segment of the middle class, possessed with public school education and professional skillsets, to utilize the machinery of popular sport to implement broader social change. To these reformers, organised sport would be used both as a means of achieving their own desires for muscular “purity” while also reinforcing a sense of respectability, masculinity and gentlemanly behaviour among the larger working-class population.

From 1800 onwards, there existed a concerted attempt on behalf of middle-class reformers to modernize athletic pastimes, and to combine these activities with a strong sense of social and moral values. This transformation of sport into a vehicle for middle-class respectability emerged from concerns over the moral degradation of leisure and the participation of significant segments of the working-class population in hedonistic and irreputable pastimes. The middle-class rhetoric of respectability, notes Mike Huggins, emerged from dual concerns: both the misuse of leisure time by the working class and amongst younger segments of the middle class themselves.\textsuperscript{2} By the mid-nineteenth century, sport had been increasingly employed to encourage the development of the

\textsuperscript{1} \textit{Scottish Referee} November 5, 1888, 2.
\textsuperscript{2} Mike J. Huggins, “More Sinful Pleasures? Leisure, Respectability and the Male Middle Classes in Victorian England” \textit{Journal of Social History} 33, no. 3 (Spring, 2000), 586.
‘respectable working man’, while also ensuring that younger segments of the middle-class did not stray from the bounds of respectability.

These dual concerns led to the rapid reshaping of leisure time activities to better align with middle-class values. This modernizing mission emanated from the industrializing urban centres, areas which were perceived by members of the broader middle class as afflicted by squalor, disease, and the moral decay. At the same time, these urban areas guaranteed the economic stability necessary to sustain modern football clubs and the larger centralized bodies tasked with governing them. In Scotland specifically, the establishment and rapid growth of the Scottish Football Association (S.F.A.), and of the numerous clubs under its jurisdiction, illustrates the early success of the middle-class organisers in introducing a modern, centrally governed popular pastime.

This redefinition of popular pastimes was most recognizable in Glasgow, the rapidly expanding centrepiece of Scotland’s industrial heartland, and the second city of the British Empire. The population growth was marked, with the population growing from about 24,000 in 1755, to 77,000 in 1801, to 147,000 in 1821, to 274,000 in 1841. By 1901, the population of Glasgow is estimated to have reached over 762,000. With population growth came overcrowding. In 1861, the worst slum area had a population density of some 583 people per acre. As late as 1881, Glasgow’s Medical Officer of Health, J.B. Russell, discovered that three quarters of the population lived in two-roomed

---

apartments, while only one in twenty lived in apartments with five rooms or more.\(^6\)

Andrew Davies notes that the tradition of gang formation in the city stretched back at least to the 1880s.\(^7\) With the influx of population brought on by industrialisation and large waves of Irish immigration in the 1840s, Glasgow increasingly gained a reputation for squalor, disease, and crime. The rapid urban change, and the growth of squalor and crime ensured that Glasgow remained the focus of middle-class reform throughout much of the 19th century.

Despite the apparent social and moral issues, Glasgow’s industrial economy lent itself to the establishment of organised and regimented football associations, and of course, football clubs. Among the first major clubs to develop in Glasgow was Queen’s Park F.C., founded in 1867. The club quickly took to championing the amateur ideal and enjoyed immense success during the early period of Scottish football.\(^8\) The success of Queen’s Park in the 1870s and 1880s did much to popularize association rules football in Glasgow, with its repeated presence at cup finals drawing increasing numbers of spectators and yielding larger and larger gate incomes.\(^9\)

Glasgow, with its vast population of working class labourers, would become the focal point of the middle-class modernization of sport in Scotland. Seeking to promote physical health, and to dissuade leisure activities considered immoral, middle-class reformers turned to the creation of football and athletics clubs. Participation in the affairs

---

\(^6\) Aspinwall, “Glasgow: The Creation of the Nineteenth Century City of Culture,” 18.
\(^7\) Andrew Davies, “Street Gangs, Crime and Policing in Glasgow during the 1930s: The Case of the Beehive Boys,” *Social History* 23 no.3 (Oct. 1998), 252.
of these clubs provided younger members of the middle class with physical training, and perhaps more importantly, connections which could be cultivated and used to enhance one’s own social standing. Conversely, the encouragement of work-place football promised to create a working-class which was both physically fit and used to working within a regimented and organised system.

Encouraged by increases in working class literacy during the mid-nineteenth century, middle-class modernizers turned to the periodical press as a means of reinforcing notions of masculinity and respectability which had been enshrined in association football. While these messages were carried by the Scottish press more broadly, they became particularly prevalent in sport-focused periodicals such as the Scottish Referee, The Scottish Athletic Journal, The Scottish Umpire, and Scottish Sport that were established in the 1880s. It was within the pages of these journals that the respectable amateur ideal was cultivated. The amateur ideal rejected economic renumeration in favour of cultivating a distinctly middle-class views of masculinity and sportsmanship.

With the growing participation in sport by members of the working class in the 1880s, the Scottish periodical press became concerned with the defence of the amateur ideal, and of middle-class dominance of organised football in Scotland.

The Victorian middle-class dominance of sport faced perhaps its greatest challenge in professionalism, or the introduction of the paid player. Major Scottish football clubs, following the example of their English counterparts, increasingly advocated for the professionalization of Scottish football, and sought to subvert the rulings of the S.F.A. in favour of their own financial success. With football clubs becoming ever more vocal in their defiance of the amateur mandate of association
football, the role of sport within Scottish society was questioned, debated, and ultimately, redefined. By the 1880s, this examination and re-evaluation of sport became the subject of increasing coverage by the Scottish periodical press.

An examination of Scottish sports journalism, and the vibrant debates surrounding professionalism contained within, reveals the struggle between middle-class notions of sport, complete with its moral and social values, and developing notions of football as a mass consumer sport. The debates surrounding professionalism during the 1870s and 1880s exposed a turning point in the middle-class modernizing mission. The gradual acceptance of professionalism in the Scottish game by club management, S.F.A. officials, and eventually the periodical press ultimately demonstrates the failure of the middle-class modernizers in creating a stable vehicle for the ideals of Victorian respectability. Instead, the period of 1870 to 1890 is characterized by the reimagination of popular football as a mass consumer industry.

As the meaning of sport in Scotland changed, and association football evolved into a consumer industry it becomes clear that the traditional Victorian class relationships had also changed. This evolution is marked by a growing appreciation amongst middle-class organisers of football that the working-class had developed into consumers of popular culture, who by their patronage strengthened the popular culture which they consumed. What had, in previous decades been a hegemonic relationship between the middle-class and the working class, had developed into a far more symbiotic relationship between producers, in the form of football clubs, and working-class consumers. The development of a football “industry” was not the original aim of middle-class reformers,
but its development was encouraged by the same machinery that the middle-class had created to redefine traditional popular culture.

For instance, the codified rulesets, governed by football associations, ensured that football became both accessible and centralized. This centralization coaxed football from its traditional rural atmosphere into larger cities, like Glasgow, where it could be observed by growing urban populations. The efforts of the middle-class in expanding popular sport inevitably led to the creation and expansion of football clubs. Initially, these clubs supported the middle-class notions of amateur sport, and reinforced messages of athleticism and masculinity. However, it would be these same clubs, enticed by the promise of growing gate incomes, who gradually eroded the notions of respectability and amateurism from the association game that they had originally championed.

The most prominent and thoroughly studied of these clubs are Rangers Football Club and their perpetual rival, Celtic Football Club. The two clubs, often referred to collectively as the “Old Firm”, are easily the most successful clubs in Scotland, and have attracted considerable academic interest. The first major contribution to the study of these clubs was made by Bill Murray, who published his monograph *The Old Firm: Sectarianism, Sport and Society in Scotland*, in 1984. More recently, academics like Joseph Bradley and Andrew Davies have furthered the academic study of the relationship between these two clubs. However, these studies have focused largely on the sectarian aspects of the Old Firm rivalry. Celtic F.C has long maintained a Catholic identity, while Rangers have assumed the mantle of Glasgow’s ‘Protestant Club’. This has led to the

---

establishment of a religious element within the Old Firm rivalry that has repeatedly been the focus of academic study since the 1980s.

While it is impossible to eliminate the sectarian nature of the Old Firm rivalry, and of Scottish football more generally, this focus on Sectarianism has been to the detriment of other areas of Scottish popular sport. The latter half of the 19th century has received considerably less attention. Religious discrimination was certainly present, with Glaswegian factory and dockyard managers often employing Protestant Scots over members of the Catholic Irish community. Scotland has had a long tradition of ‘anti-Catholicism,’ with the continuing presence of organisations like the Orange Order from the early 1840s. Indeed, as two studies have noted, in the 1790s, there were more anti-Catholic societies in Glasgow than Catholics. The strong defense of Protestantism in Scotland certainly informed ideas of middle class respectability, and the protestant work ethic, but outwardly sectarian attitudes, at least in the relationship between Rangers and Celtic, would not become prominent until the early 20th century. Instead, the 1880s and 1890s marked a period of cooperation between Rangers and Celtic. The management of both appreciated the economic advantage of a symbiotic relationship between the two clubs, and pushed heavily for both the establishment of the Football League in 1890, and later, the full professionalization of the Scottish game.

This paper examines the formative period of these two clubs, and of Scottish football more broadly. The nineteenth century witnessed the establishment of football as

---

13 Murray, The Old Firm, 10.
a popular pastime in Scotland, and the redefinition of traditional leisure activities by vocal middle-class reformers to reinforce ideals of respectability and masculinity. It would ultimately be the efforts of these reformers which allowed for clubs such as Rangers and Celtic to establish their dominance over Scottish football. Despite the importance of the middle-class modernizer to the establishment of modern football in Scotland, there has been little attention paid to the redefinition of popular culture in Scotland which preceded the establishment of the Old Firm, and later, of the Sectarian character of Scottish football.

An examination of the middle-class attempts to redefine sport in Scotland with the goal of expanding upon this overlooked aspect of Scottish popular culture will no doubt benefit the study of popular culture in nineteenth century Scotland. Utilizing the Victorian periodical press, specifically the Scottish sporting journals the *Scottish Athletic Journal*, *The Scottish Umpire*, *Scottish Sport*, and the *Scottish Referee*, this paper defines the notions of Victorian respectability and Muscular Christianity that became core tenants of mid-nineteenth century middle-class pastimes. It then examines middle-class attempts to reshape Scottish leisure culture more broadly, with a focus on the elimination of traditional pastimes and the establishment of the new mechanisms of popular sport. Finally, this paper illustrates the challenges and debates surrounding middle-class amateur sport, and the eventual failure of middle-class reformers to assert complete control over popular leisure in the face of increasingly modern, mass consumer sport.
Chapter I

THE FORMATION OF MODERN LEISURE: A HISTORIOGRAPHIC SKETCH

Early efforts to study what is now termed ‘popular recreation’ in Britain emerged during the 1970s, with Robert Malcolmson’s *Popular Recreations in English Society* remaining one of the most influential works of this period. Malcolmson, a prominent student of E.P Thomson, linked popular pastimes prior to the 19th century to paternalistic, agrarian society, and in doing so highlighted the close ties that these pastimes maintained with both regional identity and the agricultural calendar.14 These regional pastimes were enjoyed almost exclusively by the peasantry, with the gentry pursuing recreations that reinforced the culture of their own class.15 Malcolmson identifies a series of changes and challenges to rural popular culture, on both a local and national level, occurring from about 1750 onward. This amounts to a larger historical trend involving the breakdown of traditional popular culture as a direct result of pressures and powershifts brought on by the Industrial Revolution. What emerged then, was a uniform and singular interpretation of the development of popular culture and pastimes in Britain up until about 1850.

By the 1980s, revisionist historians challenged the position of Malcolmson and others. Hugh Cunningham produced a comprehensive reassessment of the effects of the Industrial Revolution in his *Leisure in the Industrial Revolution*. He suggests that industrialisation and commercialization brought new opportunities for the advancement of communal pastimes, while also noting the resilience of traditional recreation which

---

was, at times, overlooked by Malcolmson.\textsuperscript{16} Peter Bailey illustrates the persistent control of the working class over their own entertainment leading to the creation of a consumer class, and the development of a new formula for capitalist growth that secured mass leisure industries as highly successful agents of social control.\textsuperscript{17} This conclusion is gained largely through an examination of urban music halls which had by the 1860s begun to develop into a leisure industry, and the success that these establishments had in shaping popular culture. Critically, Bailey’s approach highlights the importance of the working-class as consumers who shaped the industries which they consumed.

Wray Vamplew’s \textit{Pay Up and Play the Game} likewise illustrates the increasing role of the consumer in the modernisation of sport. A thoroughly economic examination of Victorian pastimes, Vamplew concluded that “money may be the root of much that is evil in modern sport, but … sports consumers appear to be willing to continue to spend that money.”\textsuperscript{18} The “evils” of sport, despite vocal protests from sporting ‘purists’ were maintained by the pocketbooks of an ever-increasing consumer base. Here, the increasing importance of capital gain is shown to overcome the social and moral values which had traditionally been used to define class.

Adrian Harvey demonstrates a similar pattern in British football in his “The Emergence of Football in Nineteenth Century England,” in which he established that the popularity of soccer flourished in the nineteenth century through the strong influence of

\textsuperscript{16} Emma Griffin, “Popular Culture in Industrializing England” \textit{The Historical Journal} 45, no. 3 (Sep.2002), 622.
\textsuperscript{17} Peter Bailey, \textit{Leisure and Class in Victorian England: Rational Recreation and the Contest for Control, 1830-1885} (London: Routledge, 2007), 182.
the public-school system. Harvey illustrates the continued existence of ‘popular’ football, in addition to the more prominent codified game which developed in school and universities during the mid-1850s. Of importance is the notion that organised football was never entirely under the control of its middle-class creators. Much like Bailey’s music hall, modern football relied heavily upon the support of the working-class consumer and, as a result, was invariably shaped by working class consumer demands.

Emma Griffin, in her “Popular Culture in Industrialising Britain” further highlights gaps within the current historiography, noting that “much that has been written about the meaning of popular culture … is unable to get to grips with the way in which forces beyond working-class control shaped and defined the custom under consideration.” In other words, there is little discussion beyond traditional class relationships, a fact which limits the ability both to express working-class agency, and to breakdown traditional notions of a unified and distinct classes. She further notes that the idea of a common culture shared by all poor has been increasingly challenged, so too the notion that there existed two distinct social groups – the elite and the popular – which maintained distinct leisure practices. Griffin establishes that recreations and cultural practices cannot so easily be attributed to an entire class, or indeed, to one class. Instead,

---

19 Adrian Harvey, “The Emergence of Football in Nineteenth-Century England: The Historiographic Debate,” *The International Journal of the History of Sport* 30, no.18 (2013), 2154. Note that, in England, the term Public school refers to independent, fee-charging institutions, while in Scotland, the term refers to schools provided and administered by local government. In this paper, the term refers to the English model of private schooling.

20 Griffin, “Popular Culture in Industrializing England,” 627.

the actions, objects and beliefs are continually moving beyond the social groups and class
to which they are attributed.22

In his 2012 article “Popular Culture and Sporting Life,” Mike Huggins notes that
numerous attempts to study leisure have relied too heavily upon traditional class
interpretations.23 There has been little exploration of this question, with most academic
studies focusing solely on ordered and rational middle-class recreations and their role in
reinforcing notions of work ethic, thrift, and respectability among the working class.24
Instead, he argues that age, gender, community and regional differences are all integral to
the development of distinct recreations. Huggins questions the typical application of class
history to pastimes, indicating both the larger need to establish the extent to which
activities were shaped by power or control from above, and to broaden the analysis of
pastimes beyond traditional notions of class.25 Like Griffin, Huggins has recognized the
need to move away from the concept of unified classes, and to examine elements which
transcend these notions, such as the relationship between young and old. It is the intent of
this paper, in addressing both the ways in which these recreations failed to fully assert
control over the working-class and the radically different goals of “middle-class”
organisers, to reduce this gap in the current historiography.

The most valuable source for establishing the disparate views of both the
working-class consumer and middle-class organiser is the Scottish periodical press. Bill

---

23 Mike Huggins, “Popular Culture and Sporting Life in the Rural Margins of Late Eighteenth Century
(Winter 2013), 190.
25 Huggins, “Popular Culture and Sporting Life in the Rural Margins of Late Eighteenth-Century England,”
190.
Bell has argued the continued necessity for studying the Victorian periodical press. Bell illustrates that “despite its obvious importance as a commodity, a leisure pursuit, and a shaper of opinion, the Scottish Periodical… has remained invisible in many literary and historical accounts of the nineteenth century.”

Although the apparent relationship between history and print culture has remained underdeveloped for many years, the relationship itself is evident. Leslie Howsam, in her article “Victorian Studies and the History of the Book” highlights the relevance of print history to the study of popular leisure when she writes that “The linkage of literature and history was part of a recognition that the historical context for those literary works was more than just ‘background’ … that the political and social turmoil of decades like the 1840s and 1870s, for instance, were intrinsic to the preoccupations of writers.”

Examinations of Victorian print materials reveal the ideals, and anxieties inherent within Victorian society.

Most importantly, perhaps, is the ability of Victorian print material to illustrate the social and political attitudes of its authorship, and to a lesser extent, its readers. These large social concerns were often addressed as “Questions”, and their presence in Victorian periodicals does much to highlight the anxieties of Victorian society. Howsam notes the variety of Questions posed in the periodical press, from the woman question, the drink question, to the "condition of England" question and so on. This trend of asking “questions” ultimately found its way to the pages of sport-specific publications.

---

like the *Referee* and the *Umpire*. They asked questions about belonging, about identity, and most importantly, about the organization and structuring of the modern game.

While daily newspapers endeavoured to detail the many developments of sport in Scotland, the 1880s saw the introduction of numerous periodicals dedicated exclusively to sport. With sport-specific periodicals emerging south of the border in the 1870s, and the rapidly growing popularity of rugby, football, and cricket in Scotland, Scottish printers quickly began to produce their own sport-oriented weeklies. It is through such periodicals that the debates surrounding professionalism would find the greatest audience, and it was these periodicals which set about modernising the Scottish game.

Among the first major weekly newspapers to emerge was the *Scottish Athletic Journal*. The first issue was published on September 1, 1882, priced at 2d an issue. It aimed to provide comprehensive coverage of Scottish football, along with rugby, cricket, cycling, and other athletics, even featuring accounts of athletics at Scottish private schools.\(^{29}\) The *Scottish Athletic Journal* was met with competition in the form of the *Scottish Umpire and Cycling Mercury*, which was introduced in 1884, at the price of 1d. While the *Umpire* maintained a middle-class slant like its competitor, the *Scottish Athletic Journal*, it was slightly more relaxed in its support of amateurism in Scotland.\(^{30}\) With the arrival of the *Scottish Referee* in 1888, priced at 1/2d, the *Scottish Athletic Journal* and *Umpire* were forced to amalgamate under the single title of *Scottish Sport*.

By 1884, the *Scottish Athletic Journal* had become one of them most popular sporting periodicals in Scotland, fuelled, no doubt, by the immense popularity of the

\(^{29}\) Quoted in: *Dictionary of Nineteenth Century Journalism*, s.v “Scottish Athletic Journal.”

\(^{30}\) Quoted in: *Dictionary of Nineteenth Century Journalism*, s.v “Scottish Umpire.”
association game. It noted, in a moment of reflection, that “newspapers like cotton and countless other things depend on consumption to make them pay. Quality is all very good, but now-a-days the public will not purchase an article unless it looks bulky.” Of course, the association game provided the “bulk” required for a successful venture, and the Scottish Athletic Journal was selling in excess of 20,000 copies within a year of its inception, and had, by 1886, expanded from 16 pages to 32 and decreased its price to 1d. Likewise, the Scottish Athletic Journal’s immediate competitor, The Scottish Umpire, boasted similar numbers, and when the two journals merged in 1888, the resulting Scottish Sport claimed a circulation of over 43,000.

The sales of Glasgow’s mainstream newspapers also saw a significant increase in sales during the period between 1870 and 1880. For example, the Evening Times, launched in 1876, quickly gained a daily circulation of nearly 50,000 copies, while The Herald reached a daily circulation of around 27,000 by the mid-1870s, and The Glasgow News, a Tory daily, managed about 12,000 copies a day. The rise in popularity of these periodicals was due both to an increase in educational opportunities available to the Scottish working class, and a general stabilization of the Glaswegian economy by the early 1880s.

The popularity of journals like Scottish Sport and The Umpire was further encouraged by the lack of sports-specific coverage in more conventional papers, with only the Mail and Glasgow News providing brief coverage of the sport. The periodicals

31 W.W Beveridge, “Athletic Training IV” Scottish Athletic Journal 1 no. 7 (13 October 1882), 10.
32 Murray, The Old Firm, 47.
33 Murray, The Old Firm, 47.
also enjoyed a notable increase in profits when their coverage included some mention of Old Firm clashes between the dominant clubs Rangers and Celtic. When, in 1887, Rangers completed the first Ibrox Stadium, the *Scottish Umpire* provided an additional 3000 copies an issue which depicted a sketch of the new ground, and later introduced a single page reproduction due to the success of the first printing.\(^35\) The need for sports journalism was so great that in 1890 *Scottish Sport* noted that “demand existed among the public for the earliest information of the results of matches played on Saturday, a different state of matters prevailed, and ‘copy’ had to be produced as the match went on and dispatched a few sheets at a time to the printer.”\(^36\) During the height of the sports specific periodical, publishers and printers were hard-pressed to meet demand and provide non-stop coverage of Scottish sporting life.

The rise in popularity enjoyed by the sports periodical was also a result of new technological advancements. By the 1880s, cheaper paper, steam-powered high-speed printing, railway circulation, and the telegraph ensured a steady supply of printed materials to literate Scots.\(^37\) The technological advancements brought on by the Industrial Revolution increasingly aided in the expansion of press readership, especially in industrial Scotland. New economies of scale allowed for the mass production of books, pamphlets and newspapers at increasingly low prices. As a result, the ability of the printed press to address the Victorian questions, and to gain ever an increasing readership was greatly enhanced, especially amongst the inhabitants of an environment like Glasgow. The periodical press appreciated that, while the educated middle-class formed

\(^{35}\) Murray, *The Old Firm*, 16.

\(^{36}\) *Scottish Sport*, 28 October 1890.

the backbone of the readership, the larger working class represented a valuable consumer resource.

The working class, occupying the unskilled and semi-skilled positions in Scotland’s growing industrial heartland, had by the 1880s undergone a radical change in income, and often possessed enough extra income to patronize the growing consumer popular culture. Murray, building on the work of Leone Levi, established that, in 1884, the average working-class labourer earned between 15/- to £1 a week, semi-skilled artisans between £1 3/- and £1 8/-, and skilled artisans upwards of £2 a week. Levi’s calculations also indicate that in the period between 1857 and 1884, the average unskilled labourers annual budget for ‘travelling and amusements’ had tripled, from £1 to £3. Due to a combination of more affordable consumer products, a more stable economy, and a shorter work week, Glaswegians soon found that they could spare both money and time in order to participate in Glasgow’s burgeoning sport culture.

The introduction of the 1872 Education Act (Scotland), mandating free and accessible public education to all children between the ages of 5 and 13, further increased the potential readership of the printed press. Prior to 1872, only about 60% of children attended school, and of these, many did not regularly attend. By the end of the 19th century, nearly 97% of the Scottish population were literate, higher even than their English and Western European counterparts, which boasted literacy rates of

---

38 Murray, *The Old Firm*, 42.
39 Murray, *The Old Firm*, 42.
40 Education Act (Scotland), 1872.
The rise in literacy brought about by mandatory education, combined with a remarkable rise in the popularity of association football inevitably increased the demand for sports periodicals, especially among the working class. As a result, the periodical press during the mid-nineteenth century targeted increasingly literate members of the working-class, in addition to its traditional public-school educated audience.

Fostered by the Scottish periodical press, the growing interest in football and other organised sport in industrial Scotland during the mid-1880s cannot be understated. The periodical press increasingly focused on coverage of sports and athletics, covering rugby, association football, in addition to other activities such as cycling, rowing, and running. In Glasgow, popular sport resonated with the working class, whose appetite for match recaps, statistics, and in-depth analysis only increased with the introduction of increasingly codified rules and modern football organisations. Football gained an immense following throughout Scotland. As George Macdonald Fraser notes in his 1970 *The General Danced at Dawn*, “The native Highlanders, the Englishmen, and the Lowlanders played football on Saturday afternoons and talked about it Saturday evenings, but the Glaswegians, men apart from this in most things, played, slept, ate, drank and lived it seven days a week.”43 This mass popularity, and near constant discussion was enabled by the city’s increasing vocal periodical press, which ensured near constant access to the latest results and keen insight into the debates which shaped the sporting world.

While the popularity of association football created an excellent opportunity for the growth of sports journalism during the Victorian period, the nature of the demand would soon become one of the greatest challenges to journals like the *Umpire* and *Referee*. University of Edinburgh lecturer Matthew McDowell, notes that “Daily newspapers’ coverage of sport was not typically as in-depth as that of the *Referee*, but in an atmosphere of intense partisanship, and with sport's profitability as an industry driven to an extent by gambling, speed came to be of more value than pages-long analysis.”

With technological advances, such as the introduction of the telephone in 1890, and the increasing inclusion of sport in mainstream daily newspapers, the demand for sport specific weeklies subsided. *Scottish Sport* would print its last issue in 1900, while its competitor, *The Scottish Referee* would continue its cheaper newspaper format until 1914.

By the late 1890s, mainstream daily papers had increasingly recognized the economic potential of sports coverage and were able to provide daily updates on the most recent scores and club news, thus rendering weekly sports papers obsolete. Despite the eventual commercial failure of these periodicals, there existed between 1870 and 1895 a period in which the periodical press was utilized as a tool, alongside association football itself, to impose the social values of the educated middle-class upon the industrial labourer. The simultaneous rise of popular sport and mass literacy ensured that a close relationship was established between athletics and print media.

Studies of middle-class reform and leisure have largely focused on the urban environments of Southern England, with works like Harvey’s *Beginnings of a*

---

44 Quoted in: *Dictionary of Nineteenth Century Journalism*, s.v “Scottish Referee.”
Commercial Sporting Culture in England focusing largely on the urban areas of London, Manchester, and Oxford. Likewise, studies of Scottish football have largely been preoccupied by the sectarian issues prevalent within the sport. This paper remedies these shortcomings, by expanding the study of leisure into a Scottish perspective, while also examining the formative years of Scottish football before issues of sectarianism became prominent. It is the intent of this paper to illustrate the conditions which gave rise to the football clubs that in the twentieth century, would assert their own increasingly powerful identities over their multitude of fans.

Chapter II

MUSCULAR CHRISTIANITY AND VICTORIAN RESPECTABILITY

It is, of course, necessary to understand that the middle-class modernizers who pushed their own distinct set of moral and social values through sport and the printed press were but a segment, albeit highly vocal, of what is understood as the traditional Victorian middle class. It is important to note that not all members of the broader middle class wished to join the temperance movement or the amateur sporting establishment, or that they wished to remain entirely distinct from the other classes at all.46 Diverging from traditional understandings of class relations in Victorian Britain, the period of 1870-1890 presents a far more complex notion of the relationship between the working and middle class, and between distinct groups within the middle class as well. An examination of the debates surrounding professionalism, and of the content of sporting periodicals more generally, reveal the attempts of a vocal segment of middle-class society. The rhetoric of respectability and moral uprightness was powerful, and remained so for much of the period, the active middle-class reformers formed a small, but certainly vocal, minority.47 It is the attempts of these middle-class modernizers, possessed with public education, and a strict sense of moral duty, to exert control over working-class morals and values through the modernization of sport that form the key focus of this paper.

The moral and modernizing middle-class demonstrated, from the early 19th century onwards, an intense obsession with the concept of Victorian respectability. Respectability is defined broadly as a creed and a code for the conduct of personal and

family life that is often applied to all classes, while also maintaining a preoccupation with notions of sin, guilt, and redemption.\textsuperscript{48} The major rhetorical thrusts of respectability emerged from middle class fears of working class misuse of leisure, and sought, above all else, to foster the creation of the respectable working man.\textsuperscript{49} Likewise, it existed as a specific system of values, aimed at incorporating sectors of the working class into the broader middle-class social consensus that assured mid-Victorian society.\textsuperscript{50} The rhetoric of respectability was, as a result, never intended to be merely the preserve of the middle class, rather, it was by design imposed upon members of the working class.

Middle Class respectability thus provided the core impetus behind the rise of organised sport as a vehicle for messages of Victorian masculinity and purity. Leisure, as a solely masculine environment, existed as one of the key areas in which the debates over respectability could take place. Sir Arthur Conan Doyle, a keen cricketer in his own right, is noted for saying that the main reason for playing sports was that it “kept men fit for the serious duties of life.”\textsuperscript{51} Sir Henry Newbolt, an English novelist, poet, and historian, argued that “how the game was played was important for social and moral salvation, and that playing should not be for actual or symbolic reward.”\textsuperscript{52} To the middle-class modernizer, sport was not an indication of success, but rather a pathway to success in later life. It provided its participants with a set of moral values and gentlemanly attitudes.

\textsuperscript{48} Mike Huggins, \textit{The Victorians and Sport} (London: Hambleton and London, 2004), 50.
\textsuperscript{49} Peter Bailey, "Will the Real Bill Banks Please Stand up? Towards a Role Analysis of Mid-Victorian Working-Class Respectability," \textit{Journal of Social History} 12, no. 3 (Spring, 1979), 336.
\textsuperscript{50} Huggins, \textit{The Victorians and Sport}, 50.
\textsuperscript{51} Huggins, \textit{The Victorians and Sport}, 50.
which were believed to prepare one for success in business, professional careers, and increasingly, in the factory and shipyard as well.

In addition, Conan Doyle and Newbolt both express a concern which was pervasive in Victorian society. The 19th century would see a massive growth in the medical sciences, and a general pre-occupation with both moral and physical health. During the period between 1800 and 1860, over seventy new hospitals were opened, and some eight thousand physicians were trained in English universities. This preoccupation developed as a symptom of rapidly growing industrial cities and the accompanying fear of filth and epidemics which existed throughout the nineteenth century. As a direct result of industrialisation, Victorians were confronted with the threat of disease and death, a preoccupation which, among other things, led to an appreciation for both a healthy mind and healthy body. These messages would quickly be distributed and reinforced by the key advocate for middle class values, the periodical press.

The popular miscellany magazine, Blackwood’s Edinburgh Magazine, which ran from 1817 until 1980 quickly took up the middle-class cause. The magazine, in reinforcing middle class notions of respectability and effective use of ones time, equated masculinity and fitness with national success, stating that “in a commercial age, a nation must encourage manliness and such past-times that promote physical and moral strength, discipline, the realisation and the sinking of self.” Masculinity, for the Victorian middle-class and elite, was often at the centre of success, both individually, and on a

54 Koller and Brandle. Goal! 11.
national level. As an article in the *Scottish Athletic Journal* confirmed, masculine “ability is the external proof of a man’s popularity, and geniality of character and manliness of disposition are the internal proofs of a man’s popularity.”

Among the most prominent commentators published in the *Scottish Athletic Journal* was Reverend William Wightman Beveridge. An avid footballer, and product of the Ayr Athletics Club, Beveridge was capped for the Scottish national team three times while attending Glasgow University. He would later be ordained as a minister in 1883 and would go on to fervently argue for the betterment of the mind and body through athletics, both in sermons and through serialized columns in the periodical press. He insisted that “the words which Paul spoke of the athletes of old are equally true of those today: everyman that striveth for mastery is temperate in all things.” In a Victorian era defined increasingly by notions of temperance and restraint, Beveridge strikes at the heart of the issue, insisting that athleticism is an essential pathway to both respectability and moral salvation.

In a later sermon recorded by the *Scottish Athletic Journal*, he further expressed these dual concerns, noting that “it is very true that in life we need the vigorous mind: but also, we need the vigorous body. And mind and body are so intimately related, and so act upon each other, that is, the man who has the healthy body is most likely to have the healthy mind.” The rhetoric of this “muscular Christianity” espoused by the likes of Beveridge, indicates the attempts of educated middle-class Victorians to reinforce a

---

56 “Modern Athletic Celebrities” *Scottish Athletic Journal* 3 no. 137 (April 8, 1885), 9.
distinct set of moral and social values based upon the effective use of leisure time and the
of a healthy mind and body.

Beveridge would, in that same sermon, issue a challenge to those who had not
adopted the tenets of muscular Christianity. He argued that the modern Christian man
should not strive to emulate the traditional saintly image, defined often as a person who
was frail and weakly, but instead to emulate contemporary Scottish athletes, whose
devotion to athletics assured their moral purity.60 Beveridge, and the *Scottish Athletic
Journal* more generally, passionately argued for moral and physical health, and for the
development of a ‘Saintly’ physique. Successful amateur athletes were held up by the
*Scottish Athletic Journal* as examples to the working class, with weekly coverage of these
individuals repeatedly reinforcing the middle-class athletic ideal to which the working
class was supposed to adhere.

Among the best examples of Beveridge’s athletic sermons is the serialized
“Athletic Training” segment, published in the *Scottish Athletic Journal* in 1886. The first
issue of this column begins candidly, stating that:

> The training athlete is not the victim of hardships and misery and all
> unhappiness; there is no man so happy. He inhales the free, fresh air of
> Heaven with a sense of pleasure which others never dreamt of; he is
> endowed with a health of body and mind to an extent unfelt before;
> indeed, life seems to put forth new blossoms for him.61

From this statement, Beveridge moves to convince his readership that the condition of the
athlete may be obtained by men of moderation, those who disavow idleness and

---

60 “Modern Athletic Celebrities” *Scottish Athletic Journal* 3 no. 178 (January 19, 1886), 9.
gluttony.\textsuperscript{62} Again, the path to physical health and moral salvation is directly tied to ideals of moderation and physical activity.

Beyond simply convincing his audience to commit to athletic training, Beveridge provides what amounts to a step-by-step guide to athletic prowess. For Beveridge the watchword is regularity, in nearly all aspects of life. The article instructs its followers to “keep early hours…and when you seek repose, let it never be upon the luxurious bosom of a feather bed. Such an effeminate resting place … is a delusion and a snare.”\textsuperscript{63} Likewise, practitioners are encouraged to eat regularly, and not to excess, while drinking, even moderately, is proven to be incompatible with physical perfection.\textsuperscript{64} In addition to this sleeping and eating arrangement, Beveridge ventures so far as to dictate the appropriate attire for participating in sport, suggesting that the “shoes you wear be made to order…do not wear stockings … [and] fasten your shoes not with silk, cotton or leather laces, but with a rosin-end…”\textsuperscript{65} Beyond being a guide to athletic purity, Beveridge’s ‘Athletic Training’ stands as an example of middle class attempt to instill values of temperance, moderation, and muscular Christianity. The gains made by adherence to the athletic ideal are made clear, as is the way of arriving there.

To this end, ‘Athletic Training’ begs its adherents to conform to the middle-class ideal, abandon vices like alcohol, gambling, and adopt the path to moral and physical purity. The column, in effect, provided its readership with a rigid system of training which encouraged its practitioners to conform to the ideals of moral purity and

\textsuperscript{62} W.W Beveridge, “Athletic Training 1” \textit{Scottish Athletic Journal} 1 no.4 (September 1882), 10.

\textsuperscript{63} W.W Beveridge, “Athletic Training IV” \textit{Scottish Athletic Journal} 1 no.7 (October 13, 1882), 10.

\textsuperscript{64} W.W Beveridge, “Athletic Training IV” \textit{Scottish Athletic Journal} 1 no. 7 (October 13, 1882), 10.

\textsuperscript{65} W.W Beveridge, “Athletic Training V” \textit{Scottish Athletic Journal} 1 no. 9 (October 27, 1882), 10.
respectability. At their heart, these instructions sought to ensure the effective use of leisure time by the working class. Moreover, it is representative of the larger set of moral and social values which middle-class modernizers sought to enforce on the working-class through athletics and the periodical press.

With a modernizing middle-class obsessed with the respectability of the working classes, it is unsurprising that sport was adopted as a tool that was hoped to ensure the very salvation of the working classes. On a more practical level, working class participation in sport prevented the moral misuse of leisure time, and instead prepared its practitioners for the harsh, physical realities of industrial life. At the same time, mass participation in sport, reinforced by the periodical press, ensured that the work force remained both disciplined and physically healthy, benefits which were not lost to the management of Glasgow’s numerous factories and growing shipyards.

In addition to providing advice to their readership on how to achieve physical respectability, the Scottish periodical press provided its readership with numerous examples of the athletic ideal. For instance, an article published in the March 28, 1892 issue of the Scottish Referee elevates the Englishman Arthur Kinnaird, 11th Lord Kinnaird in a similar manner. Kinnaird, dubbed a ‘Christian athlete’ is portrayed as an exemplary figure. Kinnaird won several F.A. cups while playing for the Wanderers F.C (London) and Old Etonians (Eton College), and from the age of 21 was heavily involved in the administration of the Football Association.66 Outside of football, Kinnaird was the president of the YWCA and the YMCA in England, a director of Barclays Bank and Lord

---

High Commissioner to the General Assembly of the Church of Scotland, a position which saw Kinnaird act as the personal representative of the Queen Victorian to the Scottish church.\textsuperscript{67}

While an aristocrat, and certainly successful in sport, Kinnaird is shown to be both a man of intellect and gentlemanly bearing. As a man whose interests extended beyond the realm of leisure and into business, welfare organisations and the upper levels of government, he illustrated, on a practical level, the benefits of living a respectable lifestyle. For those looking towards social advancement, regular church attendance, involvement in charitable or philanthropic organisations, and participation in local government greatly enhanced an individual’s chances of entering the social elite.\textsuperscript{68} As a successful man involved in these pursuits, Kinnaird became an exemplary figure whose accomplishments were prominently celebrated in the pages of the Scottish periodical press.

During his life, Kinnaird remained an active proponent of muscular Christianity, for him “debates on religious, social, and moral topics never lose interest…, and frequently he has been the champion of rational recreation for young men in the face of puritanical bigots.”\textsuperscript{69} He is illustrated as being a ‘true aristocrat’ and is held up as an example both to his peers, and to those “beneath” him. The column shows an immense appreciation for progress, noting that “time was when muscular exercise was tabooed by religious folk. The young Christians who are lank, limp and lifeless are now the

\textsuperscript{68} Huggins, “More Sinful Pleasures?” 587.
\textsuperscript{69} “A Christian Athlete” \textit{Scottish Referee} March 28, 1892, 4.
exception... [the] mortification of the flesh and emaciation of the body are not fashionable as part and parcel of the Christian creed.”

It was not uncommon, in fact, for the Scottish periodical press to elevate members of the athletic community to celebrity status. The *Scottish Athletic Journal*, for example, ran a “Modern Athletic Celebrities” column in its papers from April 1884 until its merger with *Scottish Sport*. Likewise, The *Scottish Referee* ran a regular “Portrait Gallery” which provided an engraving and biography of a famous sporting personality.

Like the *Scottish Athletic Journal*, The *Referee* also ensured that it reinforced the productive use of leisure time through its celebration of middle-class individuals successful both in and outside of sport. In a biographical column dedicated to John Murray of the Vale of Leven F.C. (Alexandria), the *Referee* noted that a “more honest amateur never entered the football arena.” Murray’s success in the footballing realm was attributed, like so many others, to discipline and a strict adherence to respectability. He was characterised as one of the most gentlemanly players in Scotland, while also being noted as a life long abstainer. With his success tied directly to his gentlemanly demeanor, and to his denial of less reputable leisure activities like the consumption of alcohol, Murray illustrates the criteria utilized by the periodical press in the creation of athletic celebrities.

While focusing on its celebration of respectability, and the adherence of sporting heroes to strict middle-class moral codes, the Scottish periodical press also ensured the commemoration of those who had defended middle-class sporting values. The *Scottish*...
*Athletic Journal*, in its coverage of Thomas Lawrie, president of the S.F.A. illustrates that Lawrie, “in the administration of the affairs of Association … displays the wonderful ability and vast knowledge which make him subject of universal admiration.” As a fervent defender of amateurism working through the mechanisms of the S.F.A., Lawrie was elevated not for his ability on the pitch, but for his role as an organiser of the Scottish game. Crucially, the inclusion of organisers, in addition to the players themselves, illustrates concerns beyond events which occurred solely on the pitch.

The journal likewise celebrated Mr. J.E McKillop, a man who also held the title of S.F.A. President. McKillop was particularly favoured by the press for his actions against the ‘professional question’, which was the greatest challenge to the amateur association game in Scotland. The coverage of Lawrie and men like him illustrates a distinctly middle-class concern with the structure and organisation of sport. This preoccupation with the organisers and administrators of sport is indicative of concerns which transcended the activity itself. These men became celebrities not for their participation in leisure activity themselves, but for their ability to strengthen and support respectability and the amateur ideal within the S.F.A.

It was these men who would effectively become the heroes of the middle-class reformers. The *Scottish Athletic Journal* would make clear that “hero worship is not confined to those who explore the realms of science, literature, or art, it is an instinctive something that permeates every phase of human existence.” With this statement, the *Scottish Athletic Journal* makes the argument that those who have worked towards the

---

74 “Modern Athletic Celebrities” *Scottish Athletic Journal* 3 no. 126 (Jan 21, 1885), 9.
75 “Modern Athletic Celebrities” *Scottish Athletic Journal* 3 no. 135 (March 25, 1885), 9.
development of the association game deserve the same recognition of those great scientists, novelists, and historians which arose during the Victorian period. The elevation of these organisers to levels of importance on par with the likes of Conan Doyle and Charles Darwin illustrates the critical importance of the athletic organiser to the Scottish periodical, and to the middle-class modernizer more generally.

The celebration of the organisers of the S.F.A., the managers of successful clubs, and of athletes who practiced the ideals of respectability, are among the most prominent commemorations of middle-class amateurism. In producing these biographical sketches, the papers provided exemplary members of the sporting community which their readers could emulate. Additionally, the papers could actively celebrate key members in the creation of association football in Scotland, and in doing so, commemorate the efforts of middle class modernisers and their modernization efforts. The ‘celebrities’ being discussed purposely shared a number of characteristics. For example, most of these athletes were well educated in the public-school system and possessed university degrees. These gentlemen generally pursued more than one sport, often cricket, running, or rowing. They were generally successful in business, medicine, law, or some other professional field, and remained heavily active both in the administration of athletics clubs and of welfare and community organisations. It is unsurprising then, that the modern athletes were celebrated more for their abilities as managers, officials, and owners than as actual football players.

For much of the 19th century it was the middle class which sought to develop and enhance leisure and pastimes, establishing sporting associations and codified sets of rules which helped to expand, among other things, organised football. Where football had once
existed as a group of only superficially related past times, the actions of the middle-class
organiser, through the introduction of codified rules and football associations, set about
establishing association rules football which carried with it middle class ideals of
respectability, and both moral and physical health. Likewise, the middle class, through
the printed press, redefined the athletic ideal to align with the gentlemanly amateur. At
the same time, the press was vocal in its instruction to its readers, illustrating clear paths
to attaining athletic skill and consequently, moral purity and respectability.
Chapter III

REDEFINING THE GAME: THE MODERNISATION OF SPORT

This middle-class desire to modernize and redefine sport emerged, in part, from hegemonic concerns over the ‘moral misuse’ of leisure time and sought to encourage the emergence of the respectable working man. At the same time, it was fuelled by concerns about the respectability of the middle-class itself. Middle-class reformers increasingly became concerned not only with the perceived moral ills of the working class, but also with the iniquities of their own social order. As a result, it became necessary to offer a firm guiding hand, and to provide meaningful pastimes to occupy leisure time that would have otherwise been filled with alcoholism, gambling and other vices.

Traditional, highly localised leisure activities had developed alongside the agricultural calendar, remained closely tied to religious festivals, and had, by the 1800s, developed a reputation for debauchery and a loosening of morals. These festival pastimes were, as a result, wholly incompatible with the set of moral values which the middle-class sought to reinforce, and consequently, new forms of pastime had to be developed. While traditional leisure time activities diverged from Victorian ideals of masculinity and respectability, sports like league football, cricket, and rugby provided effective arenas for reinforcing them. Sport was often argued to be the training ground for courage, perseverance, physical vigor, and group loyalty. A writer noted that sport was an “excellent preparation for the military exercises, and render men fit to become defenders

77 Malcolmson, Popular Recreations in English Society, 167.
of their country.” There appeared, by 1850, to be a consensus amongst a vocal portion of the middle class that modern sport offered an avenue for achieving Victorian respectability.

A key component in the creation of modern sport was the elimination and marginalisation of traditional, community-based recreations. Before modern recreations, and the messages they carried within, could be adopted, older popular past times had to be overwritten. These pastimes were understandably a product of the conditions in pre-Industrial Britain, and consequently remained intimately tied to the intermittent nature of agriculture labour. Likewise, the widespread use of animals in popular recreations also stemmed from this lifestyle, with horse-racing emerging from debates over the quality of the mounts, cockfighting and bull-baiting as entertaining way to dispose of excess stock, and badger baiting as an amusing form of pest control. These pastimes remained tied to the land, the above examples all making use of naturally available resources and geographical space.

Even early versions of football and rugby, dating to as early as the 1300s, developed around the pre-industrial economy and festival schedule. The game, which was in effect a precursor to both modern rugby and football, would at this time have been nearly unrecognizable to the modern spectator. There were no codified rules, no limits on the playing field, number of players, or the length of the game. The game would often

encompass an entire medieval village, again making use of readily available space, and involved carrying a ‘ball’ through a designated goal post, often the gates of the city.

The tradition of utilizing public land for the playing of the game persisted until the 19th century, when, following changes in land ownership law, the traditional game came increasingly under attack. Malcolmson notes “that public thoroughfares had always been regarded as legitimate playing places by common people, but as the pace of urbanization accelerated…the clash between this popular point of view and the growing concern for orderliness and property rights was very much accentuated.”82 He further argued that:

Traditional recreation was rooted in a social system which was predominantly agrarian, strongly parochial in its orientations, marked by a deep sense of corporate identity: it could not be comfortably absorbed into a society which was urban-centred, governed by contractual relations, biased towards individualism, increasingly moulding its culture in a manner appropriate to the requirements of industrial production.83

Thus, the agrarian pastimes of old became increasingly at odds with the urban industrial middle class ideal. The concerns of respectability, and the perceived incompatibility of older pastimes would ultimately inform concerted efforts to eliminate pre-industrial popular recreations and replace them with pastimes deemed to be both productive and ‘respectable’.

The efforts of these campaigns were markedly noticeable, as Malcolmson argues, a vast number of traditional recreations which had existed prior to the 1800s, had, by the

---

82 Malcolmson, *Popular Recreations in English Society*, 140.
mid-nineteenth century, nearly ceased to exist.\textsuperscript{84} Those sports and leisure activities which did survive were altered, argued Malcolmson, and the social values and meanings of these pastimes also changed.\textsuperscript{85} With the onset of urbanization and industrialisation, and the subsequent rise in middle-class political power, these pastimes came under concerted legal attack. National bodies increasingly began to replace local sports, and traditional pastimes, including cockfighting and bear-baiting were made illegal by Acts of Parliament in 1803 and 1835, respectively.\textsuperscript{86} The Highway Act of 1835 denied access to the public spaces and thoroughfares in which traditional street football took place, while an Act of 1853 targeted the betting shops which had increasingly sprung up alongside these localised pastimes.\textsuperscript{87}

In addition to legal action, in the form of parliamentary acts, these pastimes were attacked by a growing number of reform groups, including paternalist entrepreneurs who believed that workers should spend their free time productively, and avoid the consumption of alcohol and other social vices.\textsuperscript{88} The Lord’s Day Observance Society, for instance, combatted the evils of alcohol associated with these pastimes, and achieved a measure of working class support.\textsuperscript{89} Additional challenges rose from animal rights groups like the Royal Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals (R.S.P.C.A), founded in part by the famed William Wilberforce in 1824. The inspectors of this agency frequently prosecuted working class animal abusers, although it did little to condemn distinctly

\textsuperscript{84} Malcolmson, \textit{Popular Recreations in English Society}, 89.
\textsuperscript{85} Malcolmson, \textit{Popular Recreations in English Society}, 89.
\textsuperscript{86} Colin Matthews, Public Life and Politics, SOC to the 19\textsuperscript{th} Century, 88.
\textsuperscript{87} Vamplew, \textit{Pay Up and Play the Game}, 44.
\textsuperscript{88} Koller and Brandle. \textit{Goal!} 45.
\textsuperscript{89} Vamplew, \textit{Pay Up and Play the Game}, 45.
upper class activities like hunting.\textsuperscript{90} These groups used arguments similar to one made by the \textit{Manchester Mercury} in 1800, asserting that “every act that sanctions cruelty to animals must tend to destroy the morals of people and consequently every social duty.”\textsuperscript{91} Traditional pastimes, were thus subject of great concern to middle-class modernisers by the 19\textsuperscript{th} century and were subject to concerted attacks by both legal and moral reformers.

While Malcolmson notes that “some observers lamented the decline of traditional pastimes,” he also clearly established that vocal segments of the middle class viewed localised traditional leisure activities as roadblocks to progress and impediments to national improvement.\textsuperscript{92} In their stead emerged new uniform and modern forms of entertainment. Griffin notes that the annual cycle of feasts and festivals, governed by seasons and harvests, was systematically replaced with organised sport and communal music hall.\textsuperscript{93} Likewise, industrialisation and urbanization of the 19\textsuperscript{th} century brought with it the rising incomes, increased spare time, a regulated work week, and modern transport systems that spectator sports require.\textsuperscript{94} The relentless rhythm of factory and industrial life encouraged the establishment of a codified set of rules, standardized pitch and, more generally, the regimentation of popular pastimes.\textsuperscript{95}

Among the most prominent impacts of this modernization impact was the centralization of pastimes in industrial centres like Glasgow, and the introduction of codified and uniform rules governing these pastimes. This of course reflects the

\textsuperscript{90} Vamplew, \textit{Pay Up and Play the Game}, 45.
\textsuperscript{91} Malcolmson, \textit{Popular Recreations in English Society}, 137.
\textsuperscript{92} Malcolmson, \textit{Popular Recreations in English Society}, 89.
\textsuperscript{93} Griffin, “Popular Culture in Industrializing England,” 621.
\textsuperscript{94} Griffin, “Popular Culture in Industrializing England,” 621.
\textsuperscript{95} Griffin, “Popular Culture in Industrializing England,” 621.
hegemonic relationship between the working and middle class, a relationship which the middle-class reformer intended to strengthen. A worker who in his leisure time participated in organised athletics would be physically fit for work in the factory and more open to the regimentation which was inherent within the industrial workplace. Likewise, the worker would be less likely to pursue immoral pastimes in his free time, thereby avoiding alcoholism and crime. The redefinition of pastimes aimed to ensure both the productive use of leisure time, and to instill a sense of uniformity and regimentation which prepared them for life in Scotland’s rapidly industrialising heartland.

Convinced that new pastimes which suited the social ideals of the middle-class were the key to reasserting control over the working-class, reformers embarked on a mission to modernize pastimes. For these Victorians, it became necessary for traditional past times, which invariably tied their participants to a highly localised set of norms and values, to be eliminated in favour of codified sport emanating from the centres of British industry and empire. While the success of these modernizers in eliminating traditional sport has been the subject of continued debate, the reformers were nevertheless successful in their creation of modern popular recreations, as evidenced by, among other examples, the enormous growth of association football in both England and Scotland in the latter half of the 19th century.
Chapter IV

THE RISE OF ASSOCIATION FOOTBALL IN BRITAIN

Broadly speaking, there were two types of football being played in Britain by the mid-nineteenth century. The first was “a rough game, possessing few, if any, rules, which was played in the wider community, especially during festival times,” while the second was an increasingly standardized and codified version of the sport which generally took place at public schools. An early set of rules from the 1850s, for example, allowed for a free kick at goal after ‘fair catch’ of the ball, for the throwing of the ball to a team mate, and even allowed participants to run with the ball in hand after a fair catch, rules which all made for a game entirely different from the one with which current fans are familiar.

In 1864, a journalist noted that football was quickly becoming “the pastime of aristocratic colleges and schools,” while also noting the increasing localisation of the sport occurring due to the lack of uniform rules. As the game increased in popularity, students attending these institutions sought to compete with an increasing number of rival schools, but were frustrated by the tendency of these clubs to play by a different, and often incompatible, set of rules. By 1848, Cambridge University had produced its own set of rules, and were later followed by other organisations, such as Sheffield F.C. in 1855. With the foundation of the English Football Association in 1863, the often-diverse rules of both the elite and public English schools were moulded into one coherent

The establishment of football associations marks a critical stage in the modernization of British football. Prior to the 1860s, the developing game had possessed a disparate set of rules and regulations. The establishment of associations ensured that football would become more centralised, and more effectively governed by the middle-class organiser.

Formed on October 26, 1863 by the representatives of eleven London clubs, the members of the Football Association (F.A.) quickly set about establishing a codified and uniform set of rules. The F.A. was not the only body to emerge in England, however, with local Associations being formed in in Birmingham, Lancashire, Norfolk, Oxfordshire, Essex, Sussex, Berkshire, Buckingham, Walsall, Kent, Nottinghamshire, Middlesex, Liverpool, Cheshire, Staffordshire, Derbyshire, Scarborough, and most notably Sheffield, between 1875 and 1883.101 The Sheffield Association, which played by rules different to that of the F.A., presented the most serious challenge to its authority. When, in 1877, the two associations merged, the dominance of the F.A. in the governance of the “kicking game” in England became clear. As a result, the F.A. entered a period of immense growth, and from an original membership of ten clubs in 1863, could claim fifty in 1871, and over one-thousand in 1888.102

The origins of the Scottish Football Association (S.F.A.) and codification of football in Scotland would similarly begin within the school system, albeit at a slower pace than their English counterparts. By the late 1890s, under the increasing influence of

---

101 Koller and Brandle, Goal! 18.
102 Koller and Brandle, Goal! 18.
the English school system, this began to change. With the headmasters at Scottish schools often educated in England, it is unsurprising that a distinctly ‘English’ concept of education became prevalent in both Scottish private schools and reformed grammar schools. While Scotland maintained a distinct sporting and academic culture, by the 1890s it had become increasingly open to the influence of English sporting and athletic institutions, such as the English F.A.

Inspired by both the English school system and the development of football associations as governing bodies of the sport, football associations were established in Ireland, Wales, and, of course, Scotland. The Scottish Football Association, or S.F.A., was established a full ten years after its English counterpart, in 1873, but like the F.A., sought to standardize rules and encourage the growth of the association game in Scotland. The S.F.A. was also subject to rapid growth following its inception. The *Scottish Athletic Journal* suggests that this was largely due to the introduction of the S.F.A. Challenge Cups, annual competitions in which association clubs could compete, asserting that “there is no question that the cup competitions have contributed very largely to create the great interest taken in football by all classes throughout the country.” The journal further noted that in the first cup season, twenty seven clubs joined the S.F.A., the following season it counted 43 members, and by its third season, 1880-81, counted some 54 member clubs with a total membership of 2862.

With the introduction of Association membership, the S.F.A. conducted a substantial restructuring of football in Scotland. The increasing popularity of the

---

104 “Football in Ayrshire” *Scottish Athletic Journal* 1 no. 3 (September 15, 1882), 4.
105 “Football in Ayrshire” *Scottish Athletic Journal* 1 no. 3 (September 15, 1882), 4.
Association game, driven largely by the cup competitions encouraged outlying clubs and footballing organizations to participate in an increasingly centralized sporting environment. In the early stages, the S.F.A. provided clubs with opportunities to display their athletic prowess, while also giving access to increasing revenues, or “gates” due to participation in the ever-popular cup matches. As a result, an increasing number of once disparate and disjointed clubs began participating in the association game, with a uniform set of rules and one, centralized governing body in the guise of the S.F.A.

Despite its intent to remain an independent body and exercise its powers as the supreme footballing body in Scotland, the S.F.A. and the game it espoused remained deeply tied to the rest of Britain. Like the United Kingdom itself, British football in the 19th century was composed of distinct but affiliated national bodies. The actions of one association invariably affected the others. While the associations each remained dedicated to the expansion of the amateur game in Britain, differences in definitions of the term “amateur”, combined with vastly different levels of financial success, by the late 1880s, led to miscommunication and debate over the key elements of policy which governed association football in Britain.

At the same time, the S.F.A. strove to rise above the external influence of the larger and wealthier English Football Association and create a distinctly Scottish game. Unlike the Football Association in England, however, the S.F.A. was not the sole legislative body for football in Scotland. Instead, several smaller, regional associations, such as those in Edinburgh, Ayrshire and Fifeshire, set about governing the rules of association football in their districts. As a result, it became the task of the national body,
the S.F.A. to secure the compliance of each local body when it needed to make larger decisions about football in Scotland.

While these associations, notes the *Scottish Athletic Journal*, “do not in any way oppose, but rather aid the work of the Scottish Association,” they nevertheless illustrate the limits of the middle-class modernization mission in Scotland.106 Whereas the English F.A. ruled supreme over its own affairs, its Scottish counterpart remained limited by the regional concerns of affiliated associations. Likewise, the Scottish notions of amateur athletics, indicated in part by the reluctance to accept professionalism until 1893, were increasingly challenged by the more rapid acceptance of professionalism by the English F.A., who legalised the professional player in 1885. While the modernization of Scottish sport, focused at reaffirming the amateur ideal was enshrined within the Scottish F.A., the ability of the Scottish Association to effectively reinforce this message was increasingly challenged by the economic superiority of the English F.A., and to a lesser extent, the varied concerns of the regional associations.

Crucial to the establishment of centrally controlled amateur athletics was the creation of annual conferences between the national S.F.A. and the regional associations. The practical level on which both the F.A. and S.F.A. conducted their business, and communicated with one another, was the conference. The *Scottish Athletic Journal*, in particular, was a strong supporter of the conference system noting that the conference “is a necessity, and in this journal, it will always find a warm supporter.”107 The *Scottish Athletic Journal* would continue, establishing the integral nature of the conference

106 “Association Notes” *Scottish Athletic Journal* 1 no. 1 (Sept 1, 1882), 3.
107 “Our Little Embroglio” *Scottish Athletic Journal* 1 no. 3 (15 Sept 1882), 1.
format: “[The conference] is indispensable to the success and development of the game, and without a Conference at which the new rules and new laws can be discussed, the dribbling game will never flourish...”108 However, when the football associations failed to meet the expectations of amateur sportsmen, or met an impasse regarding certain rules, as they often did, the press would not shy from condemning the lack of progress.

Following the failure of the Scottish Football Association to attend the 1882 annual conference, the *Scottish Athletic Journal* accused the S.F.A. of “disturbing the harmony and good feeling which has raised between [the F.A. and S.F.A.].”109 Furthermore, “the whole interests of the Association game are bound up in the conference ... it should be the aim of every Association... to aid it in every way to a proper performance of its duties, and also keep it in life. That is not what the Scottish Association is doing.”110 The failure of the S.F.A. to attend the conference with its English counterpart was considered by the periodical press to be a step-backwards in the creation and maintenance of a centralized and unified middle-class football. As a critical component in this mission, the failures of the S.F.A. to gain ground was quickly and harshly criticized by the middle-class commentators writing for the *Scottish Athletic Journal*.

By the early 1880s, discussion of professionalism had become common in both the columns of the sporting press and the minutes of the various football associations. Increasingly, professionalism and the professional player were viewed as a threat to the continued existence of amateur association football. From 1882 onward, the Scottish

---

108 “Our Little Embroglio” *Scottish Athletic Journal* 1 no. 3 (15 Sept 1882), 1.
109 “Our Little Embroglio” *Scottish Athletic Journal* 1 no. 3 (15 Sept 1882), 1.
110 “Our Little Embroglio” *Scottish Athletic Journal* 1 no. 3 (15 Sept 1882), 1.
F.A., realizing the threat professionalism posed to the amateur ideal, took a determinedly anti-professional stance, and used its annual conferences to bring increasingly strict legislation down upon the professional player. In this, the S.F.A. was supported by the periodical press, first by the *Scottish Umpire* and the *Scottish Athletic Journal*, and later, though perhaps to a lesser extent, by *Scottish Sport* and the *Scottish Referee.*
Chapter V

MODERNIZATION OUT OF CONTROL - DEBATES ON PROFESSIONALISM

The first major debates surrounding professionalism emerged in the mid-1880s and referred to a system of ‘Drafting’ which was being utilized by clubs to attract new players to their rosters. Drafting was defined by the *Scottish Athletic Journal*, as a “system by which the members of one club are induced to join another, by unfair and unscrupulous influence.”\(^{111}\) The *Scottish Umpire*, also produced an in-depth examination of the ‘Drafting Problem’. Within this discussion, it made clear what was meant by unscrupulous influence: “When those despicable emissaries come over the border, and with the chink of their English gold, lure men from their country to demean themselves and all connected with them by exhibiting themselves on a football field for a few shillings, they are said to be drafted.”\(^{112}\) The journal, however, remained hopeful that “if the disease be so bad, we may find some remedy for it.”\(^{113}\) Despite resistance on behalf of the F.A. in England, with the establishment of anti-professional association by-laws limiting the ability of teams to compete in cup competitions in 1882, and their strengthening in 1884, and an even more ferocious objection by the S.F.A. the onset of professionalism was, by this time, inevitable.

The expansion of Association football in the mid-19\(^{th}\) century had led to an increase in clubs, and in participation generally. While, at the beginning of the century, participation in sport demanded certain social qualifications, the expansion of popular pastimes by middle-class modernisers had expanded access to organised sport and

\(^{111}\) “The Drafting System” *Scottish Athletic Journal* 1 no. 8 (October 20, 1882), 1.
\(^{112}\) “Drafting” *Scottish Umpire* Sept 25, 1884, 3.
\(^{113}\) “Drafting” *Scottish Umpire* Sept 25, 1884, 3.
increasingly stressed its importance in achieving respectability. As noted by Vamplew, this caused problems for middle-class sportsmen who lacked the time to participate in sport without pay, but also feared the corresponding loss of social status caused by ‘idleness’. With the goal of ‘modern’ pastimes including the prevention of the immoral use of time by the middle class itself, the realization that the changing economic situation of the 1880s threatened middle class participation in sport quickly became a concern. If the middle-class amateur was to stay middle-class, he would have to receive at least some form of remuneration, even if it covered his basic expenses when he was unable to work.

While these expenses were initially paid to allow continued middle-class participation in sport, in part by providing economic security to its participants, the introduction of expenses had the unintended consequence of strengthening the hold of professionalism on the Scottish game. It was these expenses which would ultimately pave the way for the introduction of professionalism and the dilution of the middle-class amateur. Indeed, “once expenses of any kind had were paid, then pure amateurism had had its day.” This refers, in part, to the developing practices of “shamateurism”, in which players were compensated for their play through the payment of expenses, often in excess of the actual wages lost, or with highly desired employment at Glasgow’s shipyards. It became increasingly difficult to determine the limits of fair compensation for expenses paid, and many clubs quickly took to paying “expenses” as a means of remunerating players directly for their service.

At the same time, the rise of shamateurism opened participation in the upper levels of Scottish sport to an increasingly large segment of the population, especially to a

114 Vamplew, Pay Up and Play the Game, 199.
115 Vamplew, Pay Up and Play the Game, 199.
working-class who had developed an increasing interest in association football throughout the 19\textsuperscript{th} century. Shamateurism, in effect, allowed the entry of working-class players who lacked the leisure time to effectively practice, travel, and play football at a skilled level. Whereas, under the amateur rules, the educated middle-class and aristocracy were the only groups with leisure time enough to participate in sport, the introduction of remuneration allowed labourers skilled at football to escape the drudgery of the factory and regimented work week.

The increasing ability for working class professionals, afforded with the economic security of ‘expenses’, to participate in sport, is the major factor in the rejection of the professional by the gentleman amateur. As Vamplew notes, “most amateurs could not hope to beat the professionals, and this fear of the loss of their traditional sporting mastery led to actions designed to keep a sport … exclusive to amateur participation.”\textsuperscript{116} The periodical press initially criticized the potential of drafting to limit the growth of the association game. The \textit{Scottish Umpire} argued that “to induce young players to leave their mother club, is an evil so far that young clubs can never – unless by a wholesale pursuit of the same system – rise to any position of prominence.”\textsuperscript{117} The \textit{Scottish Athletic Journal} offered a similar statement, asserting that the “drafting system is most strongly to be condemned, and has led to the ruin of many clubs who last season gave promise of accomplishing big things this.”\textsuperscript{118} In both cases, the removal of young players from developing clubs to more successful ones is portrayed as detrimental to the growth and

\textsuperscript{116} Vamplew, \textit{Pay Up and Play the Game}, 199.
\textsuperscript{117} “Drafting” \textit{Scottish Umpire} September 25, 1884, 3.
\textsuperscript{118} “Association Notes” \textit{Scottish Athletic Journal} 1 no. 3 (September 5\textsuperscript{th}, 1882), 2.
success of new clubs, and as a consequence, to the growth of association football as a whole.

The primary targets of this criticism were, of course, the English clubs. The *Scottish Athletic Journal* made little effort to withhold this criticism, attributing the rise of drafting to the English who “in order to improve their reputation, get a good name and be above their neighbours, have resorted to means which are far from honest.”  

Under pressures from clubs already practicing professionalism, the English F.A. fully relented on professionalism, legalising it in 1885. The legalisation of the professional in England ensured that the drafting issue became increasingly pressing for the organisers of Scottish football. Despite the stance of many of its commentators, the *Scottish Umpire* published an add for a Lancashire football club seeking a “first class centre and right-wing player,” in an 1888 edition of their paper. In fact, the *Umpire* had accepted advertisements from English clubs practicing “shamateurism” as early as 1884, indicated by a *Scottish Athletic Journal* column which noted with disapproval that such an ad had appeared in the columns of a contemporary. Regardless of the rivalry inherent between competing periodicals, by the mid 1880s, there existed a very real threat of Scottish players leaving for professional clubs in England.

The first Scotch player is recorded as having joined a Lancashire club in 1879, a fact attributed by the *Scottish Athletic Journal* to the “great progress the English have made in the Association game.” It was the superiority and dominance of the English F.A. which the Scottish F.A. fervently sought to avoid. With the increasing loss of Scotch

119 “The Drafting System” *Scottish Athletic Journal* 1 no. 8 (October 20, 1882), 1.
120 “Club Advertisements” *Scottish Umpire* October 23, 1888.
121 “The Drafting System” *Scottish Athletic Journal* 1 no. 8 (October 20, 1882), 1.
122 “The Drafting System” *Scottish Athletic Journal* 1 no. 8 (October 20, 1882), 1.
players to English clubs, and the corresponding loss of skilled players registered in the
Scottish Association, the S.F.A. took to passing increasingly stringent laws outlawing
professionalism. One of the first major revisions to the rules on professionalism occurred
in 1885, in reaction to the adoption of professionalism in England. The revised law, as
devised by the S.F.A. read as follows:

a man receiving remuneration for his services shall be disqualified from
playing in any club under the jurisdiction of the S.F.A. for a period of
two years...any club playing a pro shall be deemed a professional club
and expelled from the association; nor can any scotch club play against
a professional club.123

The revision and subsequent enforcement of anti-professional laws in Scotland, led,
within only a few months, to confusion and the first indications of dissent among
Scotland’s more powerful clubs.

The *Scottish Athletic Journal* noted that the new edict had eliminated a loophole
which allowed Scottish clubs to defy the S.F.A.124 In a later article, it would also indicate
a sense of general confusion amongst clubs when it came to matches with English
clubs.125 Whether the rule changes created a sense of confusion, or cut off potentially
lucrative revenue streams, the results were the same. The S.F.A. had limited the ability of
clubs to make profit, and elicited, in various degrees, challenges from various clubs. It
would be the now famed Glasgow Rangers who emerged as one of the earliest
challengers to the laws of the S.F.A.

The Glasgow Rangers were formed in 1872 by a group of men, Moses and Peter
McNeil, Peter Campbell and William McBeath, who, attracted to the new footballing

123 “Modern Athletic Celebrities” *Scottish Athletic Journal* 4 no. 159 (Sept 8, 1885), 9.
124 “Modern Athletic Celebrities” *Scottish Athletic Journal* 4 no. 159 (Sept 8, 1885), 9.
125 “Modern Athletic Celebrities” *Scottish Athletic Journal* 4 no. 163 (Oct 6, 1885), 9.
craze playing out on the Glasgow Green, set out to form a football club. Despite early growing pains, Rangers embarked upon a campaign of constant improvement, and had by 1887, moved to the first Ibrox Park, and were consistently enjoying success in Scottish football.\textsuperscript{126} The Rangers had, by the mid-1880s, effectively issued a challenge to the authority of the S.F.A., and had been practicing forms of “shamateurism” well before the legalisation of professionalism in Scotland. Importantly, Ranger’s ability to subvert the rules of the S.F.A., through the practice of shamateurism and the general exploitation of loopholes in association rules, marks a shift in the balance of power in Scottish popular recreation. By the early 1880s, club management, more concerned with gate income and revenue, had already discarded notions of middle-class morality in favour of economic success.

Of course, the Rangers’ infringements did not go unchallenged, with the club being accused publicly of practicing professionalism on numerous occasions, most vocally by the \textit{Scottish Athletic Journal}. It was this same journal which leapt to the defence of the S.F.A. following its revision of its anti-professional rules. The journal made its position clear, downplaying the ‘pseudo-opposition’ to the recent edict of the S.F.A., and predicting failure for the proposed Rangers’ anti-amateur meeting. The journal continued, levelling further charges of professionalism against the club: “No wonder the Rangers desire professionalism, the club before now paid its players, and one of its present office bearers has been dependent on the bounty of the club.”\textsuperscript{127} While the meeting did not amount to a major challenge to the S.F.A., it foreshadowed a growing discontent with the affairs of the S.F.A. amongst Scotland’s top clubs. More importantly,

\textsuperscript{126} Murray, \textit{The Old Firm}, 13.
\textsuperscript{127}“Modern Athletic Celebrities” \textit{Scottish Athletic Journal} 4 no. 163 (Oct 6, 1885), 9.
this dissent illustrates the fracturing of the middle-class organisers at club level and those who governed football through the machinery of the S.F.A.

By January of 1886, the dissatisfaction of the clubs developed into open action, with Queens Park F.C. (Glasgow), through its representatives on the S.F.A. committee, attempting to breakdown the partition, limiting the ability of amateur clubs to play professionals, the S.F.A. had erected in Scotland.\(^{128}\) This was a dramatic shift in the amateur association game. Queen’s Park was revered by the Scottish Press and remained a dedicated amateur club long after the legalization of professionalism in 1893. Equally surprising were the protests by 3rd Lanark F.C. (Glasgow) against the new rules.\(^{129}\) Lanark, like Queens Park, had long been a bastion of amateurism in Scotland, and was a vocal proponent for the establishment of anti-professionalism rules in the first place. The cause of these rebellions against the S.F.A by Scotland’s foremost clubs were rightly named by the *Scottish Athletic Journal*, which asserted that “the ‘Gate’ consideration is the only one on which the advocates can hope for the success of their effort. Money is at the root of the agitation.”\(^{130}\) Despite the guiding hand of the S.F.A., and the continual reinforcement of the amateur ideal, the issue of gate revenue had increasingly become a concern of the clubs governed by the association. By the 1880s, these clubs, seeking to better their own reputations and increase revenues, had moved from exploiting loopholes in S.F.A. rules and the practice of shamateurism, to vocal calls for the introduction of professionalism in Scotland.

\(^{128}\) “Will it pay?” *Scottish Athletic Journal* 4 no. 179 (Jan 26, 1886), 13.

\(^{129}\) “Will it pay?” *Scottish Athletic Journal* 4 no. 179 (Jan 26, 1886), 13.

\(^{130}\) “Will it pay?” *Scottish Athletic Journal* 4 no. 179 (Jan 26, 1886), 13.
Faced with the threat of individual football clubs challenging the rulings of the S.F.A. against professionalism, the association was all but powerless to respond. Despite increasingly strict anti-professionalism laws, the S.F.A. would ultimately be beholden to the whims of its southern neighbour. The S.F.A. certainly made attempts to assert its independence, for example, when it passed numerous anti-Professionalism edicts. Meanwhile, the *Scottish Athletic Journal* noted that “[The S.F.A.] acted independently of either England, Ireland, or Wales… [and] asserted her right to deal as she thought proper with what she believed was an evil – killing the game within her border.”\(^{131}\) Despite this resistance, the S.F.A. ultimately lacked the financial means to support itself and remained dependent on the financial success of its cup games and international matches. By 1886, the S.F.A. was in a dire financial situation and awaited its next international match against England with the hope of once again filling its ailing coffers. \(^{132}\) Of this, the English F.A. was keenly aware. The *Scottish Athletic Journal* astutely observed that “England is no doubt using the knowledge it has of the financial position of the S.F.A. as a lever to force it to give way, and should Scotland do so, it will not be because she has changed her position on professionals, but because her financial position may be rendered more satisfactory.”\(^{133}\) With the inability to ensure the financial returns demanded by business minded football clubs, the S.F.A. position as a bastion of amateurism became increasingly untenable.

As with Scottish football clubs, and later the Scottish Football Association, the once vocally anti-professional newspapers were forced to increasingly adopt more

\(^{131}\) “Will it pay?” *Scottish Athletic Journal* 4 no. 179 (Jan 26, 1886), 13.

\(^{132}\) “Modern Athletic Celebrities” *Scottish Athletic Journal* 4 no. 178 (Jan 19, 1886), 9.

\(^{133}\) “Modern Athletic Celebrities” *Scottish Athletic Journal* 4 no. 178 (Jan 19, 1886), 9.
sympathetic views towards the paid player, if only to maintain the bottom line. Like the clubs, the papers became increasingly involved in new economic relationships with growing working-class readership. The success of the *Scottish Referee* was, in part, due to its accessible format, and broad coverage of both amateur and professional viewpoints. As early as 1888, the *Scottish Referee*, offered an area in which professional football could be discussed. For instance, the newspaper observed that “the amateurs have had a good innings, and every weekly paper is devoted to the advancement of the amateur, pure and untainted... while the noble army of pros has no medium in which their doings may be discussed.”

The commentator would continue, noting that “this anomalous state of matters is no longer to exist, and in the columns of the Scottish Referee will be found from week to week brief notices and conversational remarks on all that concerns ... our interests.” While, of course, the *Referee* did not immediately support the paid player, the grudging acceptance of this journal, at least, was marked by an increased willingness to entertain the professional point of view.

A March 28, 1892 article published in the *Scottish Referee*, for instance, illustrates the ‘Professional View’, and discussed the inevitability of professionalism in Scotland. The author notes “that the majority of players in the leading city and provincial clubs are in favour of the legalisation of professionalism in Scotland has already been ascertained, and were the matter entirely in these clubs’ hand, the adoption of professionalism would soon become an accomplished fact.” The author continued, asserting that, “such a consummation is much to be desired, for it would then dispel that

---

134 “Among the Professionals” *Scottish Referee*, 12 November 1888, 4.
135 “Among the Professionals” *Scottish Referee*, 12 November 1888, 4.
136 “Professionalism” *Scottish Referee*, March 28, 1892, 1.
shadow of suspicion which for a long time has been lurking in thousands of minds… that
practices the reverse of honest (sic) and not in accordance with true sportsmanship are
rampant in our midst.”137 In this, it would appear that the middle-class modernizer
accomplished his task, and while not preserving the ideal of gentlemanly amateur,
nevertheless instilled a grander appreciation for sportsmanship and gentlemanly
behaviour.

By early 1894, a year after the official adoption of professionalism in Scotland,
the successor to the *Scottish Athletic Journal* and *Umpire*, *Scottish Sport* provided a
generally positive review of the professional game. Noting that “professionalism is now a
year old, and since its birth it has done an immense amount of good to Scottish football.
Peace and contentment have all along followed in its train, and the anxiety which used to
fill our minds regarding players has vanished…”138 A far cry from the pointed attacks of
the fervently anti-professional *Scottish Athletic Journal*, the Scottish periodical press of
the 1890s had adopted a more balanced and accepting view of professionalism and
knowing ultimately that the battle for amateurism had been lost, turned its focus
elsewhere.

What had originated as a middle-class driven mission to create uniform and
controlled popular recreations which carried with them notions of Victorian respectability
and ‘Muscular’ Christianity had evolved far beyond the expectations of its middle-class
organisers. In striving to control the machinery of the mass spectator sport which they
championed, the middle class was met with dissent and resistance by the clubs that
governed sport at its most basic level. Instead of reinforcing the hegemony of amateur

---

137 “Professionalism” *Scottish Referee*, March 28, 1892, 1.
athletes, and solidify middle-class claims to the arena of sport, middle class organiser opened sport to an ever-increasing number of people.

The working class proved to be a critical force in the development of professional football. Armed with a newfound appreciation for athletics and organised sport, as well as the budget for leisure time activities, the working-class began to participate in organised sport, both as athletes and as patrons to the increasingly popular and powerful football clubs based in Scotland’s industrial heartland. This participation is best reflected by the economic growth that was made clear in the reports of Glasgow’s major clubs. By 1894, *Scottish Sport* showed that Rangers had gained a revenue of over £6,956, and saw a balance in hand of £170, an £154 increase over the previous year. The profits made by Rangers would allow for the acquisition of the first Ibrox, in 1887, but even that proved inadequate to handle the increasing attendance, and Rangers moved to its present site in 1899.

Celtic F.C. enjoyed even more financial success in the late 19th century, with revenues increasing from £6,500 in 1894 to a British record profit of £10,142 only two years later. With this economic success, Celtic management increasingly toyed with the idea of reforming Celtic from a charitable organisation to a profit-oriented business. This suggestion was voiced at every general meeting from 1893 until 1897, when Celtic converted to a limited liability company. By the turn of the century, both *Scottish Sport* and the *Scottish Referee* openly commented on the ever-increasing returns made by the two clubs.

---

139 “The Celtic Annual General Meeting” *Scottish Sport* May 8, 1894, 10.
Often, they would turn to comic illustrations, like this, from the 24 August 1900 edition of *Scottish Sport*:

>'Nothing succeeds like success'. 'Mr. Secretary Maley: “Leave this to me”'. *Scottish Sport*, 24 August 1900

Fig. 1
While illustrating the greed of the dominant football clubs, the shift in focus by the periodical press further illustrates the shift to mass consumer culture. Clubs were no longer attacked for their breaches of middle-class moral code and respectability. Instead, the once fervent discussion over the preservation of the amateur ideal had been replaced with discussions of the revenues of the respective clubs and candid observations of the financial success of clubs like Rangers and Celtic.

Expressed in the Scottish periodical press as the issue of gate income, the need for ever-increasing returns became an ever-present concern in modern sport. Its increasing importance is also indicative of the dramatic shift occurring in popular sport during the period between 1870 and 1890. By the mid-1890s, the middle-class organiser and club management had formed an entirely new, economic relationship with working class supporters, and gained a new appreciation for the economic potential of an increasingly solvent and leisurely working class. What had once existed as a tool for reaffirming Victorian respectability was quickly transitioning into a new form of popular culture, fuelled largely by the demands of an increasingly engaged working class.

The role of the periodical press in creating a working class actively engaged in consuming popular culture cannot be overstated. Eisenstein establishes that, prior to mass literacy, public affairs generally involved a speech or address, which people had to actively attend and listen. For Benedict Anderson, author of *Imagined Communities*, the newspaper is a logical extension of the printed book which is sold on a colossal scale.
while retaining its ephemeral popularity.\textsuperscript{144} The mass readership and ephemeral nature of the newspaper press, continues Anderson “creates [an] extraordinary mass ceremony.”\textsuperscript{145} The newspaper reader, observing exact replicas of his own paper being consumed by his subway, barbershop, or residential neighbours, is continually reassured that the imagined world is visibly rooted in everyday life.\textsuperscript{146} While the newspaper reader consumed print culture in the privacy of his own mind, he remains aware that the “ceremony he performs is being replicated by thousands of others of whose existence he is confident, yet of whose identity he has not the slightest notion.”\textsuperscript{147} Active consumption of the periodical press by an ever increasing number of working class Scots gave rise to common practices, shared experiences, and, ultimately, a sense of identity and belonging.

While the newspapers and periodical press established a sense of belonging, and indeed, the communal nature of football as a popular recreation, it was the football clubs of Glasgow’s industrial heartland which most effectively took advantage of the need for identity and belonging. Rangers and Celtic effectively offered membership in something greater which attracted a mass working class following. For the masses of Irish working-class members inhabiting Scotland’s industrial heartland, Celtic F.C. became a logical source for identity and community, allowing Irish Catholic faced with discrimination at the hands of the dominant Protestant Scot, to utilize football to express his own identity. Football, and supporting Celtic provided an opportunity to remedy political and social

\textsuperscript{144}Benedict Anderson, \textit{Imagined Communities Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism} (New York: Verso, 2016), 34.
\textsuperscript{145} Anderson, \textit{Imagined Communities}, 35.
\textsuperscript{146} Anderson, \textit{Imagined Communities}, 35-36.
\textsuperscript{147} Anderson, \textit{Imagined Communities}, 35.
disadvantages, with a victory over the Rangers often compensating many supporters for their miserable wages.  

Likewise, Rangers F.C., faced with an increasingly bitter rivalry with Celtic, was increasingly perceived as a bastion of Scottish Protestantism, a notion supported by the notable unionist popular identity that formed part of its early character and its historical refusal to sign players of the Roman Catholic faith. As a result, Rangers quickly assumed the mantle of the ‘protestant’ club, and consequently commanded immense loyalty from protestant working class Scots. When, in 1896, Scottish Sport noted the dominance in Scotland of two Irish teams and asked where the Scottish team was that could challenge them, it was quickly assumed that Rangers would issue such a challenge.  

By appealing to both traditional religious divisions which had prevalent in Glasgow since the waves of Irish catholic immigration in the 1840s, and to the working-class ethic which had come to define Glasgow’s industrial landscape, clubs like Rangers and Celtic offered new ways in which to consume popular culture. The working-class origins of the two clubs provided a sense of comradery and belonging that previous clubs dedicated to a foreign amateur ideal, like Queens Park, could never establish. Likewise, the Scottish F.A., though reluctant to accept the professional player, could not afford to sacrifice the increasing gate incomes associated with playing against the professional. Nor could the governing body of Scottish football ignore the demands of increasingly

148 Koller and Brandle, Goal! 149.
powerful and economically successful clubs like Rangers and Celtic. While the S.F.A. fought wholeheartedly, through legislation, anti-professional edicts, and the periodical press, for the preservation of the amateur game in Scotland, it soon became victim to the economic realities inherent in the shift of sport from regional pastime to mass consumer industry.
CONCLUSION

The middle-class modernisation attempts of the mid-nineteenth century met with an entirely unexpected set of results. Though the modernisers were nominally successful in eliminating localised traditional pastimes, they grossly underestimated the pulls of identity and belonging which were exerted by the football clubs that developed because of efforts to popularise association football as a mass spectator, popular sport. By the early 1890s, the S.F.A. which once existed to protect the amateur sporting ideal was little more than a slave to the demands of increasingly popular and financially successful football clubs, the likes of Rangers and Celtic.

The rise of these football clubs marked both the failure of the middle-class modernizer to assert its authority over popular leisure, and paved the way for the club affiliations identity, and sectarian politics which continues to dominate any discussion of Scottish football during the twentieth century. Despite their failure, these reformers played an integral role in the establishment of modern mass consumer sport in Scotland. While the amateur athletics clubs and the football associations they originally created to re-assert the ideals of respectability and middle-class masculinity failed in their initial goal, they succeeded in popularizing the association game in Scotland.

Likewise, the Victorian sporting press, despite its eventual failure as both an advocate for amateurism and as a commercial venture, nevertheless succeeded in securing the interest of thousands of working class Scots, providing near constant access to a larger community, and assuring football’s continued success as a mass consumer industry. An examination of the period between 1870 and 1890 reveals a distinctly Victorian set of social concerns. At the same time, it illustrates the changing role of the
working-class consumerism, and of the continued ability of sport to act as a mechanism for the assertion of social values, and more importantly, as an arena for the creation and solidification of identity. By examining the oftentimes overlooked intersection between the redefinition of popular leisure in Britain, and the rise of association football in Scotland it is hoped that this paper has contributed to the broader understanding of football and popular culture in Scotland.
Bibliography


Bailey, Peter. "Will the Real Bill Banks Please Stand up?" Towards a Role Analysis of Mid-Victorian Working-Class Respectability,” *Journal of Social History* 12, no.3 (Spring, 1979): 336-353.


Primary Sources

*The Scottish Athletic Journal*, 1882-1888

*The Scottish Referee*, 1888-1894

*The Scottish Umpire and Cycling Mercury*, 1884-1888

*Scottish Sport*, 1888-1894

*Blackwood’s Edinburgh Magazine*, 1901

Web Resources


**Vita Auctoris**

Alastair Staffen

**Date of Birth:** 1992

**Education:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Degree</th>
<th>Institution</th>
<th>Location</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2006-2010</td>
<td></td>
<td>Vincent Massey Secondary School. Windsor, Ontario, Canada</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010-2015</td>
<td>Bachelor of Arts (Honours) History,</td>
<td>University of Windsor. Windsor, Ontario, Canada</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015-2018</td>
<td>Master of Arts History,</td>
<td>University of Windsor, Windsor, Ontario, Canada</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>