

12-21-2022

Intersectionality in the Lives and Works of Mary Ann Shadd and Henry Bibb

Karleigh R. Kochaniec
University of Windsor, kochani@uwindsor.ca

Follow this and additional works at: <https://scholar.uwindsor.ca/gljuh>



Part of the [History Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Kochaniec, Karleigh R. (2022) "Intersectionality in the Lives and Works of Mary Ann Shadd and Henry Bibb," *The Great Lakes Journal of Undergraduate History*. Vol. 8: Iss. 1, Article 5.
Available at: <https://scholar.uwindsor.ca/gljuh/vol8/iss1/5>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Undergraduate History Collections at Scholarship at UWindsor. It has been accepted for inclusion in The Great Lakes Journal of Undergraduate History by an authorized editor of Scholarship at UWindsor. For more information, please contact scholarship@uwindsor.ca.

Abstract

Throughout the mid- to late nineteenth century, Henry Bibb and Mary Ann Shadd were highly accomplished and recognized abolitionists. Both Shadd and Bibb worked in the Detroit-Windsor region and resided in Windsor-Essex for a number of years. As part of their efforts, Shadd (*The Provincial Freeman*) and Bibb (*The Voice of the Fugitive*) were editors of their own newspapers that were targeted towards educating and informing Freedom Seekers. The abolitionists often worked together but also had a fair share of differences. Pre-existing research discusses the works of Shadd and Bibb, and the differences they demonstrated through their efforts, but little attention has been paid to how these differences were influenced by their lived experiences. This essay will use the individual lives and identities of Shadd and Bibb to observe the varying opinions and views as expressed in their newspapers. These conclusions will help determine how their identities influenced individuals who may have supported their views.

When it comes to research regarding well-known activists, often they are presented as being the same, holding similar opinions and agreeing on how they plan to fight for their cause. What is often overlooked are divisions within these activists' communities, not only among its leaders but also members of the public. In the case of Mary Ann Shadd and Henry Bibb, both were Black abolitionists throughout the 1850s in the Windsor-Essex region who used the respective newspapers that they edited to publish anti-slavery materials.¹ One should also know that within these papers, Shadd and Bibb presented different ideas on how to achieve equality.² When studying these differences, it is important to understand how gender and class influenced their varying opinions on specific subjects. The respect held by both Shadd and Bibb within their community also meant that their ideas often influenced the public in various ways. However, Bibb and Shadd had major differences when it came to their views on how to achieve equality. The two often disagreed on how reliant the Black community should be on monetary assistance, such as government grants.³ Bibb and Shadd also disputed whether the Black community should integrate into, or separate themselves from, white society.⁴

Much of the existing literature on this topic either discusses Bibb and Shadd separately or will only mention certain aspects of their feud. These articles do not consider how their positionalities and experiences affected their views, as well as how the public interpreted them. This is evident in articles by Shirley Yee and Carolyn Calloway-Thomas, which discuss the opinions and upbringing of Shadd with occasional references to her disagreements with Bibb.⁵ Other scholars like Afua Cooper and Fred Landon focus on Bibb's life and the views he expressed as a leader in the abolitionist movement.⁶ Authors such as Calloway-Thomas and Landon fail to compare the experiences and actions of both figures, but rather examine their lives separately.

Shadd and Bibb lived within a close proximity, often interacted with one another, and shared many of the same readers.⁷ This type of analysis is important as it will also highlight how their differences may have affected the public.⁸ Often when discussing the abolitionist movement in the Windsor-Essex region, Bibb and Shadd are grouped together as one entity, but that fails to acknowledge the differences they held. In order to understand the overall movement and how Shadd and Bibb viewed it differently, one must consider their identities. Experiences shape personal views, which correlate to one's intersecting identities. Mary Ann Shadd and Henry Bibb's lived experiences are influential in determining why they had opposing views on the issues of assimilation and self-reliance, while also influencing members of the public who shared similar identities.

¹ Elizabeth Cali, "'Why does not somebody speak OUT?': Mary Ann Shadd Cary's Heteroglossic Black Protofeminist Nationalism," *Vitae Scholasticae* 32, no. 2 (2015): 34-35; Afua Cooper, "The Fluid Frontier: Blacks and the Detroit River Region: A Focus on Henry Bibb," *Canadian Review of American Studies* 30, no. 2 (2000): 139.

² Cali, "Why does nobody speak OUT?," 34-35.

³ Shirley J. Yee, "Finding a Place: Mary Ann Shadd Cary and the Dilemmas of Black Migration to Canada, 1850-1870," *Frontiers: A Journal of Women Studies* 18, no. 3 (1997): 4-5, 7-8.

⁴ Shirley J. Yee, "Finding a Place," 4-5, 7-8.

⁵ Yee, "Finding a Place;" Carolyn Calloway-Thomas, "Mary Ann Shadd Cary: Crafting Black Culture Through Empirical and Moral Arguments," *The Howard Journal of Communications* 24, no.3 (2013).

⁶ Cooper, "The Fluid Frontier;" Fred Landon, "Henry Bibb, a Colonizer," *The Journal of Negro History* 5, no. 4 (1920).

⁷ Cali, "Why does nobody speak OUT?," 39.

⁸ Cali, "Why does nobody speak OUT?," 39.

This essay will provide background information on the lives of Shadd and Bibb, as well as demonstrate how their views differed throughout the abolitionist movement. Several of the sources used refer to Bibb's autobiography *Narrative of the Life and Adventures of Henry Bibb: An American Slave*, and Shadd's pamphlet *A Plea for Emigration; or Notes of Canada West*, in addition to their respective newspapers.⁹ Much of the background information provided within these articles is important to understanding why Shadd and Bibb had different opinions and how their identities influenced those beliefs. In addition to this, articles within Henry Bibb's *The Voice of the Fugitive* and Mary Ann Shadd's *The Provincial Freeman*, that were published between 1851 and 1857 will be used. Shadd and Bibb's individual newspapers demonstrate their opposing opinions and many of the articles within these works showcase their own views. One must also note that not every article within these newspapers may have been written by Bibb or Shadd, but they chose to put these articles in their publications, which can be telling of their personal views. The sources being used to conduct this research are influential in the sense that they will present the intersecting identities of both Shadd and Bibb, as well as allow for a feminist perspective. This analysis will use intersectionality, which is a framework that acknowledges one can face varying and simultaneous forms of discrimination based on one's multiple identities in ways that are unique to each individual.¹⁰ Using intersectionality to look at their opinions will also allow for insight into how they may have influenced the public.

This paper begins by discussing the upbringings and backgrounds of Mary Ann Shadd and Henry Bibb. This section of the work will consider how Shadd and Bibb had contrasting experiences, thus influencing their work as abolitionists later in life. Next, the debates surrounding the integration or separation of a Black settlement will be analyzed through Shadd and Bibb's newspapers. By observing the differences in opinions they showed through *The Voice of the Fugitive* and *The Provincial Freeman*, one can see how their intersecting identities are influential in the formation of these opinions. Following this, the essay will explore how Bibb and Shadd expressed their views of self-reliance in their respective newspapers. This portion of the work will also consider their intersecting identities and upbringings to better understand their views. The paper will conclude with a discussion regarding the debates surrounding temperance within *The Voice of the Fugitive* and *The Provincial Freeman*. This section will focus on how, despite Bibb and Shadd demonstrating similar views on the issue, one can still see the distinctions in their motives to support temperance, which can once again be brought back to their upbringings and identities. The inconsistencies in opinions between Mary Ann Shadd and Henry Bibb regarding assimilation and self-reliance, as expressed in their respective newspapers, can be attributed to their intersecting identities. Their contrasting experiences and identities can also indicate what groups of people were supportive of, or influenced by, each individual.

Henry Bibb was born an enslaved person in 1815 in the state of Kentucky.¹¹ Because of his status, Bibb was denied an education as a child and spent much of his life looking for ways to escape the institution of slavery.¹² Throughout his life, Bibb made several attempts to escape

⁹ Jane Rhodes, *Mary Ann Shadd Cary: The Black Press and Protest in the Nineteenth Century* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1998), 35, 43.

¹⁰ Kimberle Crenshaw, "Demarginalizing the Intersection of Race and Sex: A Black Feminist Critique of Antidiscrimination Doctrine, Feminist Theory and Antiracist Politics," *University of Chicago Legal Forum*, (1989): 149.

¹¹ Landon, "Henry Bibb, a Colonizer," 438.

¹² Landon, "Henry Bibb, a Colonizer," 438.

slavery but was often recaptured to be thrown into prison and later sold to a new enslaver.¹³ Bibb was eventually able to escape to the North in 1841 and later resettled in Detroit, Michigan the following year.¹⁴ Throughout this process of escaping slavery, Bibb was permanently separated from his wife and child.¹⁵ At this time, he began lecturing on abolition and joining several anti-slavery societies.¹⁶ Bibb later remarried to Mary Miles, and in 1850, after the passing of the Fugitive Slave Act, they settled in Sandwich, Ontario.¹⁷ He was involved in many projects to help grow the Black community, such as the Refugee Home Society, and developed a reputation as a leader in the abolitionist movement.¹⁸

Bibb's position as a previously enslaved person meant that he had few economic and educational opportunities.¹⁹ In his early years, he faced a great deal of abuse and after escaping slavery, it was more likely that he would have difficulty establishing a stable life. This differs greatly from Shadd, who received an education and was born as a free middle-class Black individual.²⁰ Although Bibb faced more difficulties when it came to his lack of formal education and economic status, he received privileges because of his gender. Bibb is described as having quickly gained popularity and respect in his position as an abolitionist leader and lecturer within his community.²¹ His position as a man must be taken into consideration when it comes to his influence within the community because Shadd was not granted the same privilege. This respect and credibility can also be argued as partially due to his status as a previously enslaved person, which further complicates his positionality.²²

Mary Ann Shadd was born as a free Black woman in 1823 in the state of Delaware.²³ Her parents were involved with both the American Colonization Society and the Underground Railroad; therefore, she had some understanding of the experiences faced by previously enslaved individuals.²⁴ At the age of ten, Shadd and her family moved to Pennsylvania where she was able to attend school, which allowed her to become a teacher later on in life.²⁵ When she became a teacher, the expectation set for her by her family and community was that she would use her privileges to uplift less fortunate Black individuals.²⁶ She also was well educated on political matters and emigration.²⁷ As a young adult, Shadd met Henry Bibb and his wife Mary.²⁸ The Bibb's invited her to teach in Canada and she eventually settled in Sandwich in 1851.²⁹ Once she

¹³ Landon, "Henry Bibb, a Colonizer," 439-440.

¹⁴ Rhodes, *Mary Ann Shadd Cary*, 34; Cooper, "The Fluid Frontier," 136.

¹⁵ Rhodes, *Mary Ann Shadd Cary*, 34.

¹⁶ Cooper, "The Fluid Frontier," 136.

¹⁷ Cooper, "The Fluid Frontier," 139; Rhodes, *Mary Ann Shadd Cary*, 34-35. Sandwich later becomes part of present-day Windsor.

¹⁸ Cooper, "The Fluid Frontier," 139; Rhodes, *Mary Ann Shadd Cary*, 34-35.

¹⁹ Landon, "Henry Bibb, a Colonizer," 438.

²⁰ Calloway-Thomas, "Crafting Black Culture," 244-245.

²¹ Cooper, "The Fluid Frontier," 139.

²² Rhodes, *Mary Ann Shadd Cary*, 57.

²³ Rhodes, *Mary Ann Shadd Cary*, 9; Carol B. Conway, "Racially Integrated Education: The Antebellum Thought of Mary Ann Shadd Cary and Frederick Douglass," *Vitae Scholasticae* 27, no. 2 (2010): 87.

²⁴ Rhodes, *Mary Ann Shadd Cary*, 9; Conway, "Racially Integrated Education," 87.

²⁵ Calloway-Thomas, "Crafting Black Culture," 244-245.

²⁶ Rhodes, *Mary Ann Shadd Cary*, 19.

²⁷ Conway, "Racially Integrated Education," 88.

²⁸ Conway, "Racially Integrated Education," 88; Rhodes, *Mary Ann Shadd Cary*, 34.

²⁹ Conway, "Racially Integrated Education," 88; Rhodes, *Mary Ann Shadd Cary*, 34.

moved to Sandwich, she established a school with the intention of educating Black and white students.³⁰ Shadd became passionate about the emigration of Freedom Seekers from the United States to Canada, particularly following the passing and enforcement of the Fugitive Slave Act of 1850.³¹

Although Shadd was privileged in the sense that she was well educated and had economic capital, she still faced discrimination because of her identity as a Black woman.³² Shadd faced criticism as a female public speaker with strong opinions.³³ Not only did she face oppression because of her race, but she also faced gender-based discrimination by other Black individuals for being ‘unladylike’ while unapologetically voicing her opinions on the abolitionist movement.³⁴ For example, Elizabeth Cali’s pre-existing work used the publications of Henry Bibb and Frederick Douglass to demonstrate how Shadd’s work was often discredited and described as harsh.³⁵ Ultimately, Mary Ann Shadd experienced both privileges and disadvantages when it came to her identity. Aspects such as her gender led her to being viewed negatively and treated differently by other abolitionists because she did not fit into the traditional ideal of a woman at the time. Despite this, she knew she was a trailblazer and encouraged other women to do the same.³⁶ Although she faced a great deal of discrimination, it is important to understand the economic and intellectual privileges she held, as well as how those opportunities affected her ideas and the way others viewed her. This will be important in understanding the possible reasons for her disagreements with Bibb. Their intersecting identities will be important when examining their opposing perspectives as they were likely impacted by this. Their identities also shaped how their beliefs may have been viewed by the public.

The first major difference concerning the opinions of Mary Ann Shadd and Henry Bibb was their stance on whether Black people should be separate from white society or integrate themselves into the larger pre-existing society. Bibb took a separatist approach to the debate and believed that if Black people were to separate themselves from white society, they would achieve equality much easier than by trying to assimilate.³⁷ Bibb had envisioned a future in Canada in which there would be a distinct colony of Black individuals who would settle on a large plot of land that was purchased from the government.³⁸ This can be seen through his efforts with the Refugee Home Society, where farmland bought by the Society would be sold to refugees in order to establish their own community.³⁹ Bibb’s opinion on separatism is also clear in an article entitled “Coloured Settlement,” which was published in his newspaper *The Voice of the Fugitive* in 1851.⁴⁰ This article expresses the desire to create a settlement for Black individuals where lots would be sold, and a separate church and school would also be established.⁴¹

³⁰ Conway, “Racially Integrated Education,” 88; Rhodes, *Mary Ann Shadd Cary*, 36-37.

³¹ Calloway-Thomas, “Crafting Black Culture,” 245.

³² Cali, “Why does not somebody speak OUT?,” 33.

³³ Cali, “Why does not somebody speak OUT?,” 34

³⁴ Cali, “Why does not somebody speak OUT?,” 34-35.

³⁵ Cali, “Why does not somebody speak OUT?,” 33-35.

³⁶ Rhodes, *Mary Ann Shadd Cary*, 222.

³⁷ Avonie Brown, “Links and Lineage: The Life and Work of Mary Ann Shadd in Media, a Black Feminist Analysis” (Master’s Thesis, University of Windsor, 1994), 71.

³⁸ Landon, “Henry Bibb, a Colonizer,” 442.

³⁹ Rhodes, *Mary Ann Shadd Cary*, 41-42.

⁴⁰ Henry Bibb, “Coloured Settlement,” *The Voice of the Fugitive* (Windsor, ON), January 29, 1851.

⁴¹ Bibb, “Coloured Settlement.”

Shadd took a different approach from Bibb and encouraged previously enslaved individuals to assimilate into white society.⁴² She viewed Black settlements as temporary, and believed that the only way to form a permanent identity within Canada and establish equality was through assimilation.⁴³ Shadd also saw assimilation into Canadian society as a way for white and Black people to become exposed to one another, therefore developing a sense of respect for each other.⁴⁴ Unlike Bibb, Shadd opposed separate settlements because she believed they created a false and stereotypical image of previously enslaved individuals, which the larger white society frowned upon.⁴⁵ Her pro-assimilationist views were evident in an article in *The Provincial Freeman* that was published in 1857 and outlined the duties of Black men.⁴⁶ It addressed how in order to gain the same rights as white individuals, people of colour should adopt the dominant culture in the region in an attempt to ‘prove’ themselves worthy.⁴⁷ The article even states that Black individuals have the duty to “become as thoroughly British as they can,” thus proving that they can be equal.⁴⁸ Shadd makes her stance very clear within her newspaper and even states that she would rather do what is right than be popular.⁴⁹

When comparing the opinions of Bibb and Shadd, their ideas can be linked back to their intersecting identities. When looking at how Bibb believed it would be easier to be separate than integrated into white society, one must consider Bibb’s previous experiences as an enslaved person.⁵⁰ When reckoning with Bibb’s early life, it makes sense for him to hold the views he had, bearing in mind the atrocities he would have faced growing up as an enslaved person. Someone who faced abuse at the hands of white people may be less willing to assimilate and live peacefully with those who contribute to their oppression. This push towards separatism has been argued to be a utopian response to the atrocities enslaved individuals faced, as well as an attempt to escape further oppression.⁵¹ In this case, it is much more likely that Bibb’s views may resonate with other previously enslaved individuals who also faced abuse at the hands of white people. Bibb’s identity as a former enslaved person would allow him to empathize with newcomers in Canada who would much rather distance themselves through a separate community for people of colour.

When it comes to Shadd’s views on assimilation, one must consider her identity as a free Black woman.⁵² Although Shadd faced racial oppression and prejudice growing up as a Black woman, it would not have been to the same extent as an enslaved person who experienced much more extreme forms of oppression. This perhaps would make her more willing to assimilate into white society and make some sacrifices in order to attain equality. Other Black people who were born free may have been more likely to side with Shadd’s views on this debate. The fact that Shadd’s

⁴² Yee, “Finding a Place,” 7.

⁴³ Yee, “Finding a Place,” 8.

⁴⁴ Conway, “Racially Integrated Education,” 89.

⁴⁵ Calloway-Thomas, “Crafting Black Culture,” 250.

⁴⁶ Shadd, “The Duties of Coloured Men in Canada,” *The Provincial Freeman* (Chatham, ON), April 25, 1857.

⁴⁷ Shadd, “The Duties of Coloured Men in Canada.”

⁴⁸ Shadd, “The Duties of Coloured Men in Canada.”

⁴⁹ Shadd, “The Duties of Coloured Men in Canada.”

⁵⁰ Brown, “Links and Lineage,” 71; Landon, “Henry Bibb, a Colonizer,” 438.

⁵¹ Roger Hite, “Voice of a Fugitive: Henry Bibb and Ante-Bellum Black Separatism,” *Journal of Black Studies* 4, no. 3 (1974): 281-282.

⁵² Conway, “Racially Integrated Education,” 87.

article, “The Duties of Coloured Men in Canada,” also explains it is better to do what is right than to do what is popular shows that she is aware that her opinion will not be received well by many within the community.⁵³ This can be linked to her being less respected as a female abolitionist because women were generally expected to stay out of the public sphere and remain quiet about their opinions. Shadd’s identity as being born free makes it more likely for her to garner support from other Black individuals who were also born free, thus possibly creating a divide within the community.

The second difference in opinion that is clear within Bibb and Shadd’s work as abolitionists are their views on reliance. When it came to establishing communities and providing aid to newly arrived refugees, Bibb often turned to government-sponsored grants, which would go towards building schools and churches.⁵⁴ Through the Refugee Home Society, he would also use government grants to provide land and housing for Freedom Seekers in the settlement he wanted to establish.⁵⁵ This is also evident within an article in *The Voice of the Fugitive* that explains how Bibb wants to create a permanent settlement and, in order to do so, go to England where he would secure a government grant.⁵⁶ What is important to note on Bibb’s perspective of this issue is he wanted to secure these grants for permanent housing rather than temporary ones.⁵⁷ Therefore, in Bibb’s case, he is more reliant on the government, as the homes being built with the funds would be a part of a permanent settlement.

On the other hand, Shadd was adamant about Black individuals being self-reliant, and openly opposed Bibb accepting government-sponsored grants.⁵⁸ She felt that accepting government grants would stereotype Black people negatively, just as she believed the same with separate settlements.⁵⁹ Shadd viewed accepting government grants as begging, which creates a reliance on the government in order to sustain their Black settlement.⁶⁰ This is made clear within her newspaper, which bears the slogan: “self-reliance is the true road to independence.”⁶¹ Within *The Provincial Freeman*, there is also an article that discusses the importance of self-reliance and how it would help prove that Black people were productive members of society and in turn, deserving of freedom.⁶² The article further explains that previously enslaved individuals should receive assistance upon arrival in Canada, but that help should remain temporary because there is no reason for able-bodied men to not be working.⁶³ This article shows that Shadd believed that Freedom Seekers should look for ways to become self-reliant, as, in her opinion, it was part of the process of achieving equality through integration.⁶⁴

⁵³ Shadd, “The Duties of Coloured Men in Canada.”

⁵⁴ Yee, “Finding a Place,” 4.

⁵⁵ Landon, “Henry Bibb, a Colonizer,” 442.

⁵⁶ Henry Bibb, “For the Liberty Party Paper. The Canadian Refugee,” *The Voice of the Fugitive* (Windsor, ON), April 23, 1851.

⁵⁷ Bibb, “For the Liberty Party Paper.”

⁵⁸ Yee, “Finding a Place,” 4-5.

⁵⁹ Calloway-Thomas, “Crafting Black Culture,” 250.

⁶⁰ Conway, “Racially Integrated Education,” 89.

⁶¹ Mary Ann Shadd, “Prospectus of the Provincial Freeman and Daily Advertiser,” *The Provincial Freeman* (Chatham, ON), May 31, 1856.

⁶² Mary Ann Shadd, “Fugitive Slaves in Canada,” *The Provincial Freeman* (Toronto, ON), March 25, 1854.

⁶³ Shadd, “Fugitive Slaves in Canada.”

⁶⁴ Shadd, “Fugitive Slaves in Canada.”

When looking at the debates regarding self-reliance, the upbringings and economic backgrounds of Bibb and Shadd can provide reasoning for their disagreements. Due to the fact that Bibb was born into slavery and had to find ways to support himself after having escaped, he was able to empathize with refugees and may have wanted to provide more permanent support to newcomers.⁶⁵ This differs immensely from Shadd, who grew up in a middle-class family, and therefore may not have faced as much economic hardship after moving to Canada.⁶⁶ Her stance on providing temporary support and pushing for self-reliance is most likely tied to her economic status.⁶⁷ With this information, it is likely that people who were Freedom Seekers, that had recently arrived in Canada, were more likely to share the same views as Bibb. This is because they shared similar experiences and required assistance in order to establish themselves in a new place. One must also recognize how Shadd looks at accepting grants as ‘begging,’ which shows the possibility of her ignorance towards the economic status of those who recently escaped slavery.⁶⁸ Others who had more economic capital or who had already been established within Canada for quite some time would most likely agree with Shadd’s views on the issue. They may also believe in self-reliance due to their ability to rely on their own wages.

Although Henry Bibb and Mary Ann Shadd encountered many differences when it came to their personal beliefs about how Black individuals in Canada should go about their lives, they did share some opinions. One of those shared opinions included their views on the temperance movement and how it is intertwined with abolition. Bibb promoted events around temperance in his newspaper, in which various speakers were featured to discuss the issue and how it affected abolition.⁶⁹ He even placed ads within *The Voice of the Fugitive* that were inquiring about hiring a travelling temperance worker.⁷⁰ Temperance was also discussed throughout *The Provincial Freeman*, explaining how crimes were often a result of intoxication, and how increased crime rates result in higher taxes, which will then go to the criminal justice system.⁷¹ Shadd also encouraged temperance because she thought it would demonstrate how people of colour saw themselves as equal and wanting that to be acknowledged by the white population.⁷²

Although Bibb and Shadd both agreed on the issue of temperance, one can still see the differences behind their reasoning and how they related back to their opposing views. In hiring a temperance worker and holding temperance festivals, Bibb was educating Freedom Seekers and providing them with an income, much like how he tried to help them through government grants and permanent housing.⁷³ Shadd emphasized temperance because it showed the public that Black people were deserving of equality, much like how she also felt self-reliance and integration would prove them to be equal.⁷⁴ Although they shared similarities, one can still see the

⁶⁵ Cooper, “The Fluid Frontier,” 136.

⁶⁶ Calloway-Thomas, “Crafting Black Culture,” 244-245.

⁶⁷ Shadd, “Fugitive Slaves in Canada.”

⁶⁸ Conway, “Racially Integrated Education,” 89.

⁶⁹ Henry Bibb, “Temperance Festival,” *The Voice of the Fugitive* (Windsor, ON), March 12, 1851.

⁷⁰ Afua Cooper, “‘Doing Battle in Freedom’s Cause:’ Henry Bibb, Abolitionism, Race Uplift, and Black Manhood, 1842-1854,” (PhD diss., University of Toronto, 2000), 324

⁷¹ Mary Ann Shadd, “Intemperance-What it [...] and What it Causes,” *The Provincial Freeman* (Toronto, ON), April 15, 1854.

⁷² Lorene Bridgen, “On Their Own Terms: Temperance in Southern Ontario’s Black Community (1830-1860),” *Ontario Historical Society* 101, no. 1 (2009): 74.

⁷³ Bibb, “For the Liberty Party Paper. The Canadian Refugee.”

⁷⁴ Shadd, “The Duties of Coloured Men in Canada”; Shadd, “Fugitive Slaves in Canada.”

differences behind their motives, and how those were influenced by their intersecting identities. This reflects their opposing views on the decision to integrate into white society and issues of self-reliance.

Due to their intersecting identities, Mary Ann Shadd and Henry Bibb held opposing views that they publicly shared. Shadd and Bibb felt differently about the Black community assimilating into the larger white, Canadian society. They also disagreed on how self-reliant previously enslaved individuals should be, thus likely influencing members of the public who shared similar identities to them. While the two had one common goal of achieving equality for Black people and agreed on certain matters such as temperance, it is also important to note where their ideas diverged.⁷⁵ When coming to an overall conclusion about their differences in views and efforts concerning abolition, Bibb can be seen as more pragmatic than Shadd, who had more radical ideals.⁷⁶ When reflecting on their positionalities using an intersectional framework, one can see the reasons as to why Bibb was more pragmatic and Shadd was more radical. This demonstrates the importance of using an intersectional lens when conducting historical research.

Although Bibb and Shadd had different opinions, some being more respected than others, it is also important to note that they should not be demonized for their respective views. These opinions were a product of their upbringing and lived experiences, which would then go on to influence others who could relate to them. Neither activist held opinions that were inherently wrong, they were just different approaches to the same problem. Often grand narratives and mainstream histories present all abolitionists and Black activists as being the same. These narratives and histories also fail to address the tensions that existed between these individuals. Remaining ignorant to differences such as these, is to overlook how the abolitionist movement was experienced and perceived differently by Black individuals.

⁷⁵ Cooper, "Doing Battle in Freedom's Cause," 324; Bridgen, "On Their Own Terms," 74.

⁷⁶ Rhodes, *Mary Ann Shadd Cary*, 45.

Bibliography

- Bibb, Henry. "Coloured Settlement." *The Voice of the Fugitive* (Windsor, ON), January 29, 1851.
- Bibb, Henry. "For the Liberty Party Paper. The Canadian Refugee." *The Voice of the Fugitive* (Windsor, ON), April 23, 1851.
- Bibb, Henry. "Temperance Festival." *The Voice of the Fugitive* (Windsor, ON), March 12, 1851.
- Bridgen, Lorene. "On Their Own Terms: Temperance in Southern Ontario's Black Community (1830-1860)." *Ontario Historical Society* 101, no. 1 (2009): 64-82.
- Brown, Avonie. "Links and Lineage: The Life and Work of Mary Ann Shadd in Media, a Black Feminist Analysis." Master's Thesis, University of Windsor, 1994.
- Calloway-Thomas, Carolyn. "Mary Ann Shadd Cary: Crafting Black Culture Through Empirical and Moral Arguments." *The Howard Journal of Communications* 24, no.3 (2013): 239-256.
- Cali, Elizabeth. "'Why does not somebody speak OUT?': Mary Ann Shadd Cary's Heteroglossic Black Protofeminist Nationalism." *Vitae Scholasticae* 32, no. 2 (2015): 32-48.
- Conaway, Carol B. "Racially Integrated Education: The Antebellum Thought of Mary Ann Shadd Cary and Frederick Douglass." *Vitae Scholasticae* 27, no. 2 (2010): 86-104.
- Cooper, Afua. "'Doing Battle in Freedom's Cause': Henry Bibb, Abolitionism, Race Uplift, and Black Manhood, 1842-1854." PhD diss., University of Toronto, 2000.
- Cooper, Afua. "The Fluid Frontier: Blacks and the Detroit River Region: A Focus on Henry Bibb." *Canadian Review of American Studies* 30, no. 2 (2000): 129-150.
- Crenshaw, Kimberle. "Demarginalizing the Intersection of Race and Sex: A Black Feminist Critique of Antidiscrimination Doctrine, Feminist Theory and Antiracist Politics." *University of Chicago Legal Forum*, (1989): 139-167.
- Hite, Roger. "Voice of a Fugitive: Henry Bibb and Ante-Bellum Black Separatism." *Journal of Black Studies* 4, no. 3 (1974): 269-284.
- Landon, Fred. "Henry Bibb, a Colonizer." *The Journal of Negro History* 5, no. 4 (1920): 437-447.
- Rhodes, Jane. *Mary Ann Shadd Cary: The Black Press and Protest in the Nineteenth Century*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1998.

- Shadd, Mary Ann. "Fugitive Slaves in Canada." *The Provincial Freeman* (Toronto, ON), March 25, 1854.
- Shadd, Mary Ann. "Intemperance-What it [...] and What it Causes." *The Provincial Freeman* (Toronto, ON), April 15, 1854.
- Shadd, Mary Ann. "Prospectus of the Provincial Freeman and Daily Advertiser." *The Provincial Freeman* (Chatham, ON), May 31, 1856.
- Shadd, Mary Ann. "The Duties of Coloured Men in Canada." *The Provincial Freeman* (Chatham, ON), April 25, 1857.
- Yee, Shirley J. "Finding a Place: Mary Ann Shadd Cary and the Dilemmas of Black Migration to Canada, 1850-1870." *Frontiers: A Journal of Women Studies* 18, no. 3 (1997): 1-16.