University of Windsor [Scholarship at UWindsor](https://scholar.uwindsor.ca?utm_source=scholar.uwindsor.ca%2Fbiologypub%2F1234&utm_medium=PDF&utm_campaign=PDFCoverPages)

[Biological Sciences Publications](https://scholar.uwindsor.ca/biologypub?utm_source=scholar.uwindsor.ca%2Fbiologypub%2F1234&utm_medium=PDF&utm_campaign=PDFCoverPages) [Department of Biological Sciences](https://scholar.uwindsor.ca/biology?utm_source=scholar.uwindsor.ca%2Fbiologypub%2F1234&utm_medium=PDF&utm_campaign=PDFCoverPages)

3-24-2018

Phenotypic integration of behavioural and physiological traits is related to variation in growth among stocks of Chinook salmon

Mitchel G.E. Dender

Pauline M. Capelle

Oliver P. Love *University of Windsor*

Daniel D. Heath *University of Windsor*

Christina A. Semeniuk *University of Windsor*

Follow this and additional works at: [https://scholar.uwindsor.ca/biologypub](https://scholar.uwindsor.ca/biologypub?utm_source=scholar.uwindsor.ca%2Fbiologypub%2F1234&utm_medium=PDF&utm_campaign=PDFCoverPages) Part of the [Biology Commons](http://network.bepress.com/hgg/discipline/41?utm_source=scholar.uwindsor.ca%2Fbiologypub%2F1234&utm_medium=PDF&utm_campaign=PDFCoverPages)

Recommended Citation

Dender, Mitchel G.E.; Capelle, Pauline M.; Love, Oliver P.; Heath, Daniel D.; and Semeniuk, Christina A., "Phenotypic integration of behavioural and physiological traits is related to variation in growth among stocks of Chinook salmon" (2018). *Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences*, 75, 12, 2271-2279. [https://scholar.uwindsor.ca/biologypub/1234](https://scholar.uwindsor.ca/biologypub/1234?utm_source=scholar.uwindsor.ca%2Fbiologypub%2F1234&utm_medium=PDF&utm_campaign=PDFCoverPages)

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Department of Biological Sciences at Scholarship at UWindsor. It has been accepted for inclusion in Biological Sciences Publications by an authorized administrator of Scholarship at UWindsor. For more information, please contact [scholarship@uwindsor.ca.](mailto:scholarship@uwindsor.ca)

Phenotypic integration of behavioural and physiological traits is related to variation in growth among stocks of Chinook salmon 4 **MITCHEL G.E. DENDER¹, PAULINE M. CAPELLE², OLIVER P. LOVE², DANIEL D.** 5 **HEATH¹, JOHN. W. HEATH³, CHRISTINA A.D. SEMENIUK^{1,}*** 1 *Great Lakes Institute for Environmental Research, University of Windsor, Windsor, Ontario N9B 3P4, Canada* ²*Department of Biological Sciences, University of Windsor, Windsor, Ontario N9B 3P4, Canada* 10 ³ *Yellow Island Aquaculture Ltd., Heriot Bay, BC, Canada V0P 1H0* 12 * Corresponding author. Great Lakes Institute for Environmental Research, University of 13 Windsor, 401 Sunset Ave., Windsor, Ontario, Canada N9B 3P4. Tel.: +1 519 253 3000 ext. 3763 *E-mail address:* semeniuk@uwindsor.ca (C.A.D. Semeniuk)

Running headline: Phenotypic integration benefits salmon growth

19 The selection for a single organismal trait like growth in breeding programs of farmed 20 aquaculture species can counter-intuitively lead to lowered harvestable biomass. We outbred a 21 domesticated aquaculture stock of Chinook salmon (*Oncorhynchus tshawytscha*) with 7 wild 22 stocks from British Columbia, Canada. We then examined how functionally related traits 23 underlying energy management - diel variation in cortisol; foraging, social, and movement 24 behaviours - predicted stock-level variation in growth during the freshwater life history stage, a 25 performance metric under aquaculture selection. Outbreeding generated significant variation in 26 diel cortisol secretion and behaviours across stocks, and these traits covaried, suggesting tight 27 integration despite hybridization. The coupling of nighttime cortisol exposure with daytime 28 behavioural phenotype was the strongest predictor of stock-level variation in body mass. Our 29 results suggest selecting for an integrated phenotype rather than on single mechanistic traits 30 alone can generate the greatest effect on aquaculture fish growth under outbreeding practices. 31 Furthermore, selecting for these traits at the stock level may increase efficiency of farming 32 methods designed to consistently maximize fish performance on a large scale.

33

34 **Key words:** Aquaculture, Behaviour, Diel cortisol, Phenotypic integration, Functional traits, 35 Growth, Chinook salmon,

Page 3 of 32

36 **Introduction**

37 For the first time on record, people are consuming more farm-raised than wild-caught fish 38 (FAO 2016), and urbanization is simultaneously creating a greater demand for both improved 39 quantity and quality protein due to its recognition in healthy diets (Clapp $& Cohen\ 2009$; 40 Henchion et al. 2017). Aquaculture production has been relieving the pressure on wild fish 41 populations by attempting to provide a more sustainable and economic source of protein (FAO 42 2016). However, aquaculture faces the same challenges as other farming practices: to harvest the 43 greatest amount of product at the minimum operator cost. As with any domestication process, 44 fish stocks have the tendency to inadvertently become inbred when only selecting the largest, 45 fastest growing individuals as broodstock (Bentsen & Olesen 2002), thereby becoming 46 susceptible to disease (Arkush et al. 2002), experiencing slower growth (Kincaid 1983), or 47 having low fecundity (Su et al. 1996). (Re)introducing alleles at fertilization is the classic 48 method of lessening the effects of inbreeding depression via the outbreeding of domestic 49 broodstock with wild individuals (Lehnert et al. 2014). First generation (F1) hybrid offspring of 50 wild-caught and domesticated parents may experience benefits associated with outbreeding such 51 as increased size (i.e., hybrid vigour: Gharrett et al. 1999; Whitlock et al. 2000). However, stocks 52 may also experience outbreeding depression (Allendorf et al. 2001; Neff et al. 2011), whereby a 53 shift in mean phenotype occurs and causes a reduction in growth (Tymchuk et al. 2006) and 54 survival (Gharrett et al. 1999; Tallmon et al. 2004; Edmands 2007). These discrepancies can be 55 explained through the evolutionary concept of an integrated phenotype (Murren 2012), which 56 recognizes that optimal functioning of the organism requires multiple traits to work in unison. As 57 such, when genetic recombination disrupts the evolutionary orchestration of integrated traits, 58 individual performance and fitness can be compromised (Lancaster et al. 2010).

59 To enhance the performance of captive stocks, aquaculture producers should ideally be 60 able to assess whether the genotypes selected for outcrossing will maintain the expression of 61 maximal performance metrics such as growth through the continued integration of key 62 phenotypic traits (e.g., traits related to energetic management) that ultimately increase harvest 63 biomass (Tallmon et al. 2004). One of these metrics is the ability to manage energetic 64 homeostasis, both physiologically and behaviourally, since energetic management is widely 65 recognized as critical for maximizing growth in aquaculture (Boisclair and Sirois 1993; 66 Silverstein et al. 1999). In particular, diel management of baseline levels of glucocorticoids is 67 important for overall energetic balance via the optimal timing of fuel mobilization (e.g., glucose, 68 lipids, and fatty acids; Gregory and Wood 1999). Likewise, behavioural traits related to 69 energetics such as aggression, schooling, neophilia, and coping style all directly affect the ability 70 of an individual to acquire, consume, and efficiently convert food to tissue (Gregory and Wood 71 1999; Almazán‐Rueda et al. 2005; Martins et al. 2006). Collectively, physiological and 72 behavioural traits related to energy management are expected to impact fitness (Gilmour et al. 73 2005), yet the linkages among these traits in novel environments remain largely unexplored.

74 Here we apply the framework of phenotypic integration (Ketterson et al. 2009; Lancaster 75 et al. 2010; Murren 2012) to assess the impacts of outbreeding on performance at an important 76 early life-history stage within an emerging model of Pacific salmonid aquaculture (Chinook 77 salmon; *Oncorhynchus tshawytscha*). Specifically, our objectives are to determine whether: 1) 78 outcrossing a domesticated stock with multiple wild populations generates variability in traits 79 expected to impact juvenile growth (e.g., diel cortisol patterns, exposure to cortisol during 80 nighttime and daytime, and behavioural phenotype); 2) physiological and behavioural traits are 81 tightly coupled; and 3) taking an integrative, compared to a traditional, single-trait approach,

Page 5 of 32

82 better predicts variation in growth in an aquaculture setting. We examine these questions using a 83 domesticated stock outbred with wild genotypes from 7 regional populations in coastal British 84 Columbia, Canada. We focused these questions on an early-life stage given the recently 85 highlighted importance of identifying mechanisms controlling early development since these are 86 considered significant for the determination of developmental windows that most impact growth 87 variation and survival (Valente et al. 2013). Given the high degree of local adaptation of 88 semelparous Pacific salmon (Taylor 1991), reflecting the environment-specific functional 89 properties of specific loci (Carlson & Seamons 2008), our chosen system also provides the 90 unique opportunity to examine whether physiology and behaviours associated with energy 91 management become decoupled in a hybrid F1 generation, and whether the expression of energy-92 management phenotypes is optimally related to growth in a novel, captive environment. Given 93 that adaptive covariation between physiology and behaviour should be ultimately linked to 94 performance (McGlothlin et al. 2007), selection for suitable captive phenotypes expressing 95 optimal cortisol-behavioural trait combinations should be critical for producing the ideal farmed 96 fish. As such, we expected hybridized stocks expressing an optimal combination of low daytime 97 baseline cortisol (representing low energetic demand), intermediate nighttime baseline cortisol 98 (representing the ability to mobilize energy without entering stress-induced levels; Mommsen et 99 al. 1999), and favorable energy management behaviours (e.g., high foraging rates, high sociality, 100 and lower movement) to exhibit the largest mean body mass.

102

101

105 **Methods**

106 **Animal husbandry and growth**

107 Research was conducted at Yellow Island Aquaculture Ltd. (YIAL) on Quadra Island, British 108 Columbia (latitude: N 50° 7' 59.124"; longitude: W 125° 19' 51.834"). The YIAL Chinook 109 salmon population originated from crosses made in 1985 from two nearby hatcheries: Robertson 110 Creek (latitude: N 49° 18' 37.8792"; longitude: W 124° 57' 36.4392") and Big Qualicum River 111 (latitude: N 49° 21' 56.3616"; longitude: W 124° 39' 6.2964"). The domesticated YIAL stock has 112 been maintained in captivity for seven generations. In 2013, sires from 7 wild stocks originating 113 from tributaries on Vancouver Island and the lower mainland of British Columbia (Figure 1) 114 were selected for generating outbred crossed stocks with YIAL dams, with an additional YIAL x 115 YIAL stock serving as a control (Semeniuk et al. submitted). Gamete collection and fertilization 116 occurred during October and November of 2013, with milt of 10 males from each stock 117 fertilizing mixed eggs from 17 YIAL dams, who were the offspring of self-fertilization in one 118 functional hermaphrodite, to control for known maternal effects on growth (Heath et al. 1999). 119 After incubation in vertical-stack trays, fry were transferred on March 14, 2014 to 200 L barrels 120 (mean: 122 ± 5 fish per barrel; range: 120-136) split by stock and duplicated to account for barrel 121 effects (n=16 barrels), with a flow through water system maintained between $10-12$ °C and water 122 turnover at 1 L/min. All barrels were cleaned approximately every 7 days and dissolved oxygen 123 was monitored once a week and maintained above 80% saturation. Fish were fed to satiation 8 124 times daily between 8:00am to 5:00pm, and mortalities removed every two days (mean mortality 125 rate (March 26-June 4, 2014): 2.52 ±3.9% per barrel; range: 0-16 fish). For this study, barrels for 126 each stock consisted of a mixture of all 10 families. On June 6, 2014, a random subset of 10–13 127 individual fish were removed from every barrel, individually weighed to the nearest 0.01g, and

128 fish were returned to their original barrel. Body mass at this stage was used as our performance 129 metric to represent early growth from the fry stage, a critical freshwater life-history stage under 130 strong selection in aquaculture (Piper et al. 1982).

131

132 **Blood sampling and cortisol assays**

133 We sampled fish for diel cortisol patterns at 8 months post fertilization, over a three-day period 134 beginning on June 25, 2014. Specifically, six fish from each stock were sampled (alternating 135 between barrel replicates) at 6 time periods across the entire diel cycle for a total sample size of 136 36 fish per stock (Figure 2A). These specific sampling times were chosen to represent both key 137 periods over the 24-hour period where fish have been shown to be active behaviourally and 138 physiologically (Thorpe et al. 1987; Gries et al. 1997; Pavlidis et al. 1999; Bremset 2000), to 139 capture as much finer-scale variation with day- and night-time periods as possible. Fish were 140 captured via dip net, immediately euthanized in a clove oil solution, and blood was collected via 141 caudal severance using heparinized hematocrit tubes. All sampling was completed within 5 142 minutes of the initial disturbance to account for increases in cortisol due to capture and handling, 143 and a given barrel was only sampled once every 24 hours to ensure that individuals had not been 144 disturbed from a previous capture session. Packed red blood cells were then separated from 145 plasma via centrifugation at 14,000 rpm (13,331 g) and plasma was stored at -80˚C until further 146 analyses. Baseline plasma cortisol was determined using a cortisol enzyme-linked 147 immunosorbent assay (Cayman Chemical, MI, USA) optimized in-house for use in juvenile 148 Chinook salmon (Capelle et al. 2016). Samples were run in triplicate across fourteen assay plates 149 at 1:20 dilution. Individual assay plates included standard curves and common control samples,

Page 8 of 32

150 and were read at a wavelength of 412nM using a spectrophotometer (Biotek Inc). Inter- and 151 intra-assay coefficients of variation were 11.0% and 4.6%, respectively.

152

153 **Behavioural analysis**

154 All barrels (2 barrels per stock) were each filmed once over a span of seven days (June 3–10, 155 2014). GoPro cameras (Woodman Labs, USA) were placed on the bottom center of the barrels at 156 ~6:00am and behaviours were recorded for 1.5 hours. At 1 hour post camera deployment, fish in 157 the barrels were fed ~4.2g of feed. Feed amount was calculated using Taplow Feeding charts 158 (Chilliwack, BC, Canada), with daily amounts representing ~2% of the biomass in a barrel to 159 match a satiated growth promotion diet. Behavioural analyses consisted of: assigning a score to 160 the degree of group cohesion, calculating individual swimming velocity, and scoring uniformity 161 of gregarious swimming direction fifteen minutes prior and post the addition of food, at one-162 minute intervals. During food presentation, position and movement of a subset of fish (~60) were 163 noted, as well as latency (in seconds) to resume pre-feeding behaviours (see supplementary 164 materials, Tables S1 and S2). Behavioural videos of the Capilano-River stock were highly 165 distorted due to unforeseen technical issues and thus this population was excluded from all 166 behavioural analysis.

167

168 **Statistical analysis**

169 All analyses were conducted using JMP version 12 (SAS Institute Inc.), except where indicated. 170 Prior to analysis, model assumptions of normality and homogeneity of variances were tested by 171 visual inspection of residual versus predicted plots, and normality was confirmed using the

Page 9 of 32

182

172 Shapiro–Wilk test. Non-normally distributed data were log^{10} transformed where indicated. In all 173 cases, results were evaluated for significance at $\alpha = 0.05$.

174 To describe diel cortisol variation across all stocks, a general linear model with stock, 175 time of day, and their interaction included as fixed effects was used. Cortisol data were $log¹⁰$ 176 transformed to achieve normality. Next, the area under the diel cortisol curve (AUC) was 177 calculated for daytime (6am–6pm) and nighttime (6pm–6am) cortisol (see Figure 2A), following 178 Pruessner et al. (2003) as an estimate of the amount of hormone fish were exposed to 179 (aggregated at the stock level), and as a means to capture the potential different roles of cortisol 180 across the 24-hour cycle. Daytime and nighttime cortisol exposures were pooled separately for 181 each stock but differences were examined using a paired t-test.

183 Behavioural variables from video recordings were grouped *a priori* into three categories with 184 known implications for fish growth and consisting of distinct variables: Foraging, Sociality, and 185 Movement (Fernö et al., 1988; Fernö et al., 1995; Oppedal et al., 2011). A principal component 186 analysis (PCA) with varimax rotation was used for initial exploration of each behavioural 187 category independently to reduce redundancies in the data and to create more homogenous 188 groupings. Each 'factor' extracted explained a minimum of 35% of the variance in behaviour 189 based on the Kaiser criterion (eigenvalue >1) and visual inspection of variance plots (Table S1), 190 and were retained for the second stage of PCA. In the second stage, the rotated factors resulting 191 from each behavioural category were loaded into a PCA to produce an overall behavioural 192 phenotype. This PCA produced only a single component with an eigenvalue score that was >1 193 (eignevalue = 2.3), explained 38.3% of the overall variance, and was used in subsequent models. 194 High positive scores were associated with fish that spent longer time feeding, retained group

For personal use only. This Just-IN manuscript is the accepted manuscript prior to copy editing and page composition. It may differ from the final official version of record.
For personal use only. This Just-IN manuscript For personal use only. This Just-IN manuscript is the accepted manuscript prior to copy editing and page composition. It may differ from the final official version of record.

195 cohesiveness, and collectively exhibited consistent swimming directions, suggestive of more 196 efficient energetic management.

197 To investigate the effects of cortisol and behaviour on growth, analyses were conducted 198 using daytime and nighttime cortisol exposure separately. To first confirm the coupling of 199 cortisol during daytime and nighttime directly with behaviour, we used a linear regression with 200 the behavioural phenotype score regressed against cortisol exposure $(AUC_{night}$ or AUC_{day}). 201 Next, we assessed whether each trait in isolation or in combination influenced size using linear 202 regressions with mean body mass per population as the response variable (from the sub-sample 203 of individuals weighed prior to the experiment and averaged across replicate barrels), and 204 population-level behavioural phenotype with nighttime cortisol exposure (AUC_{night}) or daytime 205 cortisol exposure (AUC_{day}) as the explanatory variables. Both linear and quadratic terms for 206 cortisol and behaviour were used in a subset of models to account for any hormetic relationships 207 (Schreck 2010). For model selection, we used a combination of fit, significance, and AIC 208 modified for small sample size (AICc) using the package "AICcmodavg" in R (Mazerolle and 209 Mazerolle 2017).

210

217

211 All analyses were aggregated to the level of the population since screening at the individual level 212 is not necessarily a feasible practice within aquaculture (Castanheira et al. 2013; Pigliucci, 2003). 213 Instead, determining whether integrated phenotypes exist at the population level is not only 214 practical, but since intraspecific variability influences fundamental evolutionary processes of 215 adaptation (Bennett et al. 2016), it also increases the potential that the desired phenotypes will 216 remain robust under the stresses of captivity in subsequent generations.

218 **Results**

219 **Variation in diel cortisol and behaviour among stocks**

220 Stock and time of day interacted to influence baseline cortisol levels $(F_{47,279} = 14.01, n = 280, p <$ 221 0.001). While each stock showed similar diel rhythms in their baseline cortisol (Figure 2A), they 222 differed in overall exposure to cortisol across the full 24-hour cycle (Figure 2B). In addition, 223 daytime cortisol exposure was significantly lower than nighttime exposure (*paired* $t(6) = 5.59$, *p* 224 < 0.001). The behavioural phenotype scores for different stocks ranged from –1.88 (Nitinat) to 225 2.23 (Chilliwack), and were additionally composed of differences in the contributions of each 226 independent behavioural trait (Figure 2C).

227

228 **Integrated effects of cortisol and behaviour on growth**

229 Daytime cortisol exposure had a negative linear relationship with behavioural phenotype $(R^2 =$ 230 0.64, $p = 0.031$; Figure 3), while nighttime cortisol exposure showed no such relationship (R^2 = 231 0.12, $p = 0.44$). As univariate predictors of performance, nighttime cortisol exposure and 232 behavioural phenotype each showed a non-linear, hormetic relationship with body mass (cortisol: 233 $R^2 = 0.94$, $p = 0.003$, AICc = 6.1; quadratic regression: body mass = (4.44 - 0.002*(AUC_{night} – 234 $(75.31)^{\degree}$ 2); (behaviour: R^2 = 0.95, p = 0.003, AICc = 5.8, quadratic regression: body mass = 235 $(4.03 - (0.12 * behaviour²))$. AUC_{day} had no effect on body mass (linear or quadratic 236 relationships; R^2 < 0.4, *p*-values > 0.36, AICc's > 11.0). However, the inclusion of both 237 nighttime cortisol exposure and behaviour increased the model's predictive ability and its 238 weighting to explain variation in body mass, with stocks exhibiting mid-range in nighttime 239 cortisol exposure and high energy-management behaviours having the largest body masses $(R^2 =$ 240 0.998, $p = 0.07$, AICc = -143.3; Figure 4A). There was no meaningful or significant integration

Page 12 of 32

241 of daytime cortisol exposure with behavioural phenotype on body mass. All models tested are 242 included in Table S3.

244 **Discussion**

243

245 Rapid human population growth and increases in anthropogenic stressors on wild ecosystems 246 require improved efficiency in alternative food-production systems such as aquaculture to keep 247 pace with world demand for protein (Green et al. 2005). However, aquaculture practices such as 248 selecting for fast growing individuals can inadvertently decrease stock genetic diversity and/or 249 co-select for undesirable traits that will ultimately impact production (Castanheira et al. 2017). 250 We sought to determine whether outbreeding a domesticated Chinook salmon stock with 251 multiple wild populations resulted in the optimal integration of physiological and behavioural 252 traits at the nexus of energetic management, and if this integration lead to maximized 253 performance at an early-life freshwater stage. Outbreeding generated significant variability in 254 physiological and behavioural traits that are associated with energetic management and known to 255 impact growth. As predicted by the theory of phenotypic integration (Murren 2012), growth was 256 influenced by a coupling of nighttime cortisol exposure and behavioural phenotype, specifically 257 with intermediate cortisol values and high energy-management behaviours combining to 258 generate an optimized hormetic relationship to maximize body size. Our results also suggest that 259 examining the effects of the co-variation of multiple functionally related traits on body mass is a 260 stronger approach than examining these traits in isolation. Moreover, relationships that exist 261 between phenotypic traits such as daytime cortisol exposure and behaviour do not imply 262 integration (and by extension maximized performance), highlighting that only within the context 263 of a performance measure can phenotypic integration be revealed. While phenotypic correlations

264 among traits have been extensively studied, fewer have been examined in light of performance-265 or fitness outcomes, and fewer still across multiple populations. This is the first study to show 266 how among-population coupling of physiological and behavioural traits can influence early-life 267 metrics such as growth rate (here measured as body mass), considered important in assessing 268 long-term success in aquaculture (Valente et al. 2013). This work therefore suggests that 269 researchers and producers may benefit from determining how phenotypic integration impacts 270 early-life performance when employing methods such as outbreeding to enhance or rescue 271 breeding programs.

272

273 **Impacts of outcrossing on variability in performance-mediated traits**

274 Optimal management of energy budgets over both short- and long-term periods within the 275 constraints of local environmental variation is expected to maximize fitness (Fong 1975; Taylor 276 1991; Sanford & Kelly 2011), a critical consideration for production output in aquaculture 277 (Akvaforsk 2005). Outbreeding in our study produced substantial variation in diel physiological 278 and behavioural traits central to daily energetic management. We focused on diel variation in 279 baseline cortisol because it can differentially affect growth by regulating metabolic processes and 280 promoting homeostasis in fish (Mommsen et al. 1999). In diurnal vertebrates, an optimal diel 281 cortisol cycle consists of high levels early in the morning to provide the energy via 282 gluconeogenesis following night fasting (Dallman et al. 1993), to initiate foraging and other 283 activities (Astheimer et al. 1992; Breuner et al. 1999; Breuner and Hahn 2003). Levels then tend 284 to decline for the remainder of the day to avoid the "high cost of living" associated with 285 maintaining high baseline circulating glucocorticoid levels (Sapolsky et al. 2000; Bernier et al. 286 2004). Although our data confirm that all populations showed strong diel rhythms in baseline

287 cortisol, populations nonetheless differed significantly in patterns of cortisol exposure during 288 night and day. Outbreeding also generated a range in behavioural traits associated with energetic 289 management, and when combined with differences in cortisol exposure, revealed certain stocks 290 to be less ideally suited to captive environments as evidenced by the resultant low body size.

291 The differences observed among stocks are presumably driven by large sire effects that 292 result from genetic differences among the source stocks that have arisen through local adaptation 293 and potentially genetic drift (Fraser et al. 2011). The sire effect would have dominated possible 294 dam effects among stocks given that we used a common inbred line of domestic dams to both 295 minimize maternal effects and equalize any influences across all stocks (as eggs were also 296 pooled). Within our study, not all hybrid stocks showed high performance. While there are many 297 possible causes of this pattern of reduced performance, one may be the poor performance of the 298 F1 generation is due to the intermediate phenotypes generated by hybridization which are 299 unsuited to the domestic parental environments (Frankham et al. 2002; McClelland & Naish 300 2007). Another mechanistic cause of lowered performance in hybrid stocks may be intrinsic 301 outbreeding depression due to the disruption of epistatic interactions in large co-adapted gene 302 complexes (Edmands 1999); however, we do not believe this to be the case since previous 303 studies have shown Chinook salmon F1 hybrids of genetically different parental lines 304 demonstrate no evidence of hybrid breakdown (Lehnert et al. 2014). Instead, suboptimal 305 performance of juvenile Chinook salmon of certain stocks most likely reflects local adaptation of 306 performance traits within freshwater systems that are very important for the success of early life-307 history stages of anadromous, semelparous salmonids (Waples 1991). When different genotypes 308 are raised in common environments, the impacts of these locally adapted phenotypes persist and 309 are known to generate significant variation in performance outcomes (McClelland & Naish

314

310 2007), and so deliberate selection of these tightly integrated traits will be robust past the F1 311 generation and persist through multiple generations. However, the potential for non-additive 312 genetic effects coupled with residual epigenetic effects may interfere with the predictable 313 inheritance of some of the traits measured.

315 **Effects of outcrossing on the outcome of phenotypic integration under novel captive** 316 **conditions**

317 Traditionally, researchers have focussed on single traits rather than multi-trait combinations to 318 predict fitness or performance of wild populations (Gilmour et al. 2005; Killen et al. 2013). 319 However, since traits that depend on common mechanisms for their expression may evolve as a 320 unit (McGlothlin & Ketterson 2008), ignoring the potential for synergistic effects of integrated 321 phenotypes on performance can limit our appreciation of their adaptive value (Pigliucci 2003; 322 Ketterson et al. 2009; Laughlin & Messier 2015). In our study, examining interactions between 323 physiology and behaviour suggested that daytime cortisol exposure predicted behavioural 324 phenotype in a simple linear fashion, setting up the expectation that both would interact to 325 impact growth. However, an integrated phenotypic approach revealed it was the combination of 326 exposure to nighttime cortisol and behaviour that was the best predictor of maximized growth 327 across the 7 stocks, with stocks having mid-range nighttime cortisol exposure and maximal 328 energetics behaviour exhibiting the highest body mass (Figure 4A).

329 Chronically high cortisol levels are known to negatively impact behavioural traits such as 330 foraging and competitive ability due to a reduction in appetite (Gregory $& Wood 1999$) and can 331 inhibit aggression and locomotion in salmonids (Øverli et al. 2002). As such, prolonged exposure 332 can lead to tertiary responses such as slow growth, reduced immune function, and compromised

333 survival (Pickering & Pottinger 1983; Barton 2002). In our study, stocks with individuals that 334 expressed elevated daytime cortisol exposure may have incurred these behavioural costs that led 335 to reduced growth. During nighttime, when fish were not fed and feeding activity was much 336 reduced (Fraser & Metcalfe 1997), cortisol plays a more direct role in growth: elevated baseline 337 levels maintain energetic homeostasis, allowing stored glycogen in the liver (generated from 338 food consumed and digested during the day) to be mobilized as glucose to fuel the maintenance 339 and growth of tissues (see Dallman et al. 1993). Behaviours that promote energy gain while 340 reducing energetic costs of locomotion (including sociality) are generally assumed to lead to the 341 highest growth (e.g., foraging efficiency: Eklöv, 1992; high cohesiveness: Johnsson 2003). 342 Interestingly, as a sole (univariate) measure, these maximized behaviours seemingly had a 343 counter-intuitive, negative effect on growth (i.e., significant hormetic relationship), and yet as an 344 integrated unit with physiology, these same behaviours conferred the greatest performance. We 345 therefore argue that an integrated approach situated within a performance context is needed to 346 understand how underlying traits will ultimately impact performance in aquaculture. We also 347 demonstrate that with this integrated relationship - visualized as a contour plot (Figure 4B), there 348 exists the potential for further selection of integrated traits to maximize production. For instance, 349 *actively* selecting for specific behaviours (i.e., greater locomotory-, foraging efficiency, and 350 sociality) - should these traits remain co-varied within a physiological range, can result in even 351 greater mass gains than those observed. This integrated selection approach at the stock level can 352 be of value for other performance traits (such as disease resistance) and in other breeding 353 programs, outside of salmon culture: it is not only feasible for farming methods that must 354 routinely document production data of functional traits and performance on a large scale, but can 355 be used to possibly increase efficiency as well.

Page 17 of 32

356 **Conclusions**

357 While phenotypic integration can increase organismal performance by optimizing the adaptive 358 phenotype over evolutionary time, it may decrease flexibility in a changing environment 359 (Schlichting 1989). This apparent trade-off is an important realization for evolutionary biologists 360 and applied producers since both robust and flexible phenotypes carry costs due to (1) the 361 potential for a "mismatched" phenotype to a given environment (Hendry 2004; Nosil et al. 2005) 362 and (2) the associated energetic costs of flexibility (DeWitt et al. 1998; Snell-Rood 2013), 363 respectively. In fact, with regards to food production, abrupt changes in environment (e.g., from 364 the wild to captivity, or fresh water to salt water) may better suit a less flexible and instead a 365 more integrated phenotype, as the temporal lag in endocrine activity and its associated 366 behavioural response may be too slow (and take several generations) to adaptively respond to 367 changing conditions (Taff & Vitousek 2016). Since the management of cortisol is intimately 368 involved in the osmoregulatory transition of fish from fresh to salt water (rev. in McCormick 369 2012), we would predict that (above and beyond energetic management) a tighter integration 370 between cortisol and behaviour could also result in a less costly transition. Taken together, 371 appreciating population-level effects associated with integrated energetic management has the 372 ability to better inform researchers and aquaculture producers about early-life stage mechanisms 373 that influence variation in growth and survival (Valente et al. 2013), and that can also undergo 374 intentional selection for increased food production long-term.

376

For personal use only. This Just-IN manuscript is the accepted manuscript prior to copy editing and page composition. It may differ from the final official version of record.
For personal use only. This Just-IN manuscript For personal use only. This Just-IN manuscript is the accepted manuscript prior to copy editing and page composition. It may differ from the final official version of record.

377 **Acknowledgements**

378 We thank Yellow Island Aquaculture Ltd, especially Dr. Ann Heath, J. Drown and the YIAL

379 staff (N. Antoniolli, K. Jones, E. Haugen and D. Meester) for fish care and providing the

380 facilities for the experiments. We also thank C. Harris and K. Janisse for lab assistance, and all

381 field volunteers. This manuscript was improved by the input of three anonymous reviewers. We

382 thank the Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council (NSERC) of Canada for Strategic

383 Partnership Grant and Discovery Grant funding to DDH, OPL, and CADS, and the Canada

384 Research Chairs program for funding to OPL. All research followed the University of Windsor

385 Animal Care Committee guidelines (AUPP #13-22) for the care and use of animals and complied

386 with the Canadian Council on Animal Care guidelines.

387 **References** 388 Akvaforsk Å. 2005 Selection and breeding programs in aquaculture. Gjedrem T, editor. 389 Dordrecht: Springer. 390 Allendorf FW, Leary RF, Spruell P, Wenburg JK. 2001 The problems with hybrids: setting 391 conservation guidelines. *Trends Ecol. Evol.* **16**, 613–622. (doi:10.1016/S0169- 392 5347(01)02290-X) 393 Almazán‐Rueda P, Van Helmond ATM, Verreth JAJ, Schrama JW. 2005 Photoperiod affects 394 growth, behaviour and stress variables in *Clarias gariepinus*. *J. Fish Biol.* **67,** 1029– 395 1039. (doi:10.1111/j.0022-1112.2005.00806.x) 396 Arkush KD, Giese AR, Mendonca HL, McBride AM, Marty GD, Hedrick PW. 2002 Resistance 397 to three pathogens in the endangered winter-run chinook salmon (*Oncorhynchus* 398 *tshawytscha*): effects of inbreeding and major histocompatibility complex genotypes. 399 *Can. J. Fish Aquat. Sci.* **59,** 966–975. (doi:10.1139/f02-066) 400 Astheimer LB, Buttemer WA, Wingfield JC. 1992 Interactions of corticosterone with feeding, 401 activity and metabolism in passerine birds. *Ornis Scand.* **23**, 355–365. 402 (doi:10.2307/3676661) 403 Barton BA. 2002 Stress in fishes: a diversity of responses with particular reference to changes in 404 circulating corticosteroids. *Integr. Comp. Biol.* **42**, 517–525. (doi:10.1093/icb/42.3.517) 405 Bennett MG, Whiles MR, Whitledge GW. 2016 Population level responses of life history traits 406 to flow regime in three common stream fish species. *Ecohydrology* **9**,1388-1399. 407 Bentsen HB, Olesen I. 2002 Designing aquaculture mass selection programs to avoid high 408 inbreeding rates. *Aquaculture* **204**, 349–359. (doi:10.1016/S0044-8486(01)00846-8)

409 Bernier NJ, Bedard N, Peter RE. 2004 Effects of cortisol on food intake, growth, and forebrain 410 neuropeptide Y and corticotropin-releasing factor gene expression in goldfish. *Gen.* 411 *Comp. Endocrinol.* **135**, 230–240. (doi:10.1016/j.ygcen.2003.09.016) 412 Boisclair D, Sirois P. 1993 Testing assumptions of fish bioenergetics models by direct estimation 413 of growth, consumption, and activity rates. *T. Am. Fish Soc.* **122**, 784–796. 414 (doi:10.1577/1548-8659) 415 Bremset, G. 2000 Seasonal and diel changes in behaviour, microhabitat use and preferences by 416 young pool-dwelling Atlantic salmon, *Salmo salar*, and brown trout, *Salmo trutta*. *Env.* 417 *Biol. Fishes.* **59,** 163–179. (doi:10.1023/A:100769131) 418 Breuner CW, Hahn TP. 2003 Integrating stress physiology, environmental change, and behavior 419 in free-living sparrows. *Horm. Behav*. **43**, 115–123. (doi:10.1016/S0018-506X(02)00020- 420 X) 421 Breuner CW, Wingfield JC, Romero LM. 1999 Diel rhythms of basal and stress-induced 422 corticosterone in a wild, seasonal vertebrate, Gambel's white-crowned sparrow. *J. Exp.* 423 *Zool.* **284**, 334–342. (doi:10.1002/(SICI)1097-010X(19990801)284:3<334::AID-424 JEZ11>3.0.CO;2-#) 425 Capelle PM, Semeniuk CAD, Sopinka NM, Heath JW, Love OP. 2016 Prenatal stress exposure 426 generates higher early survival and smaller size without impacting developmental rate in 427 a Pacific salmon. *J. Exp. Zool. Part A* **325**, 641–650. (doi:10.1002/jez.2058) 428 Carlson SM, Seamons TR. 2008 A review of quantitative genetic components of fitness in 429 salmonids: implications for adaptation to future change. *Evol. Appl.* **1**, 222–238. 430 (doi:10.1111/j.1752-4571.2008.00025.x)

432 personality in fish? Searching for consistency over time and across contexts. *PLoS One.*

453 Fernö A, Furevik DM, Huse I, Bjordal Å. 1988 A multiple approach to behaviour studies of 454 salmon reared in marine net pens. ICES.

455 Fernö A, Huse I, Juell J-E, Bjordal Å. 1995 Vertical distribution of Atlantic salmon (*Salmo salar*

456 L.) in net pens: trade-off between surface light avoidance and food attraction.

457 *Aquaculture* **132**, 285–296. (doi:10.1016/0044-8486(94)00384-Z)

- 458 Frankham R, Briscoe DA, Ballou JD. 2002 Introduction to conservation genetics. Cambridge 459 University Press.
- 460 Fraser NH, Metcalfe NB. 1997 The costs of becoming nocturnal: feeding efficiency in relation to 461 light intensity in juvenile Atlantic salmon. *Funct. Ecol.* **11**, 385–391.

462 (doi:10.1046/j.1365-2435.1997.00098.x)

463 Fraser DJ, Weir LK, Bernatchez L, Hansen MM, Taylor EB. 2011 Extent and scale of local 464 adaptation in salmonid fishes: review and meta-analysis. *Heredity* **106**, 404–420. 465 (doi:10.1038/hdy.2010.167)

466 Fong H. 1975 Animal physiology: adaptation and environment. *Yale J. Biol. Med.* **48**, 262–263.

467 Gharrett AJ, Smoker WW, Reisenbichler RR, Taylor SG. 1999 Outbreeding depression in 468 hybrids between odd-and even-broodyear pink salmon. *Aquaculture* **173**, 117–129.

469 (doi:10.1016/S0044-8486(98)00480-3)

470 Gilmour KM, Wilson RW, Sloman KA. 2005 The integration of behaviour into comparative 471 physiology. Physiol. Biochem. Zool. 78, 669–678. (doi:10.1086/432144)

472 Green RE, Cornell SJ, Scharlemann JP, Balmford A. 2005 Farming and the fate of wild nature.

473 *Science* **307**, 550–555. (doi:10.1126/science.1106049)

Page 23 of 32

496 (doi:10.1016/0044-8486(83)90402-7)

497 Lancaster LT, McAdam AG, Sinervo B. 2010 Maternal adjustment of egg size organizes 498 alternative escape behaviors, promoting adaptive phenotypic integration. *Evolution* **64**, 499 1607–1621. (doi:10.1111/j.1558-5646.2009.00941) 500 Laughlin DC, Messier J. 2015 Fitness of multidimensional phenotypes in dynamic adaptive 501 landscapes. *Trends Ecol. Evol.* **30**, 487–496. (doi:10.1016/j.tree.2015.06.003) 502 Lehnert SJ, Love OP, Pitcher TE, Higgs DM, Heath DD. 2014 Multigenerational outbreeding 503 effects in Chinook salmon (*Oncorhynchus tshawytscha*). *Genetica* **142,** 281–293. 504 (doi:10.1007/s10709-014-9774-5) 505 Martins CIM, Schrama JW, Verreth JAJ. 2006 The effect of group composition on the welfare of 506 African catfish (*Clarias gariepinus*). *Appl. Anim. Behav. Sci.* **97**, 323–334. 507 (doi:10.1016/j.applanim.2005.07.003) 508 Mazerolle MJ, Mazerolle MM. 2017. Package 'AICcmodavg'. 509 McClelland EK, Naish KA. 2007 What is the fitness outcome of crossing unrelated fish 510 populations? A meta-analysis and an evaluation of future research directions. *Conserv.* 511 *Genet.* **8**, 397–416. (doi:10.1007/s10592-006-9178-x) 512 McCormick, SD. 2012 Smolt physiology and endocrinology. *Fish Physiol.* **32,** 199-251. 513 (doi:0.1016/B978-0-12-396951-4.00005-0) 514 McGlothlin JW, Jawor JM, Ketterson ED. 2007 Natural variation in a testosterone‐mediated 515 trade‐off between mating effort and parental effort. *Am. Nat.* **170**, 864–875. 516 (doi:10.1086/522838) 517 McGlothlin JW, Ketterson ED. 2008 Hormone-mediated suites as adaptations and evolutionary 518 constraints. *Philos. T. Roy. Soc. B* **363**, 1611–1620. (doi:10.1098/rstb.2007.0002)

Page 25 of 32

eord.

544 Pruessner JC, Kirschbaum C, Meinlschmid G, Hellhammer DH. 2003 Two formulas for 545 computation of the area under the curve represent measures of total hormone 546 concentration versus time-dependent change. *Psychoneuroendocrino.* **28**, 916–931. 547 (doi:10.1016/S0306-4530(02)00108-7)

548 Sanford E, Kelly MW. 2011 Local adaptation in marine invertebrates. *Annu. Rev. Mar. Sci.* **3**, 549 509–535. (doi:10.1146/annurev-marine-120709-142756)

550 Sapolsky RM. 2000 Stress hormones: good and bad. *Neurobiol. Dis.* **7**, 540–542. 551 (doi:10.1006/nbdi.2000.0350)

552 Schlichting CD. 1989 Phenotypic integration and environmental changes. *BioScience* **39**, 460– 553 464.

554 Schreck CB. Stress and fish reproduction: the roles of allostasis and hormesis. 2010 *Gen. Comp.* 555 *Endocrinol.* **165**, 549–556. (doi: 10.1016/j.ygcen.2009.07.004)

556 Semeniuk CAD, Capelle P, Dender M, Devlin R, Dixon B, Drown J, Heath J, Hepburn R, Higgs

557 D, Janisse K, Lehnert S, Love O, Mayrand J, Mickle M, Pitcher T, Neff B, Semple S,

558 Smith J, Toews S, Wellband K, Venney C, Heath D. submitted Domestic-wild

559 hybridization to improve aquaculture performance in Chinook salmon. *Aquaculture*

560 Silverstein JT, Shearer KD, Dickhoff WW, Plisetskaya EM. 1999 Regulation of nutrient intake 561 and energy balance in salmon. *Aquaculture* **177**, 161–169. (doi:10.1016/S0044-

562 8486(99)00076-9)

587 interconnected populations. *Heredity* **84**, 452–457. (doi:10.1046/j.1365-

588 2540.2000.00693.x)

590 **Figure 1.** Map of British Columbia, Canada showing the source of wild Chinook salmon stocks 591 used for outbreeding in the study. A captive, inbred stock was used as the basis for all crosses 592 and is held at Yellow Island Aquaculture Ltd. Colours: Bright green – YIAL; purple – Robertson 593 Creek; orange – Quinsam River; pink – Puntledge River; light blue –Nitinat River; dark blue – 594 Chilliwack River; dark green – Capilano River; red –Big Qualicum River.

597 daytime and nighttime exposure to baseline cortisol, and (C) variation in behavioural traits of

598 Chinook salmon parr.

For personal use only. This Just-IN manuscript is the accepted manuscript prior to copy editing and page composition. It may differ from the final official version of record.
For personal use only. This Just-IN manuscript For personal use only. This Just-IN manuscript is the accepted manuscript prior to copy editing and page composition. It may differ from the final official version of record. **Figure 3.** Exposure to daytime cortisol predicts overall behavioural phenotype (combination of foraging, sociality, and movement behaviours) as a linear relationship across 6 outbred populations of Chinook salmon and the inbred control population.

Figure 4. Body mass outcome of optimal phenotypic integration between exposure to cortisol during the night and overall behavioural phenotype (see Methods) across 6 outbred populations of Chinook salmon and the inbred control population (YIAL), represented as both (A) a threedimensional plot and (B) as a contour map.

A

