Public education as a marketing medium: An examination of corporate-sponsored curriculum used in the Canadian public school classroom.

Jeremy Stewart. Gillies

University of Windsor

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholar.uwindsor.ca/etd

Recommended Citation

https://scholar.uwindsor.ca/etd/3235
INFORMATION TO USERS

This manuscript has been reproduced from the microfilm master. UMI films the text directly from the original or copy submitted. Thus, some thesis and dissertation copies are in typewriter face, while others may be from any type of computer printer.

The quality of this reproduction is dependent upon the quality of the copy submitted. Broken or indistinct print, colored or poor quality illustrations and photographs, print bleedthrough, substandard margins, and improper alignment can adversely affect reproduction.

In the unlikely event that the author did not send UMI a complete manuscript and there are missing pages, these will be noted. Also, if unauthorized copyright material had to be removed, a note will indicate the deletion.

Oversize materials (e.g., maps, drawings, charts) are reproduced by sectioning the original, beginning at the upper left-hand corner and continuing from left to right in equal sections with small overlaps. Each original is also photographed in one exposure and is included in reduced form at the back of the book.

Photographs included in the original manuscript have been reproduced xerographically in this copy. Higher quality 6" x 9" black and white photographic prints are available for any photographs or illustrations appearing in this copy for an additional charge. Contact UMI directly to order.

UMI

Bell & Howell Information and Learning
300 North Zeaib Road, Ann Arbor, MI 48106-1346 USA
800-521-0800
PUBLIC EDUCATION AS A MARKETING MEDIUM
An examination of corporate sponsored curriculum used in the Canadian public school classroom

by

Jeremy Stewart Gillies

A Thesis
Submitted to the College of Graduate Studies and Research through Communication Studies
In partial fulfillment of requirements for the degree of Master of Arts at the University of Windsor

Windsor, Ontario, Canada

1999

© Jeremy Stewart Gillies, 1999
The author has granted a non-exclusive licence allowing the National Library of Canada to reproduce, loan, distribute or sell copies of this thesis in microform, paper or electronic formats.

The author retains ownership of the copyright in this thesis. Neither the thesis nor substantial extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without the author’s permission.

L’auteur a accordé une licence non exclusive permettant à la Bibliothèque nationale du Canada de reproduire, prêter, distribuer ou vendre des copies de cette thèse sous la forme de microfiche/film, de reproduction sur papier ou sur format électronique.

L’auteur conserve la propriété du droit d’auteur qui protège cette thèse. Ni la thèse ni des extraits substantiels de celle-ci ne doivent être imprimés ou autrement reproduits sans son autorisation.

0-612-52557-0
ABSTRACT

PUBLIC EDUCATION AS A MARKETING MEDIUM

An examination of corporate sponsored curriculum used in the Canadian public school system

Jeremy Stewart Gillies
University of Windsor, 1999

Advisor:
Dr. Myles Ruggles

This thesis draws on the work of a wide range of theorists, philosophers, and educators in order to examine corporate sponsored curriculum used in the Canadian public school system. The main aim of this thesis is to determine whether or not corporate sponsored curriculum is, in fact, advertising. Does the classroom become a marketing medium through the use of corporate sponsored curriculum? Two case studies, of the Bank of Montreal’s *my money Investment Kit* and the Tampax *Health Education Program On Puberty And Menstrual Health*, will be used as models for this thesis. The curriculum will be examined through both proponents and critics of advertising via four main perspectives. These perspectives include: 1) the view that advertising is a form of information, 2) the view that advertising is a form of persuasion, 3) the view that advertising is a form of symbolism, and 4) the critical cultural view of advertising. The findings will be entrenched in the socio-historical context of the current role played by the system of public education. This role is then contrasted with the aims and desires of marketing organizations and corporations. The thesis concludes with a synthesis of the findings and combines them with theoretical, philosophical, and contemporary views of education and society.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First and foremost, I would like to thank my advisor, Dr. Myles Ruggles, for his assistance with this thesis. He was an invaluable guide in all aspects of my research. Myles' theoretical knowledge extends far beyond the requirements of his role in communication studies. His patience with my struggles of synthesis and hands-off approach were greatly appreciated. I would also like to thank my second reader and Flipside Alternative Daily colleague, Dr. James Winter, for his efforts with this thesis. I hold him personally responsible for changing my direction of thought into critical mode. I am also grateful to Dr. Howard Pawley for his time, effort, and extremely important commentary on this project. Academia aside, my family has gone through a great deal of strife at times during the creation of this volume. I extend my sincere appreciation to them for their tolerance and understanding. I must also say thank you to my seven roommates during my first year of graduate school. They made my stay in Windsor an eventful one to say the least! Finally, I would like to thank my partner for her invaluable assistance with this research. Her perpetual help, encouragement and assistance made this thesis a reality.

Yes, one day we will go for a Ph.D.... or two.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

| ABSTRACT | iii |
| ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS | iv |
| INTRODUCTION | 1 |
| Corporate Messages in Public Schools? | 4 |
| Corporate Sponsored Curriculum: Problem and Approach | 6 |
| The Public Classroom as a Marketing Medium | 7 |
| Methodology and Samples | 11 |
| Changes In Thinking About Education | 12 |
| Applying Findings to the State of Education | 13 |
| Plan of Discussion | 13 |

| NON-CRITICAL RESEARCH TRADITIONS OF ADVERTISING | 15 |
| The Reader, The Text and The Copy | 16 |
| Advertising as a Form of Information | 18 |
| Summary of Advertising as a Form of Information | 31 |
| Advertising as a Form of Persuasion | 33 |
| Summary of Advertising as a Form of Persuasion | 38 |
| Advertising as a Form of Symbolism | 39 |
| Advertising as a Combination of Non-Critical Perspectives | 41 |
| Summary of Advertising as a Combination of Views | 47 |

| CRITICAL RESEARCH TRADITIONS OF ADVERTISING | 49 |
| The Making of Meaning | 50 |
| Meaning and Ideology in Advertisements | 57 |
| A Summary of Advertising, Ideology and Meaning | 67 |
| The Institution of Advertising | 69 |
| Combining Analogous Critical Perspectives | 74 |
III METHODOLOGY AND DETAILED DESCRIPTION OF THE TWO CASES

Sample Selection 110
An Overview of the Samples 112
A Detailed Look at the Samples 115
Case 1: my money investment club kit: Get to know your dough 115
Breakdown of the Curriculum 115

Case 2: Tampax Health Education Program on Puberty and Menstrual Health 127
Breakdown of the Curriculum 127
The Poster 136
The Student Handbook 136
The Video 141
The Sample Tampons 148

IV CASE STUDIES: AN ANALYSIS OF THE MY MONEY INVESTMENT CLUB KIT AND THE TAMPAX HEALTH EDUCATION PROGRAM ON PUBERTY AND MENSTRUAL HEALTH

Case 1: The my money Investment Club Kit: Get to know your dough 149
Analysis of the my money Investment Club kit through the Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Information 150
Summary of the Analysis of the my money Investment Club kit through the Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Information 153
Analysis of the my money Investment Club kit through the Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Persuasion 154
Summary of the Analysis of the my money Investment Club kit through the Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Persuasion 157
Analysis of the my money Investment Club kit through the Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Symbolism 158
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Summary of the Analysis of the my money Investment Club kit through the Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Symbolism</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysis of the my money Investment Club kit through the Critical Perspective of Advertising</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary of the Analysis of the my money Investment Club kit through the Critical Perspective of Advertising</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Case 2: <em>The Tampax Health Education Program on Puberty and Menstrual Health</em></td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysis of the Tampax Health Kit through the Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Information</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysis of the Tampax Health Kit Teaching Guide through the Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Information</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysis of the Tampax Health Kit Student Handbook through the Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Information</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysis of the Tampax Health Kit Video through the Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Information</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary of the Analysis of the Tampax Health Kit through the Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Information</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysis of the Tampax Health Kit through the Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Persuasion</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysis of the Tampax Health Kit Teaching Guide through the Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Persuasion</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysis of the Tampax Health Kit Student Handbook through the Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Persuasion</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysis of the Tampax Health Kit Video through the Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Persuasion</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary of the Analysis of the Tampax Health Kit through the Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Persuasion</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysis of the Tampax Health Kit through the Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Symbolism</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysis of the Tampax Health Kit Teaching Guide through the Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Symbolism</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysis of the Tampax Health Kit Student Handbook through the Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Symbolism</td>
<td>206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysis of the Tampax Health Kit Video through the Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Symbolism</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
INTRODUCTION

Do you remember your third or fourth grade of primary school? If you attended a public school in Canada during the past half-century, you more than likely had a typical course of study that included core subjects such as math, spelling, writing, and reading. What if these subjects were somehow altered so that you were materially rewarded for achieving better grades in each? Let us take reading and math as two examples.

Perhaps you remember a chart in your classroom that displayed the amount of reading each student accomplished on a monthly or yearly basis. For each book a student read (or fixed amount of pages), the student received a sticker that was to be placed on the chart. By the end of the month or year, the chart had turned into a bar graph of the reading levels of each student in the class. The reward for high levels of reading was teacher and class praise for achieving a high standing on the chart. It is obvious that this chart system poses potential problems in terms of self-esteem. Those students who cannot read the same amount of material as other students may feel less important, or be ridiculed by those who read more books. At the other end of the spectrum, students who read more may be ridiculed because they excel and are above the average of the class. Regardless of the problems this system poses, one thing is clear—the reward for good work is a sticker and self-satisfaction.
What if the rules were somehow changed? What if you got more than a sticker for reading a certain amount of books in a month? In order to get this reward you have to sit down with your teacher, establish personal reading goals, and achieve those goals. Let us say that, on average, you read approximately four books in a month. In order to increase the amount of reading you do, you decide to set a goal for yourself to read five books in one month. If you complete your desired goal, in addition to your sticker, you will receive your new reward. What is this reward? Would a new toy be out of line? How about a free movie pass? What about a pizza? Sounds like a good deal, doesn't it? You are told that will now get free pizza for doing something that you should already be doing as part of your curriculum. If this idea sounds far-fetched, let me be the first tell you that it is real. Pizza Hut restaurants has a program such as this in over 25,000 schools in Canada. (Pizza Hut, 1997)

The program, called Book It!, is designed for kindergarten to grade eight students. It was set up to "motivate students to read more, by rewarding their reading accomplishments." (Pizza Hut, 1997, p. 3) The five-month program runs from October through to February. Provided that they reach their reading goals, each student is rewarded with one Pizza Hut personal pan pizza on a monthly basis, up to a maximum of five. (Pizza Hut, 1997) It is up to the teacher to determine whether or not the goals have been met. If the whole class manages to meet all of its reading goals for at least four of the months during the five-month period, the class and teacher receive a free pizza party. (Pizza Hut, 1997) Students are also rewarded with certificates, buttons, a personal congratulation
from a Pizza Hut restaurant manager, and a chance to be on the reading honour roll. (Pizza Hut, 1997)

The system of reading is not all that has changed. What if you math class had some alterations as well? Traditionally you may have counted any number of methods used in order to teach about addition, subtraction, graphing and ratios. What if your class was given curriculum that specified that you must use M&M’s Chocolate Candies as counters? The Great Chocolate Experience II uses M&M’s in a variety of math and other exercises. For example, students are provided with M&M/Mars regional data on the actual ratios of M&M colours in a given size bag. They are then supposed to make predictions as to what they believe the colour composition of the bag will be. Students then count the M&M’s, sorting them and graphing them according to colour. A comparison is made between the M&M/Mars regional data, their predictions, and their own data set to see how accurate both M&M/Mars and their own estimates were. (Bequette, 1997a) Upon completion, students are encouraged to eat the data set.

The Great Chocolate Experience II also contains other math activities. These include things such as arranging 15 M&M’s into various piles and counting the remainder. Another activity instructs students to use the whole package of M&M’s as a starting point. Students should then “put two M&M’s in [their] mouth,” and determine “how many are left?” (Bequette, 1997a) This kit is not limited to use in math class. It suggests others way of using various chocolate products around the classroom. Give Me A Little Kiss combines the use of kisses (made by Hershey’s), a bulletin board, and random activities. Each morning a student is
allowed to pick one of the kisses off of the board and read an accompanying note that has been re-wrapped with the kiss. (Bequette, 1997b, p. 1) The note contains a fun activity for the class to participate in—something such as “no math homework,” “15 minutes of extra recess time,” or “play board games on Friday afternoon.” (Bequette, 1997b, p. 1) Other activities include using kisses as stepping-stones on a path that follows a story line, writing an advertisement for chocolate toothpaste, and providing students with candy rewards for reading books. (Bequette, 1997b)

Corporate Messages in Public Schools?

Supplemental curriculum packages, such as the previous two examples, are increasingly being used in many areas of study in Canada’s public schools (see chapter five). These packages are produced by corporations and other private interest groups and are intended for use in the public school system. The learning material kits are also known as “SEMs” or Sponsored Education Materials. For the purposes of this research project, we will look at corporate sponsored curriculum only, as it makes up almost the entirety of the available materials. I will also avoid the use of the acronym “SEM” because it is a non-descriptive title. It does not spell out the identity of the participants involved in the creation of the materials. The examples of Pizza Hut and the Great Chocolate Experience II are a good indication of the types of privately created materials that are being used. Is this corporate curriculum merely veiled advertising for
commodities, and if so, should there be cause for concern? The answer to these questions will be answered by this thesis in two stages.

Traditionally, the Canadian public classroom has been free of advertising messages. In the main part of this project, I will examine, in depth, two case examples of corporate sponsored curriculum through four perspectives of advertising. Through the use communication theory, we can get at the root of the messages employed in the corporate sponsored curriculum packages. Public school curriculum is a form of communication. Advertising is also a form of communication. What happens when a corporation creates a curriculum package? Does the corporate logo on the curriculum materials or the reference to corporate commodities in the curriculum make any difference to the content of the learning materials?

In the second part, I will apply the analysis of the case studies to the situation as it is in Ontario schools in order to draw conclusions about the issue of concern. I will also examine the difference between private and corporate expectations, theories of the public school system, and some public expectations of Ontario schools. The situation is not unique to Ontario. It is part of a larger movement to re-structure education in Canada. We will also examine some of the changes that are taking place in other provinces at both the elementary, secondary, and post-secondary school levels.
Corporate Sponsored Curriculum: Problem and Approach

My specific interest resides in the corporate materials themselves. Are they different from advertisements? Should they be indistinguishable from advertising? Is this just a new type of advertising? As is attested by the review of some of the research reports on the current situation in our public schools, there has been a sharp increase in the use of corporate sponsored curriculum in the public classroom. These materials are produced privately, by corporations, and are intended for use with regular coursework, or to be used as a separate course altogether. Corporate sponsored curriculum is clearly not the same thing as publicly subsidized teaching materials. Traditional public classroom materials are free of commercial commodity brands, labels, and slogans.¹ If we replace these traditional teaching materials—such as textbooks, videos, handouts—with corporate created teaching materials, do we also replace the messages? If so, are the new meanings in alignment with the aims of business or do they serve a wider community? Are these materials of any educational use, or are they merely a deceptive way for corporations to push commodities, messages, and values upon students? Does the public classroom now become a marketing medium?

There are four key research traditions that define advertising: advertising is a form of information, advertising is a form of persuasion, advertising is a form of symbolism, and advertising is a form of ideological creation, maintenance, and control. The first three perspectives are non-critical because they do not examine the context in which advertising is created and they also do not acknowledge any
type of social power. The fourth perspective is divided into two camps. The first is
the critical cultural view and the second perspective is the view of critical political
economy. The critical cultural perspective will allows us to examine the details of
the corporate sponsored curriculum packages. The structural framework of
advertising will be addressed in the latter part of this project through the critical
political economic perspective. This view informs the most important part of the
theoretical background for this project because it will allow us to address the
notion of public concern. It will also allow us to look at the school setting as a tool
for dissemination of various ideological perspectives.

The Public Classroom as a Marketing Medium

Dallas Smythe (1981) argues that we live in a society that is dominated by
what he calls the consciousness industry. The central issue for Smythe (1981) is
whoever controls the means of disseminating information also has ultimate
political power. Our mindset, our values, our beliefs, our expression of feelings,
our daily routines, are all informed, and in many cases governed, by the
consciousness industry. The components of this industry include all of the
institutions in our society that help create and maintain the values of the free-
market economy. Churches, banks, television networks, and even public schools
contribute to the building of our consciousness. It might be alarming,
disconcerting, and somewhat inconceivable that the production of your
consciousness is governed to a great extent by a few large-scale institutions. The
ideological teachings of the consciousness industry are not monolithic. There is potential for alternative perspectives to be present in many forms such as social resistance, personal choice, and criticism. Perhaps it is the fact that people are not machines that is the biggest site of resistance. We all do not process data the same way!

One crucial aim of the consciousness industry in North America is to perpetuate the values of the free-market system. Within this framework, the consciousness industry produces audiences for advertisers so that people may learn and maintain the cyclical process of mass production and mass consumption. Where does one's personal autonomy assert itself? In North America, we live in a society that upholds the notion of individual freedom. The freedom described in Smythe's (1981) model is one of "consumer sovereignty." (p. 9) We have the ability to choose from among millions of commodities—that is, we choose what we consume. Arguably, it would be very difficult to choose to not consume because we are virtually dependent upon the system. Smythe (1981) further asserts that the process of learning the rules, values, and beliefs of the consciousness industry is a type of labour, "one that is totally unacknowledged." (p. xxi) It must be noted that this is not a top-down approach. People willingly market commodities and systemic ideologies to themselves. (Smythe, 1981)

The pay-off for the marketing of commodities is what Smythe (1981) refers to as the "free lunch." (p. xxi) The free lunch is better known to people as news, movies, sports—you know, television. His argument is extended further to say that the real product that is created is the person watching and performing the
unpaid labour. (Smythe, 1981) If we extend this argument further, we see that
"the media's job is to sell audiences to advertisers," (Smythe, 1981, p. 14) and not the other way around. Once again, the whole process is by no means automatic. There is a point of struggle where the interaction among people, commodities, and advertisements takes place. There is potential resistance to the views espoused by the advertisers through the "innate capacity and need for love, respect, communal relations and creativity." (Smythe, 1981, p. 270) While material things may be able to create feelings or emotions in a person, they are unable to have feelings or emotions for a person. The major contradiction that occurs is between "people and capital." (Smythe, 1981, p. 271) To paraphrase the Beatles, money cannot buy one love.

I would like to extend our traditional notions of the mass media to include the classroom. The traditional components of the mass media include things such as television, movies, newspapers, plays, radio broadcasts, paperback novels, and music. We tend not to think of the classroom as being a tool of mass media even though it employs the system of mass distribution of information. In reality, the classroom is a place not unlike the other media mentioned above. These media all help to transmit information from one source to another. Aside from a few obvious differences, the one important contrast between the classroom and other media outlets is that the audience in a public school classroom must be there by law. Almost all other media outlets are strictly voluntary—you can change the channel on a television, close a book, tear out a page from a magazine, or unplug your radio. Children, on the other hand, are
supposed to pay attention to the teacher's lessons when they are in class. Public schools are similar to these media outlets because they contribute to the creation and maintenance of free-market values in children because they are part of the consciousness industry. They are very much like other sources of media where information, ideas, beliefs, and values are shown, taught, and learned. The material taught in a public school is fairly congruent with the notions and beliefs of the society in which it is located. Finally, like other sources of media, there is potential for resistance to the messages.

To what extent does it matter that corporations are now producing curriculum materials to be used in the public classroom? This is a question of policy choice. We can, however, attempt to determine how closely related traditional models of advertising are to the new curriculum materials produced by corporations. It is through this analysis, that we can see whether or not the classroom becomes a marketing medium. There is also a potential major twist, in this case, to the concept of the free lunch. The roles of work and free lunch change. Traditionally, the source of unpaid labour is the marketing of products to oneself. In this new model, the unpaid labour becomes the curriculum activities performed by the student in class. The free lunch is no longer the programming (or in this case, the curriculum), but is the advertising and its respective commodity. In the case of Pizza Hut, the student literally receives food for performing work.
Methodology and Samples

In two case studies, we will examine two very different corporate sponsored curriculum packages. The first case, the Bank of Montreal’s My Money Investment Kit, is a seven-lesson package that explains investment to young public school children (Kindergarten to Grade 8). The kit contains various activity sheets, a teacher’s guide, and a board game to be played by the students once they have learned all the investment information in the kit. The second package is entitled TAMPAX Health Education Program on Puberty and Menstrual Health. This kit, produced by Tampax (a subsidiary of Proctor and Gamble), contains a video, a teacher’s guide, a student handbook (one for every student), a poster, and a sample package of Tampax Satin tampons.

In order to illustrate how each package works in detail, both of these curriculum packages will be analyzed under each of the four advertising research traditions. A detailed explanation of how each package works will hopefully provide the reader with tools to decode further examples or corporate sponsored curriculum that are not covered in this thesis. In order to facilitate this type of analysis, each of the four perspectives is broken down into separate parts and simplified in order to determine key things to look for in the curriculum materials. For example, one part of the information perspective argues that an advertisement contains facts about the utility value of a product. In the curriculum, we would look for evidence of information about the utility value of a given commodity. Each perspective will have its own set of characteristics to
compare and contrast with those found in the corporate sponsored curriculum materials.

**Changes In Thinking About Education**

In order for us to examine the public school system and corporate sponsored learning materials, we must understand the system of public education and its history. We will examine some of the well-known historical philosophical and political economic views of public education. The next step will be to examine desires and aims of corporate involvement in the public education system. Finally, we will look at some of the changes that have taken place within Ontario and the rest of Canada.

Public education in Ontario is undergoing some extremely important changes that can be grouped under one all-encompassing notion; private groups are increasing their involvement within the public classroom and the system of public education. However, there is a striking contrast between the *goals of public education*, and *private interest* in education. Ontario is not alone in its restructuring of the public education system. Other provinces, and other countries are making similar changes as a response to globalization.
Applying Findings to the State of Education

Why does it matter that corporations are now creating corporate sponsored curriculum for use in the public classroom? It may be possible for both the goals of public education and corporate interests to be harmonized through the use of corporate sponsored curriculum. The major difference between the two sectors is between public accountability and shareholder accountability. Public schools have to educate. Private firms have to make money. What happens when there is a conflict between these interests? This question is one that must be answered through policy. Hopefully, the findings of this study will be able to direct policy so that it will benefit the public interest, not just a few for-profit organizations.

Plan of Discussion

Chapter one examines the research traditions of advertising that view advertising as a form of information, of persuasion, and of symbolism. Chapter two will look at the critical perspectives on advertising: critical cultural analyses and the critical political economic view of which Smythe is a good example. Chapter three contains a description of the methodology employed for the analysis and detailed breakdowns of the kits themselves.
Chapter four is comprised of my analysis of some of the corporate sponsored curriculum materials.

Chapter five will examine some of the literature surrounding the current use of corporate sponsored materials in classrooms.

Chapter six contains my synthesis of the analysis and the stated of public education, as well as my conclusions about the findings and recommendations for further study.
CHAPTER ONE
NON-CRITICAL RESEARCH TRADITIONS OF ADVERTISING

Defining the role that advertising plays within our free-market society has been the challenge of many scholars, market researchers, independent organizations, and governments for a long time. There is one thing that all of the critical and non-critical theorists of advertising agree on—that advertising is a huge part of North American society. Why do we have advertising? What function does it serve? Who does it serve? What are the benefits? What are the costs? It would be easy to write an encyclopedia-length series on different theories of economics, communication, social relations, politics, and how advertising relates to each. Instead of that daunting task, let us simplify the congestion by examining some of the more prominent arguments made by both proponents and critics of advertising.

The intent of this chapter is to explain some of the non-critical positions held by various theorists. There are three distinct, non-critical views of advertising—sometimes these views are combined in order to form a broad perspective. The use of the term "non-critical" identifies the fact that these theories ignore the institutional structure of advertising in the free-market economy. The theories developed by the sources of this section are by no means
a complete survey of all of the individual positions on advertising. They are, however, a solid introduction to the three non-critical research traditions.

The major difference between these two traditions is that the non-critical view sees advertising as a socially neutral or positive force. The critical perspective believes that advertising is a controlling and destructive ideological tool designed to serve the business community. Those who see advertising as a value neutral or positive tool do not acknowledge or discuss ideology when talking about advertising. The conversations they have regarding advertising, however, do suggest that ideology is at work in some cases. The non-critical side includes these perspectives: advertising is a type of information, advertising is a form of symbolism, advertising is a form of persuasion, or advertising is a combination of these perspectives. In contrast with the non-critical camp, the critical perspective includes critical ideological analysis of advertisements and their meaning, political economic criticism of the system, or a combination of both. We will tackle the critical camp in the next chapter.

The Reader, The Text and The Copy

In order to describe someone who is subjected to an advertisement, I elect to use the term reader. This term is widely used by many people who write from the paradigm of post-modern thought. The term reader is prefaced on the notion of text. Text, in is most broad definition (for this work), means anything that can be interpreted by a person. The key is that someone can obtain information from
the thing in question, through one of the five major senses. Let us look at an event outside of advertising.

A reader can make sense of touching the keys on a computer keyboard, because that touch conveys information that can be interpreted by the reader. Information and interpretations for this act could be: how the key felt to the reader's finger, how much force was used to press the key, how much force was exerted back to the reader's finger by the spring inside the key, what sound was made by the key, as well as many other possible sensations. There are other possible readings of the keyboard. A person may also be able to read the letters and symbols on each of the individual keyboard keys. The design of the keyboard is another factor, which can be read by the user. For example, the specific shape and style of the collective components of the keyboard may tell the user about its function when compared to other keyboards. Another aspect that may be interpreted could be the location of the keyboard. Most likely the keyboard is attached to a computer system. If the system is located in a prominent place in someone's house, the computer may be interpreted as a vital part of that person's life. We could come up with hundreds of other possible readings in our keyboard model. What is important here is the suggestion that a computer keyboard is itself a text because it can convey information.

An advertisement on television, in a magazine or on the radio is still a text, although each format is interpreted in a different way. The key is that they all must be interpreted. Use of the term reader suggests an active process of gathering the information within an advertisement on many different levels,
predicated on one's own framework and interpreted in an infinite number of ways. In order to refer to the specific written words within a text, I will use the printer's term *copy*.

Advertising as a Form of Information

The *advertising as a form of information* perspective assumes that the individual reading an advertisement is a rational or logical individual. The advertisements themselves present information about the product and its utility. The consumer then operates in a series of logical, well reasoned steps which lead to a conclusion about the advertised commodity. Martin Bell (1966) endorses the notion of the rational consumer in *Marketing: concepts and strategy*. For Bell (1966), a consumer seeks out commodities to purchase, in order to satisfy wants or needs, based on a strategic plan of action referred to as "problem solving." (p. 199) Bell (1966) does not make a distinction between a *want* and a *need*. Whether or not wants and needs are different is irrelevant for this project because both can lead to consumption at some point. The terms want and need will be used interchangeably for the purpose of assessing Bell's (1966) assertions.
Bell’s (1966) first step is for the consumer to identify or realize wants.

Physical, psychological and social needs give rise to consumer wants that motivate the individual to seek satisfactions from goods and services available in the market. These consumer wants arise either within the individual or from his environment, and the changing patterns of consumer wants can be directly traced to the changing conditions in the organism, in the environment, and in the relationship between the two. (Bell, 1966, p. 193)

His evaluation is grounded in a general, common sense, logic-based argument. Even if the needs are created needs, that is, not of the individual’s own generation and suggested through advertising, the above passage is quite accurate. It is perhaps useful to stress that consumption needs are more likely to arise out of psychological means rather than physical or social means. The social pressures exerted are likely to be a derivative of, or originate from, the psychological needs rather than the other way around. The physical need aspect, in regard to consumption, is questionable once we get past the fundamental need for nourishment, shelter, and perhaps (in extreme cases) addiction. Let me illustrate by posing a question. Is there a real, fundamental physical need to own a television? Unless your intent is to remove the inside of the television and use it as shelter, then the need is not of a fundamental nature. You certainly cannot eat the television!
The second principle Bell (1966) introduces is: people will seek means to satisfy their wants.

Wants-satisfying goods and services exist in the consumer's environment. This environment must be searched to locate those goods and services that best fit the consumer's want—that provide the best solution to his problem. Of course, an individual does not institute a complete environmental search every time he perceives a want. Wants recur and patterns of problem solving develop. (Bell, 1966, p. 199)

Bell (1966) assumes that the consumer actively seeks out the means to satisfy their wants. Arguably, advertising may not serve this function. Advertising could serve to alert the consumer of products and services before a person even has a want. In some cases, advertising may actually create that want. In any case, advertising does not serve to merely inform the consumer, but to motivate the consumer to seek satisfaction for a want through consumption of a product. The persuasion theorists would probably agree with the assertion that advertising is a motivating factor. Their theories will be addressed later in this chapter.

The third stage in Bell's (1966) rational consumer model is the process of evaluation of alternatives. At this point, the consumer will rank the current want within a personal hierarchy of wants to determine if it should be fulfilled at that time. Bell (1966) asserts that the consumer "determines the degree of satisfaction that he will consider appropriate in view of the potency of the want
and the sacrifice required to satisfy it." (p. 201) Bell (1966) cites consumer trends, income, and opportunity cost as plausible methods of evaluation of his theory. He uses the example of a weekly shopper in a grocery store, with a limited amount of money to spend on commodities. The shopper will make decisions based on an entire week's worth of food preparation and consumption. Careful decisions must be made, otherwise the consumer may eat expensive foods for the first few days, and starve during the rest of the week.

Finally, a choice must be made. This fourth stage entails the decision of the consumer based on the evaluation of the competing alternatives. Bell (1966) suggests that a consumer will make a choice when one or more of the following conditions are satisfied:

1. No more satisfactory solutions exist than those already discovered.
2. The effort required to search for additional solutions is not justified in view of the potency of the want or the degree of satisfaction anticipated.
3. There is not sufficient time to explore the environment further and evaluate other alternatives.
4. The decision cannot be postponed. (p. 203)

Nelson (1974) takes a stance similar to that of Bell (1966), but provides a much more detailed account as to how consumer power works. He asserts that "information is generated by advertising because of consumer power in the product market. The nature of that power will vary significantly by the nature of
the product being advertised." (Nelson, 1974, p. 730) Consumer power dictates the success of one product over another because without consumption, no commodities would exist. Nelson's (1974) second statement assumes that consumers have ultimate control over their consumption behaviour. While consumers do have the final say as to where their money will be spent, they may not be able to make the choice to not consume. In order to live in the free-market economy and survive, one must spend money to get what they want.

Nelson (1974) makes a distinction between search products (he uses the example of style or fashion) and experience products (those which the consumer knows, such as the taste of a particular beverage). Nelson (1974) suggests that misleading or deceptive advertisers probably do not exist in the search category because the consumer can compare advertiser claims to the actual product before a purchase is made. For example, if an advertiser uses a picture to advertise a new dress, and the actual dress does not match the one portrayed in the picture, the dress would not be purchased on the basis of the advertiser's claims. The experience category is much trickier for the consumer. Nelson (1974) asserts that the only way for a consumer to tell if the product claims are true is to actually consume the product. How can someone tell if a product tastes good if it has never been tasted? It is here that information plays a key role.

is something such as the actual flavour of a beverage. An advertisement can describe the flavour, but it cannot provide the real taste sensation of the product. Nelson (1974) also suggests that the more a person sees advertisements, the more likely it is that the person will purchase the product portrayed in the advertisements. Repetition of messages generates legitimacy and, therefore, increases the value of the commodity.

Nelson (1974) also examines a long-standing complaint of advertising—that it can be deceptive. He argues that deceptive advertisements are easily recognizable because they contain indicators of their illusory content.

As long as consumers followed the decision rule: believe an advertisement for experience qualities when it tells about the functions of a brand; do not believe the advertisement when it tells how well a brand performs that function—the consumer will be rarely deceived. (Nelson, 1974, p. 749)

Nelson (1974) assumes that the foundation of all advertisements is based on the rule of product utility. Nelson (1974) prefaces his argument on the assumption that deception only occurs at the level of product claims, not product performance. He does not address the imagery and interactions within an advertisement. Product meaning, as we will examine through Levitt (1970) and symbolism, may not be derived from the product itself, but from the notions that the consumer has about that product. Deception does not always take place at
the level of claims of performance; sometimes it occurs at the level of fulfilling the consumer's expected notions surrounding the product.

Nelson's (1974) *deception rule* may work when the information surrounding the product is factual, but what happens when the information is intended to mislead the consumer? Is it possible to make a rational decision based on false information? One can certainly arrive at a plausible deduction, but since it is predicated on false premises, the decision may not be in the best interest of the consumer. It is because of this problem that there have been many attacks made on false advertising.

The *Federal Trade Commission*, by Wagner (1971), outlines the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) guidelines for dealing with false advertisers. The FTC “announced that any complaints it issued alleging false and misleading advertising on the television networks would be given immediate publicity.” (Wagner, 1971, p. 174) The FTC monitored radio and television through the mandatory submission of advertisers' scripts, while newspaper and magazine advertising was examined through regular inspections of content. To determine if an advertisement was false, the FTC would ask: “what is the promise made?” (Wagner, 1971, p. 174) In order to determine the meaning of the advertisement, the FTC first had to synthesize a definition of the level of intelligence of the reader of the advertisement. Initially, according to Wagner (1971), the term “average purchaser” was employed as the definition. (p. 174) Since that definition did not include people of low intelligence or those with low perceptual skills, the Second Circuit court expanded the definition. Advertising had to be “clear enough
so that, in the words of the prophet Isaiah, 'wayfaring men, though fools, shall not err therein.'" (Wagner, 1971, p. 175)

With the level of intelligence set at the level of anyone who can read an advertisement or look at the advertisement and draw information from it, the FTC was able to create a definition of advertising deception. "The Commission...has adopted a policy to prohibit only those advertisements that have a tendency or capacity to deceive. Simple falsity in the mock-ups is not enough. The representation must be such as to induce the public to act." (Wagner, 1981, p. 177) The FTC proceeded to define several different kinds of deception including: bait-and-switch schemes (luring consumers to a store with a low priced article, only to find out that the product cannot be purchased, at which point the salesperson tries to convince the consumer to purchase higher priced alternatives), deceptive television advertising (combating false virtues assigned to a product), mock-ups (false or misleading television demonstrations and comparisons), food, drug, and cosmetic advertising, and cigarette advertising.

The assumption of the FTC was that advertisers who made outrageous claims were the only parties who could be considered guilty of using misleading advertising. On a practical level, a product must be able to perform the tasks it claims it can perform. This is easy to regulate in terms of mechanistic performance, but how can one determine the validity of Nelson's (1974) experience claims? Is it possible to regulate experiential feelings? If a commodity works as it claims it does on a pragmatic level, but leaves the consumer unfulfilled, does it constitute false advertising? If the FTC were to regulate false
experiential claims, there could potentially be billions of product complaints, returns, and lawsuits.

The theorists we have examined thus far have dealt with the concept of the rational individual who seeks out as much information as is possible in order to determine the ability of a commodity to satisfy his or her needs. Linder (1970) takes a slightly different approach to the rational consumer. He argues that consumers act in a rational manner because they use advertisements as a time saving device. This may not sound much different than Bell (1966) or Nelson (1974), but the emphasis on different areas of rational behaviour splits the two perspectives. For Linder (1970), the truly rational consumer does not want to spend all of his or her time deciding upon which things to consume. He suggests that a consumer is truly rational or intelligent when he or she makes an effort to avoid spending all of their time reading consumer magazines or seeking out advertisements. The truly intelligent person, in fact, desires to be persuaded by advertising. "One actually wants to be influenced by advertising to get an instant feeling that one has perfectly good reason to buy this or that commodity, the true properties of which one knows dismally little about." (Linder, 1970, p. 74) This claim suggests that the weight of a consumer's value of a product is tied with the advertiser's position of supreme knowledge. Although Linder (1970) touches on the element of persuasion in advertising later in his theory, his arguments in favour of the rational consumer are of more importance in this section.

Linder's (1970) framework is a striking contrast to Bell (1966) and Nelson (1974). Both models operate on the principle that the human being is rational, but
in Bell’s (1966) case, information seeking is paramount to making a reasoned commodity decision. Information is gathered about products. Linder (1970) asserts that the consumer does not have time to do product research, but instead desires enough information to make a decision about a commodity. That decision is made (for the most part) on the basis of the claims made by the advertiser. Instead of researching competing alternatives, the commodity is selected based on its own claims of superiority over other commodities.

In order to advance the notion of the rational, information based individual, Albion and Farris (1981) suggest that the behaviour of the individual is also contingent upon the type of commodity being consumed. They suggest that advertising works as a six-stage process. Albion and Farris (1981) argue that people: 1) are made aware of a product or service, 2) learn about the product or service, 3) acquire a taste for the product or service, 4) begin to choose it over others, 5) buy the product, 6) consume the product on a routine basis. (p. 4) Although all of the theorists in the information-rational consumer camp might agree that these six stages are plausible, the model is not complete because there is debate surrounding the sequence of the stages in the consumption process. Albion and Farris (1981) suggest three ways in which the model can be ordered.

Model one suggests a method of “learn-feel-do” or the “standard learning hierarchy.” (Albion & Farris, 1981, p. 5) The consumer is surrounded with a wide range of different products. Advertising is performed through use of the mass media. The products being advertised are new or improved. The second model
employs a the method of "learn-do-feel" or "dissonance-attribution hierarchy." (Albion & Farris, 1981, pp. 4-5) Products in this model tend to be quite similar and tend to include those that are personal in nature. The products in this system are not new, but tend to be reaching their high selling point in their life cycle. The third model of consumer behaviour is the "do-feel-learn" or "Krugman low-involvement hierarchy." (Albion & Farris, 1981, pp. 4-5) Consumer participation with the product is low and the product tends to be in the final stages of its life cycle. The mass media are highly involved in advertising products in this category. Albion and Farris (1981) conclude by suggesting that the choice of model is dependent upon "product and situational variables." (p. 5)

Albion and Farris (1981) also examine the impact of advertising on consumer behaviour. They propose that there are five separate methods employed by advertisers and each has a different effect on the consumer. The five methods are precipitation, persuasion, reinforcement, reminder, and location. (Albion & Farris, 1981, pp. 6-8) The precipitation method leads the consumer to purchase a product or service, especially in the case of high-priced or high-risk goods and services. The persuasion method argues that the consumer should choose a specific product among similar products because of its superiority. The reinforcement method is used to build brand loyalty through reassuring the consumer that he or she has made the best purchase possible. The reminder method uses repetition to encourage the consumer to purchase and use a product or service on a regular basis. Finally, the locational method tells a consumer where to get the product. Albion and Farris (1981) suggest that this
category also includes classified advertising, as it is almost "purely informational." (p. 8)

Albion and Farris (1981) further examine the split between the view that advertising is information and the view that advertising is a form of persuasion. They fail to draw a complete definition of advertising because the advertising as a form of information theorists have many different, but not mutually exclusive views. Bell (1966) and Nelson (1974) argued that information provides the consumer with facts that narrow the decision-making process and Linder (1970) argued that information is just as likely to increase a consumer's level of uncertainty. A much more inclusive definition of advertising information was suggested by Wilkie; "any stimulus that is relevant to the decision to buy or consume a product or service." (Albion & Farris, 1981, p. 39) Albion and Farris (1981) conclude that as the definition of information expands the boundary between information and persuasion becomes less visible. At the other extreme, the more the definition contracts, the more likely it is that certain tenets pertaining directly to information will be left out.

The distinction drawn between advertising as information and advertising as persuasion occurs at the level of product differentiation. Albion and Farris (1981) suggest that vertical product differentiation employs informational methods of advertising. Vertical product differentiation refers to the split between lower-priced, lower-quality commodities and higher-priced, higher-quality commodities of the same genre—brand name products versus no-name products. Commodity advertising is aimed at groups in accordance with their income level.
High-end goods are aimed at people who have more money to spend, while private label or no-name goods are aimed at those with less money. Horizontal product differentiation (very similar products with only name differentiation, for example, Allen's canned Apple Juice versus Rougemont canned Apple Juice) tends to employ the use of persuasive advertising. (Albion & Farris, 1981, p. 42) This tactic encourages the consumer to switch brands and is also used to maintain brand loyalty.

Albion and Farris (1981) conclude several points from their research on the advertising industry. They suggest that advertising does, in fact, increase demand, but only in situations where the conditions are right.

Advertising may be of help in increasing the demand for a particular product, and it may have helped to create attitudes and desires compatible with increase consumption at the expense of savings, but only within a social and economic environment conducive to that increase.

(Albion & Farris, 1981, p.179)

From this perspective consumers will not make purchases unless they: a) are economically fit to make them, b) make the choice to not save money, and c) if it is en vogue to make purchases of a particular commodity.

We believe strongly that advertising as an efficient form of mass communication, can accelerate [sic] the growth of new markets and new
entries into markets. We doubt that advertising significantly determines the ultimate size of a market, except in those markets that depend on so-called reminder advertising for a portion of total demand (soft drinks, perhaps). Other factors appear to be much more important in increasing demand. The effectiveness of advertising is severely limited because it is most often used for new products and new services. (Albion & Farris, 1981, p. 179)

**Summary of Advertising as a Form of Information**

We have examined several theorists who believe in the information seeking, rational consumer model. Bell (1966) saw advertising, consumption, and the consumer meshed together in a four-stage process of want recognition, commodity seeking, commodity evaluation, and commodity selection. The selection of the commodity was based on a well researched, informed consumer, who made a decision in a series of logical steps. Nelson (1974) examined the roll of consumer power. He suggested that the rational consumer was the basis for commodity and market survival. Nelson (1974) was concerned that false informational claims made in advertisements had a negative effect on market behaviour. He divided commodities into two categories (style and experience) and suggested that consumers could not be deceived by stylistic claims because false assertions could be seen and challenged before consumption. Experience qualities, or those which can only be known when the product is actually

31
consumed, could be falsified in order to mislead the consumer. Nelson (1974) also argued that commodities (of both types) were legitimized proportionately by the number of times their advertisements were repeated. He suggested that consumers exercise their market power, and thus prevent deception by ignoring informational claims surrounding experience products.

The Federal Trade Commission (1971) sought to deal with problems surrounding false advertising. The FTC concluded by creating laws that would punish advertisers who made false claims. The false claims laws only dealt with false *performance* claims of a commodity on a practical level. The FTC did little to address the problems associated with Nelson’s (1974) experiential claims.

Linder (1970) argued that the rational individual model used by these theorists was, in fact, backwards. The rational individual does not have enough time in the day to perform product research. The rational individual will obtain information from advertisements about commodity claims, and form an opinion based on the arguments made by the advertisement. If the argument were convincing, the consumer would likely select the product, as there was little time for product comparison. Finally, Albion and Farris (1981) employ a more complex version of Bell's (1966) consumption model. This six-stage process is configured differently depending upon the type of product that is being advertised. They also suggest that all advertisements are not the same, but instead fall into one of five categories (precipitative, persuasive, reinforcing, reminding, and locational). Albion and Farris (1981) suggest that advertising as a device of information and advertising as a device of persuasion changes based on the level of product
differentiation. They argue that the informational advertising is used to alert
consumers to different grades of similar commodities. Persuasive advertising
attempts to win brand loyalty to commodities that are virtually identical in all but
their name. We will now examine advertising as a persuasive device.

Advertising as a Form of Persuasion

What effect does advertising have on consumer demand and the
inclination to consume? The advertising as a form of persuasion group views
advertising as an instrumental force in luring the consumer to purchase
commodities—it increases demand. Let us briefly return to Linder’s (1970)
second assertion. Linder’s (1970) model of rationality embodies extreme
efficiency in decision-making and time budgeting for the consumer. Efficiency is a
necessity because our free-market society is driven by the concept of time. In
this case, a truly rational human being does not try to waste time, or think for him
or herself, but allows the advertisement to do the thinking. The sell becomes the
argument made by the advertiser—that the advertised commodity will fulfill the
needs of the consumer. If an advertisement does not motivate a person to
consume, the advertisement is making a weak argument.

Damon (1991) declares that advertising does not create needs, it merely
persuades consumers based on existing, untapped needs.
...advertising exerts a powerful influence on consumer behaviour.

However, rather than creating needs, advertising stimulates existing needs. That is, it arouses latent needs that consumers do not feel strongly or consciously. (Darmon, 1991, p. 477)

Simon (1970) argues that advertising has the ability to drive consumers toward the purchase of products. He examines this argument from the perspective of business. "The evidence that advertising can affect people's behaviour is immediate and overwhelming, both from the introspection of our own experience and from the fact that advertisers spend hard cash to pay for advertising." (Simon, 1970, p. 194) Simon (1970) does not take issue with the advertising used by industrial firms, nor the use of circulars and weekly flyers because they are almost pure information. "First, there is no question but that much of advertising is useful and important economically, and without grave danger to society; industrial advertising and department-store advertising are leading examples." (Simon, 1970, p. 284)

Simon (1970) assumes that these industrial or weekly advertisements are value free or purely factual. Let us take a weekly department store flyer as an example. Part of the flyer contains a picture of a slender woman wearing a dress, some information pertaining to the dress, and a sale price. The commodity being advertised is a dress that is on sale for half of its regular price. Simon (1970) would argue that this type of advertising merely provides consumers with practical information—the store, the dress, and the feature price. The dress does
not stand alone, however, since it is modelled by a woman. The dress is also patterned in a specific style, material and colour. Why do they advertise that particular dress? Why do they use that specific woman as a model? There is more than just factual presentation in weekly circular-type advertisements. It is plausible to suggest that the presentation of products in flyers does not merely inform the reader of their existence, but also persuades the reader to buy the product because it is a cheaper purchase than normal. In the case of trade or industrial magazines, one cannot discount the persuasive power of a stylish picture of a box for a new computer program, for example. It must not be understated that the text of an advertisement can convey as much or more information than the copy of an advertisement. Other types of advertisements do not present information about products in the same way as industrial magazines or circulars; instead, they focus on messages surrounding the product in order to sell it.

According to Driver and Foxall (1984) the intent of advertising is to change or captivate the mind of the reader so that they believe in the message. The goal of the message is to persuade (although relatively weakly) the person to consume the commodity displayed in the advertisement. Driver and Foxall (1984) focus on psychological testing as a means of determining the overall effectiveness of advertising. They argue that because the testing is grounded in actual consumer purchases and commodity sales, it is more likely to be an accurate reflection of effectiveness of specific advertising campaigns. For Driver and Foxall (1984), consumers operate in a series of stages. These stages are:
"consumer brand choice is understood as a function of purchase intention, which is a function of preference; preference is a function of liking which is portrayed as a function of awareness." (p. 85)

Driver and Foxall (1984) maintain that advertising creates each of these stages and motivates people to move from one mode of thinking to another in order to facilitate consumption of a commodity. "Advertising does not physically impel the consumer toward the purchase of goods; its purpose is to create a state of mind conducive to purchase.' (Colley, 1961)" (Driver & Foxall, 1984, p. 85) Within this framework, advertising is one of several communication tools used to persuade consumers to purchase commodities. Advertising serves as a means to suggest to people they should consume, and prepares the consumer to spend money. Driver and Foxall (1984) also maintain that the notion of the consumer as a rational being is a limited view, because many purchases are based on brand loyalty or are cued by social or situational factors unaccounted for by the rational model.

Advertising plays a key role in the highly competitive consumer brand market. Driver and Foxall (1984) speak about this type of advertising in terms of creation and maintenance of brand loyalty. They argue that new products must captivate the mind of the consumer. Advertising is the device used to convince consumers to try a new product. When a product lives up to its advertised standards or claims, repeat consumption is likely.
If advertising engenders curiosity which happens to elicit trial, its pre-purchase work is done; its role thereafter is primarily to remind the buyer of any benefits provided by the chosen item but its capacity to do this depends crucially on the performance of the brand in question and the judgment made by consumers with respect to the consequences of using it. (Driver & Foxall, 1984, p. 93)

This brings us to the second component of their theory. Since consumers tend to consume on the basis of brand loyalty, advertisements for competing brands must try to win attention and pull consumers away from their current brand. In other words, advertising can be seen as a “defensive” (Driver & Foxall, 1984, p. 93) mechanism employed by both the utilized brand and its competitors. The current brand advertises defensively to help maintain brand loyalty out of a fear of loss of revenue. The competing brands use advertising defensively to help increase their market share and revenue.

Finally, Driver and Foxall (1984) suggest that in the case of commodities such as cigarette and alcohol, advertising may not have an impact on consumption. “[There is]...a negligible relationship between advertising and aggregate consumption (competitive advertising is to achieve market share at the expense of rivals), even to the extent that advertising bans have had little effect on consumption.” (Driver & Foxall, 1984, p. 105) Although these commodities are exceptions to the model of advertising described by Driver and Foxall (1984), it is clear that there is more to advertising than statistical relationships. Statistics can
measure levels of consumption based on specific advertising campaigns and their ability to persuade. Statistics cannot measure the addictive power of cigarettes and alcohol, nor can they measure the environmental relationships and power structures that played a part in someone's choice to smoke or drink. A door is left open to another view of advertising—the perspective that advertising and consumption is a symbolic practice.

Summary of Advertising as a Form of Persuasion

Linder (1970) argues that the rational consumer is rational because he or she does not waste time looking at every advertising claim, but instead consumes on the basis of the ability of the advertisement to persuade him or her to do just that. Darmon (1991) suggests that advertising persuades individuals to consume because it taps into existing latent needs. Simon (1970) asserts that advertising undoubtedly has the ability to persuade consumers to purchase products. He suggests that industrial or trade magazines, flyers or weekly-circular forms of advertisements do not contain elements of persuasion. Instead, they are designed to alert corporations, or the public, to the existence of a commodity or feature item, perhaps one that is on sale. For Driver and Foxall (1984), advertising serves to prepare the consumer for the process of consumption. They reject the notion of the rational consumer because consumption can take place by virtue of external or situational factors not
attributable to the perspective of the informed consumer. In this view, advertising helps to direct the consumer to specific products, facilitate a mindset that allows consumption to occur, and in the end, help maintain brand loyalty. Driver and Foxall (1984) further suggest that advertising can sometimes be seen as a defensive mechanism used to maintain brand loyalty or increase market share.

Advertising as a Form of Symbolism

The theorists who regard advertising as a form of symbolic communication and consumption argue that we do not only consume commodities. In addition to the actual physical commodity, we consume the images, ideas, and messages surrounding commodities. The success of a product depends upon the ability of the product to uphold the images, ideas, and messages that have been attached to it through advertising. Levitt (1970) provides an interesting perspective on the role of symbolic interaction and consumption in The Morality(?) of Advertising. He argues that people do not consume based solely on the functional nature of the commodity itself. "The promises and images which imaginative ads and sculptured packages induce in us is as much the product as the physical materials themselves." (Levitt, 1970, pp. 89-90) We consume based on what we think the commodity will provide us with on emotional, mental, and physical levels. "The 'purpose' of the product is not what the engineer says it is, but what the consumer implicitly demands it will be." (Levitt, 1970, p. 91) Whether or not the product actually does this is inconsequential at the point of purchase. Levitt
(1970) suggests that it is only through the consumption of the product that we realize its limitations.

Levitt (1970) compares advertising texts to the texts of poets, novelists, painters, sculptors, and playwrights. Levitt (1970) claims that: "None is satisfied with nature in the raw, as it was on the day of creation. None is satisfied to tell it exactly 'like it is' to the naked eye, as do the classified ads." (p.86) From within this perspective, the goal of all art is to falsify nature. This is also the goal of advertising. Levitt (1970) argues that advertising, like art, is part of civilized life, and is "man's attempt to transcend his ancient animility." (p. 87) An example of the link between art and advertising occurs with the actual packaging materials of the commodities. Levitt (1970) argues that the packaging design of a product will lead a consumer to purchase creatively wrapped goods over identical goods bundled in a plain wrapper. He maintains that the basis for the choice is predicated on humankind's supposed natural desire for symbolic communication. I will take issue with the term natural in the next chapter, but for now it is acceptable as long as it is prefaced by the knowledge that these are the assertions of Levitt. "I believe [that the] universal characteristic of human nature [is that] the human audience demands [sic] symbolic interpretation in everything it sees and knows." (p. 89)

Levitt (1970) also contends that people purchase commodities on the basis of problem solving. Advertising is used to inform the consumer that a given commodity will help solve a problem. This idea transcends the non-critical and
critical camps, although the critical camp addresses the notion of problem solving in a detailed manner.

...the problem of rising above [our] own negligibility, of escaping from nature's confining, hostile, and unpredictable reality, of finding significance, security, and comfort in the things [we] must do to survive.

(Levitt, p. 90)

Levitt's (1970) version of the problem solving argument assumes the stance that humans "naturally" have problems with themselves, and therefore are constantly trying to reconstruct themselves through consumption. This completes the argument that products are consumed on the basis of their ability to fulfill mental, emotional, and physical needs. One can fix or remake what is wrong with oneself based on consuming the ideas, values and beliefs surrounding a given commodity.

**Advertising as a Combination of Non-Critical Perspectives**

Oliver (1981) believes that advertising is both informational and persuasive. He contends that advertising is part of a three-step process. In his model, the first stage is to locate a "consumer need that is not being fulfilled." (Oliver, 1981, p. 1) The second step is to "design a product or service to meet the need at a price the consumer is able and willing to pay." (Oliver, 1981, p. 1) In the third phase, distribution and communication channels are arranged "using
advertising to inform consumers about the advantages and the availability of the product or service." (Oliver, 1981, p. 1) While his three-step process includes the model of information, it also includes (in the third stage) the notion of argument and persuasion. Oliver (1981) confronts the notion of advertising as a form of persuasion through the Report of the Royal Commission on Consumer Problems and Inflation (1968).

The view that persuasion is bad...must be rejected out of hand. [sic]

Persuasion is an inherent part of the democratic process. Indeed democracy would not work if people could not be persuaded to do some things, and not do others. Unalterable convictions, if they could not be channeled and provided adequate outlets, would lead to a breakdown of democracy. Moreover, the persuasion in advertising is innocuous in most instances. It is so because the point of persuasion is clearly evident, and, in the event the consumer succumbs he is not seriously hurt, except when he buys an unsafe vehicle or an unhealthful substance...the consumer is protected by his own intelligence... (Oliver, 1981, p.18)

Oliver (1981) concludes Advertising and society by surmising that "...in a conserver society as in a consumer one, advertising will continue to portray choices; people will continue to make choices."2 (p. 28) This reference suggests that Oliver (1981) views humans as active agents. The notion of choice prevents the consumer from being lured into buying a faulty commodity. Although the
information in the advertisement may be persuasive, the consumer has the ultimate choice in consumption. This further suggests that the success of free-market economy is inextricably hinged upon consumer behaviour.

In the preface to The Role of Advertising, Sandage and Fryburger (1960) agree that advertising is an essential part of capitalism and the free-market economy.

As a force in our economy it is vital to the operation of our free-market system. It affects consumption, production, and investment. As communication it informs, interprets, symbolizes, persuades, and often entertains. As an institution in our society it is held to be comparable to the school and the church in the magnitude of its social influence. As an instrument of business it links buyers to sellers in a vast, efficient communications network. (Sandage & Fryburger, 1960, p. v)

Their approach is extremely multifaceted because their work examines many aspects of advertising. Sandage (1960), in The Role of Advertising in Modern Society, believes that four major facets of the free-market economy have been influenced by advertising. "(1) high-level consumption, (2) allocation of resources, (3) stimulation of product variety, and (4) consumer prices."
(Sandage, 1960, p. 257) While all four parts are important, the latter three serve to sustain the first principle of maintenance of an economy based on high-level consumption. Without the first idea, the other three would serve without function.
Sandage (1960) argues that America changed from a society dependent upon the cottage industry (including mercantilism, craftwork, and agrarian practices) to a revolutionized mass produced goods oriented economy. "If the production and distribution facilities of America were devoted only to meeting the basic needs of the citizenry, only a fraction of our capital goods and labor force would be employed full-time." (Sandage, 1960, pp. 257-258) We see the emergence of dependency upon high levels of consumption and a high level of material standard of living. The free-market society of North America could not exist if people did not work to consume. Indeed, the system of the free-market economy is a system of excess, but within the excess, labour force employment is high—at least, in theory.

Sandage (1961) creates a distinction between advertising as an institution and advertising as an instrument. As an institution, Sandage (1961) suggests that advertising has been assigned three basic functions. "The most important functions are to communicate on a mass basis to (1) inform, (2) persuade, and (3) educate consumers in respect to products, services, and ideas." (p. 147) The tools of communication employed by the advertising institution are advertisements themselves and the mass media in which the advertisements are displayed.

Sandage (1961) also examines the notion that advertising is a form of consumer information. He argues that since we do not have the time to seek out products, corporations must make product knowledge readily available for our use. "It requires the dissemination of information as to where products and
services can be found, their quality characteristics presented in terms of consumer needs and consumer wants, and the cost to the consumer." (Sandage, 1961, p. 148) Sandage (1961) assumes that consumers have genuine needs and wants for products. The consumer has a given problem; consumption of a given product will correct the problem. The perspective that advertising is merely informational does not adequately address its role.

To overcome the limitations of the informational view of advertising, Sandage (1961) attempts to include the notion that advertising is a form of persuasion. He asserts that "persuasion is necessary to get people to extend and enrich the range of their wants, therefore their lives." (Sandage, 1961, p. 149) In acknowledging that advertising does in fact create greater need, Sandage (1961) does come closer to setting the issue within the framework of consumption. He argues that persuasion is necessary in order to keep the economy functioning; which, in turn, leads to more job creation. Sandage (1961) acknowledges that the process of labour for consumption with an injection of advertising to maintain the process is cyclical and very much a driving force behind our free-market economy. "It is perhaps sufficient to observe that our modern culture encourages this and that the institution of advertising is performing a function dictated by the culture itself." (Sandage, 1961, p. 150)

A third function of advertising, as noted by Sandage (1961), is that of consumer education. The consumer is provided with supreme agency because the consumer ultimately determines the life of the free-market system. The consumer chooses to consume, or not to consume.
The consumer, generally, is in a position to buy or not to buy in the case of a large percentage of the goods and services available or that can be made available. The ultimate freedom to choose is his. Our social ideal is an economic democracy built on the solid foundation of consumer choice. (Sandage, 1961, p. 151)

In order to help combat the overwhelming abundance of advertising, Sandage (1961) suggests that our schools should educate the consumer to the point where they can make wise selections among commodities.

Compare this with the process of education in our schools where we insist on presenting students with conflicting ideologies, hypotheses, theories, and descriptive matter with the knowledge that will help to develop discrimination, enhance judgment, and sharpen intellect. (Sandage, 1961, p. 152)

Sandage (1961) insists that advertisers should be provided with space in the mainstream press to present their ideas and be “afforded freedom from censorship.” (p. 158) Sandage (1961) also suggests that advertising may be the key to solving the problems of the world and create world peace. “It is possible that advertising can play an important role also in laying the foundations for eventual peace in the world.” (Sandage, 1961, p. 155) Peace would be achieved
through homogenization of the world though the ideology of advertising and the practice of mass production and mass consumption. Finally, he suggests that the methods employed in the United States could provide the world with a bounty of mass produced goods, raising the standard of living for all. "Is it not possible that the forces that brought economic abundance to America could be implemented to bring eventual abundance to the world?" (p. 155) Sandage's concluding statements are rather utopian, ethnocentric, and environmentally destructive.

**Summary of Advertising as a Combination of Views**

Oliver (1981) argues that people are rational and that advertising is both informative and persuasive. Persuasion is seen as a necessary component not only of advertising, but also the democratic process as a whole. People must use their intelligence in order to prevent being misled by advertising. Sandage (1960) and Sandage and Fryburger (1960) suggest that advertising is a cornerstone of the free-market economy itself. Advertising is as powerful a persuader of values as religion because like religion, it involves informing, persuading, interpreting and the symbolizing of ideas and events.

Sandage (1961) splits his analysis of advertising into two camps: advertising as an institution and advertising as an instrument. As an institution, advertising serves to inform, persuade, and educate. As an instrument, advertising serves to deliver information about a commodity and persuade a consumer to purchase it. Sandage (1961) argues that consumers have ultimate
choice over consumption of commodities. It is through the system of education that people are able to build up critical thinking skills that help evaluate claims to determine the validity of a commodity. Finally, Sandage (1961) suggests that advertising could provide world peace because advertisers are free from censorship and ideology. He suggests that employing the methods practiced by the United States would ultimately lead to a higher standard of living and benefits for all.

At this point I must make it clear that since the time of his writing, many critical discourses have been written. His problematic view does little more than encourage people to believe that the free-market economy system is paramount to all else. This belief is completely ignorant of the existing and extinct cultures around the world, which function and have functioned very well on their own. In the next chapter, we will examine the some of the critical perspectives of advertising. While these theories incorporate many of the ideas found in this chapter, they go far beyond the limited scope of the non-critical theorists. We will see why notions of ideology, manufactured consciousness, and even the foundations of the free-market system must all be questioned in order to round out the debate on the form and function advertising takes in North American society.
CHAPTER TWO
CRITICAL RESEARCH TRADITIONS OF ADVERTISING

So far we have examined three groups of theorists who believe that advertising is a beneficial and necessary component of the free-market economy. They tend to view advertising as a tool for disseminating information, a device of persuasion or a form of symbolism—some even combine two or all three of these perspectives in their theory. The one thing that has escaped their argument is any concrete criticism of advertising itself. They treat advertising as a neutral thing—something independent of the society in which it is created. Advertising is seen not as a tool of ideology, but as an agent used to promote commodities.

In this chapter we will examine some of the critical theories of advertising. The common thread that holds this group together is the belief that advertising is a tool by which ideological values are transmitted. Advertising is a product of free-market society and is saturated with free-market ideology. Even the critical perspective is split into fractions, but they all examine advertising within its social context. Some of the theorists criticize advertising itself and others further that argument by criticizing the entire capitalist framework. For this group of theorists, advertising is not only a type of information or persuasion, it is awash in symbolism and ideology. Their view of symbolism is not as simple as Levitt's (1970) because it is buttressed through the inclusion of semiotic theory (the study of signs). We will also examine theories that question the role of advertising as
part of the ideological framework of the free-market system. The theorists in this area argue that true democracy does not really exist in the free-market world, because capitalism has overtaken, appropriated and replaced true democratic values, beliefs, language, and practices with its own.

The Making of Meaning

In order to understand semiotics and ideology, we must first examine the role that meaning plays in our lives. What is meaning? Why do things mean something to us? Do we create our own meanings or is meaning something that is innate? Some theorists in semiotic discipline subscribe to the notion that things do not carry internal meaning within themselves. In other words, things are naturally free of meaning. It is only when we interpret or read an object that meaning is attributed to it. Meaning therefore, comes from within you and I, not from the thing itself. This implies that there is a split between an object in its natural, unrealized state and our interpretation of that object. When an object has a shared meaning among a population, that meaning is created through a negotiated process and becomes a cultural convention.

To illustrate this concept, let us examine a cultural convention of North America. In North America we tend to walk on the right-hand side of a sidewalk, hallway or staircase. Those of us who were born here probably do not consciously think of this as a learned practice until it is challenged by someone who does not subscribe to the norm. It becomes problematic when somebody
collides with you because they come from a culture in which people walk on the left-hand side as a normative practice. Who is at fault? Neither of you. Both of you are simply following cultural conventions. As a group, we have accepted that our way of walking in public is on the right-hand side. This is a cultural convention created through negotiation. It is negotiated and endorsed each and every time we observe the cultural rule of walking on the right-hand side. The meaning we attach to this practice may not be clear at first. To understand what it means we must look at our reaction to bumping into someone who does not observe the right-hand side rule. Sometimes we might get frustrated and curse the person who was unobservant of our rule. We might even say that the other person is stupid or ignorant. It is also possible for us to accept the blame and apologize for bumping into that person.

Csikszentmihalyi and Rochberg-Halton (1981) find this view of meaning making somewhat incomplete. They begin The Meaning of Things by dismissing the work of some prominent semioticians--Lévi-Strauss, Schneider, and Eco--on the basis that they all utilize a static symbol system in their theories.

According to these contemporary theories, the essence of culture is that it is a 'logical' system of conceptual beliefs rather than a life to be lived in the flesh and blood. Our view, by contrast, is to see nature and culture on a continuum, so that culture, or cultivation, is the completion of nature. (Csikszentmihalyi & Rochberg-Halton, 1981, p. 174)
This view suggests that things carry some types of meaning with them already—that is, an object may not be judged solely by cultural convention alone, but also on the merits of the object itself. Meaning, therefore is realized through one's interaction with an object. Csikszentmihalyi and Rochberg-Halton (1981) refer to this process as a *transaction*. "Transactions are psychic activities (or communicative sign processes) and not simply physical behaviors *per se*, although they involve physical behaviors; and there are different modes of transactions." (Csikszentmihalyi & Rochberg-Halton, 1981, p. 175) The three key modes of transaction are the *aesthetic experience*, the *flow of psychic energy*, and the *goals of transactions* with objects.

In terms of the aesthetic experience, Csikszentmihalyi and Rochberg-Halton (1981) draw heavily from Dewey (1934) when they suggest that humans interact with objects on two levels—*recognition* and *perception*. Csikszentmihalyi and Rochberg-Halton (1981) assert that recognition is an extrinsic process because it works on a passive level. On this level, a person will most likely judge an object based on the way that their culture has suggested they judge the object. For example, one may value the work of Martha Stewart because she has made it fashionable for women to enjoy housework, hosting, and interior decorating. Martha Stewart is valued on a social level (extrinsic) and also on a passive level because one merely has to emulate or improve upon the creations of Martha Stewart in order to be socially accepted.

The perception of an object involves much more than just the mere recognition of what it means on a cultural level. Csikszentmihalyi and Rochberg-
Halton (1981) argue that perception is based on "critical receptivity to the object so that its qualities may modify previously formed habits or interpretive associations." (p. 181) This process is intrinsic because it allows people to learn. Under this model, a person must change their framework so that they can include new meanings which were previously unrealized. A perception of Martha Stewart and her practices would occur if one were to look at her work and recognize an ideology that is counter to the socially accepted ideology. In this case, one might read her as a symbol of an oppressive Victorian ideology—the myth of the "Angel in the house." This counter reading perceives Stewart for what she represents in her own pragmatic terms, something that is not portrayed by the societal interpretation of Martha Stewart.

The second mode of transaction is that of the flow of psychic energy. "When we turn to consider how psychic energy is channeled, it becomes clear that attention plays the key role in serving to limit and direct psychic energy." (Csikszentmihalyi & Rochberg-Halton, 1981, p. 184) Flow in objects appears to work in two particularly different ways. The first way is that flow works is that it facilitates "familiar symbolic context" with objects, and in turn, objects will "reaffirm the identity of the owner." (Csikszentmihalyi & Rochberg-Halton, 1981, p. 187) In this case objects and their owner are merely extensions of each other. A particular brand of soda pop can come to represent a person (or person can represent the soda) because they consume it on a regular basis. The process of affirmation and reaffirmation is habitual because it is based on familiarity, and therefore, little attention is required to facilitate this kind of flow.
The second type of flow involves paying great attention to an object. This type of flow involves perception because one must engage directly with an object, not with its associations. Csikszentmihalyi and Rochberg-Halton (1981) use the example of a young person playing drums: "They're an activity...I can really get into them after playing for a while. I just turn on the radio, close my eyes—it gets that I'm in the music, in the record."^3 (Csikszentmihalyi & Rochberg-Halton, 1981, p. 186) The person not only has objects that are familiar, but engages with the objects on a perceptual level. The music, the radio, the person become one directly through their interaction, thus, a great deal of attention is required for this second type of flow.

The third aspect of transactions are the goals of one’s transactions with objects. The role of intent is the key to this stage. "The importance of the cultural environment from this perspective is that it facilitates adaptation or socialization, that is, indicates goals, acts as a rule for conduct, has a purposive influence." (Csikszentmihalyi & Rochberg-Halton, 1981, p. 188) The objects one values are governed by one’s set of beliefs. An object has meaning to someone because it reflects, upholds or embodies the values sustained by an individual at a given moment in time.

Ultimate goals provide a standard toward which actions are, or should be aimed. Thus when one values a cherished photo, or souvenir, or plant, these transactions are intentional activities that reflect what one considers
significant and which involve real outcomes. (Csikszentmihalyi &
Rochberg-Halton, 1981, p. 188)

This does not suggest that people never change their values. Instead, it argues
that goals provide us with a direction to follow so that we may learn more or at
the very least, pursue continued interaction with an object.

Csikszentmihalyi and Rochberg-Halton (1981) discuss how transaction
works in terms of the personal self, the social self, and the cosmic self. The
personal self is based on the idea that there is a private self that nobody else
knows, typical of “Americans who believe in ‘rugged individualism.’”
(Csikszentmihalyi & Rochberg-Halton, 1981, p. 191) is that which is created
through interaction with family, friends, and institutions. The cosmic self is that
which entails the person’s interaction with the universe—“the portion of the self
involved in the creation, discovery, or embodiment of the laws of the universe,
distinct, but inseparable, selves make up who we are at any given moment.
These selves are not fixed, but like the meaning of objects, are in a constant
state of negotiation.

The transactions between people and objects, as well as the definition of
self, are manipulated by advertising. Csikszentmihalyi and Rochberg-Halton
(1981) assert that there is an emphasis placed on the private self in American
society—arguably, this is the case for Canada as well.
The valuing of the personal self as the sole ultimate goal, which often is actually a goal of private self, can thus be seen as privative, as deprivation rather than as ultimate fulfillment, because it excludes those larger patterns of meaning whose internalization and personification are essential to the reality of human existence. (Csikszentmihalyi & Rochberg-Halton, 1981, p. 195)

The problem with privatization of the self is that it shelters one from the society in which one lives. One cannot develop a true sense of self because one develops notions of self through internal measures. If one does not interact with others, then the sense of self one develops is limited to a single, subjective position. In this instance, notions of the self become completely esoteric to the rest of the society in which one lives. The ideal situation would be for a person to interact with as many people as is possible in order to understand how he or see is seen by others. A measure such as this would allow for critical personal evaluation, based on the models of perception and flow. (Csikszentmihalyi & Rochberg-Halton, 1981, p. 195)
Meaning and Ideology in Advertisements

Contrary to the concept of the public self, advertisements stress notions of individualism—"You need to consume," "Our commodity will fix the problem you have." In order to address the concept of meaning in advertisements we will begin by examining the ideas of Dyer (1982) and Williamson (1984). Advertising is seen as an extremely powerful device; one that not only informs, but shapes the consciousness and ideas of the people who read it. The critical view is much more substantial than the informational, rational consumer model because it takes issue with notions of agency. The advertisement is far from a neutral or mildly persuasive force. In their theories, Dyer (1982) and Williamson (1984) make a point of examining advertising in its social, political and economic context.

Advertisements may, as others claim, inform consumers of new products, remind them to use existing products, and suggest that consumers switch brands. While this may be the some of case, it is not the entire case. Dyer (1982) examines the notion of material fulfillment as a replacement for traditional means of fulfilling intrinsic needs. Based on the ideas of the Frankfurt School, she takes a very critical stance toward advertising. Dyer suggests that while a material culture does provide for a higher standard of living in terms of material wealth, it "encourages social and political apathy." (Dyer, 1982, p. 81) Dyer (1982) further argues that when people are treated as markets "no arena exists where arguments about alternative products or the provision of goods and services for
social needs can take place.” (p. 83) In effect, this preserves the system because there is an extreme lack of reflection and self-criticism of the system. The free-market system is endorsed as it is merely seen as the way things are.

Dyer (1982) discusses two important concepts related to advertising that were originally developed by Marcuse. First, advertising is based on the "manipulation of false needs." (Dyer, 1982, p. 81) We will see later that this is slightly different from Williamson (1984), who argues that the class categories created by advertising were false. The idea that needs are false is somewhat misleading because false is judged in terms of traditional values and needs. It is possible for a false need to be real. It is just as real to need a mass-produced soft drink as it is to need a glass of water. The notion of false does apply, for example, to the argument that a specific brand of soft drink will replenish one's thirst better than competing alternatives. This is an example of the difference between a value (preference of soda pop) and a fundamental need for survival (water). The idea of false needs does not work when it is placed in a context such as the free-market system. The need to consume is very real within this framework. In fact, the need to consume is fundamental to the survival of the free-market system. It can even be argued that traditional values themselves are false as well because they are also predicated on a specific framework. What is important here is that Dyer (1982), through Marcuse, suggests that the need to consume is constructed, and is not natural.

Dyer (1982) argues that a constructed reality that appears as natural "blocks peoples ability to recognize that people are being controlled." (Dyer,
Although people are presented with an abundant array of choices—choices of an endless amount of products, services, and beliefs—they are limited to choices available within a specific socio-economic framework. Advertising effectively eradicates notions that exist outside of its ideology because it presents itself as being natural.

Since advertisements pitch their ideology to the individual, there is a tendency for the individual to become segregated from his or her community. This process is called alienation. “Alienation is a concept which is used to refer to the mental and physical separation of people from each other and from real involvement with their work and society.” (Dyer, 1982, p. 81) When people become fragmented from their community, there is a danger that debate over social ideas, values, practices, and norms will subside. If we are to assume that democracy is an active process, then apathy most certainly cannot be a benefit.

Dyer (1982) also rejects the simple informational view of advertising in favour of one that encompasses the ideology of the system in which advertising is created.

What an ad means depends upon how it operates, how signs and its 'ideological' effect are organized internally (within the text) and externally (in relation to its production, circulation and consumption and in relation to technological, economic, legal and social relations). (Dyer, 1982, p. 115)
Dyer's (1982) view emphasizes the evaluation of an advertisement's social and historical context, something that is missing from most of the informational, persuasive and symbolic views of advertising. An advertisement is not simply an independent piece of information about a product or service, but is created within a specific framework, to serve a specific purpose, and to call attention to our own values as we form an interpretation of the text. In other words, we bring our own set of values to an advertisement (social and personal meaning) when we read it, but those values have also been created within the free-market framework. As we read an advertisement, we interpret the interactions among the components within the text and form an opinion about the way in which the product conforms to our need to consume, and the way in which it structures the relationships surrounding consumption of that product.

Another serious problem with advertising occurs when it is tied to the mainstream media. The use of advertising as a source of revenue for the mass media force the media to ignore important or controversial issues in favour of issues that will not upset their financial sources. Dyer (1982) suggests that freedom of the press provides illusory independence from advertisers' influence. It really means "that the freedom to publish rests in the hands of the advertisers; they are free to compete, and free to take their advertisements elsewhere, if the editorial matter, the ambiance, or the audience is not to their liking." (Dyer, 1982, p. 68) According to Dyer then, truth is not only dependent upon the advertisers. Truth is the view of the advertisers. Controversial news items rarely make it into mainstream newspapers, television and radio, but these are few and far
between. The media, in effect, become a tool by which the system of the free-
market economy perpetuates itself, but under the illusion that the information
presented is objective and free of ideology.

Williamson’s (1984) motivation for her study of advertising is based on her
personal experiences with advertising. In order to understand her frustration with
the messages within advertising, Williamson (1984) attempted to reconcile her
desire to achieve the magazine glamour she admired as a teenager. Her
theoretical knowledge told her that her desire was an unattainable myth. This
lead Williamson (1984) to question herself. “So what made me want it? A real
need--but falsely fulfilled; in fact, sustained by its perpetual unfulfillment.” (p. 9)

Williamson (1984) argues that advertising has a dual function. The first
function, as mentioned above, is to sell products and services. “But it has another
function, which I believe in many ways replaces that traditionally fulfilled by art or
religion. It creates structures of meaning.” (Williamson, 1984, pp. 11-12) These
structures of meaning go beyond the words or images involved. The focus shifts
to an examination of how the words and images interact with one another, and
what meanings the commodities attain through the reading of an advertisement.
“Advertisements...provide a structure which is capable of transforming the
language of objects to that of people, and vice versa.” (Williamson, 1984, p. 12)
Williamson (1984) contends that through this transformation, people and objects
become interchangeable.
Williamson (1984) argues that while the true class system is predicated on the role one assumes in the production process, people are judged on the basis of what they consume.

But in our society...it is the products of their own work that are used, in the false categories invoked by advertising, to obscure the real structure of society by replacing class with the distinctions made by the consumption of particular goods.⁴ (Williamson, 1984, p. 13)

The problem with placing value in the products consumed is that it conceals the fact that people are socially limited by their actual financial class. As Williamson (1984) notes, people are led to believe that they can change social status through the consumption of certain kinds or brands of commodities. The way in which two conflicting views, economic class versus consumption class, can work together is a function of ideology.

Williamson (1984) defines ideology as “the meaning made necessary by the conditions of society while helping to perpetuate those conditions.”⁵ (p. 13) This notion is predicated on what Williamson (1984) calls the human “need to belong, to have social ‘place.’” (p. 13) Since this process of belonging is not performed through the actual class system based on production, but through a system based on consumption and advertising messages, one’s social place is extremely malleable.
The fact that advertising does not have a subject creates distance between those who created and those who consume the advertisement. Williamson (1984) argues that the gap left by the absence of a speaker is filled in by the reader, and thus the reader becomes “both listener and speaker.” (p. 14) When the speaker and reader become one, Williamson (1984) contends that the advertisement then “works in practice as anonymous speech.” (p. 14) The speech itself contains interconnected symbols and metaphors that provide the object and ourselves with social meaning.

The other important aspect of commodities, which so far has been neglected, is their pure utility value. “Advertising gives those goods a social meaning so that two needs are crossed, and neither is adequately fulfilled.” (Williamson, 1984, p. 14) This happens because commodities are unable to live up to their social value base on their utility alone. Social meaning is also in a constant state of negotiation. What is in style today, will most certainly be out of style tomorrow because of the basic, vital need of the system to encourage people to consume again.

Most commodities are sold based on their ability to conform to or create a lifestyle for the consumer, not based on their utility. In the process, utility becomes secondary to social meaning. Pure intrinsic human needs (e.g.: love, happiness, health, sleep) are said to be fulfilled by consumption of a commodity. “Material things that we need are made to represent the other, non-material things we need; the point of exchange between the two is where ‘meaning’ is created.” (Williamson, 1984, p. 14) The value of a commodity can only be
realized, as Levitt (1970) suggested, at the point of consumption. The utility value of a product can be proven through demonstration and trial. For example, an apple peeler will peel apples to within nth degree of success on a regular basis. What if the advertisement makes inferences about peeling apples as a method of personal fulfillment? We see a link forged between achieving happiness through peeling apples with said apple peeler. Even if the product works all of the time, one may still not achieve full product value if they are unsatisfied with the ability of the product to create happiness. Material things do not always live up to their social meaning and they are often unable to fulfill intrinsic needs because they are not designed to do so.

A third group of theorists, Leiss, Kline and Jhally (1991) also believe in the ideological view of advertisements. This group subscribes to a well-rounded view of advertising as an institution and they locate their theory within the context of the free-market economy. As such, I have broken down their theory into several parts. Leiss, Kline and Jhally (1991) separate the characteristics of a commodity and talk about the imagery surrounding its advertisement. While they may agree with less critical theorists that there are informational qualities about a product presented in an advertisement, they insist that there is also an ideological structure surrounding the advertisement and the commodity involved. Leiss, Kline and Jhally (1991) assert that there are two types of attributes involved with most consumer products. First, there are the physical attributes—those which describe its chemical makeup, shape, and absolute utility. The second characteristic of a product is its imputed qualities. These include the images
surrounding a product which conform with or create lifestyle attributes in the individual who uses the product. (Leiss, Kline and Jhally, 1991) Although it is the imputed attributes that are of concern here (in order to emphasize the ideological properties of advertisements), it is important to note that both imputed and physical characteristics are necessary to ascertain satisfaction and meaning from a given commodity.

I would like to add to Leiss, Kline and Jhally (1991) in suggesting that the physical attributes of a product are actually based on imputed characteristics in the first place. In many cases, things such as clothing, automobiles, flavoured coffee, and even computers are created based on image and not necessarily on their practical use. Let us examine the case of clothing. Clothes definitely have physical attributes of varying styles and combinations, but the materials used are not free of ideology. The importance of physical attributes is only worthy when comparing, for example, cotton to polyester. The choice of material for clothing in many cases, is based on an imputed characteristic such as style or taste. Meaning is inextricably wrapped up in the imputed attributes, and not necessarily the physicality of a garment. A polyester shirt may be considered to be in style, but it is not necessarily the polyester that gives one satisfaction when wearing the shirt. More so, it is the perception that polyester is in style that provides the satisfaction. Obviously my argument falls apart on the merit of tactile sensation and pleasure (just think of something soft like silk or velour, or a cool linen shirt in the summer time), but even a small degree of enjoyment of that material is predicated on notions of what is considered to be sensuous. This type of taste is
certainly not universal, nor innate. The only natural part of the examples described above would be to keep the body at a comfortable temperature.

Leiss, Kline and Jhally (1991) assert that imagery is the key to understanding the role of advertisements within our free-market economy. The relationship between the physical attributes and the imputed attributes is actually constructed through a process of negotiation, not based on a natural connection. The need to consume is also constructed, but it is based on what perhaps can be considered an innate feeling or the need for satisfaction. "The message structure [of an advertisement] as a whole plays upon ambiguous feelings for the well-established, traditional formats for satisfying needs on the one hand and for the attractions of new products on the other." (Leiss, Kline and Jhally, 1991, p. 60)

On one side there are sentimental values of need satisfaction based on traditions, and on the other side are the needs of the free-market economy. Adsvertisements link the need for satisfaction with the need to consume.

Leiss, Kline and Jhally (1991) turn to the issue of how advertisements motivate people to consume. In contemporary North America, the need to consume is part of one's learning and practices since the time they are born. Leiss, Kline and Jhally (1991) argue that the structure of advertising plays with the self-consciousness of the reader through its suggestion that "one should be at least somewhat dissatisfied with what one has or is doing." (p. 61)

Advertisements are inscribed with ideology that is supposed to enable people to overcome their dissatisfaction through consumption of the product. Advertising is the device through which commodity consumption and lifestyles are united.
The focal point of Leiss, Kline and Jhally (1991), for my purposes, is their view of the role of advertising in social interaction. They suggest that criticisms of advertising within the social interaction camp focus on the perpetuation of ideologies. These ideologies include stereotypes, goals, values, and imagery that dehumanizes, for example: sexism, racism, materialism, inequality, and lack of diversity. (Leiss, Kline and Jhally, 1991, p. 304) While these ideologies limit the way in which advertisements present the world, they do serve to sustain the free-market system. Leiss, Kline and Jhally (1991) argue that rather than focusing upon the functions, problems and outcomes of advertising, we should address the larger social issue of our concerns about free-market economy and the institutions within it.

A Summary of Advertising, Ideology and Meaning

Dyer (1982) and Williamson (1984) both address the notion of myth creation tied to consumption. Dyer (1982) argues that the need to consume is false, but it appears to us as a natural part of human existence. Dyer (1982) further suggests that being wrapped up in notions of consumption leads to political and social apathy because people do not realize that they are being guided. Dyer (1982) addresses the problem surrounding advertising and the mainstream media. The media often will ignore progressive or controversial issues in favour of those which conform to the beliefs of those who financially
support the media outlet—the advertisers. This turns the media into a tool of ideology. The danger of this process is that the media still purport to be ideology free and portray themselves as objective.

For Williamson (1984) the notion of a false class system was crucial in perpetuating the consumer society. People are led to believe that they can change their social class and status through consumption. Williamson (1984) argues that advertising serves more than to merely inform people about commodities. She suggests that advertising also creates meaning—replacing the meanings made by more traditional structures, such as religion and art. Advertising eradicates traditional notions of class and replaces them with class distinctions based on one's ability to consume. Advertisements themselves are void of a subject, but the role of the subject is fulfilled by the reader because the reader becomes both the speaker and the listener. This leads to the appearance that the advertisement is an anonymous utterance—providing social meaning without a contextual reference to its real creator.

Leiss, Kline and Jhally (1991) assert that a commodity and its advertisement have two types of attributes, physical and imputed. Physical qualities refer to the actual utility of a commodity. Imputed qualities deal with the images surrounding the commodity—this is where most of the ideology resides. Traditional values have been replaced by values associated with commodities. Intrinsic meaning is something to be purchased and realized through consumption. We are presented with a range of possible meanings. This range is so large that we think it is open ended, but in reality the range is very limited. The
range of choice we have resides almost solely within the framework of the free-market system.

The Institution of Advertising

Dyer (1982), Williamson (1984) and Leiss, Kline and Jhally (1991) question the ability of the system to provide intrinsic need fulfillment to the people within it. One important problem they examine is that of replacing the class system based on production with a class system based on consumption. Scitovsky (1976), in The Joyless Economy, provides and excellent treatment of the shift in associating one’s social status with consumption as opposed to more traditional associations with means of production. Like Dyer (1982), Williamson (1984), and Leiss, Kline and Jhally (1991), Scitovsky (1976) also believes that the rational consumer view and the informational model of advertising of the free-market economy and advertising is very limiting. He suggests that consumers are not always aware of their needs and wants and that their interests are at times quite whimsical.

[The rational-informational] approach overlooks the fact that tastes are highly variable, easily influenced by example, custom, and suggestion, constantly changed by the accumulation of experience, and modified by
changing prices and the availability of some satisfactions and the
unavailability of others. (Scitovsky, 1976, p. 5)

Scitovsky (1976) also contends that the satisfaction one receives from
consuming goods, might also be altered by the modification of consumer tastes.
To examine consumption habits, Scitovsky (1976) dismisses the rational-
informational model because it is “unscientific,” and decides to analyze consumer
behaviour through consumer motivation. (p. 5)

One important aspect of Scitovsky’s (1976) work is that it tackles the
question of income and its relation to personal happiness. Scitovsky (1976) found
that while economic welfare may rise, people were not necessarily happier
because of the overall increase or benefit to society. When one’s personal
income increases over other people’s incomes during the same period of time,
people seemed to be more happy. (Scitovsky, 1976, p. 135) Scitovsky (1976)
argues that this works on the principle of novelty.

There is novelty in the change from a lower to a higher level of living, and
the satisfactions such novelty yields are not only additional to those
derived from a stable level of living, they are also likely to be much more
important and more vividly remembered. (Scitovsky, 1976, p. 138)

While “highs” may increase satisfaction, “lows” can also have a positive
impact on personal satisfaction. Scitovsky (1976) provides an example of a
college student moving from a nice home to a barren apartment. He suggests that this type of change, or freeing oneself of a routine lifestyle, can have a positive impact—in this case, more freedom and personal responsibility for the student. The only time that downgrading one’s lifestyle (in these terms) appears to have a positive effect is when one is not forced to make the change and when a change is not long term. “When a reduction in our standard of living is imposed by economic necessity, it usually seems quite painful.” (Scitovsky, 1976, p. 138)

Scitovsky (1976) suggests that the systems of status and rank are “addictive.” (p. 138) When we achieve a certain level of status or rank, and maintain it for a while, Scitovsky (1976) argues that we begin to take that acquired level for granted. The result is that “we cling to them not for the satisfaction they yield, but to avoid the pain their loss would inflict.” (Scitovsky, 1976, p. 139) Scitovsky (1976) warns us that economic quantification of human satisfaction is problematic, especially when dealing with the figures pertaining to the average national income. “Economic quantification is attractive and useful, but we must not let it seduce us into attaching more significance to the measure of quantity and to what is quantified then they deserve.” (Scitovsky, 1976, p. 139)

From Scitovsky’s (1976) work thus far, we may draw a few conclusions. Some personal satisfaction through attaining a higher level of income. In turn, this is tied to an increase in the level of personal consumption. When one attains a certain level, it is much more difficult to go back down to a lower level of income for a long period of time. The idea that status and rank are addictive also suggests that consumption itself is addictive.
Let us return to the idea of novelty, or stimulus, as referred to by Scitovsky (1976). He argues that the need for stimulus is documented, at least, back to Roman times, in their phrase “bread and circuses.” (Scitovsky, 1976, p. 150) If we accept that humans need to be stimulated for satisfaction as a basic human need then why do economic theorists ignore this need? Our own judgment of our standard of living is based on things such as number of cars, televisions, and food consumption, but seldom acknowledges that these choices are based on comfort level, not our level of pleasure. “We have unwittingly fallen into the habit of identifying a high standard of living with a high level of comfort, neglecting stimulation or pleasure as a source of satisfaction and assuming that the more comfort we have the better off we must be.” (Scitovsky, 1976, p. 152) The problem with judgements based on higher levels of material comfort is that they are subjective because they favour the values of capitalism.

Scitovsky (1976) examines some of the products we (it is American data, but the situation is again, arguably the same in Canada) consume and services we seek by comparing them to European consumption patterns and costs. He concludes that US citizens pay more for products and services, and consume more products, energy and services than the European counterparts. In relation to commodities, “we seek and secure them in excess—not in relation to a norm, but in the sense that we obtain them either in larger quantities than we can use, or to the point where they do more harm than good.” (Scitovsky, 1976, p. 181) A prime example of the harm created through over consumption is the excess prescription of antibiotics. Annually, 30,000 lives are lost and $2.24 billion is
charged in treatment expenses in the US—half of which were unnecessary. (Scitovsky, 1976, p. 169)

The need to consume is ultimately wrapped up in the values of the Puritans. Scitovsky (1976) suggests that advertising does not necessarily persuade consumers to consumer specific commodities, but it does encourage consumers to select a specific brand of a commodity. (p. 205) The notion of consumption, he argues, is based on the ideas of Puritanism.

The Puritans were 'an earnest, zealous, godly generation, scorning delights, punctual in labor [sic], constant in prayer, thrifty and thriving, filled with a decent pride in themselves and their calling, assured that strenuous toil is acceptable to Heaven.' (Scitovsky, 1976, p. 205.)

This is evident today in both Canada and the United States. It is evident in our free-market economic system through its dominance over many aspects of our lives. The notions within religion, while still strong in a few people, have been replaced in many cases with the praises of capitalism. The concept of the hard worker is still a position which is rewarded, but in the form of overtime pay or bonuses. The notion of punctuality surfaces in our businesses, labour contracts, and the ritualized work routine. There are rules governing the time at which one arrives to work, how long one's break periods are, how many sick days one is allowed, and how much vacation time one is afforded. The one exception to the Puritan model appears to be "scorning in delights," as consumption could be
considered a delight. A change in the view of consumption was necessary to justify its necessity.

The notions that we, as consumers, draw from this group include that of preference of comfort over pleasure; Scitovsky (1976) notes Puritans were "against pleasure." (p. 205) The only pleasures tolerated by Puritans were simple in nature, any kind of artificial pleasure was not acceptable. Pleasure from consumption would have been considered objectionable. Scitovsky (1976) asserts that the value of a person's craft has been replaced by the money that a person makes. Just as Williamson (1984) had argued, this suggests that the amount of money made by a person becomes the measure by which he or she is judged. "We use money not only as a medium of exchange, but also as the measuring rod of a man's worth, and we value income not only for the goods it will buy, but also as the proof of our usefulness to society." (Scitovsky, 1976, p. 207) Clearly, the way in which one visibly demonstrates their income (other than through direct indication of the exact figure) to the rest of the world is through consumption. In this case, consumption is not a delight, but is the measure of the pride and worth of a person.

**Combining Analogous Critical Perspectives**

When combined with Williamson's (1984) and Dyer's (1982) ideology of advertisements, Scitovsky's (1976) work becomes much more important. For
Scitovsky (1976), status and rank, as well as income are fundamental for an increase in novelty and maintenance of status level. Williamson (1984) argues that advertisements present us with values regarding status, beliefs, customs, norms and morals. It is not much of a stretch to suggest that the values presented in advertising play a great deal upon our notions of the importance of status, rank, income levels, and satisfactions derived from material consumption. If advertising does create a reality based on consumption to satisfy the needs and wants of a person, the notion of personal value is therefore driven greatly by business and has little to do with any intrinsic desires of the individual. That notion is the foundation for the work of Ewen (1976) and his argument that the consumption mentality is not natural, but is created by business in order to provide an outlet for the surplus of mass produced goods. We will visit him later.

The Free-Market System, Advertising and Its Foundations

In Propaganda (1928), Edward Bernays examines the “new propaganda,” or advertising and media messages combined with the free-market system. He also looks at the problems of our market society functioning under the system of democratic rule. Although his writings deal with the United States during the 1920s, the tenets of his argument equally apply to the situation in Canada (both in the 1920s and in the 1990s). Bernays (1928) argued that any type of message directed toward the public in an attempt to win their belief in the message (and
therefore, consent) must be done using the new propaganda. "Modern propaganda is a consistent, enduring effort to create or shape events to influence the relations of the public to an enterprise, idea or group." (Bernays, 1928, p. 25) Bernays (1928) maintains that this is done in every field including politics, industry, and even education.

Universal literacy was supposed to educate the common man to control his environment. Once he could read and write he would have a mind fit to rule. So ran the democratic doctrine. But instead of a mind, universal literacy has given him rubber stamps, rubber stamps inked with advertising slogans, with editorials, with published scientific data, with the trivialities of the tabloids and the platitudes of history, but quite innocent of original thought. Each man's rubber stamps are the duplicates of millions of others, so that when those millions are exposed to the same stimuli, all receive identical imprints. (Bernays, 1928, p. 20)

Although this passage predicated on the cause and effect model, it does provide several important points. It illustrates the principle of a constructed conscious informed by the perspectives of those in charge of the education system. The quote also suggests that the teaching of free-thinking is not really a part of education. Instead, the real aim of education is to indoctrinate the student into societal beliefs, norms, customs and values in order to prepare the next generation for entry into the system. The notion of free thought aside, the
problem with indoctrination into the system is that there are very few people who are in control of the creation of the beliefs, norms, customs and values that are taught to the educated masses. While people do have the ability to think for themselves, the overwhelming amount of business generated ideology is enough to make free thought an extreme chore. "[Business seeks] to inject itself into the lives and customs of millions of persons." (Bernays, 1928, p. 64) It is because of this injection that people will purchase products that they may not even need in the first place, in order to keep the mass market oriented production system flowing. "Mass production is only profitable if its rhythm can be maintained—that is, if it can continue to sell its product in steady or increasing quantity." (Bernays, 1928, p. 63)

The technique of demand creation is demonstrated through Bernays' (1928) example of the velvet industry during the early part of the 1900s. "The public has its own standards and demands and habits. You may modify them, but you dare not run counter to them...the public is not an amorphous mass which can be molded at will, dictated to." (Bernays, 1928, p. 66) The use of leading sources or important figures in a society to endorse products, sometimes known as star power, is necessary. This technique was employed by the velvet industry in the early 1900s in order to sell their fashions.

According to Bernays (1928), the velvet industry was losing business and in danger of disappearing because velvet had gone out of fashion. In a desire to keep the industry alive, manufacturers decided that velvet had to be revived in the United States. Turning to Paris (Lyons to be precise), where silk was made,
the velvet manufactures learned about the latest trends in the fashion scene. They enlisted the help of Parisians, who visited designers in Lyons and encouraged them to use velvet in their designs instead of silk. When several members of royalty were persuaded to wear these new fashions, the hook had been set. Back in the United States, the velvet gowns were presented to women who were purchasing dresses. The women purchased these gowns not only because they liked them, but because people were led to believe that velvet clothes were in fashion based on who was wearing them. In turn, the media were enlisted to describe these new dresses and in doing so, helped convince the masses that the dresses were in fashion.

Bernays (1928) contends that the new propaganda has tremendous power and influence.

It takes into account not merely of the individual, nor even of the mass mind alone, but also and especially of the anatomy of society, with its interlocking group formations and loyalties. It sees the individual not only as a cell in the social organism but as a cell organized into the social unit. Touch a nerve at a sensitive spot and you get an automatic response from certain specific members of the organism. (p. 28)

His notions of condition and response reek of behaviourism (the view that humans are completely reactive). Bernays (1928) does manage to locate this process within a contextualized idea of created consumer consciousness. He
argues that people have been led up to the point of consumption through the various institutions within society. What and when a person chooses to consume is where the response takes place.

Perhaps what is really going on is not a conditioned response, but an active choice within a given set of limits. To put it another way, people may make choices about what they consume and are not consuming once a "consumption button" has been pressed or stimulated by an advertisement. People can actively seek out alternatives to the commodities presented in an advertisement, or question the nature of the advertisement altogether. A more accurate examination would suggest that due to the system employed by those in power, people are fed a range of information. Within that range of information, people make what they believe are open choices. The problem is not one of conditioned response, but of apparent open-ended decision making. Unless people are aware of their framework, they will tend to make decisions from within it. In the free-market arena, they will consume because the free-market model works so effectively that consumption appears to be the natural thing to do. When presented with a range of issues, most of the choices reside within the framework and therefore critical or even extensive evaluation of the system of consumption cannot be performed. Rather than looking at people as reactive, people should be thought of as active agents operating within a limited scope of thinking and decision making.

Finally, the free-market system will continue to perpetuate itself because once those who are in power die or are removed from power, their progeny will
take over and maintain some type of order. The new propaganda is given the job of education and maintenance of order.

And if nowadays the successors of the rulers, those whose position or ability gives them power, can no longer do what they want without the approval of the masses, they find in propaganda a tool which is increasingly powerful in gaining that approval. Therefore, propaganda is here to stay. (p. 27)

How will the cycle be broken? Hopefully it will be broken (at the very least illuminated) through efforts which expose and denaturalize not only the framework of the free-market economy, but how the agents operate within that framework. How then, did this system come to be?

Ewen (1976) is one theorist who has thoroughly traced the roots of consumer consciousness. Like Bernays (1928), he argues that the notion of consumption is not natural, but created by the heads of business in charge of the industrial revolution during the 1920s. Notions of “progress, power, and sensuality” through consumption were introduced into a male dominated language based around the almighty machine. (Ewen, 1976, p. 5) There was also a role change in and within the institutions of religion, education, legislation and the military. The focus for business was to change a traditional agrarian society in to one that would be willing to work in factories and to consume a surplus of mass produced goods.
Industrialization, then, was more than a question of producing more goods in a new way. It also entailed a process of socialization which was aimed at stabilizing and inculcating fidelity among whose labor was being conscripted. (Ewen, 1976, p. 6)

This process effectively reduced the unity of workers as well as personal meaning in the production process. In other words, people were now working in a fragmented environment; their efforts did not result in an end product of their own creation. People became replaceable cogs in a giant machine known as a factory.

With the change in mentality of the worker, a change in the mentality of the purchaser had to take place in order to complete the cycle. Although there was a way to produce more goods at a lower cost, people did not seem to understand that the goods had to be consumed in order to keep the system working. They had no immediate need for the abundance of commodities. There was also the problem of feelings of fragmentation among workers, as they seemed to lack a meaningful purpose in the production process. Make no mistake, the free-market consumer is an invention of big business. We will revisit this invention later.

The method of re-instilling meaning was to employ advertising which substituted its meanings for traditional meanings.
True, advertising was to develop as a tool of social order whose selfespoused purpose was the “nullification” of the “customs of the ages: [to]...break down the barriers of individual habit.” It defined itself as “at once the destroyer and creator in the process of the ever-evolving new. Its constructive effort [was]...to superimpose new conceptions of individual attainment and community desire”; to solidify the productive process while at the same time parrying anticorporate feeling. Beyond standing at the helm of the industrial machines, businessmen understood the social nature of their hegemony. They looked to move beyond their nineteenth-century characterization as captains of industry toward a position in which they could control the entire social realm. They aspired to become captains of consciousness [italics mine]...[advertising] altered [the course of industrialization] and its meaning within people’s lives. (Ewen, 1976, p. 19)

At this time, the role of advertising also changed. Initially, advertising magazines, trade periodicals, and newspapers tended to be purely informational. The advertisements were predicated on product claims that were factual—an advertisement said what the product would do. The change in advertising during the 1920s through Ewen’s (1976) captains was to shift the utilitarian sell to that of the intrinsic qualities of the product. (p. 35) In other words, the focus became selling products based on one’s self-awareness and self-consciousness rather than on product utility alone. A study by Lynd (c1929), quoted in Ewen (1976),
even went so far as to suggest that there is a better chance of selling a product if you base the advertising around a person's critical self-consciousness than on the "merit of the product alone" (Ewen, 1976, p. 38) (this notion is also echoed by Dyer (1982) and Williamson (1984)).

Coupled with the change in the focus of advertising, there was a change in the view of society as a whole. Business came to stress the individual as well as the idea of mass consumption over more traditional definitions of class based and family oriented society. The change in meaning became apparent when traditional family values and mode of production were dropped in favour of the mass mentality. No longer was it possible for a worker to receive intrinsic pride from his or her work, the worker had to "locate his needs and frustrations in terms of the consumption of goods rather than the quality and content of his life (work)." (Ewen, 1976, p. 43) Commodities were now able to provide all of the needs and wants of the individual; to consume was to gain intrinsic satisfaction and the mass media helped to perpetuate this ideology.

Let us return to the idea of a manufactured consciousness. The idea that people could be bought and sold soon followed the notion of need satisfaction through consumption. Printers' Ink was a magazine dedicated to advertising criticism and social responsibility, and made its critical views widely known, particularly during this period of change. In 1938, a stern warning was issued to its readers. "Modern machinery...made it not only possible but imperative that the masses should live lives of comfort and leisure; that the future of business lay in its ability to manufacture consumers as well as products [Italics mine]." (Ewen,
1976, p. 53) The change that had taken place could not be easily undone. People were forced by business (under the guise of “democratic choice”) to not only accept the system through the use of advertising and institutional restructuring, but also to perpetuate the system through the work-consume cycle. Any values that ran counter to this system were removed through consumer education.

With these two aspects in place, replacing traditional intrinsic need and want fulfillment with consumption as fulfillment, combined with the inescapable dependency upon the new model of business and mass production for survival, the ideology of consumerism was born. The ideology of consumerism effectively changed the way in which reality was constructed for the participants within our free-market society. “[It is]...the eradication of indigenous cultural expression and the elevation of the consumer marketplace to the realm of an encompassing ‘Truth’ [italics mine].” (Ewen, 1976, p. 67) The idea that the world of goods and mass production was fact effectively turned people away from their own needs and therefore, away from the democratic ideal of self-determination. People were no longer free to choose, but dependent upon the system of consumption in order to survive. By the same token, in consuming (as an active process), people democratically validated the system that served the interests of business and mass production. The free-market economy had effectively replaced traditional, “less developed,” and even “more popular” notions of democracy. (Ewen, 1976, p. 93)
The idea that democratic values were replaced by capitalist values is bolstered by the work of Smythe (1981) in *Dependency Road: Communications, Capitalism, Consciousness, and Canada*. Smythe (1981) also examined the role of advertising and how it has become an integral part of our society. He calls the combination of business, advertising, the mass media and many other societal institutions the *Consciousness Industry*. Like Bernays (1928) and Ewen (1976), he asserts that capitalism has erased the “difference between the world of message-images” (or media texts) and the “nature of the ‘real’ world.” (Smythe, 1981, p. xiv) In other words, the free-market system has utilized advertising to create a new sense of reality in order to facilitate the consumption of mass produced goods. Traditional family values and agrarian values have been effectively displaced and replaced with the notion of specialized labour and consumption as justification for need satisfaction. Smythe (1981) argues that the mass media were invented to legitimize the direct development of the social system for capitalism. Capitalism could not exist as it does today without the help of the mass media.

Smythe (1981) outlines a few key terms which I too will utilize in my thesis, and as such, it is necessary to explain them. To begin with, Smythe (1981) refers to all media information as “message-images.” (p. xiv) This term is used in its most broad sense to include things such as television shows, newspaper columns, advertisements and radio dramas. For my purposes the term “text” will be used to refer to Smythe's (1981) *message-images*, as it is a single word that encompasses all that he speaks about. Ideology, as defined by Smythe (1981)
refers to a "system of values with which people support or attack a particular class-dominated social system." (p. 16) The term text, in its purest sense can refer to anything that can be interpreted through communication. For example, even the folder in which a document is placed can be regarded and analyzed as a text, just as the staple used to hold the pages together is a text. A text contains the ideology of the context in which the text was created, as well as other possible ideologies brought to it by the person who interprets it.

Smythe (1981) also speaks of what he calls the *Consciousness Industry*. (p. xiv) In order to explain what the consciousness industry is, I will first outline its components. The parties involved in the consciousness industry include those in advertising, market research, photography, commercial application of art to product and container design, fine arts, teaching machines and related software, educational testing, the formal education system, the mass media via corporate links and intersecting markets (i.e.: professional sports/amateur sports, performing arts, comic books/toys/games, music (both production and sales), hotels/airlines, consumer goods industry), the telecommunications sector (computers and electronics), those in physics and chemistry, the banks, the finance industry, the insurance industry, the gambling industry, and finally, organized and white collar crime. (Smythe, 1981) Smythe (1981) refers to this area as the "primary information sector." (p. 5) It would be fairly accurate to suggest that the production of consciousness is performed through an almost ubiquitous monolith of people who control the economy.
The consciousness industry produces many things, but the main goal is to produce audiences for markets who have been prepared to consume mass produced commodities. Since audiences are so valuable to advertisers, they are bought and sold in three distinct, but mutually beneficial ways:

1. They market consumer goods and services to themselves.
2. They learn to vote for the one candidate (or issue) or another in the political arena.
3. They learn and reaffirm belief in the rightness of their politico-economic system. (Smythe, 1981, p. 9)

I do not suggest that people are as unthinking as lemmings, following each other to their doom. What Smythe (1981) was suggesting is not a simple is that. Like Ewen (1976), Smythe's (1981) argument really contends that people cannot know what they do not know. In other words, if people are provided with a limited amount of information that is seemingly balanced, they will be able to select critically from the information provided to them, but only within the limited range of the information provided. Selections within a framework may be democratic, but the choice of framework is not democratic because it is rarely questioned. This point was illuminated by Smythe (1981) in his discussion of freedom of choice. He argues that consumer sovereignty is really a myth because while a person is free to choose among thousands of commodities, they are unable to choose not to consume.⁶
Another important part of the consciousness industry is child education. Children are not only commercialized through advertising, but through other forms of communication such as television shows or public education. Leiss, Kline and Jhally (1991) suggest that policy aimed at protecting children should not be limited to advertisements, but expanded to include all forms of commercialization.

The real problem remains that the child’s socialization is formulated within a wide cultural kaleidoscope; in order to be effective, our policy formulations must address the entire realm of commercially mediated culture, and not just the part of it represented by advertisements. (Leiss, Kline and Jhally, 1991, p. 310)

To criticize this problem is to criticize the foundation of our society: the future generations. In order for us to perform their suggested task, two things must occur. We must completely separate the free-market system from our notions of democracy; only then can we redefine what it means to be democratic. The second thing we must do is become reflexive of the free-market system itself. If this should happen, it would arguably destroy the myths of free-market system because it relies on the way that it portrays itself as a natural order. Once children are taught to be critical of the system in which they belong, they would likely choose to redefine the system, or at least not wholly ascribe to its values and premises, and therefore, force a redefinition. Children are socialized to grow
up and consume based on false notions of freedom of choice and higher standards of living. They are the future of the system. Once the future generation of "believers" is removed, it is plausible that the system will be forced to redefine itself. It is highly doubtful that schools, media programmers and other institutions within the system would allow that to happen because their survival (as they exist now) is dependent upon the system in which they are entrenched.

The role played by the mass media, as cultural filter, is as critical as the role played by public education, for ensuring that capitalism survives. Smythe (1981) refers to this as a "hegemonic filter." (p. 16) The mass media not only screen in the values of the capitalist system, they screen out conflicting values such as traditional (pre-mass market) notions of society. The consciousness industry also works to mainstream marginal ideas. We need only look so far as the so-called Hippie movement (a well-noted period of high social awareness and political action) of the 1960s or the gang problems in south-central Los Angeles (turf wars and massive territorial shoot-outs apparently on the basis the drug trade) of the 1990s to see this happen. In both cases, the music and the style of dress of the movements were appropriated by large corporations to bring the outward cultures or sub-cultures into the mainstream. While providing the appearance of maintaining the original values of each movement, the original values were in fact, discarded in favour of more mainstream values. In these examples, business profited through commodification of the appearances of the movements—making it "cool" to adopt these styles. This process has been referred to as conspicuous consumption.
Leiss, Kline and Jhally (1991) also examine the role the mass media play in creating and upholding capitalist ideology. "The panoply of communications organizations that create the technology, own or control the channels, and produce the messages also intervene in the activities of human communication. (Leiss, Kline and Jhally, 1991, p. 69) Whoever authors the message has ultimate control over the ideological content of the information within. Even if the informational and rational consumer model was a plausible theory, the idea that information is ideological nullifies true rational behaviour. While there may be an endless array of interpretations of an advertisement, both favourable and counter productive, one must recognize the framework in which an advertisement was created in order to counter it. In other words, a person is only able to be rational about information presented within the free market because they have a limited number of choices or positions they can take regarding of that information. It is a position of limited autonomy based on the ideas of the few communications organizations, and therefore not true freedom, nor access to vast or alternative information. In order for a person to counter an advertisement, they must be fully aware of the context in which the advertisement was created. They should also possess some knowledge about arguments and ideas that run counter to the claims made by advertisement on both the surface and structural levels.

Leiss, Kline and Jhally (1991) contend that advertisements do exert a great deal of influence on programming content of communications organizations. Since media organizations are dependent upon advertising revenue for their survival, they must ensure that constant support is maintained.
In discussing the role of advertising and communications, business and media agreed that:

More directly, advertisers' interests lay less in specific contents and ideas than in the formats and stylistic techniques of media—layout, printing, program flow, orientation, and market strategy—that influenced the audiences that the media gathered and the markets that could be penetrated through them, their selling power, and the opportunities they gave to use advertising design and strategy to maximize advertising goals.

(Leiss, Kline and Jhally, 1991, p. 96)

With the desire to attract audiences, advertisers would hardly welcome a program or news article that ascribed to values which ran counter to those suggested in their advertisements. If an advertiser pulls its monetary contributions from a media organization, the media organization stands to suffer. The advertiser can simply look elsewhere for message distribution as the mass media industry is highly competitive. In the desire to stay competitive, most media organizations would arguably rather soothe their advertisers than present contradictory, controversial or audience alienating content. This ensures the survival of the free-market ideology.

Smythe (1981) has his own vision of a created consumer consciousness. As has been shown, he subscribes to the idea that consumer consciousness is not a natural state, but is produced by business and industry. He further suggests
that the production of consciousness is a huge area of human labour, but is often completely ignored. Audiences of the media:

...work at their own ideological production and reproduction, under the stimulus of an industry devoted to the manufacture of consciousness. The most apparent, but not exclusive, component of this industry is advertising, which Smythe declares is wrapped around the “free lunch”—the entertainment, news, drama, etc. programming on television, in magazines and newspapers and radio. (Schiller, 1981, p. xxi)

People play an active role in the process of "making meaning" of their world. The entire system in which one lives is ideological and in turn, the system has an impact on the observations and understandings realized by that person. Advertising serves to provide images and ideas to a relatively homogenized audience. The actual content of the advertisement is ideological and has a real context, although this is unattributed. Advertisements are created within a social, political and economic system, by people who work within that system. The goal for that system is to sell commodities. The message they intend must, therefore, reflect their own interests. People who watch television, for instance, might believe they are watching it for the program, but in reality they are watching it as a source of labour. Audiences actually work for the advertisers. What is this "work?" Audiences willingly work to market commodities to themselves. The television show is merely a free lunch for the work performed by the audience. In
fact, the advertisements themselves cost more to produce (8 to 10 times more per minute) than the television shows wrapped around them. (Smythe, 1981) The unstated truth of this matter is that the work performed by audiences around the world, is one of the greatest sources of unpaid labour in the history of the world.

Smythe’s (1981) concept of the free lunch argues that the information in the media must: “(1) attract and keep [the audience] attending to the program, newspaper, or magazine; (2) cultivate a mood conducive to favourable reaction to the advertisers’ explicit and implicit messages.” (p. 38) Smythe (1981) also argues that because of its mandates, the free lunch itself often “reaffirm[s] the status quo and retard[s] change.” (p. 39) Controversial ideas are rejected because they could cost the advertisers and their corporations a great deal of money. When an idea is presented that runs contrary to the status quo it is either co-opted by the mainstream, ignored, or flatly disposed of as because they are considered novel and ephemeral.

What about the concept of the audience as a source of labour? Smythe (1981) uses the work of Levitt (1976) to explain this idea. These notions also expand on those addressed earlier by Williamson (1984) and Dyer (1982) The audience member works through three stages when watching a commercial. The first stage is what I will call the recognition stage. Does the person have “the ‘problem’ the advertiser is posing?” (Smythe, 1981, p. 40) The advertisement presents a commodity as a cure for a defect or void in the person’s life. The second stage can be labeled the awareness stage. This stage entails the awareness of a “class of commodities which, if purchased and used will 'solve'
that problem" posed by the advertiser and that people similar to "him/her use this
class of commodity" to solve the problem. (Smythe, 1981, p. 40) The idea of
conformity plays heavily upon the mind of the person at this stage. If everyone
else can solve their problem through consumption, why has the person not done
anything about his or her problem yet? Finally, the third stage, or the decision
stage, suggests that the person will choose to add (or not to add) that product "to
the mental or physical shopping list for the next trip to the store." (Smythe, 1981,
p. 41) If the person accepts the assertion that they have a problem and that the
problem can be overcome through consumption of a product, they most likely will
purchase it to solve their problem.

When the number of products in a particular commodity class increases,
the time in which one evaluates the products does not. The consumer is forced to
spend less and less time evaluating competing products. How can one be totally
rational about commodity consumption with less time to perform the act? “The
process contains a monstrous contradiction. It is totally rational from the
advertisers’ perspective and totally irrational from [that of] the audience
members’.” (Smythe, 1981, p. 41) To find one’s niche becomes the desired goal.
The process of narrowcasting oneself to a specific genre of commodity allows for
a more rational decision. This process leads to the phenomenon of one being
defined by the products he or she personally consumes.

What happens when one tries to choose among competing products
whose only difference is the packaging? Rationality is no longer rationality of
performance, but rationality of aesthetic preference. One accepts the aesthetic
arguments made by one product over those made by another. In this case, an argument can be as simple as a bright orange bottle for product A and a brown bottle for product B. If the product is a soap, for example, the person may choose product A simply on the basis of colour association. They might choose white because it is seen as a symbol of cleansing power, or avoid brown because it might represent dirt. Advertisers do not always drive our aesthetic tastes. We may choose the brown bottle because it is our favourite colour, or because it looks good with our beige towels in the bathroom. Even while many of our tastes may override the aims of the advertiser, we must not discount the power of packaging to sway us into purchasing a product that is identical to another except that it is presented in better wrapping.

From the standpoint of the advertising industry, their desire is to advertise to people who are most likely to purchase their products. "The...strategically most important class of audiences is [the audience] produced for advertisers [who are] marketing consumer goods." (Smythe, 1981, p. 28) Television shows, for example, are aimed at certain demographic groups, often of very limited range in things such as age, lifestyle, income, and in some cases, gender. The commercials within the show will be for products or services that are congruent with the demographic group watching the show. To demonstrate this, try to think of the last time you saw a beer advertisement in the middle of a soap opera, a life insurance commercial during a children's program, or a cooking oil commercial during a hockey game.
Another important strategy that is critical for the survival and growth of capitalism, as addressed by Smythe (1981), is the act of cross-marketing. Smythe (1981) refers to cross-marketed items as spinoffs. (p. 16) A spinoff is something that is non-advertising material, but is connected somehow with an advertised product and to capitalist popular culture. Smythe (1981) provides the example of a song in a popular film. The song begins to take on connotations connected with the film. It is played on the radio (sometimes with film narrative in the song) and promotes the film merely because of its association with a scene in the film. At the other end, the film promotes the song as the artist is legitimized by the song's appearance in the film. In main cases of children's films, huge toy campaigns are run as spinoffs. Children can purchase their favourite movie characters, weapons, animals and sets used in the films. The sales of toys surrounding a film can also drive children to see the film more than once, or convince them to go if they have not seen it.

All commodities share some common characteristics. Smythe (1981) cites six key characteristics of consumer goods that helps to explain why they are produced. The first thing is that all goods "appeal to and cultivate in their users selfishness because of the basis of their design, packaging, and sales appeal is to individual insecurities and potentials for aggression or exploitation...They are all teaching machines." (Smythe, 1981, p. 223) Goods uphold and create values congruent with the social and economic system in which they are embedded. Individualism and the private self is stressed by capitalism because it serves to keep the community fragmented and critical though oppressed through the veil of
nature. Since goods can solve everyone's problems, why should there be any questioning of the system or the even the problems themselves.

The second common characteristic is that all goods are "aimed at the middle, working, and upper class; the poor are not the expected users of them." (Smythe, 1981, p. 224) The "poor" account for approximately one-third to 40% of the population in the core (first world) countries. (Smythe, 1981, p. 224) The potential for profit maximizing by corporations is demonstrated here. Poor people may be able to consume goods, but not at the rate of the middle or higher classes. While advertisements themselves may be aimed at everyone but the poor, the poor can still consume the commodities on at least two levels. First, commodity consumption can be performed out of a need to survive, as in the example of food staples. Second, poor people may also consume in the hope that it will raise their standing in the class system. When a person from a poor class is able to consume very high priced goods it is because of a limited number of reasons. For example, they could have saved enough money to make one large purchase, the commodity could have been received as a gift, or they could have purchased it second hand. Although this is not tautological, more often than not, the higher classes are those who consume the greater amount of goods.

When a poor person does consume goods aimed at a higher level of income class, there is an escapist function that takes place. The consumption of goods, in alignment with Williamson (1984), theoretically raises one's class because capitalist class is assumed to be based on the commodities one consumes. There is also an element of denial or rejection of the poor person's
real class—that is, their traditional class based on the role they assume in the production segment of society. The desire to become “better” is executed through consumption, and because status is predicated on material wealth, poverty is defined through lack of commodities. To consume, for a poor person, is to deny one’s existence in the economic scale. People are able to buy their way out of a material class level, but not out of the production class level; the traditional measure of one’s class. In some extreme cases, high priced products may additionally be aimed at lower classes because the advertiser knows that they cannot afford them. As twisted as this might sound, it will actually limit the sales of the commodity in low socio-economic areas and drive the value of the commodity up higher. Budget restrictions of low-income households would indicate such a value assumption because high priced goods represent a greater percentage of their budget than high-income families.

The third characteristic is that commodities “provide TNCs [Trans-National Corporations] with their vast profits.” (Smythe, 1981, p. 224) TNCs or Multi-Nationals (are they are sometimes called) account for a large proportion of the corporations in the world. TNC products are often not localized, but if they are, you can be sure that the TNC has an equivalent in another country. Since sales are coming from large regions or from all over the world, the ability to generate revenue is huge.

The fourth common attribute of goods is that “they collectively account for the environmental pollution the responsibility for which is shifted from monopoly capitalism to technology, and thus avoided.” (Smythe, 1981, p. 224) One need
only look so far as the ozone layer to see the effects that consumption has had on the world as a whole. Chlorofluorocarbons (CFCs), car emissions and countless other products and chemicals have all contributed to the destruction of our ozone layer. It has become a world problem and corporations, which are responsible for the problem, are hardly ever blamed. Again, the problem is attributed to the price of technological progress; a small price to pay for the necessity of progress.

The fifth trait is that "their intrinsic use value is far below their exchange value, under capitalism." (Smythe, 1981, p. 224) This is perhaps Smythe's (1981) most important point, where the value of the free-market system is concerned. It is also a strong force in suggesting a return to traditional values. Things such as built-in obsolescence, cheaply made goods, and values of style and fashion are included in this category.

Consumption of goods to provide one with intrinsic satisfaction is entirely problematic. As Christopher Lasch suggests, in The Culture of Narcissism (1979), advertising has erased all traditional notions of labour and communal value.

In a simpler time, advertising merely called attention to the product and extolled its advantages. Now it manufactures a product of its own: the consumer, perpetually unsatisfied, restless, anxious, and bored. Advertising serves not so much to advertise products as to promote consumption as a way of life. It "educates" the masses into an
unappeasable appetite not only for goods, but for new experiences and personal fulfillment. It upholds consumption as the answer to the age old discontents of loneliness, sickness, weariness, lack of sexual satisfaction; at the same time it creates new forms of discontent, peculiar to the modern age. (Lasch, 1979, p. 72)

The worker is completely fragmented from the product created to the point where he or she is easily replaced by another worker or by a robot. In systems where the production of commodities is robotized, the worker is responsible for making the machine perform correctly. This process effectively eradicates traditional notions of pride in workmanship that were once espoused by the craftsman.

At the other end is the argument that consumption of products is a treatment used to fix one’s problems. To suggest that one has a problem because they do not use a product is ludicrous to begin with. Did such problems really exist before the time of the free-market economy? If a person is a damaged good, sold to advertisers so that he or she may consume the product in order to fix themselves, what happens when a new product is developed? It becomes apparent that progress is rationalized through a method of rapid product obsolescence. The idea that a new and improved product will fix a problem better than the old product hardly falls under the term intrinsic value. In reality, people use products as a quick-fix for their emotional and mental problems (which may be related to the system in the first place). The real value would be to look within oneself and examine why one subscribes to a system that
is predicated on reminding people of their failures and weaknesses, while at the same time offering to fix them directly through the purchase of its own commodities.

Finally, the sixth shared commonality is that most goods are produced through extremely wasteful processes. Consumer goods "absorb the great bulk of natural and human resources which the capitalist core extracts and uses. They engorge the private sector and starve the public sector." (Smythe, 1981, p. 225)

The argument of public good versus private profit is exemplified by this sixth characteristic of consumable goods. If more money is being pumped into a system that creates high levels of individualism, marginalizes contradictory values, and promotes greed, how can notions of the public sector compete? Indeed, how can a true public sector exist when the system in which it was created is predicated on extreme capitalist values? In alignment with Smythe (1981), the public sector, through its institutional practices and teachings, must also subscribe to the values of the free-market economy. The private sector wins because of the way it is portrayed as being natural and because the values of the free-market economy have become synonymous with democracy to the point where capitalist ideology has replaced that of true democracy. With capitalist values posing as democratic ideas, the public sector is marginalized and frowned upon as outdated and unprogressive as progress is defined by private and technological advances.
Resistance to Advertising and Free-Market Institutions

The free-market system and accompanying ideologies may seem like a giant monolith. It is true that overcome such a well-developed system of consciousness creation and maintenance is extremely difficult, but not impossible. Advertisers attempt to convince the consumer of what they should do, but it does not always work. As was mentioned in my introduction, the very fact that we are human (we have the ability to feel) and not programmable machines gives us an advantage over advertisers and the capitalist ideology. "There is a dependable quantum of individual and group resistance, reproduced every day, arising out of people's innate capacity and need for love, respect, communal relations, and creativity.' (Smythe, 1981, p. 270) The need of the dominant class to create a consciousness in people in order to maintain itself can be seen as a weakness. The top-down ideology of the dominant group is not the only type of information processed by humans.

Consciousness is a dynamic process. It grows and decays with the interaction of doing (or practice) and cognition over the life cycle of the individual in the family and other social formations. It draws on our emotions, ideas, instincts, memory, and all of the sensory apparatus. (Smythe, 1981, p. 271)
Consciousness is inextricably governed by one's life experience, "from people's interaction with each other and with their environment." (Smythe, 1981, p. 272)

A good example of a conflict of values occurs between wealthy and poor people. Poor people cannot live up to the consumption standards for the free-market economy because they have less income than wealthy people. Everyone is told to consume, but they are unable to consume the same types of commodities in the same numbers as wealthy people. Simply because of a lack of money, resistance takes place, although the desire to consume more may stay with the poor person. "In this sense there is an undeveloped guerilla struggle in the United States and Canada." (Smythe, 1981, p. 273)

There are many other kinds of resistance that can be practiced. At the same time, there are many different areas in which one can resist free-market ideology. On a technological level, Smythe (1981) mentions a type of resistance by what are now known as computer hackers. "The very nature of teleprocessing information (the combination of computers, data banks, and telecommunications) means that the capitalist system is vulnerable to instant and prolonged disruptions." (Smythe, 1981, p. 295) At the organizational level, humanitarian groups such as unions, non-profit organizations and other lobby groups are able to educate some small segments of the population about the problems of the free-market system. At a national level, Smythe (1981) provides the example of the failure of the United States to defeat Cuban and Vietnamese resistance to capitalism during the 1960s. Other examples of resistance include boycotts of particular goods, especially name brands, use of graffiti, creation of underground
media and the alternative press, and creation of counter-cultures, to name but a few.

**Summary of the Critical Foundations**

Bernays (1928) wrote about the changes in the system of democratic rule as they were taking place. He saw individual minds being replaced with rubber stamps and a mass consciousness. The needs of the people were being created by the new propaganda, or the media and advertising in order to serve the interests of big business. For Ewen (1976), the free-market economy took precedence over, and effectively altered all previous notions of society. It changed the system of living and production on which people relied from an agrarian type of society to a society of fragmented individuals dependent upon consumption of goods in order to live. Societal institutions (e.g.: churches, schools, laws) were altered to teach and uphold values that assisted the growth of the consumer oriented society. The nature of advertising changed from one that presented factual and claim based information about products, to one that plays upon the fears and shortfalls of the consumer in order to generate sales. The nature of institutional structures changed so that people are now *produced* with beliefs that are in alignment with the free-market system.

Ewen (1976) also suggests that traditional notions of democracy (a political system) were altered so that democracy came to mean the free-market system or capitalism (an economic system). Capitalism effectively maintained
patriarchal rule by replacing the family father figure with business as the new patriarch. It created a system that perpetuated itself and forced people to become dependent on its mode of production and values in order to survive. All of these beliefs are perpetuated further through advertising and consumption. The emphasis of Ewen (1976) that this process was not natural but in fact learned by and forced upon society cannot be understated.

Smythe (1981) also saw that democracy has been replaced by capitalist ideology. Like Bernays (1928) and Ewen (1976), he focused on the production of consumer consciousness in people. The consciousness industry consists of all that Ewen (1976) mentioned, and many other communication outlets ranging from toys to photographers to banks to sports franchises. The notion of the audience as a commodity that is bought and sold for its labour is another critical component to Smythe’s (1981) theory. While audience members think that they are enjoying a television program, or a “free lunch,” in reality they are performing work for advertisers. Smythe (1981) and Leiss, Kline and Jhally (1991) criticize the mass media for its inability to provide progressive programming. The messages within the programs are design to support the free-market mentality; messages must not offend the advertisers for fear of lost revenue. People are also seen, bought and sold as damaged goods; something which advertisers can fix with their products. The market for commodities is huge, often involving spinoffs, or products that surround a theme and are consumed in many formats. For example, a movie might have a soundtrack, corresponding book, and action figures that can be purchased in order to “live” the theme of the movie. In turn,
these spinoffs may encourage people to see the film for the first time or to see it more than once.

Commodities also have six common characteristics. Commodities 1) entice and foster selfishness, 2) are marketed to the middle and upper class, 3) are very profitable for TNCs, 4) are responsible for environmental pollution, but are not seen as such, 5) have little intrinsic value, and 6) devour vast amounts of natural and human resources, while at the same time they starve the public sector. Since the public sector was redesigned under the free-market system, it is also predicated on notions of the free-market economy and consumption. One important area where this is demonstrated is education. Public schools are equipped with materials and lessons that uphold values of the free-market system. Public schools are also supposed to offer critical thought and alternative perspectives as part of their teachings. The problem is that this has been created under the seemingly disaffected veil of the public sector. Let us not forget that the public sector too is part of the free-market system, one that receives redistributed public money (e.g.: from taxes), but also private ideology to everyone so that the values of capitalism are upheld and practiced.

The task of resistance, while extremely difficult, is not impossible. There are a wide variety of ways in which one can resist the dominant free-market ideology. Resistance has been successfully achieved on personal levels, community levels, organizational levels, and national levels.
CHAPTER THREE
METHODOLOGY AND DETAILED DESCRIPTION OF THE TWO CASES

In the previous two chapters, I have outlined the four key research traditions and approaches taken toward advertising. In this section, I will use the most important tenets of each of the traditions in order to perform two case studies of corporate sponsored curriculum materials. Quite obviously, there is much more to each of the perspectives than I will enlist as the crucial components, but it is necessary to narrow the focus in order to perform the analysis. The other assertions made by each of the research traditions deal with the system of advertising and its place within our society as a whole. We must understand how the curriculum works under each of the paradigms first and then apply the structural arguments later. I will examine some of the structural arguments upon completion of the review of the principles of education, marketers' ideals, and the current state of education in Canada.

The methodology for analysis will be quite simple. Each perspective of advertising contains some general principles that are crucial to its foundation. For example, all of the theorists who view advertising as a form of information agree that advertising is used to provide consumers with the utilitarian features of a given commodity. It is through these specific claims that the analysis of the curriculum can be accomplished. The analysis will demonstrate whether or not
corporate sponsored curriculum is analogous with the required basic tenets of the four research traditions of advertising.

The characteristics, as mentioned, are selected on the basis that each is a foundational and mutually agreed upon part of its respective theory. Under the advertising as a form of information perspective the characteristics that will be utilized are presented in the following model.

The assertion that the content of an advertisement is based on information about the utility value of a given commodity. The information presented in the advertisement allows the consumer to make a rational decision to purchase or not purchase a commodity based on its claims.

The perspective that advertising is a form of persuasion model will be as follows:

The major belief of this perspective is that advertisements make a reasoned argument in order to change the mind of the consumer toward favouritism of the advertised commodity. The arguments made are based on the ability of the product to fulfill the existing needs of the consumer. Advertising of this nature, more than likely, alerts consumers to different brands of the same product and tries to foster brand loyalty.
The model for the perspective that advertising as a form of symbolism will be:

Consumption takes place at the level of ideas, images and messages surrounding a commodity. The focus for this model will be the types of images and beliefs that surround a given commodity. Commodities are purchased based on their claims about their ability to achieve these ideals.

The critical tradition is much more elaborate than the non-critical perspectives. As this is the case, we will reserve the analysis of the institutional structure of advertising until later. The important components for the curriculum analysis are as follows:

Advertising is an ideological tool. Advertising creates problems through suggesting that the consumer has a problem which can be fixed by a given commodity. The majority of the ideology surrounding a commodity and its advertisement resides in its imputed qualities. We will examine the images, messages, and beliefs surrounding a given commodity. Advertising creates new meaning that replaces traditional meaning derived from art, religion, social systems.
Sample Selection

The two samples we will examine are the Bank of Montreal's *my money Investment Club* kit (the *simple steps investment kit*) and the *Tampax Health Education Program on Puberty and Menstrual Health*. These samples were selected on the basis of their representative nature of the available corporate sponsored curriculum. While no two corporate sponsored curriculum packages are absolutely identical, there are two common trends among the available materials.

The first package design, along the lines of the *my money Investment Club* kit, does not contain any specific or direct promotion of a product. We will call these *subtle-sell* curriculum packages. Information presented in the curriculum may be about commodities of a similar vein to those produced by the curriculum creator, but the information is not brand specific. Brand names and logos are used as indicators of the producers of the curriculum, as supporters of such services or as a purveyor of services. There is also (usually) some sort of testing or measurement component included in the curriculum. This can range from activity sheets, to true and false questions, to applied knowledge puzzles.

I selected the *my money Investment Club* kit as a representative of this type of curriculum package for several reasons. First, it is a comprehensive package that involves lessons and activities or tests. Students are not only taught about the banking industry in textbook fashion, they actually get to practice what they have learned. The activity sheets can be seen as both a fun exercise and as
a testing tool. Students must apply knowledge to various word games in order to see what they have learned. As a final piece of the puzzle, students get to play a board game that tests all of the concepts they will be required to know, should they decide to invest their money with the banking industry. As was mentioned before, the Bank of Montreal does not tell students about their financial services. Instead, the real-world trade names of Bank of Montreal services are used to link the general banking knowledge with the Bank of Montreal.

The other type of curriculum uses direct product marketing information in order to sell its products. We will call these direct-sell curriculum packages. Often trade names and brand logos are used in conjunction with lesson instructions in order to market a given commodity. If a problem is presented in the lesson plan, for example, the lesson will specifically state that a given commodity will be able to solve the problem. *Tampax Health Education Program on Puberty and Menstrual Health* does precisely this in its sections on menstrual protection products. Like the subtle-sell packages, there is usually some type of testing involved with the curriculum.

Additionally, I selected the *Tampax Health Education Program on Puberty and Menstrual Health* based on its multi-faceted nature. This example includes a wide variety of informational media, various testing activities, and a real-world sample of the curriculum creator’s commercially available product. The kit contains a teacher’s guide, student activities, overheads, a video, student handbooks (for each class member), a poster, and some sample tampons. In the teacher’s guide, the student handbook, and the video, there is information
pertaining directly to Tampax tampons. Students are informed as to what Tampax products are available, when to use them, and how to use them. The video, poster, and various diagrams further instruct girls on the correct use of tampons. The testing, in this case, focuses upon both knowledge of puberty and knowledge of feminine protection products. Testing is performed through a series of hand-outs, which include activities such as term and definition matching, story writing, and menstrual cycle charting.

While I have defined two different types of curriculum packages, both types have at least one other common thread—the frequent inclusion of product samples. In the case of the *my money Investment Club* kit, we have an example that does not include samples of banking services (although it probably could be argued that its board game acts as a mock-sample). In the case of the *Tampax Health Education Program on Puberty and Menstrual Health*, we have an example that includes a product sample in the form of a box of tampons. Not all of the curriculum packages are as robust as these two examples. Some curriculum packages consist only of one or two world wide web pages. The two examples I have selected do, however, provide us with some commonly utilized materials that appear in many different curriculum packages.

**An Overview of the Samples**

The *my money Investment Club* kit (*the simple steps investment kit*) is produced by Bank of Montreal First Canadian Funds and the Bank of Montreal
Group of Companies. While the curriculum is aimed at “students eight years of age and over.” (Bank of Montreal [BM], 1998a, p. i), it is not clear for what subject it is intended. The kit is distributed by the Jr. Jays Magazine and Kids Club organizations in conjunction with the Canadian Association of Chiefs of Police. The Jr. Jays company is involved with the distribution of millions of packages of gum, candy bars, and Jr. Jays comic books to Canadian schools. (I.I.R., 1996b) According to Ian Blair, Senior Media Relations Manager for Private Client Group of the Bank of Montreal, to date, approximately 10,000 kits have been distributed in English speaking Canada and 5,000 to 6,000 kits have been distributed in the province of Quebec. The kit materials consist of a teacher’s guide and a board game.

The teacher’s guide is divided into seven lesson plans designed to teach students about money. Included in the teacher’s guide is a set of overheads explaining the system of compound interest, complete with a set of handout activities. The board game is part of the seventh lesson. The game consists of play money (in the form of bonds, mutual funds, and cash), financial advice cards, dice, markers and a board of squares containing various instructions. In the real world, the Bank of Montreal has a youth bank account plan entitled my money aimed at people under the age of eighteen. The website provides information as to what the my money plan provides for each member. Included in the services as things such as withdrawals, pre-authorized payments, transfer of funds, chequing services, use of direct payment, preferred interest rate on savings accounts, and free telephone and Internet banking. (BM, 1998) The
slogans associated with the *my money* bank account plan are “raking in the dough” and “show me the money.” (BM, 1998)

The second example is the *Tampax Health Education Program on Puberty and Menstrual Health* (1998). This program is designed to provide students, ages 11 to 14, with information about puberty and changing body functions. The kit is design to be used in health classes as supplemental curriculum. According to Tampax, approximately 2,000 kits were ordered for use in Canadian schools.9 The kit includes a teacher’s instruction book (*Teaching Guide: Puberty and Menstrual Health* (1998)), a 27 minute video (*Kids to Kids: Talking About Puberty* (1998)), a poster (female and male anatomy, female reproductive organs and the menstrual cycle), a student handbock, mostly aimed at girls (*A Time For Answers* (1995)), and a trial package of *Tampax Satin Touch* tampons. The kit is contained in a white box with pastel-coloured (pink, purple, blue, yellow and green) drawings of a female and a male on the front. The components of the (except the poster and tampon box) are designed in a similar way to the box, but the drawings and headings are placed on a background comprising of a blue sky filled with wispy white clouds. While there is some mention of puberty in boys, most of the information in the kit pertains to girls and menstruation.
A Detailed Look at the Samples

While the detailed examinations of the kits are quite lengthy, it is necessary in order to provide the appropriate context for a proper analysis. With both of the kits explored in detail, much of the analysis can focus on the sections where commodities are mentioned instead of the entirety of the kits.

Case 1:

*my money Investment Club: Get to know your dough*

*Produced By: Bank of Montreal*

Breakdown of the Curriculum

The *my money Investment Club Teacher’s guide* contains the lesson plans which are designed to teach concepts and guide students through the activities. The concepts introduced revolve around the “money management and investing.” (BM, 1998a, p. i) The copy of the lesson guide is divided into three different instruction sets. A warning symbol indicates items that should not be read aloud, or that instruct the teacher to perform a specific action, speech balloons indicate what is to be read aloud to the class, and quotation marks highlight new financial terms which may have to be explained in detail.
The seven lessons (in order) are entitled: “Getting to know your dough,” “Creating an investment portfolio,” “The golden rule of investing: Diversify,” “The three basic asset classes & creating a balanced portfolio,” “Bulls & Bears: What do they have to do with investing?,” “Watch you money grow & share some of your wealth,” and “The my money board Game & other activities.” There is also an epilogue in the guide entitled “Final Word.”

The first lesson describes the barter system and its limitations, with the outcome being the invention of money. Systems of barter limit what one can obtain because of potential differences in the desires of the battering partner. If the other person does not want what you have to offer, you are out of luck. Monetary systems are proclaimed to be better because money can be exchanged for anything at any time. The lesson ends with a piece of advice. “A bank is a good, safe place to keep your money; much better than leaving it around in your room where your sister or brother could take off with it, or the vacuum cleaner could suck it up!” (BM, 1998a, p. 3)

The second lesson teaches students about the creation of an investment portfolio. It explains, in minimal detail, four types of investing; bank accounts, government bonds, stock and shares, profit, dividends, and mutual funds. During this lesson, the teacher is supposed to hand out photocopied my money Investment Club certificates that proclaim each student is an official member of the club. The certificates are signed by Terry A. Jackson, honorary chair of the my money Investment Club, and president and CEO of the Trust Company of the Bank of Montreal. There is also a small disclaimer on the bottom of each
certificate that reads "for entertainment purposes only." (BM, 1998a, p. 22) The concepts introduced in this lesson include withdrawals, lending, interest, bonds, shares, stocks, mutual funds, units, and fund managers.

While it is initially stated that "money isn't everything" (BM, 1998a, p. 4), the lessons do not deal with anything else but money. The lessons also do not explain what "everything" (other than money) else is! In the next step, each student is supposed to pretend that they have been given $100. They are instructed to examine the ways in which they can make their money grow. According to the lesson, a bank will pay interest on all bank accounts as a 'thank you' for lending the bank one's money. The bank account section also states that "some banks even have special bank accounts just for kids." (BM, 1998a, p. 4) The section concludes by providing an example of what a bank account will net the lender at the end of one year. The $100 invested in a bank account at 1% interest would net the lender $1.00. It is mentioned, once again, that the bank would deposit an extra dollar as a way of thanking the lender.

The second section explains how government bonds work. Students are told that they may invest their money in a government bond, but unlike a bank account, their money is tied up for a period of one year or more. The passage also states that one is "guaranteed to get all [of ones] money and interest back" (BM, 1998a, p. 5) at the end of the investment period. To demonstrate how much money can be made from a government bond, an interest rate of 10% per year is applied to the invested $100.
The third type of investing cited is investing through stocks or shares. Students are told that not only can they invest in something, but actually own a piece of it. The passage cites McDonalds, Irwin Toys, and banks as example corporations of which one can become part owner. (BM, 1998a, p. 5) Students are warned that investing in stocks does not mean that they will make money, and that there is a chance they can lose money if the company they invest in does not perform well. The lesson glosses over the term 'dividends,' citing it as “extra money” (BM, 1998a, p. 6) paid by a stock. The section concludes with a passage about owning stock in more than one company. “Instead of owning a share or stock of just one company, what do you think of owning a little share of lots of different companies? What kinds of companies would we like to own a share of? How about Walt Disney?” (BM, 1998a, p. 6)

The fourth and final section in this lesson deals with mutual funds. Students learn about the concept of ‘pooling’ money with others so that everyone can own little pieces of many companies. The passage argues that mutual funds are better than stocks because one company in a student’s portfolio may perform poorly and lose money, but other companies are likely to do well and make money. Students are introduced to the idea of buying many small parts of companies through a fund manager. “A ‘fund manager’ then takes all the money and goes shopping for shares in hundreds of different companies. These shares become the ingredients of the mutual fund that mix well together and make the mutual fund big and strong.” (BM, 1998a, p. 6) The lesson concludes with the
assertion that mutual funds are indeed better than stocks because they are cheaper, managed by investment experts and like stock, can yield dividends.

Lesson three, or the “golden rule of investing” (BM, 1998a, p. 7), teaches students that one should diversify one’s money. Through the use of the age-old metaphor of placing all of one’s eggs in one’s basket, the lesson places great emphasis on spreading one’s money around. Briefly stated, if one has a bunch of eggs and places them all in one basket and that basket falls to the ground, one loses all of their eggs. Should a person divide the eggs into a number of baskets, and if one basket should happen to fall, there would still be some eggs left. The passage concludes with the eggs metaphor being transferred from eggs onto one’s investment portfolio. “When you diversify it means that you spread your money around into different things. You don’t put all your eggs in one basket.” (BM, 1998a, p. 7)

The fourth lesson teaches students about the basic classes of assets, including cash, fixed income, and equity. This section breaks down the previously learned types of investing into the three categories. Bank accounts fall into the cash class, which in turn, is described as “the money you may need soon.” (BM, 1998a, p. 8) In the fixed income class, government bonds are defined as “investments that pay interest but your money is usually locked in for a longer time.” (BM, 1998a, p. 8) Equity is defined as ownership. Stocks and mutual funds are listed as types of investments under this asset class. The lesson concludes with the restating of the golden rule and the introduction of a new term, balanced investment portfolio.
The fifth lesson introduces students to the terms bull and bear. A bull is defined as one who “thinks the value of the money they have invested is going to go up.” (BM, 1998a, p. 9) A bear is the opposite of a bull. It explains how one can be both a bull and a bear about different things in one’s mutual funds or other investments.

The sixth lesson demonstrates dollar cost averaging as applied to one’s investments over eleven years (ages 10 to 21) through the use of charts (either distributed to the class or on an overhead projector). Students are told that it is better to buy mutual funds over a period of time, rather than all at once, because of the fluctuation of the unit prices of mutual funds. “The average purchase cost of the mutual funds units over a period of time is probably lower than buying them at one particular point in time.” (BM, 1998a, p. 11) The charts show what happens when $100 is invested to start (age 10) and $11.50 (earning $11,700 by age 21) or $23.00 ($23,000 by age 21) is invested each week thereafter. Students are then instructed to find their parents’ ages on a big chart in order to see how much money had been made. There is disclaimer at the bottom of the charts which states: “These calculations and projections are for demonstration purposes only, and there is no guarantee implied or otherwise to be construed as their future worth will fluctuate with market conditions. Calculations assume a pre-tax portfolio return of 7.000%.” (BM, 1998a, pp. 16 &17)

The last part of the lesson is a small section entitled “Share the Wealth.” It instructs students to do “good deeds or [donate] some of your new found wealth to charities or organizations that help needy people.” (BM, 1998a, p. 11)
Before we go on to lesson seven, there are three additional activities provided for the teacher to photocopy and distribute to the students. The first of these activities is a crossword puzzle. Students are expected to write in the terms asset class, bear, bond, bull, cash, diversify, equity, fixed income, goal, mutual, and stock. (BM, 1998a) The second activity is a word search in which students try to find the terms bear, bond, bull, cash, diversify, equity, income, investments, mutual, savings, and stocks. (BM, 1998a) The third handout is a fill in the blank sheet containing five questions pertaining to the terms taught by the previous six lessons. The answers to the questions are balanced, bears, diversify, goal, and ownership. (BM, 1998a)

The Teacher's guide concludes with a paragraph about the Bank of Montreal and the my money Investment Kit entitled "Final Word."

We hope that you will find the my money Board Game and Teacher's guide fun and easy to teach. We hope that your students enjoy the my money Board Game and learn the basics of money management, giving to charity and some basic math. First Canadian Mutual Fund and the Possibilities Foundation of Bank of Montreal Group of Companies are please to supply elementary teachers, free of charge, the complete my money Investment Kit and thank the Canadian Association of the Chiefs of Police and the Jr. jays Magazine and Kids Club for their distribution of this kit. (BM, 1998a, p. 15)
An address is provided for people to provide feedback to the Bank of Montreal about the kit.

The seventh and final lesson involves the use of the *my money* board game—much like the game of *Monopoly* by Hasbro Incorporated. Students are supposed to apply learned knowledge to a mock banking situation. The board game is for 2-6 players, ages 8 and up. The object of the game is to become "the player whose investments and cash have the highest value."

The game consists of many different pieces, but they all tie in to the final objective: finish the game with the most money and you win. The board itself is divided up into a continuous path of fifty-two rectangle spaces, ending at a space containing a large drawing of the Investore (space fifty-three) and same young male character from the cover of the box. The words "my money board game" are written across the middle of the board. Fifty-one of the spaces contain special instructions and representative icons telling the player what to do when he or she lands on the space. Not one of the icons is a corporate logo. The other space is marked "start." The breakdown of the copy written in the fifty-one spaces is as follows (number of spaces in brackets):

Money gains (26 spaces)

(5) Bonus. Collect $4.00 for cutting grass (3)/baby sitting (2).

(4) Bonds Pay Interest. Collect $1.00 for each bond you have.
(4) Yippee. Mutual funds pay dividends. Collect $2.00 for each mutual fund you own.

(3) Bull Market. Mutual funds go up. If you have mutual funds, receive one more mutual fund certificate from the Manager.

(3) Congratulations. Your good report card earns you $2.00.

(3) Grandma’s House. Here’s $5.00 dearie just for being cute.

(2) Happy Birthday. You receive $2.00 from your favorite [sic] Aunt.

(2) Toothfairy Visits You. Collect $2.00. (BM, 1998b)

Money Losses (17 spaces)

(4) Bear Market. Price of Mutual funds go down by $20.00. Return one certificate to the Manager.

(3) Lemonade Stand. Pay $2.00 for a large lemonade.

(3) Penalty for spending your whole allowance on candy. Lose a turn.

(3) Video Arcade. It’s lots of fun... but it will cost you $4.00.

(2) Burglar. Someone breaks into you piggy bank. Hand over $10.00.

(2) Pay Your Taxes. $10.00 Please. (BM, 1998b)

Special Cases (8 spaces)

(4) For the Needy. Fund-raiser for "Kids’ help Phone." Donate $5.00.

Remember it’s better to give than to receive. Take one charity card.
(4) It’s hard to get ahead. Go back 5 spaces. (BM, 1998b)

There are two special situations on can encounter on the board. The first circumstance is clearly a loss upon initial inspection as one has to give $5.00 away. The result of obtaining a charity card, however, yields the person $2.00 for making the donation. While there is a loss, the actual loss is only $3.00, when the yield of $2.00 is added to the equation and financial losses tally goes up to 18. The second case, “go back 5 spaces,” results in different outcomes depending upon the space one lands upon. The result of three of these is a financial gain and one is a financial loss. Given this new information the spaces with financial gains as an outcome rises to 29 and the financial loss outcomes total rises to 22 (but there should be an asterisk beside it).

There are six cards used to play the game. The charity card, as previously mentioned, yields a $2.00 return to a player donating $5.00. The card itself has the my money Investment Club logo on the front. The copy of the card reads “Get $2.00 back at the Investore.” (BM, 1998b) The savings account card is used to track a players’ bank account transactions. This card also has the my money Investment Club logo on the front, but there is little else written on it. The copy is limited to the words “Savings Account” and “Start$” (BM, 1998b), but the rest of the card is filled with blank lines used for recording transactions. The InvestorLine card is given to players who decide not to purchase financial advice. The front of the card states “I know enough myself. I don’t need professional investment advice. I will make my own decisions.” (BM, 1998b) The front of the
card also has the Bank of Montreal InvestorLine Discount Brokerage logo on it. For those players who want financial advice there is a card entitled “Financial Advice.” (BM, 1998b) This is the only card that is a different size from all of the rest and it also contains a myriad of information about different types of investments. The card concludes with the familiar golden rule of not placing all of one's eggs into the same basket, complete with a translation in monetary terms. The financial advice is provided by Nesbitt-Burns, member of the Bank of Montreal Group of companies. The Nesbitt-Burns logo and the my money Investment Club logo are both present on the card.

The final two pieces are not really cards, but certificates. One certificate is a government bond in the value of $10.00. There are two maple leaves on the certificate and the copy reads “Government Bond. $10.00. ten dollars.” (BM, 1998b) The last certificate is a mutual fund certificate. The Bank of Montreal First Canadian Funds logo is present on the bottom right-hand corner of the certificate. The written text of the certificate proclaims “First Canadian Mutual Funds Certificate. one unit. $20.00. twenty dollars.” (BM, 1998b) The mock money used to pay the game comes in denominations (bill or note form, not coins) of one dollar, two dollars, five dollars, ten dollars and twenty dollars. The six differently coloured (red, blue, yellow, orange, white, and green) markers for the game are small plastic polyhedrons that resemble a ball on top of a cone. Players advance spaces by rolling one six-sided die.

In order to play the game, one player must look after the money, financial advice, investment certificates, and charity cards. The title given to that player is
the "Investore Manager" (BM, 1998, p. 13), or in other words, the banker. Each player receives a bank account card (so that they may keep track of their transactions) and $100 in play money.

Before the game begins, players are allowed to put money into their bank account, buy mutual funds, buy bonds, or any combination of the three choices. Players may also purchase financial advice, for a fee of $5.00, before making their investments. The financial advice is provided by Nesbitt-Burns, and comes in the form of a card explaining all of the options a player has for spending their money. The players who do not purchase the advice are provided with an "InvestorLine" (BM, 1998a, p. 13) card.

Game play proceeds with each of the players taking a turn, rolling the die, advancing the appropriate number of spaces and performing the actions in accordance with the space the player lands upon. Game play continues until all players real the Investore. Players who lose all of their money during the game are required to drop out and are no longer involved in game play. Upon reaching the Investore, players are awarded bonuses or interest for savings account and bond investments. When all finances are totaled, as mentioned, the player with the most money at the end of the game is declared the winner.
Case 2:

_Tampax Health Education Program on Puberty and Menstrual Health_

*Produced By: Tambrands Inc.*

Before any analysis can take place, we must also examine the contents of the *Tampax Health Education Program on Puberty and Menstrual Health* (1998) (hereafter referred to as the *Tampax Teaching Kit*). Since we are dealing with puberty and menstruation, the reader must be made aware that some topics covered in the kit may not be something readers may be comfortable with. This explanation employs the terms and issues found in the kit itself, and is therefore, quite explicit about the function of puberty.

**Breakdown of the Curriculum**

The teacher's guidebook (henceforth referred to as "guidebook") is a 56-page booklet that covers puberty for boys and girls. The guidebook is broken down into many chapters that I have grouped within several headings. The first section of the guidebook, information, is dedicated to providing information about puberty for both boys and girls. The second section, demonstration, examines the use of menstrual protection products. The third section, hygiene, focuses upon establishing and maintaining good health habits. The fourth section, materials, is comprised of graphic overheads, activity sheets for students to complete, a glossary of terms and a resources list. Two other important
components to the guidebook are the teaching instructions, located after the
table of contents, and two sample letters to parents about health education,
located at the end of the guidebook.

The chapter entitled *Teaching About Puberty* is designed to provide some
instructional information about teaching the materials of the guidebook so that
anyone may be able to teach the information. The topics addressed in the
guidebook include anatomy, physiology, emotional changes, menstrual
protection, health, and personal hygiene.

The purpose of this guide is to:

- Help Students become more comfortable with the physical and
  emotional changes of puberty.
- Familiarize students with basic facts about the male and female
  reproductive systems.
- Provide an accurate understanding of menstruation, dispelling harmful
  myths and misinformation.
- Help girls make personal choices in feminine protection.
- Introduce basic habits for maintaining good health.
- Encourage communication on these topics among students, educators,
  and family. (Tampax, 1998a, p. 1)
The information section is comprised of four chapters—*Understanding Puberty, Male Reproductive System, Female Reproductive System, and Menstrual Cycle.* (Tampax, 1998a) Each of the chapters is broken down into two parts. The first part introduces information relevant to the chapter title. The second part is a collection of sample questions, with answers, that students might want to ask or have answered.

*Understanding Puberty* covers the topic body growth and physical change in a very general manner. It addresses other types of change, such as mood swings, increased conflict with parents, and obsession with weight or physical appearance as a means to encourage discussion. The *Male Reproductive System* chapter examines the physical components of the male reproductive system and the changes that occur within it during puberty. The chapter contains a labelled, cross-sectional diagram of the male reproductive system. The chapter also examines the functions of the male reproductive system. The next chapter, the *Female Reproductive System*, examines the physical changes that take place in girls during puberty much in the same manner as the boys’ section. There are two labelled diagrams, one external and one internal, of the female reproductive system. Like the chapter on the male reproductive system, each body part is explained in detail. This chapter also includes a set of definitions that are used to explain how the female reproduction system works. The final chapter of this section examines the *menstrual cycle*. The chapter covers the four phases of the menstrual cycle, menarche, and menstrual myths. (Tampax, 1998a) The explanation of the four phases of the menstrual cycle contains clinical information
about hormones, eggs, and ovulation. An ovular diagram of the menstrual cycle is also provided, but is inadequately labelled to completely understand the information contained within it. The chapter concludes with a section on menarche. It provides information about heredity, lifestyle, cramps, irregular cycles, and premenstrual syndrome as well as some possible questions and answers. (Tampax, 1998a)

The second section focuses upon Menstrual protection products. The section begins with a brief introduction to the history of menstrual protection. According to the chapter, there are two existing types of feminine protection products today—feminine pads and tampons. (Tampax, 1998a) The rest of the chapter is divided into two parts. The first part deals with the use of pads and the other examines the use tampons.

*How pads work* explains the use of pads as a method of feminine protection, how they are designed, hygienic guidelines, and when to use pads. The section on tampons contains several different subsections. The first subsection, complete with a diagram of a tampon and its applicator, is an explanation as to how tampons work. The next section, entitled “TAMPAX Tampons,” (Tampax, 1998a, p.19) not only explains how Tampax tampons are packaged, but also states the advantages of using Tampax tampons. *Inserting a tampon* covers the actual process of using a tampon. This subsection contains information about first time use, the use of water-based lubricants to assist with the procedure, and a six-part insertion guide complete with five diagrams of the stages of tampon insertion. (Tampax, 1998a)
The section concludes with a list of guidelines for using tampons, information on absorbencies of different type of tampons, and how to make one’s first tampon selection. The lesson discusses hygienic concerns when using tampons, but it does not mention a condition called toxic shock syndrome (TSS). TSS is a serious and potentially fatal disease caused by a bacterial infection typically associated with tampon use. According to a competing brand (o.b.), the symptoms of TSS include a high fever, vomiting, diarrhea, near fainting, dizziness, and a sunburn-like rash. O.b. suggests that while TSS does appear in men, women and children, half of the reported cases are from female tampon users. The topic of TSS is covered by the question and answer section at the end of the chapter, but these are not taught as part of the lesson.

Understanding absorbency explains the various absorbency rates of different tampons. “Tampax tampons come in four absorbency levels: Tampax Lites, junior absorbency for light flow days, Regular/Slender Regular for light to medium flow, Super for medium to heavy flow and Super Plus for heaviest flow.” (Tampax, 1998a, p. 21) This passage also directs girls to select the minimum amount of absorbency required, but does not explain why this is important. Choices for beginners argues in favour of using tampons because of their unique benefits. Tampons are concealed easily when carrying them in a purse, the applicator ensures that one’s hands do not get dirty, and they are easy to use correctly. (Tampax, 1998a)

The final section of this chapter is devoted to the hypothetical questions and answers students might have about tampons and pads. These questions are
not taught as part of the teacher’s lessons. They only serve to inform the teacher about possible questions students might have and to provide answers to such questions. Only one question, “How often should a pad be changed?” (Tampax, 1998a, p. 22), of the thirteen presented deals with pads. The remaining questions all focus on tampons. These are: “Can a virgin use tampons?”; “Can you feel a tampon?”; “Do I have to take a tampon out every time I go to the bathroom?”; “What keeps tampons from falling out?”; “Can a tampon get lost inside a woman’s body?”; “Can a tampon get stuck inside my body?”; “How often should a tampon be changed?”; “What happens if the tampon removal cord breaks?”; “Do tampons block menstrual flow?”; “What causes a tampon to slip down or feel uncomfortable?”; “Do tampons cause infections?”; and “What is TSS?” (Tampax, 1998a, pp. 22-23)

The third major component of the teacher’s guide pertains to good health habits. The two-page section briefly covers topics including special health concerns during puberty, nutrition, exercise, personal hygiene and the transition between being a teenager and becoming an adult. (Tampax, 1998a) This section concludes the lesson part of the teacher’s guidebook. The fourth section of the guidebook contains reproducible overhead graphics designed to accompany the lessons.

The guidebook also includes a section containing eleven reproducible activity sheets that are designed to compliment the lessons in the guidebook. All of the reproducible activity sheets in this book contain additional production information. Although it is not specifically stated, of the eleven fact sheets, two
have to be used with girls only, the rest can be used by both sexes. Arguably, boys cannot perform the activity that instructs students to *Chart Your Menstrual Cycle*, nor can they complete the activity on *Being a Woman*. There is one other activity, *Menstrual Protection: From Grass Mats to Tampons*, that speaks directly to girls, but boys could easily perform the required activity. The statement, “In your lifetime, the total number of days you menstruate will add up to about six years,” (Tampax, 1998a, p. 44) is obviously aimed at girls, but the required activities for this sheet are not sex specific. The activities, in order of appearance, are:

1) *Facts and Fables* - a twenty-five true-false-don’t know question and answer sheet. (Tampax, 1998a, p. 35)

2) *Introducing Terry* - a short story that details some of the changes that are happening to a young person named Terry. Students must conclude whether Terry is a boy or girl, why they think so and must make a chart of some of the changes that happen during puberty. (Tampax, 1998a, p. 36)

3) *From Boy to Man* - a 20 statement, true-false-don’t know type of quiz, similar to the one found in the first activity. (Tampax, 1998a, p. 37)

4) *Male Reproductive System* - contains a drawing of a male body and the internal reproductive organs which are to be labelled. (Tampax, 1998a, p. 38)
5) *Female Reproductive System* - contains a drawing of a female body and the internal reproductive organs which are to be labelled. (Tampax, 1998a, p. 39)

6) *Fact or Myth?* - examines notions and beliefs surrounding menstruation. Students are expected to pick out myths and facts from a list of eight statements. (Tampax, 1998a, p. 40)

7) *Facts About the Menstruation Cycle* – students are supposed to create a pie graph of the menstrual cycle, and indicate the first day of menstruation, when menstruation takes place, and the approximate day of ovulation. (Tampax, 1998a, p. 41)

8) *Chart Your Menstrual Cycle* - instructs girls to record their menstrual cycle for a few months in order to determine the characteristics of their own cycle. (Tampax, 1998a, p. 42)

9) *Menstrual Protection: From Grass Mats to Tampons* - students are supposed to complete a chart, "It's Your Choice," by comparing advantages and disadvantages of both external (pads/pantiliners) and internal (tampons) protection. The second activity instructs students to collect magazine advertisements, product packages, product samples, and product information. (Tampax, 1998a, pp. 44-45)

10) *Being a Woman* - activity sheet contains a twelve-month by thirty-one day chart to be used for tracking one's menstrual cycle. In each box girls are supposed to indicate whether their period flow was light, medium, heavy, spotting, or if there was no flow. The second activity is
an outline of "some medical concerns for women," where girls match terms with definitions. (Tampax, 1998a, p. 46)

11) *Taking Care of Yourself* - contains a pie chart, divided into 24 spaces, with the appropriate time of day placed at the end of each division. Students are instructed to colour in the chart (using different colours) according to the time when they rest, exercise, eat meals, snack, and other activities, as well as completing a "personal care profile." Finally, all of the students are supposed to prepare a book, entitled "Know Your Body," that is comprised of most of the information they have learned about puberty, the reproductive systems, various terms, and common medical conditions. (Tampax, 1998a, p. 47)

The remainder of the *Tampax Teaching Guide to Puberty and Menstrual Health* (1998) contains a space for notes (p. 48), a glossary of terms (pp. 49-52), resource guides for teachers (p. 53), students (pp. 53-55), two sample letters to parents (p. 56), and the activity sheets answer key (p.57). The resource guide for teachers is broken down into two parts: *teachers’ resources and articles and journals*. (Tampax, 1998a) The student resource guide consists of three parts: *non-fiction, fiction, and films and videos*. (Tampax, 1998a) The sample letters to parents are different in that one mentions that the kit was created by Tambrands Health Educational Division, while the other letter focuses upon the health issues that are covered by the kit.
The Poster

The poster that accompanies the kit is a two-sided, colour series of illustrations of the female anatomy, the male anatomy, the female reproductive organs, and the menstrual cycle. The side-view illustration of the female anatomy includes the following labelled parts: fallopian tubes, bladder, urethra, clitoris, labia, ovary, uterus, cervix, vagina, and anus. (Tampax, 1998a) The side-view of the male anatomy includes: vas deferens, urethra, penis, testicle, bladder, seminal vesicle, prostate gland, anus, epididymis, and scrotum. (Tampax, 1998a) The illustration of the female reproductive organs is a frontal view of the fallopian tubes, uterus, endometrium, ovary, ovum, cervix, and vagina. (Tampax, 1998a) The final series of illustrations is comprised of four pictures of the various stages of menstruation. The illustrations include the menstrual period, the maturation of eggs, ovulation, and the thickening of the uterus lining. (Tampax, 1998a)

The Student Handbook

A Time For Answers is a small, 51-page handbook that accompanies the kit. The handbook contains information about puberty for both sexes, but the handbook really caters to girls. The breakdown of the book is as follows: 32 pages are dedicated to girls (including a two page foldout illustration), 8 pages are dedicated solely to boys, 10 pages are for use by both sexes, and one page
is designated for the table of contents. (Tampax, 1995) The chapters in the handbook include: *All About Puberty, What's Happening?*, *All About Girls, Body Talk: Girls, Your First Period, The Menstrual Cycle, Feminine Protection, Using a Tampon, Questions Girls Have, Body Talk Boys, Questions Boys Have*, and *Body Care*. The inside cover of the handbook contains a short passage from Tambrands on why the handbook was made.

At Tambrands, we answer letters and talk to young people like you every day. We have learned that both boys and girls want to know about why their bodies are changing and whether the stories they've heard are true. This booklet has been written to help you understand as much as you can about your changing body and feelings. (Tampax, 1995)

The back inside cover of the handbook contains a short resource list of three books students can use to find more information on puberty. There is also contact information for Tambrands as well as a world wide web address for students.

The first chapter, *All About Puberty: Growing Up Takes Time*, provides a short overview of the physical and emotional changes both sexes can expect during puberty. *What's Happening: Body and Mind* addresses the emotional changes and difficulties which adolescents might encounter when trying to find answers to their questions. *All About Girls: Changes You Can See* examines the external changes of females which take place during puberty. The following
topics are covered in the chapter: 1) *Breasts* discusses the process of breast development; 2) *Pubic hair* merely states where the hair grows; 3) *Growth spur* suggests that girls will grow quite a lot during puberty; 4) *Vaginal discharge* talks about pre-period occurrences; 5) *Underarm hair* claims not only that it appears late in puberty, but that some girls shave their underarms; and 6) *Menstruation* means the same thing as "getting your period." (Tampax, 1995, p. 9) *Body Talk: Girls—The Reproductive System* delves into the internal body changes as a result of puberty. *Your First Period: Facts About Menstruation* is a short section that provides an overview of menstruation.

*Feminine Protection: What’s Right For You?* is one of the longest chapters in the handbook. Although it is six pages, it contains very small illustrations, and the rest is solid copy. The chapter begins by explaining what feminine protection means. "Protection for what, you want to know? For your clothes. Because the blood in your menstrual flow can stain your clothes, you need something to absorb it before it gets on your clothes." (Tampax, 1995, p. 23) The chapter outlines the two different types of commercially available products: pads and tampons. It explains the qualities of both types of feminine protection, how to properly use each type, and provides the benefits of tampons. (Tampax, 1995)

There is also a short section on correct absorbency selection, as well as an entire page dedicated to toxic shock syndrome. (Tampax, 1995) The illustration and images present in the chapter include the following: a green line drawing of a female skipping with a rope (p. 23), a black and white labelled diagram of a pad (p. 24), a black and white labelled diagram of a tampon and its applicator (p. 26),

138
and a colour photo of three Tampax products—Tampax Naturals, Tampax Supers, and Tampax Satin Touch (p. 27).

Using a Tampon: A Little Practice teaches girls how to insert and remove a tampon correctly. The chapter starts with a few recommendations that will make tampon insertion easier. "So, when you first use a tampon, make sure you have plenty of time and that you feel relaxed... The best time to try inserting a tampon for the first time is when you are menstruating and have a heavy flow." (Tampax, 1995, p. 29) The next few pages contain four colour diagrams that are virtually identical to those found in the reproducible graphics section of the teachers' guide (the only graphic missing is the one in which there is a close-up of the hand and the tampon). The first diagram in the handbook is similar to the second diagram on the reproducible graphic sheet (each diagram thereafter respectively corresponds directly to the diagrams on the reproducible graphic). A paragraph explaining the appropriate instructions for the step is located underneath each graphic in the handbook. The girls' section concludes with Questions Girls Have: A Time for Answers. Like the teacher's guidebook, the handbook uses typical questions and answers about puberty as a means to convey more information to girls. p. 39).

The section on boys, Body Talk: Boys – The Reproductive System, begins in a similar manner to the girls section. In this introduction to puberty, the various features of male puberty (average age range of puberty, height differences, size differences, voice changes, increased hair growth) are discussed. The next part of the chapter focuses attention on the fact that the
function of puberty is to make boys capable of reproduction. (Tampax, 1995) A labelled colour diagram of the male reproductive system explains each organ in the system and the functions performed by the organ. (Tampax, 1995) The chapter concludes with an explanation of an erection and ejaculation. Other illustrations in this chapter include a blue line drawing of two boys playing soccer (p. 40) and a purple line drawing of a boy riding a bicycle (p. 44). The boys’ section, ends with Questions Boys Have: A Time for Answers. The very familiar hypothetical question and answer section is once again employed as a method of presenting additional information about puberty.

The handbook returns to non-gender specific issues in the chapter entitled Body Care: Being Your Best. This chapter is dedicated to information about personal hygiene and health care. The topics covered include diet, in a section labelled Eat good foods, physical fitness in Exercise regularly, and cleanliness, acne prevention, and body odour control in Lather up. (Tampax, 1995) The last part of the chapter stresses the fact that puberty is a natural part of human life and instructs students to communicate with others in order to obtain answers to any other questions they might have about puberty. For More Information is a short resource list containing three non-fiction books that provide information about puberty. The postal address, for Consumer Services of Tambrands Incorporated, is provided so that students can ask questions about growing up or getting one’s period. (Tampax, 1995) The world wide web address, http://www.troom.com/ is a link to a site that is sponsored by Tampax Satin. The
handbook says that the website is “a cool place to visit more than once a month.”
(Tampax, 1995, p. 51)

The Video

While a line-by-line, shot-by-shot presentation of the video Kids to Kids: Talking About Puberty (1998) would be nice, it is neither practical, nor necessary for this analysis. The video is almost an exact reproduction of every other component of the kit. Kids to Kids is most closely matched to the student handbook—although perhaps it is not apparent unless the two are compared side-by-side. The video is broken down into several segments. Each of these segments employs adolescent pre-puberty and post-puberty girls and boys as spokespeople. The adolescents often recant stories about their puberty experiences and fears. The girls are further employed as product sales people in the section on menstrual protection products.

The first section of the video addresses the question: What is Puberty, anyway? (Tampax, 1998b) In a series of head shots, students comment on what they believe puberty is all about. At various points the narrator injects with commentary, such as, “It can feel like it happens overnight, or it can feel like it takes forever.” (Tampax, 1998b) The next series of comments addresses the emotional and intellectual changes that have taken place in both boys and girls. The narrator claims that the changes take place at different times in boys and
girls—boys, between the ages of 10 and 17 and girls, between the ages of 9 and 16. (Tampax, 1998b)

The video then proceeds into an examination of puberty from an anatomical point of view. The narrator speaks about the role of hormones, after which, girls discuss the actual changes that have happened to their bodies. The focus is then shifted to the boys. We hear a series of commentaries on the changes that have occurred in the various boys who appear on screen. In the final segment a girl comments on the fact that one will not change over night.

When you're growing up...and when you're, like...all these changes are happening...you don't, like notice them...it's not like you jump from being ten to fifteen...it's, like...umm...there's, like, a total of like five years in between there and you just like...everything happens...but it doesn't happen over night...but if you just, like, maybe over a year, you look at a picture of yourself...you're like, "hey, you know I did grow, maybe my figure did change a little bit," you know. (Tampax, 1998b)

The next section, Raging Hormones, examines the role played by estrogen and progesterone. In another series of head shots, girls talk about the mood swings and food cravings that they experience during their cycle. The narrator then explains the role that hormones play in changing the female reproductive system while a detailed examination of the organs in the female reproductive system is shown. The topic of menstruation is also introduced at this
time. A group of girls talk about the fact that they have not started their period and discuss their feelings associated with the anticipation of their first period. A list of signs that indicate when a girl is to receive her first period is then printed upon the screen. (Tampax, 1998b)

In order to examine the ovaries in detail, the video returns to the diagram of the female reproductive system. The process of menstruation is explained through the use of an animation. The narrator explains that puberty and menstruation provides women with the ability to have a baby. “So, you can see that starting periods means a girl’s body is becoming a woman’s body and is now able to have a baby.” (Tampax, 1998b) A group of girls warn that just because you can have a baby does not mean that you are ready to have a baby, because of age, level of maturity, and the lack of a job. (Tampax, 1998b) The section ends with an emphasis on responsibility. “Puberty means new responsibilities for both boys and girls. You start to take yourself a little more seriously. And sometimes, that can be a little difficult to do.” (Tampax, 1998b)

*How to find the right feminine protection without even blushing* addresses the use of pads and tampons. The segment lasts approximately five minutes and fifteen seconds, or just under one-fifth of total video running time (27 minutes). The narrator talks about the purpose of each of the products while the screen displays various packages of tampons and pads—the composition of which includes 7 Tampax packages, 3 Always packages, 1 Playtex package, 1 Kotex package and 1 o.b. package. (Tampax, 1998b) The narrator explains what feminine pads do and how they should be used. The footage that accompanies
the narration is of a female taking a pad out of its package, removing its backing, and then holding up a pair of underwear with a pad attached to the inside. (Tampax, 1998b) Following this sequence, a still image containing three different types of pads, “Ultra Thin with Wings,” “Ultra Thin,” and “Pantiliner” (Tampax, 1998b) is shown on the screen. In a series of head shots, three girls talk about their experiences with pads. A fourth girl appears on screen and states, “After a while you know you start to...kind of...shift over to tampons.” (Tampax, 1998b)

In a still image similar to that of the pads, three virtually identical tampons, in their applicators, are shown on screen. The kinds of tampons displayed include “Tampax Satin,” “Plastic,” and “Flushable.” (Tampax, 1998b) Obviously these qualities refer to the types of applicators and not the tampons, as is noted by the narrator. While the narrator explains the composition of a tampon, how it works, and its benefits (natural odour protection, prevents accidents) a number of girls are shown performing various activities in a swimming pool. (Tampax, 1998b) The video returns to a sequence of head shots of girls talking about their experiences with tampons, three of whom claim that they like using tampons better than pads. An animation, similar in content to the diagrams in the teachers’ guidebook and the student handbook, is used to demonstrate how to insert a tampon. Following the diagram, a girl appears on screen talking about how tampons stay in, the strength of the tampon removal string and the process tampon removal. Her voice continues the explanation while the screen switches to a close up of someone pulling on a tampon and its string. The video changes
once again to the animation, but this time a hand grips the tampons string and removes the tampon. (Tampax, 1998b)

Once the animation is finished, the video switches to shots of girls getting dressed, brushing their hair, and applying make-up in a locker room setting. The voice of the narrator changes, presumably to that of another woman because despite obvious tonal changes in the recording quality, she does not sound like the original narrator. One of the lockers is open and we see a girl grab an article of clothing while the camera focuses on a box of Tampax Satin tampons. (Tampax, 1998b) Her speech surrounds the choice of tampons based on absorbency requirements.

**NARRATOR:** Tampons come in a variety of absorbencies and the best way to decide which is right for you is to experiment. through you probably don't consider yourself to be full grown, your menstrual flow can be that of an adult woman. (Tampax, 1998b)

The video switches to a product shot of two Tampax Stain Packages, with the word “Heavy” written on the bottom left hand side of the screen. (Tampax, 1998b)

**NARRATOR B:** So on heavy flow days you might try super or super plus. (Tampax, 1998b)
A part of the screen is removed through a wipe transition to reveal another Tampax Satin package and the word “Medium’ appears in the bottom centre of the screen. (Tampax, 1998b)

**NARRATOR B:** On days with a more moderate flow try regular or slender regular. (Tampax, 1998b)

Another part of the screen is revealed through a wipe transition to display another Tampax package and the word “light” appears on the bottom right hand of the screen.

**NARRATOR B:** And as your flow tapers off, junior absorbency Tampax Lites may be all you need. (Tampax, 1998b)

The narrator continues her voice over while the text at the bottom of the screen changes in direct accordance with her speech.

**NARRATOR B:** Always use the lowest absorbency for your flow and remember to change your tampon every 4 to 8 hours. (Tampax, 1998b)

The narrator's voice changes back to that of the original narrator. Two packages of Always brand pads appear on the bottom of the screen.
NARRATOR A: If you aren't sure how heavy your flow might be, you can use pantiliners or pads as a tampon back up. (Tampax, 1998b)

Girls are told that they should keep a small kit containing pads, tampons, and underwear nearby just in case they get their period unexpectedly. Another series of head shots follow the information about tampons. In these commentaries, several girls dispel some common myths about tampons (that they can get lost inside a girl, that they will take away a girl's virginity). The girls' section of the video concludes with a brief warning that Toxic Shock Syndrome is a serious complication associated with tampon use. TSS is not clearly defined by the narrator, nor is it thoroughly explained. Instead, girls are instructed to read the information found on the direction leaflet in each box of tampons. (Tampax, 1998b)

The male section or Raging Hormones Part II, begins with a series of boys commenting on hormones, puberty, and the increasing levels responsibility. The narrator explains the role that puberty plays in males--surprisingly enough-- is to give males the ability to reproduce. (Tampax, 1998b) A diagram of the male reproductive system, virtually identical to that found in the other kit materials, is shown on screen and explained through a voice over. After a series of animated diagrams, detailing the process of reproduction, several boys comment on their own experiences with wet dreams. The section concludes with students of both sexes commenting on their understanding of the changes that occur in the opposite sex.
The final section of the video, *Health, Hygiene, and Happiness* examines many ways in which boys and girls can maintain good health. The video summarizes puberty through the use of the student perspective. A series of head shots, comprised of both boys and girls, is used to explain any extra information that is not covered by the other portions of the video. The world wide web addresses for students (http://www.troom.com) and for parents and teachers (http://www.bodymatters.com) are displayed on screen for a brief period of time. Approximately one minute later a screen containing the following information appears, “Special thanks to Principle Richard Miller, his staff and the Weston Middle School, Weston, CT. Without their cooperation this film could not have been made.” (Tampax, 1998b)

The Sample Tampons

The last component of the kit is a sample box of tampons. The tampons are *Satin Touch* tampons made by Tampax. The trial package of 4 regular absorbency tampons is housed in a pink box. Each tampon is individually wrapped in paper. Product claims on the box include: “easy and comfortable to use,” “maximum protection,” and “flushable and biodegradable.” The box also contains an instruction leaflet explaining (using diagrams that are virtually identical to those in the kit) how to use a tampon.
CHAPTER FOUR

CASE STUDIES: AN ANALYSIS OF THE *my money* INVESTMENT CLUB KIT AND THE TAMPAX HEALTH EDUCATION PROGRAM ON PUBERTY AND MENSTRUAL HEALTH

Case 1:

The *my money* Investment Club: *Get to know your dough*

While many questions about the legitimacy of the content of this kit may be raised, this project does not intend to deal with them. The focus here is to examine the package as the four research traditions of advertising would examine the package. On the non-critical side, there is a preface that appears to be an inherent need in the students before they even use the kit. That is to say, that before the kit is employed, the underlying presumption is that there is a real need to have money. This assumption is predetermined externally because the kit does not make arguments in favour of the need to have money. Since the non-critical traditions fail to acknowledge ideology and context, the base assumption of all three is, therefore, that people need money.

The critical tradition takes a different approach because it acknowledges that while certain things appear to be natural and fundamental needs, often they are superficial needs made to appear as natural. The critical research tradition
attempts to add context to a given set of circumstances in order to determine what is and is not natural. In this case, the need for money, however necessary in a free market society, would be a fabricated need. With that foundation split addressed, we will now look, in detail, at what the four research traditions have to say about the my money Investment Club kit.

Analysis of the my money Investment Club kit through the Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Information

The advertising as a form of information theorists argue that advertising is basically information about a product or service. The advertisement is designed to tell a consumer about the qualities or utility value of a given commodity and its ability to satisfy a need. The consumer then makes a rational choice through a series of logical steps to purchase (or not purchase) a given commodity based on its ability to fulfill that given need. Does this kit display any of those qualities?

The information provided by the my money Investment Club kit does not specifically speak about a product or service offered by the Bank of Montreal. Instead, the financial concepts are introduced in lesson plans appear to be independent of the company that has services tied into the concepts. The reason these financial concepts are introduced is to inform the student about the ability of these services to fulfill several needs. The first need or want addressed by the kit is the ability to get material things people need or want. (BM, 1998) The
second need presented is the need to not lose one's money. "A bank is a good, safe place to keep your money; much better than leaving it around in your room where your sister or brother could take off with it, or the vacuum cleaner could suck it up!" (BM, 1998, p. 3) The third need addressed is the need to have more money. "And even better, when you put money into the bank, the bank gives you more money back!" (BM, 1998, p. 3) The solution to these problems is to store one's money in a bank.

In order to link the financial services provided by banks in general to specific services provided by the Bank of Montreal, labels are applied to the services. By using trade names and logos such as my money, Investore, Possibilities Foundation of Bank of Montreal Group of Companies, InvestorLine, First Canadian Mutual Funds, and Nesbitt-Burns (BM, 1998a, 1998b), there is a link forged between the information presented in the lessons and the Bank of Montreal and its services. What is of importance here is that the services and groups outlined above are not just a fictitious part of the game and teachers guide, they actually exist in the real world.

As an example of this, let us take a look at the term my money. While there is no specific reference to my money bank accounts in the guide or the game, there is a real world bank account service is provided by the Bank of Montreal for people under 18 years of age entitled my money. What my money is to the game is a title, but in real life it is a service name complete with slogans that are identical to those used in the game. It is not hard to connect the dots, so to speak, and rationalize that brand recognition would occur if a child were to
walk into a Bank of Montreal and see signs for *my money* accounts. Furthermore, with the newly learned information about what banking can do for a student, there may be a search performed to see what services are offered by the Bank of Montreal.

While the case is not as simple as providing direct information about a specific product or service, the Bank of Montreal *my money Investment Club* kit provides information about the banking service in general. Specific advertisements about services or products offered by the Bank of Montreal do not appear in the game. However, the addition of logos, brands and slogans attached to various parts of the game make it a product of and promotional for service offered by the Bank of Montreal.

After students have completed the reading, coursework, and game play involved with the *my money Investment Club* kit, there is a possibility that the student will conduct a real world product search. Students are provided with detailed, positive information about the banking industry. The fundamental concept introduced is that if one uses a bank to invest his or her money, they are more than likely to make more money. The concept is taught and reinforced as a *positive* activity through a second fundamental concept. The more money one has, the better it is because they can buy more things; more things equals more happiness. The fact that the real world of banking, and indeed the Bank of Montreal, provides a service for youth with the same name as the kit students learn the information from is grounds to argue that this kit is a form of self-promotion, and therefore advertising.
Summary of the Analysis of the my money Investment Club kit through the Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Information

While the advertising as a form of information model does not fit completely with the my money Investment Club kit, it does present an interesting twist to the advertising as a form of information paradigm. The focus of this kit is to educate students about the services offered by the banking industry in general. The end goal of the kit is to prepare students for entry into the banking world, not as employees, but as service consumers. The way in which product information is linked to specific services offered by the Bank of Montreal is through service brand names. The general services the students learn about in the kit are the same services that are offered by the Bank of Montreal in the form of, for example, the my money savings plans. In this instance, the information offered does fit with the informational model of advertising—the kit promotes the banking industry through the provision of information about banking services. While students may seek other banks as a means of obtaining such services, they are more likely to turn to the Bank of Montreal merely on the basis of service familiarity. Students are already aware of the real-world names of the services offered by the Bank of Montreal through the brand names and logos use throughout this kit.
Analysis of the *my money Investment Club* kit through the Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Persuasion

The theorists who see advertising as a form of persuasion hold that advertising works in series of arguments made on behalf of a given commodity. The arguments attempt to persuade the consumer that the given commodity will fulfill his or her needs. Advertising, under this model, is often used to create and foster brand loyalty among consumers. The *my money Investment Club* kit uses its arguments in order to inform children about the banking industry. In the end, the knowledge of the banking industry is linked to the Bank of Montreal through the use of trade names and brand names of real-world Bank of Montreal services.

There are two main arguments made on behalf of the banking industry in this kit. It is important to revisit the initial few paragraphs of the guidebook because these passages address the assumed needs of the students. They compare the use of a bank to other methods of managing one’s money and claim that using a bank is the best method. In fact, the terms “good, safe place” and “the bank gives you money back” (BM, 1998a, p. 3) are used as persuasive devices in favour of banking. The terms “sister or brother could take off with it” and “vacuum cleaner could suck it up,” (BM, 1998a, p. 3) in reference to keeping money at home, are used to persuade students that leaving money around the house is a bad idea. One inference that can be made from this argument is that leaving money around the house is not profitable, and therefore, a negative
venture. A second inference that can be drawn from these statements might be that one will probably lose money by leaving it at home. A third inference that can be drawn from this is that a bank will protect money and provide extra money as a reward for leaving it in the bank. Finally, one other inference that is clearly demonstrated by the section is that one's siblings are thieves!

The sixth lesson in the guide attempts to demonstrate money growth through interest calculations on savings plans and investments. This is a persuasive device used to create a positive angle on the relationship between money invested and money earned. The lesson employs a few over-head charts to demonstrate some simple interest calculations on bank accounts and bonds. These charts also illustrate how mutual funds earn money. Coupled with the argument that leaving money at home earns nothing, the calculations and charts strengthen the argument for investing money with a bank. The theme that is reinforced (possibly taught) is that the more money one has, the better it is. What is even more interesting is that there is no real explanation as to why it is better to have more money other than to get more things. Again, the desire to have more money is perhaps something the students bring with them already when learning from this kit. Regardless of the origin of that desire, there is some need played upon through the use of calculations and charts. The persuasive argument made by this kit deals with the ability of the bank to fulfill that need.

As for the third part of the assumption that advertising is a form of persuasion, there is the possibility that brand loyalty, and certainly brand awareness, are desired outcomes. As mentioned in the information section, the
kit has the same name as a service offered by the Bank of Montreal. That service, *my money*, is aimed at the people who will more than likely be playing the game—young students. The argument to use a bank to look after the student's money is the foundation of this kit. The terms of the argument centre around the real world services of the Bank of Montreal and their respective logos. The end result is that the connection between banking services and Bank of Montreal services is practically drawn for the student. In other words, while the Bank of Montreal makes no claims about the services they personally offer, they do make claims as to what the banking industry has to offer. The connection between the claims and the actual services is realized through repetition of actual names and logos of Bank of Montreal services throughout the kit. The use of persuasion, in this case, could work to foster brand recognition, brand loyalty or brand superiority for the Bank of Montreal over competing alternatives.

Much like the advertising is a form of information theorists, this group might not be able to see a direct argument made by the Bank of Montreal in favour of their particular services. What can be drawn from this is a direct argument in favour of the banking industry. The banking industry on the whole is seen as necessity because it can fulfill the need to have, earn, and keep money. It is not much of a stretch to suggest that the use of trade names and services associated with the Bank of Montreal completes the argument because they provide concrete answers for the hypothetical ideas and problems presented in the literature and board game. The end result is that the Bank of Montreal brand of service is able to fulfill the all of the banking needs of students.
Summary of the Analysis of the *my money Investment Club* kit through the Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Persuasion

Although it is not a perfect fit, the theory that advertising is a form of persuasion would still view the *my money Investment Club* kit as a piece of advertising. Like the findings of informational perspective, there is no direct promotion of the services offered by the Bank of Montreal. In this case, there are arguments made in favour of the need to have money and about the ability of the banking industry to fulfill that need. As was the case with the informational perspective, the linkages between the generalized services and the services offered by the Bank of Montreal are formed through the use of trade names and brand logos. The persuasive argument, in this case, really has nothing to do with the Bank of Montreal directly. The importance here is that the kit lays a foundational argument for one's need of the banking industry. In turn, the Bank of Montreal is connected to these ideals because its production of the kit and use of trade names and branding. The kit, in effect, advertises Bank of Montreal services through the use of brand familiarity. Students will already know the names of the services they seek, but only on the terms set forth by the Bank of Montreal (as opposed to Toronto Dominion banks, Canadian Imperial Bank of Commerce, and others). The major reason that this case does not fit the model precisely is that the kit uses an innovative (however, not original) method of advertising. Instead of arguing in favour of a specific commodity or brand, this kit
does something much more subtle. Simply stated, the alternative method is: persuade people that they need something, suggest generalized services that can fulfill the need, and offer brand specific services that very closely resemble the generalized services.

**Analysis of the my money Investment Club kit through the Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Symbolism**

The position that advertising is a form of symbolism is informed by the notion that people consume ideas and images surrounding a given commodity. In order to address whether or not this perspective would view the my money Investment Club kit as a piece of advertising, we must examine the images or notions espoused by the kit. These notions include things like beliefs, assumptions, norms, ideals, and morals. To a lesser extent, we will examine the assertion that realization of one's need fulfillment is based on the ability of a consumed commodity to solve one's problem. The ability for the imagery to live up to the real thing is not a necessary part of this equation. The services offered must be utilized for extremely long periods of time in order to see any significant financial gain. Instead, the importance of the advertising here is to merely hook the students as Bank of Montreal customers in order to facilitate the use of such services. We will also take a look at the literal images as a part of this analysis.
The notions that are introduced and reinforced by the *my money* Investment Club kit surround the need to have and earn money through investing. The details provided about the banking industry are generalized and not limited solely to the services offered by the Bank of Montreal. There are many competing banks that offer mutual fund investing and specialized savings accounts. The only way that one could tell if the services offered by the Bank of Montreal were able to fulfill the needs, would be to actually use their services. What is interesting here is that the general information provided by the lessons and board game creates, for the student, an ideal predisposition towards investment. Since the idea that the people need money is assumed to be entrenched in the student already, the kit does not really address the origin need. Instead, the kit introduces two new pieces of information to the students. The first piece of information is that it is possible to increase the amount of money one has by placing it in a bank. (see the quote: BM, 1998a, p. 3) The second piece of information provided by the kit details the various ways in which banks are able to provide people with more money through investing. The end result is that the need to find a bank that will provide the described services becomes the challenge for the student.

It is important to once again stress that the services offered by the Bank of Montreal are not specifically described anywhere in the kit, but the authentic names of the services offered accompany the general ideas presented. Let us revisit these notions: 1) banks can fulfill the need to have and earn money, 2) banks are the best place to put one’s money, and 3) investing one’s money in
various plans will yield more money in the form of interest in most cases. (BM, 1998a) What is important about these notions is that they are based on actual values. The fundamental message espoused by the kit is that money makes people happy. Emphasis is placed upon the fact that it is good to not only have money, but to have more money. In order to determine the ability of banking services to fulfill the happiness claim made by the kit, one would actually have to go to a bank and utilize the services before being able to justify whether or not the bank lived up to expectations.

The validation of claims can take place on at least two distinct levels. The first level is the actual ability of a bank to return extra money on an investment. There is a real world, physical sensation to obtaining more money. It is possible to touch money and there is hard proof as to whether or not the bank was able to live up to its claim. The second level, the symbolic level of happiness, is not as easy to determine. The game component of the kit emphasizes the achievement of happiness through the attainment of wealth in a very interesting way. It is important to state that happiness may not be achieved even if the bank fulfills its claim of gaining money through use of its services. Regardless of the ability of a bank to help fulfill personal happiness, the board game demonstrates the power of symbolism to advocate a certain belief. That belief amounts to the achievement of personal happiness through gains in monetary wealth.

Specifically, the notions that investing and having more money are two positive ventures is evident in the desired outcome and the pictorial representations present on the my money Board Game. The winner is the
individual who has attained the most money upon completion of the end of the
game. Under this model, to win the game is to succeed. To succeed is to be
happy. For example, the space marked “Yippee” contains a caricature of a young
male with his arms full of money. He also has a large smile on his face. (BM,
1998b) Some examples of other spaces in which a player can earn money
include: “Congratulations” (the same young male caricature, smiling and reading
a card), “Grandma’s House” (a smiling grandmother), “Toothfairy” (she has smile
on her face), and “Bonus” (where a stack of money accompanies the phrase
‘bonus’). (BM, 1998b) It is interesting to note that the man in the square “Pay
Taxes” (BM, 1998b) also has a smile on his face. In this respect, the man could
be happy because he is receiving money from the player who is providing it. The
“Bear Market” space contains a caricature of frowning bear and the “Burglar”
 space contains a picture of a broken piggy bank. (BM, 1998b) These spaces
contain pictures that are associated with negative ideas—frowning and
corresponding emotions as well as destroyed objects. The rest of the spaces do
not clearly indicate positive or negative associations with having or losing money.

If children are to believe in the images and notions surrounding the
lessons and the game and if they also believe that the banking system can help
achieve the sated outcomes, then this kit can be seen as a form of advertising. In
this case, the kit would promote the banking industry in general. Like the other
two non-critical traditions, some sort of brand recognition would have to take
place. The Bank of Montreal brands and services logos act as symbols of
happiness because they are associated with the positive roles banks play in
earning and retaining money. The trade names and logos presented by the guide and game also provide the foundation for students to link the images and notions they symbolize with a real world corporation and its services. The only way that one could realize need fulfillment would be for to actually use the service offered by the Bank of Montreal.

Summary of the Analysis of the my money Investment Club kit through the Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Symbolism

On both a physical image level and a symbolic level, the my money Investment Club kit complies to a great extent with the theory that advertising is a form of symbolism. The main implication here is quite clear—money makes people happy. This notion is inextricable entwined with all of the information presented in this kit not only through the copy, but via the pictures and characters used to illustrate the principles. Happiness is everywhere one looks, from the smiling faces of the characters in the board game, to statements that talk about saving money to buy things. The only way students can realize happiness is through consumption of real-world services. Unlike the information and persuasion theorists, the images in this kit do extensively comply with the tenets of the symbolic perspective. The use of branding and trade names is itself a form of imagery. For example, the smiling face and thumbs-up stance of the boy who is wearing a my money shirt links an expression of happiness and satisfaction
with a service offered by the Bank of Montreal. The real-world end result or level of happiness will vary depending upon the ability of the services of the Bank of Montreal to deliver upon the claims made about the banking industry in general.

Analysis of the *my money Investment Club* kit through the Critical Perspective of Advertising

Critics of advertising assert two main principles. The first idea is that advertising does not fulfill needs, but instead creates them based on a simple formula. The advertisement, devoid of a subject, works to create a problem in the consumer. The messages surrounding the advertised commodity appear to assert that the consumer has some sort of problem that the commodity in the advertisement can fix. In reality, the advertisement suggests that the reader is flawed or damaged because they are not using the given commodity. The second major principle is that advertisements contain limited mindset, otherwise known as an ideology. The ideological values of the commodity advertisement are based on and are inextricably entwined with the beliefs and values of capitalism.

One of the first ideas introduced in the lesson guide is that there is more to life than money, although everyone should know how to look after their money. “Money isn’t everything but it’s important to know how to take care of it.” (BM, 1998a, p. 4) Since the rest of the kit does not address anything else but money, and does not even mention what the rest of “everything” is, this statement is
clearly undermined. The statement is thrown in at an attempt to balance a one-sided argument, but it is so weak and transparent that it does not help achieve balance. The two major concepts that take prominence in this kit are: 1) People need money; and 2) People can have more money if they invest wisely. The traditional notion that is challenged here is that there is more to life than money. It is because they fail to acknowledge any other aspects of life, that the two new concepts displace the other important aspects to life.

There are many needs addressed by the kit—such as the need to get things, need to have money, need to keep money, need to get more money, and the need to be happy. The need to be happy should be separated from all other needs presented in this kit because it is really the all-encompassing theme. All of the needs and wants in the teacher’s guide, activities, and board game have the desired outcome of happiness. There are obviously many other minor needs presented in this kit. These needs include the need for a bull market, the need for mutual funds, the need for donating money to others who do not have money, the need for financial advice, the need to win the board game—the list could continue practically forever. For the purpose of analysis, it is crucial to address the three major needs that lead to the happiness outcome: 1) individuals need to have money, 2) individuals need to keep money, and 3) individuals need to make more money through interest.

The way in which the need to keep money safe is addressed presents some interesting outcomes. First, the phrase “brother or sister could take off with it,” (BM, 1998a, p. 3) creates a problem. It suggests that a bank is more
trustworthy than one's own immediate family. It also suggests that we should not trust our siblings and that money is worth more than personal trust. It suggests that money is property belonging to one individual and is not owned by a community. The solution to the problem is to put one's money in a bank. The second part of the phrase, "vacuum could suck it up!" (BM, 1998a, p. 3) builds on the themes described above. One cannot leave money in their room because a family member or house keeper might come along and carelessly suck it into the vacuum. A bank is, again, more trustworthy because they have the ability to prevent such things because they are not careless. The other possibility is that the student may be too careless and suck up his or her money with the vacuum. Again, a bank is better place to keep one's money because the owner of that money is more likely to be careless with it than the bank. From these statements we can see several things. First, one should not trust one's family with one's money—they are either to careless with it, or they will steal it. Two, people are not careful enough to look after their own money. Finally, a bank is more trustworthy and careful with money than the owner of the money or the owner's family. An extra statement that may be inferred from this passage is that people are too stupid to look inside a vacuum cleaner in order to regain their money if it has been sucked up!

What has happened here? The kit makes these assertions and turns them into problems—just as the advertising does. The first assertion, that family is not trustworthy where one's money is concerned presents the following problem: What does one do when one cannot guard my money all of the time? The
second assertion, that the family, house keeper, or student is too careless to look after their own money presents this problem: Those people who live in one's house, including oneself, are not careful enough (or smart enough?) to look after money. Who is smart enough to make sure it will always be there? We see from the complete passage (on page 3) that placing the money in a bank can solve these two problems. A third problem is presented, but unlike the previous two problems, it is not stated directly as a dilemma. "And even better, when you put money into the bank, the bank gives you more money back!" (BM, 1998a, p. 3) The problem is created out of new information—the student is missing out on something that is available to his or herself. The third problem that can be inferred from this passage is, how can one make more money using the money that one has? While starting with two problems, a third is created through omission. The bank has identified a need that the student may not have even knew existed—therefore the need to have more money, at least in part is created by this passage should the student accept the claims.

Now, the person who is not aware of context is probably asking themselves about the need for money. Is it not a foundation of the free-market economy? Since money is used to purchase commodities, both of frivolous and absolute necessity, why should a student not want more to keep money safe and to gain extra money for keeping it in a bank. Do not most people use a bank? Of course the answer is yes, most people do use a bank and most people would want to make the most of their savings. What is at question here is not the real world need to have money in order to survive in a free-market society, but that
the need to have money is not natural. As the critics assert, the need for mass consumption is false. The need for money is indeed parallel to the need for material wealth. Certainly foodstuffs are purchased with money, but money is not an integral part of food as a natural product. The critics also assert that political and social apathy occurs when people become wrapped up in material consumption. The purchasing ideas presented in this kit are certainly not food-based products. Instead, students might like to buy a skateboard. (BM, 1998a) It is the presentation of money as absolute necessity that eliminates competing alternatives from appearing in the my money Investment Club kit.

There is yet another extremely important replacement of a traditional meaning in this kit. The replacement occurs in the re-defining of the term Golden Rule. The original golden rule was "...thou shalt love thy neighbor as thyself," (Leviticus 19:18) in book three of the Old Testament, perhaps better known as "do unto others as you would have them do unto you." So that there is no confusion, the meaning of this rule suggests that we should treat other people in the same manner as we would like to be treated. The my money Investment Club kit suggests that the golden rule is not one of attitude and actions toward others it is one of managing ones finances. According to the kit, the golden rule is "don't put all of your eggs into one basket." (BM, 1998a; BM, 1998b) At first the golden rule is stated as the "golden rule of diversification" (BM, 1998a), but later, the "of diversification" part is removed from the phrase. This is a very good example of the process of replacement of traditional structures of meaning with free market ideology. The power vested in the original golden rule is huge—it carries a great
deal of cultural and religious weight. The original phrase is eradicated and replaced with a new phrase and new meaning, but the power associated with the use of term **Golden Rule** still exists—there is but one absolute rule.

A key part of the critical theorists position is that advertising creates problems in the consumer that can be fixed by the commodity. Does this kit perform such a function? As argued before, the kit does not make any claims as to why it is better to have more money than to have either the a fixed amount of money or no money. The kit stresses the need for investing as a means through which one can make more money in the form of interest. Students must already arrive to the kit with a predisposed notion of needing money. This predisposition is debased through the understanding that consumption is not natural, but is a learned practice. The need to consume is already implanted in the students through other means such as other advertisements and social institutions. One requires money in order to consume. It follows that the more money one has, the more one can consume. Through this reasoning, the notion that more money is better is upheld and fostered by the kit.

The majority of the kit seeks to promote the banking industry as a positive force in the world. From the perspective of the consumer, according to the kit, the bank serves to put more money in the individual's pocket. The way to achieve this is through lending money to the bank in various ways. There is nothing else mentioned about the banking industry. The payoff for one particular bank, the Bank of Montreal is achieved through brand recognition. Since the services described by the Bank of Montreal do actually exist and are provided by the Bank
of Montreal, it is not much of a stretch to argue that people will seek out the Bank of Montreal as a solution to their problem. What problem is that? The problem is the fact that a bank will give one more money than one currently has, just for using the bank as a service provider.

Does it really matter that the Bank of Montreal is talking about services provided by the banking industry? In this case, it certainly has some important possibilities. To begin with, many older people already have money tied up in some sort of financial institution—most children however, do not. The age range of the targeted children for this product is students age eight and up within the elementary system. This means that the maximum age for students using this kit is twelve, or sixth grade. Children of this age are not old enough to work, therefore the income they receive is likely to be from sources other than legal employment. Teaching children of this age to invest money through savings accounts builds up notions of saving money before the child actually gets a job. When a child becomes legally old enough to work, they already have investment ideas implanted in their head, that will hopefully lead to more investing because of a routine paycheck—at least in the eyes of the banking industry.

The critical theorists have argued that, to a great degree, self-esteem and self-worth are wrapped up in consumption. The possession of more money than others should make one happier than the people with which he or she is compared. Utilizing methods of gaining money without actually working underline the messages within this kit. This is made perfectly clear through the end desires of the board game. The player with the most money at the end of the
game is the winner. If any player loses all of his or her money before the game is over, they are out of the game. The very notion of winner, that one person, and only one person is the winner stresses individualistic ideology. The preference of individualism over community is another tenet of the critical camp. The are no rules regarding social assistance of any kind; in fact, social assistance is not even mentioned. There is a minuscule section (it is smaller than every other section in the guide including the section that defines a bank) that instructs students to do good deeds or donate money is missing something. The only thing that is missing the part that tells students that financial donations to charities and most organizations are a tax write-offs.

The message is very clear: you are only worth something if you have money. If you do not have money, you are of no use to the game as a whole, the caricatures and phrases in the game (both in the form of rewards and work income), or the people playing the game. The only person who is worth something else is the banker. The are no rules that say he or she is no longer the banker if they lose all of their money.

One other thing that stands out from the first lesson is the simplicity with which the barter system and monetary systems were dealt with. One important item left out of the equation is the actual, physical creation of money. How is money given a value? Certainly we know it comes off of a printing press, but the kit fails to address why money is created, how much can be created and when, and most importantly, why money is worth what it is worth. In fact, it does not even mention the gold standard that was employed at one time to determine the
value of currency. Students are also told that banks are a safe place to put money, but it is never explained why they are a safe place to put their money. As for the section on government bonds, it is not stated whether the interest is compound or not. Students may be left wondering if they simply get $10 a year extra or $10 the first year, $11 the second year, and so forth. The companies cited as possible investment options are Irwin Toys, McDonalds and Walt Disney. It would be very interesting, as a side project, to research the Bank of Montreal in other to find out if it handles the Canadian accounts for those industry giants?

Summary of the Analysis of the my money Investment Club kit through the Critical Perspective of Advertising

The my money Investment Club kit was easily deconstructed through the use of the critical perspective. From this analysis we can see that the Bank of Montreal has one desire. That desire is to entice students to use their banking services. One fundamental ideology or message espoused by this kit is that people need money to be happy. There is no mention of modern alternative systems of finance, nor any criticisms of capitalism in general. The my money Investment Club kit is a one-sided attempt to win the ideological and financial backing of young students. Although no absolute link is stated between the Bank of Montreal and the hypothetical services introduced in the kit, the use of logos and trade names fortifies the position of the Bank of Montreal as the ultimate purveyor of banking services. Like the symbolic perspective, the level on which
successful consumption takes place is at the level of personal happiness. In order to be happy, a person requires money. Again, the ability to live up to the claim that using the banking industry can make people happy can only be realized through actual personal experience with the banking industry.

There are also several manufactured problems introduced by this kit. Problems such as distrust in family members, lack of happiness, and the need for more money are all created (or maintained) in the student through the information presented in this kit. The presentation of these problems directs students to seek out the banking industry as a means to solving them. The Bank of Montreal is associated with problem solving through the use of its real-world service brand names. In general, this kit maintains and fosters the major underlying principle of commodity advertising. It perpetuates the free-market system and its values of mass production and mass consumption. The my money Investment Club kit complies with the tenets and indicators that make up the theoretical background of the critical perspective.
Case 2:  
The Tampax Health Education Program on Puberty and Menstrual Health

Before we begin the analysis, I would like to remind the reader that to some people this may be a very sensitive subject. The topic of menstruation is pivotal for Tampax, as they make products used during menstruation. It follows that the analysis must centre around the information, arguments and beliefs about menstruation and feminine protection products. The Tampax Health Education Program on Puberty and Menstrual Health (hereafter referred to in brief as the Tampax Health kit) Teaching Guide (1998a) is designed to inform students about the changes that take place during puberty, counsel them on potential emotional problems and provided them with answers to questions about puberty. What is relevant to this analysis is the fact that Tampax does not produce any products for boys. Tampax only makes tampons. As such, the products illustrated in this guide are aimed at girls.

The basic layout of the guide provides for an infomercial (lengthy commercial message) type of information delivery. Students spend a good deal of time learning about puberty in general (pp.4-6), the specifics about the male reproductive system (pp. 7-9), the female reproductive system (pp. 10-13) and the menstrual cycle (pp. 14-17). (Tampax, 1998a) As was mentioned in the curriculum breakdown, there is no mention of brand name products in these sections (other than at the bottom of each page). Regardless of the accuracy of
the content, the information delivered appears to be free of corporate identity.

What is built up over the course of these four chapters is knowledge of the function of puberty and how it affects both males and females. The last half (chapters 3 and 4) of the section is dedicated to girls, ending with the introduction of the menstrual cycle. This is important because it sets up for the presentation of the use of tampons.

**Analysis of the Tampax Health Kit through the Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Information**

The theorists who see advertising as a form of information argue that advertising is basically information about a product or service. The advertisement is designed to tell a consumer about the qualities or utility value of a given commodity and its ability to satisfy a need. The consumer is supposed to make a rational choice through a series of logical steps to purchase (or not purchase) a given commodity based on its ability to fulfill that given need. Does this kit display any of these qualities? We will examine the focal point, for both Tampax and the kit, through an analysis of the information presented about menstrual protection products.
Analysis of the Tampax Health Kit Teaching Guide through the Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Information

The chapter entitled *Menstrual Protection Products* (pp. 18-23), examines the use of various types of menstrual protection products. (Tampax, 1998a) Just as the rational consumer operates in a series of logical steps in order to determine purchasing outcomes, the kit works in a series of logical steps to set the consumer up for a product pitch. First, students are introduced to the female reproductive system. Second, students are taught about the menstrual cycle. Finally, in this chapter, students are taught about the various types of products which girls and women can use during the menstruation phase of their menstrual cycle. Even the chapter itself is broken down into a series of logical reasons for rejecting or choosing certain types of protection methods over others.

The use of a historical lesson provides information about the various types of external protection methods (cloths, rags, and surgical dressing) and internal protection methods (papyrus, linen, and cotton). (Tampax, 1998a) The lesson concludes through informing the readers that Tampax tampons were invented by a doctor during the 1930s. (Tampax, 1998a)

The next section, *How Pads Work*, provides some information about pads and their use. “They range from maxis for the heaviest flow to pantiliners for the lightest flow. Pantiliners can also be worn when women are expecting their periods. Some pads are ultrathin or have “wings” or extra flaps on each side to help prevent leaking.” (Tampax, 1998a, p. 28) It is vital to note that above quote
does not contain any reference to a specific brand of feminine pads. What may
be seen from the quote is that the terms used to describe pads are similar to real
world brand terminologies. For example, the specific terms *ultrathin, pantiliner
and wings* are exclusively employed by *Always* brand, but the term *maxi* is
employed by a variety of brands including *Always* and *Kotex*.\textsuperscript{11} The average
person may or may not be able to recognize these brand terminologies or
slogans. Again, there is no connection made between the slogans employed and
their respective brand names.

The section that follows the discussion of feminine pads deals with
specific product information about Tampax Tampons. *How Tampons Work*
boasts, “since they were introduced in 1936, TAMPAX Tampons have been used
by more women than any other brand.” (Tampax, p. 19, 1998a) The next section,
*TAMPAX Tampons*, is devoted exclusively to a discussion about Tampax brand
tampons. The passages claims the “applicator makes insertion easy,” that
tampons are “hygienic, since the fingers do not touch the tampon or the vagina,”
that “the removal cord is securely stitched through the tampon top help with easy
removal,” and finally, that they are “flushable and biodegradable.” (Tampax,
1998, p. 19) These are all product characteristics. In other words, the passage is
designed to provide the student with information about Tampax brand tampons,
their qualities, and their advantages.

*Inserting a Tampon* provides instructions on how to insert a tampon using
its applicator. Not all tampons come with an applicator. Some brands, such as
o.b., are inserted without the use of an applicator.\textsuperscript{12} There is additional
information about using another product in order to make tampon insertion easier. KY jelly, a water based lubricant, is advocated as a means to lubricate the end of the tampon applicator. The diagramed section on tampon insertion and guidelines for tampon use does not contain any specific information about Tampax or other brand names. Understanding Absorbency discusses the use of different types of tampons. While the tampons are categorized based on different levels of menstrual fluid absorbency, the names associated with each type are product specific. Each of the levels is accompanied by a name that directly corresponds to real world names of each type of Tampax tampons. The types that are listed include, “Tampax Lites,” “Regular/Slender,” “Regular,” “Super,” and “Super Plus.” (Tampax, 1998a, p. 21) Again, the students are faced with information pertaining specifically to one brand. Four possible absorbency levels are prescribed for the four cited levels of menstrual flow.

Finally, there is a question and answer section that covers some frequently asked questions regarding the use of tampons. Tampax brands are cited as the solution to one of the problems. The problem stated is: “What happens if the tampon removal cord breaks?” (Tampax, 1998a, p. 22) The way in which this question is answered continues the theme of providing factual information about only Tampax brand tampons. “It is rare for the removal cord of a Tampax tampon to break.” (Tampax, 1998a, p. 22) The answer to the question finishes with instructions on how to remove a tampon without the cord. The pure utility value of this answer is that Tampax brand tampons are reliable, but at the same time, through omission, Tampax does not account for other brands.
The rest of the Teaching Guide is virtually free of product information. The only other place in which product information appears is on Activity Sheet 9. (Tampax, 1998a, p. 44) This case, however, is a little more obscure than the rest of the guide. As mentioned before, certain terms are employed in the guide to refer to different types of menstruation pads. This activity sheet mentions the terms “pantiliners” and “Ultrathin.” (Tampax, 1998a, p. 44) While the term panty liner is not a registered trademark name of a type of feminine pad, the term pantiliner is used by Always brand pads. One must then question why the term Ultrathin is capitalized, because it appears in the statement “Today’s Ultrathin pads are as absorbent as ‘thick pads.’” (Tampax, 1998a, p. 44) The answer is that this term is employed by Always brand to describe one type of feminine protection that they produce. The interesting component to all of this is that Always brand is produced by Proctor and Gamble and Tampax brand is also owned by Proctor and Gamble.14 If the student is unaware of such products or terms, no concrete link can be forged between the terms used and the corporation represented by those terms. Regardless of that knowledge, there is still some product information presented to the student because the terms employed may be used for future purchases purely out of the similarity with real world products.

One could also argue that product information is displayed in the suggested reading list, but the depth of the list would certainly account for multiple brands, publishers, authors and topics—not something as narrow cast
as the rest of the guide. There is also no product information, except for the titles of the books and accompanying reference information.

From this perspective, we can see that there is a lot of information presented in the Tampax *Teaching Guide*. Most of the information pertains to the function of puberty and the problems surrounding puberty. It is quite clear that the information provided about feminine protection products is packed with product information about Tampax brand tampons. The product information covers the use of tampons, why tampons are better than pads and what types of tampons one should purchase. All of these areas orient themselves toward one brand, Tampax. When the focus of the discussion is about feminine pads, the terms employed are harmonious with products produced by Tampax's parent corporation, Proctor and Gamble.

**Analysis of the Tampax Health Kit Student Handbook through the Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Information**

*A Time for Answers* parallels the instructional segment of *Teaching Guide* in terms of its structure and content. Once again, there is a build up of knowledge about puberty (in general terms) (pp.2-7), the female reproductive system (pp.8-16), and the menstrual cycle (pp.17-22). (Tampax, 1995) The information regarding boys is left until the end of the handbook. Just as the teacher's guide contains a section on the selection of feminine protection products, the handbook has a section entitled *Feminine Protection: What's Right For You?* (Tampax,
1995) The sub-section (which deals with pads) is virtually the same as the teacher’s guide. The only brand-specific term that is identical to that found in the guide is “wings.” (Tampax, 1995, p. 24) The section on tampons is also similar to the section found in the guide, but the wording is slightly different. Girls are told that feminine protection products can fulfill a need—protection from stains on their clothes. “Because blood in your menstrual flow can stain your clothes, you need something to absorb it before it gets on your clothes.” (Tampax, 1995, p. 23)

The next piece of information that is introduced about tampons is that they are used by “millions of girls and women.” (Tampax, 1995, p. 26) The handbooks then proceeds to list the advantages of using a tampon over using a feminine pad. Using a tampon “means you can do anything you do the rest of the month like swim, ride your bike, and do gymnastics. You can also wear whatever you want including bike shorts, leggings, and jeans.” (Tampax, 1995, p. 26) the student is presented with information about the utility value of a tampon. The use of pads, because they are not mentioned in the same light as tampons, would prohibit the activities made possible through the use of tampons.

The remainder of the section on menstrual protection focuses specifically on Tampax tampons. “A lot of girls start with TAMPAX Flushable Applicator Tampons, which are designed to be comfortable to insert.” (Tampax, 1995, pp. 26-27) Students are also provided with additional product information, such as the environmental advantages of using Tampax tampons. “And, since the tampon, applicator, and wrapper are all biodegradable, you can simply flush
them away. That helps the environment.” (Tampax, 1995, p. 27) Students are
told that because Tampax tampons are flushable, they are, “a good way to help
keep your period private.” (Tampax, 1995, p. 27) All of these qualities are utility
information about the product. In other words, the informational content is
provided in order to help students choose Tampax tampons over competing
brands or over nothing at all. Finally, there is a picture of three different packages
of Tampax tampons (p. 27) used to show what the product looks like so that
people may find them in a store. The section also talks about tampon absorbency
rates. The terms employed are “Junior, Regular, Super, and Super Plus.”
(Tampax, 1995, p. 27) The student handbook employs the absorbency rate terms
that are also used directly on the packaging of Tampax tampons.

The sections of the handbook that mention Tampax brand tampons are
relatively short when compared to the sections in the *Teaching Guide*.
Regardless of the quantity, there is still some product information presented in
the handbook. The resource list is a much shorter version compared to the one in
the teacher’s guidebook. The one thing that stands out, although not until visited,
is the world wide web address for Troom ([http://www.troom.com](http://www.troom.com)). This website is
designed to provide more answers to questions that girls, not boys, might have
about puberty and life in general. Although this sponsorship is not directly
mentioned in the kit, the website is sponsored by Tampax Satin brand tampons.
Tampax Satin tampons are the sample tampons that are included with the kit.
Analysis of the *Tampax Health Kit Video* through the Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Information

*Kids to Kids: Talking About Puberty* contains perhaps the most clear example of product information in the entire kit. Just like the other materials, the video attempts to introduce students to puberty. What is different about the video is that there is a clearly defined section in which information about Tampax tampons is the sole focus. In other words, while the *Tampax Teaching Guide* and *A Time for Answers* do contain specific passages on Tampax products, the video actually changes format in order to show the products.

The section of the video in question here begins with the heading *How to find feminine protection without even blushing.* There is a great deal of product information presented in this segment. The first occurrence of product information happens right at the beginning of the segment. While the narrator speaks about the increased availability of products and the ease with which they can be purchased, the screen gradually fills up with feminine pad and tampon product packages. The package collage is comprised of 7 Tampax tampon packages, 3 Always feminine pad packages, 1 Playtex package, 1 Kotex package and 1 o.b. package. (*Tampax, 1998b*) Following the collage, we see a close up of an opened package of Always with Wings and a demonstration of an Always with Wings pad that is fit into a pair of underwear. (*Tampax, 1998b*) Finally, there is a group shot of three different types of pads, labelled "Ultra Thin with Wings", "Ultra Thin," and "Pantiliner." (*Tampax, 1998b*) The narration that
accompanies this final shot instructs users to wear the various pads in accordance with their menstrual flow. “It’s easy to find the right pad for your flow. Thick or Ultra Thin pads for heavy days and Pantiliners for light days.” (Tampax, 1998b) Given that it has been established that these terms are used exclusively by Always brand, it is clear that the product information relates to Always brand pads.

The next presentation of product information occurs in a similar manner to the screen shot of the different types of feminine pads. Three different kinds of tampons are displayed on the screen and are labelled, “Tampax Satin,” “Plastic,” and “Flushable.” (Tampax, 1998b) The narrator performs a voice-over describing the different kinds of tampons and their composition. Following that shot, there is a series of shots of young girls performing various activities, with the focus ending upon a group of girls splashing about in a pool. The narrator provides more generic tampon information, “...absorbing blood before it leaves the body, giving full protection that helps prevent accidents. Internal protection means natural odour protection. Nothing is visible. Nothing gets in the way.” (Tampax, 1998b) Although there is no specific mention of Tampax brand tampons, this is clearly utility information about tampons.

Finally, the segment arrives at a video montage that is specifically dedicated to Tampax tampons and their use. The narrator performs a voice-over of a series of shot of girls changing in a locker room. “Tampons come in a variety of absorbencies. And the best way to decide which is right for you is to experiment. Though you probably don’t consider yourself to be full grown, your
menstrual flow can be that of an adult woman.” (Tampax, 1998b) Right at the end of this passage, there is an isolated shot of a girl removing a article of clothing from her locker to reveal a package of Tampax Satin tampons. (Tampax, 1998b) The screen switches to gradually reveal another collage containing labelled packages of Tampax tampons. The narrator continues her dialogue, “so on heavy flow days, you might try Super or Super Plus. On days with a more moderate flow, try Regular or Slender Regular. And as your flow tapers off, Junior Absorbency Tampax Lites may be all you need.” (Tampax, 1998b) Two packages of Always brand feminine pads appear on the bottom of the screen while the narrator adds her comments. “If you aren’t sure how heavy your flow might be, you can wear Pantiliners or pads as a tampon backup.” (Tampax, 1998b)

What can be seen from the video portion of the Tampax Health kit? While the entire video, like the other kit materials does not focus on Tampax products, the information provided leads into a discussion about Tampax products. The product information presented in the video surrounds the use of Tampax tampons and to a lesser extent, Always brand of feminine pads. While three other competing products are presented, they are not used for demonstration purposes. Most of the information regarding product utility is used to help promote Tampax tampons. The utility information includes ease of use, ability to conceal one’s period, ability to prevent odour, the various absorbency types of Tampax tampons available, and which type of Tampax tampon one should use according to one’s flow. When the focus is not Tampax tampons, the sister
product, Always brand pads, becomes the focus. As mentioned previously, Always is a product of Proctor and Gamble, which in turn, owns Tambrands, makers of Tampax products. In the end, the utility value of Tampax tampons outweighs that of pads, but the video provides extra information about an alternative so that students can make decisions about which product is right for them.

Summary of the Analysis of the Tampax Health Kit through the Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Information

This case conforms much more closely to the components of the informational perspective than does the my money Investment Club kit. Product utility and direct information is provided about Tampax brand of tampons in this kit. The information is presented a series of logical steps, starting with the use of competing alternatives, through to the use of tampons, eventually leading up to specific information about Tampax tampons. Qualities such as hygiene, environmentalism, privacy, and freedom are all properties that are part of Tampax tampons. The sections on menstrual protection products do not stand alone. The preceding chapters are used to build a foundation upon which the need for menstrual protection products is predicated. The rational consumer, armed with knowledge about puberty, menstrual protection products, and menstrual protection requirements can easily make a choice to consume or not consume Tampax brand products based on the information presented.
Analysis of the Tampax Health Kit through the Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Persuasion

Theorists who maintain that advertising is a form of persuasion believe in many different components to their model. There are two foundational and pivotal characteristics of this paradigm that can be used as testing measurements in order to determine if a given text can be seen as a form of advertising. The first of these principles is that advertisements use arguments in order to convince a consumer that he or she needs to consume a given commodity. The second vital component to their theory is that persuasion is used in order to create and maintain commodity brand loyalty. These two areas will be the focus of our examination the Tampax Health Kit under the theory that views advertising as a form of persuasion.

Analysis of the Tampax Health Kit Teaching Guide through the Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Persuasion

The teacher’s guide, from the perspective that advertising is a form of persuasion, is very limited in its presentation of products. The persuasive argument to use tampons is built through the two chapters dealing with the female reproductive system and the menstrual cycle. Students are taught information about bodily functions, which eventually narrows and focuses upon the need for menstrual protection products. At this point, boys are completely
excluded from the debate and must remain outside as on-lookers. The structure of *Menstrual Protection Products* follows a simple argument. A historical account of feminine protection is provided at the beginning of the chapter. The topic of feminine pads is covered during the subsequent few paragraphs following the history lesson. The remainder of the chapter is devoted to tampons and Tampax brand tampons. All of this is done to argue that tampons are the preferred method of protection over all others and Tampax is able to fulfill tampon needs.

The historical analysis is set up as a chronological evolution of feminine protection products. Initially, things such as "rags," and "diaper-like cloths" were used as external protection until nurses employed "surgical dressing" during World War One, eventually leading to commercially available sanitary napkins in the 1920s. (Tampax, 1998a, p. 18) The history of internal feminine protection products traces its roots to Egypt and the use of "papyrus," then to Rome with "linen," then to cotton in the early 20th century, and finally to the "TAMPAX tampon," invented by Dr. Earle Has in the 1930s. (Tampax, 1998b, p. 18) Early on, we can see that girls are supposed to choose between either pads or tampons, regardless of their efficacy. Whether or not they actually work better than the other methods listed does not matter. What is important is the use of a structured, chronological argument to illustrate progress—even if the progress does not result in a superior product. The argument is virtually self-serving because of the myth that newer or more modern methods are better. On top of that, these modern versions of feminine protection are compared with some ancient methods, the most recent of which is almost 80 years old!
The section entitled *How Pads Work* provides some arguments in favour of the use of pads. We will see later that when these arguments are compared to those in favour of tampons, the pad arguments actually work against themselves. The information provided is used to set up the argument that tampons are better than pads. The qualities associated with feminine pads, according to this section, include the claim that “pads are very easy to use,” pads “come in a variety of sizes and absorbencies,” “pantiliners can also be worn when women are expecting their periods,” some pads are “ultrathin,” and some pads have “‘wings’ to prevent leakage.” (Tampax, 1998a, p. 18) There are also other statements about pads in this section that will later contribute to their downfall. Feminine pads are “unsuitable” for swimming. (Tampax, 1998a, p. 18) Finally, they must be “thrown away in the trash—not flushed down the toilet.” (Tampax, 1998a, p. 18)

*How Tampons Work* does not really contain information that is parallel to that of *How Pads Work*. Instead, it explains the composition of a tampon and talks about the success of Tampax brand tampons. “Since they were introduced in 1936, TAMPAX Tampons have been used by more women than any other brand of tampons.” (Tampax, 1998a, p. 19) It is within the *TAMPAX Tampons* section that the argument in favour of tampons is introduced. Tampax claims that their tampons are easy to insert because of their “special applicator.” (Tampax, 1998a, p. 19) Tampax tampons are also “hygienic, since the fingers do not touch the tampon or the vagina.” (Tampax, 1998a, p. 19) “Tampax tampons expand for protection that helps prevent accidents.” (Tampax, 1998a, p. 19) Tampax flushable tampons can be flushed down a toilet and are “biodegradable.”
(Tampax, 1998a, p. 19) There are even more advantages to Tampax tampons listed in this passage. These advantages include "convenience, discretion, and comfort." (Tampax, 1998a, p. 19) Women can also wear "snug clothing" or "go swimming" while wearing Tampax tampons. (Tampax, 1998a, p. 19) "Tampons are comfortable to use and easy to carry and dispose of." (Tampax, 1998a, p. 19) Finally, tampons provide "natural odor protection" because they are worn internally. (Tampax, 1998a, p. 19)

What has taken place, although not overtly, is a comparison between feminine pads and tampons. While the two products are not compared directly, the order in which they are presented, the amount of text devoted to the explanation of each, and the characteristics associated with each product all lead to a virtual comparison. We see the presentation of the qualities of the feminine pad, and we are also presented with information about (primarily) Tampax brand of tampons. The positive associations of easy, freedom, privacy, and comfort with tampons far out-weigh the positive associations of ease of use and protection offered by pads. Tampons offer the freedom to perform all daily activities, including swimming, without interference. Pads cannot make the same claim. Pads cannot offer privacy because they can be seen under tight clothing and they are more difficult to conceal in a purse than a tampon. Furthermore, you can conceal the fact that you are menstruating because the proof can be flushed down the toilet—as long as you use a tampon! There is also an implication that pads are not biodegradable because they are not subject to the same rules as a tampon. The argument is structured to suggest that it is because tampons are
biodegradable that they are “flushable.” Since pads are not flushable, they must
not be environmentally friendly.

**Analysis of the Tampax Health Kit Student Handbook through the**
**Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Persuasion**

The handbook follows virtually the same structure as the teacher’s guide. *A Time for Answers* builds a foundation of knowledge about puberty in girls
during the first half of the book. The chapter entitled *Feminine Protection: What’s right for you?* is where the persuasive argument culminates into a product pitch
for Tampax.

This chapter begins by posing a question to the reader. “Protection for
what, you want to know?” (Tampax, 1995, p. 23) Girls are told that the protection
they require is protection from menstrual fluid stains on their clothes. “Because
the blood in your menstrual fluid can stain your clothes, you need something to
absorb it.” (Tampax, 1995, p. 23) While this is also part of the informational
perspective, it also creates an argument in favour of using protection versus not
using protection. The argument in favour of protection is created through the
sentence: “you need something to absorb it before it gets on your clothes.”
(Tampax, 1995, p. 23) There is an attempt to convince the reader that blood on
one’s clothes is unacceptable.
The next part of the chapter introduces the reader to feminine pads and tampons. Like the teacher's guide, the arguments made in favour of using pads are quickly erased with the discussion about tampons. Pads are said to be a method used by some girls "at first as a way of getting familiar with their flow." (Tampax, 1995, p. 24) Pads also have to be changed "every two to four hours to avoid developing an odor." (Tampax, 1995, p.24) The subsequent paragraph contains a statement is about the odour of menstrual flow and as well as a reminder about the need to change a pad every two to four hours. "When menstrual fluid is inside your body, it has no odor. But it does have an odor after it comes in contact with the air." (Tampax, 1995, p. 25) When taken in isolation, the statement is purely information based. When it is combined with future knowledge of tampons, it becomes a point against the use of pads in an argument that favours the use of tampons. There are two other points made about the use of pads in this section. Some girls, at the beginning and end of their periods, use pads at night. (Tampax, 1995) Pads must be disposed of in a waste bin because "they aren't flushable and can clog up the plumbing." (Tampax, 1995, p. 25) This final point is also turned against the use of pads because of the information contained in the tampon section.

The topic that is first addressed in the tampon section of the handbook is that of odour control. "Unlike pads, tampons absorb your menstrual flow before it leaves your body—so you don't have to worry about odor." (Tampax, 1995, p. 25) Obviously odour is a serious problem, otherwise the word "worry" would not have been employed in the previous quote. The reverse of the quotation would
be that one must worry when using pads because there is no odour control. This must be true, otherwise a similar statement would have be made about pads. Second, the change rate is decreased with the used of tampons. “You still need to change your tampon regularly, every four to eight hours.” (Tampax, 1995, p. 25) The maximum amount of time one can wear a pad is, at best, equal to the minimum amount of time one can wear a tampon. Some other characteristics of tampons that are provided in this section include size benefits, easy of use, and security.

Although a tampon is small, it works just as well as a pad. Inside your body, a tampon’s compressed fibers expand to fit your natural shape. Tampons that come with their own applicator are easy to guide into just the right place. Muscles hold a tampon securely in place until you remove it. Your pelvic muscles naturally loosen up and “let go” of the tampon. [Italics mine] (Tampax, 1995, p. 25)

Following that section is a short passage explaining who actually uses tampons. “Millions of girls and women,” (Tampax, 1995, p. 26) use tampons. It is this section in which the terms and phrases in the above quotation are expanded upon. The handbook claims that tampons do not shift around like a pad does because they go inside a woman’s body. (Tampax, 1995) Girls are also told that they can wear “whatever [they] want” and participate in their regular daily activities such as swimming, riding their bikes, and doing gymnastics. (Tampax,
The implication here is that if one wears pads they must be concerned about clothing selection and that they must restrict their daily activities. The natural assertion is solidified through the claim that Tampax Flushable Applicator Tampons are biodegradable. "And since the tampon, applicator, and wrapper are all biodegradable, you can simply flush them away. That helps the environment." (Tampax, 1995, p. 27) Finally, the argument for security is amended because of the ability of the tampon to be flushed down the toilet. "And it's a good way to help keep your period private." (Tampax, 1995, p. 27) There is personal security in the fact that one's menstrual flow will not stain clothes, nor cause problematic odour, and that the tampon will not fall out. There is additional security in the fact that tampons can help keep one's period hidden from others.

Armed with all of the previously outlined information, Tampax makes a product pitch to the reader in the final section. Students are told that it is crucial to choose the correct absorbency rate of the tampon they decided to use. "The standard absorbency rating, which is labeled on each box, shows how much fluid a tampon can hold." (Tampax, 1995, p. 27) These labels are standardized across several brands of tampon boxes such as Tampax, o.b. (Johnson and Johnson) and Natracare (Bodywise (UK) Ltd.). The product placement, or group photograph of Tampax tampon packages, which accompanies this passage creates brand recognition and/or attempts fosters brand loyalty. It is also noteworthy that no other competing tampon brands are mentioned—continuing the promotion of Tampax brand products. When coupled with the omission of
alternatives, the arguments made in favour of tampon use are linked solely Tampax tampons both in name and photographic representation.

**Analysis of the Tampax Health Kit Video through the Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Persuasion**

The advertising as a form of persuasion perspective can shed some interesting light on the video component of the kit. The way in which the preference of *tampons over pads argument* is built provides a concrete example of this type of persuasion. The first such instance occurs during the transition between the explanation of pads to the explanation of tampons. The transition is completed through a series of head shots of girls talking about their personal experiences with pads and tampons. The transition happens as follows:

**Girl 1**: When my mom first bought me pads, she bought the same... she bought the same ones as she used because she relied on them and she like them. So I use those too.

**Girl 2**: I use pads.

**Girl 3**: I use pads because they're... I mean they're not easier but...
Girl 4: After a while... you know you start, uh... kind of... shift over to tampons. (Tampax, 1998b)

Following those shots, the screen with the three kinds of tampons is displayed, with the Tampax Satin tampon placed at the very top.

What has occurred here is nothing short of a very meaningful series of edits that shift the argument in favour of tampons. If we examine the dialogue as a continuous, chronological narrative about the evolution of menstrual protection, we see that tampons replace pads as the chosen form of protection. The argument works in a series of generalized transitional steps. To begin with, girls first use pads because that is what their mothers use. As girls grow older, they discover that pads are not any easier to use than tampons and that they are uncertain about using pads altogether. Finally, as girls become more familiar with their menstrual cycle and what they need, tampons become the method of choice. No reason is given as to why they are the better choice, but it can be inferred that they are an improvement over pads. Clearly this is in alignment with one of the major tenets of advertising as a form of persuasion theory—arguments are made in favour of one product over another.

The next segment, the pool segment, continues the argument in favour of the use of tampons. The narrator argues three positive assertions. The first argument is that because tampons are internal, girls have "natural odour protection." (Tampax, 1998b) It is also argued that with tampons, "nothing is visible" and "nothing gets in the way." (Tampax, 1998b) Although there is no
specific condemnation of pads, the arguments introduced appear to be unique to tampons. That is, when tampons are not used, the assertions made by the narrator cannot be confirmed. The reverse of the arguments would be that pads cannot protect against unwanted odours, pads are visible and pads get in the way—events that are considered negative.

We are next presented with six new girls in a series of head shots. The first four speak, in turn, about the fact that they like tampons better than pads. The last two girls (absent from the group of four below) talk about simple personal difficulties in using tampons. It is really the first four girls who strengthen the argument in favour of tampons. The final two really only serve to demonstrate that while difficulties may occur, they are easy to overcome.

**Girl 5:** The first time I used a tampon was when I was thirteen, and that was my first period.

**Girl 6:** I like using tampons better.

**Girl 7:** Definitely tampons because, ummm... it's just so much easier.

**Girl 8:** Well, my sister came... you know, she's in the Army... she came to visit. And I was still using pads. She told me... you know... that the tampons are better. She told me to come to Brantford and she showed me how to use it. (Tampax, 1998b)
Again we see a play on associations with growth and maturity. Tampons are associated with well-disciplined, responsible individuals such as the older sister who is in the army. Upon returning home, she found out that her young sibling still used pads. To correct this behaviour, she told the girl to come to her home in order to teach her how to use tampons. We also have several girls, ahead of this clip, talking about their preference of tampons over pads. The argument in favour of tampon use is strengthened because we see that someone who had encountered their first period was able to use tampons as an effective method of feminine protection. It is also demonstrated that responsible women use tampons. Furthermore, there is a level of general acceptance displayed that is associated with the use of tampons.

After the instructions on how to use tampons are covered, some friendly advice is given by a few girls. The next segment of the video moves into the product pitch. What is interesting here is that the product sell is fairly factual. “So on heavy flow days, you might try Super or Super Plus. On days with a more moderate flow, try Regular or Slender Regular. And as your flow tapers off, Junior Absorbency Tampax Lites may be all you need.” (Tampax, 1998b) There really is no evidence of persuasion in the narrative or the visuals. What is more important is the information leading up to the product pitch. Hypothetically speaking, the product pitch works in the manner as follows: if condition “A” exists, and condition “B” exists, and conditions “C” through “G” exist (the argument) then product “X” will do what you need. In a carefully edited piece, we have seen a
number of girls alter the messages surrounding the use of pads and tampons. Although pads are mentioned, at first, as an acceptable means of feminine protection, by the end of the piece, the use of tampons becomes paramount. The role of pads is reverted to a back-up purpose. They are used in case one has one's period all of a sudden or as a method of extra protection in case one's tampon fails. The presentation of actual Tampax tampons, which apparently meet all of a girl's needs, finishes the argument in a very closed manner. At the conclusion of the argument, there are no competing tampon brands presented to the students. Tampax is the only answer.

Summary of the Analysis of the Tampax Health Kit through the Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Persuasion

The Tampax Health Kit uses many different arguments in order to persuade students that Tampax tampons are the best menstrual protection choice for girls. Like the informational component, factors such as cleanliness, maturity, environmentalism, privacy and personal freedom are cited as important qualities associated with tampons. Unlike the informational component, these are seen not as utilitarian, but as arguments in favour of tampon use. In other words, any product other than Tampax tampons might not be able to help fulfill the required set of qualifying factors. For example, under the argument structure of the kit, in order for a tampon to be worthy it must be biodegradable. Tampax is
the only cited feminine protection product that can make this claim. These arguments also work against other types of feminine protection through the process of data omission or a one-sided argument. It is argued that Tampax tampons can fulfill a number of ideals, however, the same is not argued for other brands of tampons, or feminine pads. As a result, there is a strong movement toward creating and maintaining brand recognition and loyalty to Tampax.

**Analysis of the Tampax Health Kit through the Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Symbolism**

The theorists who see advertising as a form of symbolism assert that the most important aspect of their position is that people do not necessarily consume merely advertised commodities themselves. Moreover, the most important part of commodity consumption takes place at a symbolic level. Advertising, under this paradigm, attaches meanings to commodities. It is through these attachments that the choice of commodity acquisition and consumption is actually based. The only way in which the consumer's need fulfillment is realized is through the direct use of the acquired commodity. In other words, there are no external means to prove that a commodity will be able to live up to its associated meanings. Every consumer of a given commodity will have a different end result or level of meaning realization. The claims made by Tampax tampons in the *Tampax Health Kit* will be the focus for this section of our analysis. We will examine the various
meanings, images, beliefs, and claims Tampax makes about its products and the products of its competition in order to determine if the text complies with the tenets of the advertising is a form of symbolism paradigm.

Analysis of the Tampax Health Kit Teaching Guide through the Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Symbolism

In the teacher's guide, there are several different images and ideas surrounding feminine protection. These images are presented in the chapter entitled Menstrual Protection Products. The first type of imagery encompasses the literal drawings of tampons, body parts and other figures. The second type of imagery, and arguably more important type of imagery, consists of concepts and ideas. These concepts include notions such as technological superiority, cleanliness, privacy or secrecy, environmentalism and personal freedom are used to illustrate the benefits of tampons and the weaknesses of feminine pads. The second type of imagery is addressed through beliefs, notions, and values presented in the teacher's guide.

The first kind of images present in the teachers’ guide are the literal images. There are pictures and diagrams of tampons used in the teacher's guide instruction set (pp. 19-20) and in the reproducible, overhead-graphics section (p.27). All of these graphics are pictures of a tampon with an applicator. As was noted before there are other tampons that do not use applicators (such as o.b.
and Natracare), but these are not pictured. In fact, the drawings of the tampons match (almost exactly) to the actual sample Tampax tampons that come with this kit. There are also no pictures are drawings of feminine pads anywhere in the teacher’s guidebook. The creation and maintenance of a literal product image is just as important as the creation and maintenance of notions and beliefs surrounding a product. Girls are provided with representative drawings of the product and how to use it. This comprises only a miniscule part of the imagery found in the kit. Girls are also presented with nations surrounding the product. These notions, or imputed characteristics, dictate the types of emotions, ideas, and values a product aspires to have.

In the second case, the use of a chronological, historical discussion about feminine protection products fosters the notion of technological superiority. The passage is setup in terms of a historical progression toward newer, therefore better, forms of feminine protection. Readers are first introduced to different types of pads (diaper-like clothes or rags and surgical dressing) and later to the practices of Egyptian women, Roman women, early 20th century dancers and actresses, and finally, to the creator of Tampax tampons, Dr. Earle Haas. (Tampax, 1998a) The term “newer” comes to mean “better,” through the chronological introduction to each method. The idea that antiquated and inferior methods have been replaced by modern practices is eminent by the end of the passage.

The next concept that is introduced in this chapter is that of personal cleanliness. There are two different aspects to this concept. The first component
is the importance of the cleanliness of one's clothing. Whether one uses pads or tampons, the whole reason women need feminine protection is to protect their clothes from blood stains (although this is not stated in the teacher's guide). “Pads fit into the underpants to absorb the menstrual flow,” while a tampon is “worn inside the vagina and it expands as it absorbs menstrual flow.” (Tampax, 1998a, pp. 18-19) The second concept of cleanliness is that of personal hygiene. In other words, this means ensuring that menstrual fluid does not come in contact with one's hands. The claim made by Tampax tampons with applicators is that they “are also hygienic, since the fingers do [not] touch the tampon or the vagina.” (Tampax, 1998a, p. 19) Both products may be able to fulfill the first image of cleanliness. That is, both products may be able to protect one's clothing. The second claim, that tampons are hygienic because they never come in contact with the hands, can only be made in favour of tampons. Pads must be placed in one's undergarments and therefore must be touched or handled in order to put them in the correct place. We see that the image of hygiene is not upheld with pads, but it is with tampons.

Most of the images surrounding tampons are buttressed through the omission of information. The next notion, privacy and secrecy, is one that illustrates this point very well. The idea that a girl's period is supposed to be a private thing, hidden from others, is demonstrated in two sections of the chapter. First, “the advantages of tampons include convenience, discretion, and comfort. As tampons are worn internally, women can wear snug clothing and go swimming with confidence.” (Tampax, 1998a, p. 19) This passage clearly states
that using tampons will allow a girl to keep her period private because tampons cannot be detected under tight and revealing clothing. Second, “tampons are also popular with younger girls because they are small and easily hidden in a pocket or purse.” (Tampax, 1998a, p. 21) The same claim is not made about pads. It is through the omission of a respective claim in favour of pads that only one perspective is acknowledged and promoted. Although a statement that claims, "pads are bulky and cannot be easily hidden," does not exist, it is quite clear that pads must be bulky and not easy to hide. Tampons are also supposed to be “popular” with younger girls. Like the other arguments, there is no claim that states, “pads are less popular with younger girls,” however, the omission of information leads to that conclusion. By no means is this a closed, one-way argument, but the text in the passage does certainly tend toward favouritism of tampons over pads for keeping one’s period a secret. If pads were able to fulfill the same claims as tampons, as the advertising world goes, it would be written somewhere.

In an interesting twist, the image of cleanliness is coupled with secrecy and privacy in the desire for protection from personal odour. The two components of this argument are inextricably entwined. If one has an odour, in North American society, that person is thought of as unclean. The other component plays into the issue of privacy because people have the ability detect an odour. People are able to tell where an odour comes from and possibly recognize what type of odour it is. The tampon is able to prevent odour detection. “And because tampons are worn internally, the menstrual blood is absorbed
before it leaves the body. And with tampons, internal protection also means natural odor protection." (Tampax, 1998a, p. 19) The same claim cannot be made on behalf of pads because pads are worn externally and are "designed to draw wetness away from the body." (Tampax, 1998a, p. 18) Yet again we see that tampons are able to fulfill both the idea of cleanliness and the idea of privacy, while pads cannot do the same.

According to this chapter, tampons also appeal to the environmentalist because they are made of biodegradable materials. Pads, however, do not live up to this claim as they contain materials that are not biodegradable. "Used pads must be folded up and wrapped in the plastic wrapper, or toilet paper, and thrown away in the trash—not flushed down the toilet." (Tampax, 1998, p. 18) While it is not clearly stated that pads are not environmentally friendly, they do not support any of the Three R's (reduce, reuse, and recycle) that are so popular with the mainstream environmentalists. There is no claim on behalf of pads that suggests they are biodegradable. According to this passage, the plastic is not reusable and the rest of the product is not biodegradable because it must be disposed of in a waste container. Tampax tampons, on the other hand, are environmentally friendly because their composition, from wrapper to applicator to tampon, is biodegradable. "Tampax Flushable Applicator tampons are flushable and biodegradable. This means that the tampon, the cardboard applicator, and the wrapper can all be flushed away." (Tampax, 1998a, p. 19) Not only do tampons clearly become the promoted choice for concerned environmentalists, but they
also introduce the notion of necessity for environmental protection coupled with feminine protection.

The idea that tampons help maintain or even create a level of personal freedom is also discussed in this chapter. If we look at the first quote used in support of the privacy and secrecy idea again, we see that it also supports the idea of personal freedom. "The advantages of tampons include convenience, discretion, and comfort. As tampons are worn internally, women can wear snug clothing and go swimming with confidence." (Tampax, 1998a, p. 19) Personal freedom, in this sense, is more that of lifestyle maintenance and personal choice than anything else. Girls are told that they are able to wear whatever they want and perform whatever activities they choose. "Many girls, especially those who are active in sports, use tampons from their very first period." (Tampax, 1998a, p. 21) Once again we see that tampons are able to accommodate young girls who wish to maintain a rigorous lifestyle. The same types of claims are not made in favour of pads. The omission of this information leads to a position in favour of the use of tampons over the use of pads for girls who want to maintain a high level personal freedom.

The answers contained in the first two sample questions in the section entitled Good Health Habits further promote the use of tampons as health products. The first question asks, "Can a girl exercise during her period?" (Tampax, 1998a, p. 25) The answer to that question argues, "Exercise is important for overall good health and should become a part of every girl or woman's daily routine. Many girls and women choose tampons because they
make it easy to keep up with all their regular activities, including exercise routines, during a period." (Tampax, 1998a, p. 25) According to this answer, the use of tampons facilitates overall health because they enable a female to perform daily exercise routines more easily. The second question asks, "Is it okay to swim during a period?" (Tampax, 1998a, p. 25) Its respective answer claims, "Yes. But, from a practical point of view, women should wear internal sanitary protection – tampons." (Tampax, 1998a, p. 25) Once again, in order to continue a healthy lifestyle, females should use tampons during their period. There is no mention of the use of alternative methods of menstrual protection. The use of the terms "easy" and "practical" fortify the position of tampons because they can help maintain an ideal lifestyle.

**Analysis of the Tampax Health Kit Student Handbook through the Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Symbolism**

The imagery and symbolism found in the student handbook is very similar to that found in the rest of the kit. The handbook, to a great extent, mirrors the content found in the teacher's guide. There are several prominent notions upheld by the handbook as positive ideals associated with feminine protection products. These images include personal protection, privacy, cleanliness, naturalness, freedom, and environmentalism. There are also drawings on many of the pages in the student handbook. As was noted by our examination of the handbook
contents, these drawings depict various sport and recreation activities being
performed by both boys and girls. The important aspect here is that these young
people are all active.

We must first examine the role played by the notions or images portrayed
in the student handbook. The range of products designed to be used during
menstruation are referred to as “feminine protection products” (Tampax, 1995, p.
23) in the section Feminine Protection: What’s Right for You? Girls are told that
these products protect their clothes from menstrual flow stains. (Tampax, 1995)
The rest of the section deals with the differences between feminine pads and
tampons and their abilities to uphold other values introduced the rest of the
chapter.

Where does a girl want her protection to be located? There are two
options provided in the handbook. The first option is to use a pad. Pads absorb
blood after it has left the body, but tampons “absorb menstrual fluid inside the
vagina—before it leaves the body.” (Tampax, 1995, p. 23) At this point there is
no clear advantage to either method of protection. There is a problem associated
with pads and their ability to uphold the value of cleanliness and privacy. “When
menstrual flow is inside your body, it has no odor. But it does have an odor after
it comes in contact with the air.” (Tampax, 1995, p. 25) First, in order to remain
clean a girl must change her pad every two to four hours. (Tampax, 1995) If there
is too much menstrual fluid, the possibility that a pad will leak menstrual fluid onto
one’s clothes increases. Second, if the use of a pad does not prevent odour,
there is little chance of it being able to provide personal privacy. In other words,
because there is a potential for others to notice ones menstrual flow odor, the pad cannot ensure that nobody else will be able to tell if one has their period.

The second option is to use a tampon. Tampons, on the other hand, act as a type of preventative maintenance. Tampons prevent the flow of menstrual fluid from leaving the body. “Unlike pads, tampons absorb your menstrual flow before it leaves your body—so you don’t have to worry about odor.” (Tampax, 1995, p. 25) Since no odour is created, no odour can be detected, therefore, nobody can tell, by odour alone, that one has one’s period. In regard to cleanliness, there is no chance of menstrual fluid staining one’s clothes because it stays inside the body (although it has been absorbed by the tampon). There is no risk of soiling one’s clothes. Tampons are able to maintain privacy through removing all visual indicators of one’s period.

The other privacy issue still deals with idea of concealing one’s period from others, but it is defined in terms of the actual product, rather than external effects. What is interesting here is that the handbook stresses the issue of hiding one’s period from others to a greater extent than does the teacher’s guide. Obviously the students get to spend more time with their own handbook than they would reading the teacher’s guide—that is, if they ever get to see the teacher’s guide at all! This leads to a reinforcement of the principle that menstruation is a private issue that must be hidden from others at all costs. The handbook makes similar claims to the teacher’s guide, but instead focuses on the disposal of used feminine protection products. Pads are much larger than tampons, and are therefore, more difficult to hide from others. One also has to
dispose of used pad in the garbage, therefore, there is a chance of being observed by others. A tampon, as is explained by the handbook, offers privacy because you can flush it down the toilet when you are done using it. "And, since the tampon, applicator, and wrapper are all biodegradable, you can simply flush them away. That helps the environment. And it's a good way to keep your period private too." (Tampax, 1995, p. 27) It is less likely that someone will observe a girl use or remove a tampon in public because most washrooms have private, walled-in toilets.

Environmentalism is also addressed through the use of tampons. As was noted above, tampons are biodegradable, and therefore environmentally sound. The same argument cannot be made for pads because they must be disposed of in the garbage. Irrespective of the fact that pads are made mostly out of biodegradable materials, such as cotton and other natural fibres, in this sense they are not recyclable because there is no program or designated space for feminine pad recycling. The concept of nature and naturalness is attached to the notion of environmentalism. Tampons conform to the inside of a girl's body. "Inside your body, a tampon's compressed fibers expand to fit your natural shape." (Tampax, 1995, p. 25) Like the environmental claim, this claim cannot be applied to pads. The association with natural shape and nature is transferred to the tampon itself, making it appear as a natural device. That is, the use of tampons is a natural process.

The concept of personal freedom is addressed through a quick note on daily activities. The use of a tampon enables a girl to "do anything [she would do]
the rest of the month like swim, ride [her] bike, and [to] do gymnastics." (Tampax, 1995, p. 26) The drawings present throughout this handbook (although some are male) emphasize active recreation. The physical activities, pertaining to girls, include aerobics (Tampax, 1995, p. 2), rollerblading (p. 3), ballet (p. 5), bicycle kicks (p. 8), skateboarding (p. 19), jumping rope (p. 23), diving (p. 29), running (p. 36), and tennis (p. 39). There is no such claim made for feminine pads. Furthermore, a girl is not restricted to certain type of fashion. "You can also wear whatever you want, including bike shorts, leggings, and jeans." (Tampax, 1995, p. 26) The reverse argument of this is that the use of pads will restrict the types of clothing one can wear. Tampons become symbols for and purveyors of personal choice and personal freedom, while pads become devices of personal restraint.

Actual images or photographs of Tampax brand tampons are used to show what the real world packaging of Tampax brand products look like. When shopping, memory recall of the product photographs can be used as a means of comparison between and among Tampax and its competitors' brands. The photograph, in effect, is used to combine the assertions, ideas, values, and beliefs made about tampons in this section with a visual symbol and a brand name--Tampax. The instructional diagrams on tampon insertion, depict a woman using a tampon that has an applicator. Not all tampons have applicators, but Tampax tampons certainly have them. The use of the tampon applicator is the only method shown for inserting a tampon. Again, at the time of product
purchase, this type of familiarity could assist in the purchase of Tampax brand tampons over competing alternatives.

This handbook examines many images surrounding puberty. The images, ideals and symbols surrounding feminine protection products are those that matter most to Tampax. As was demonstrated above, the necessity for girls to have protection, privacy, cleanliness, naturalness, freedom, and environmentalism during their period is quite prominent in the section dealing with feminine protection. Clearly, the section does not suggest that pads are useless, but it does assert that tampons uphold these notions better than pads. Tampons are able to incorporate and espouse all of the images, symbols, beliefs, and values necessary for a girl during menstruation. A girl becomes protected from stains on her clothes with a tampon, but not necessarily with a pad. A girl can keep her period private with a tampon, but not always with a pad. A girl has a sense of cleanliness, including being odour free with a tampon, but not necessarily with a pad. A tampon conforms to a girl’s natural internal shape, but pads do not. A girl can perform any activity she would like when she is using a tampon, but she cannot do this with a pad. Finally, a girl is exercising environmental responsibility when she uses a tampon, but not when she uses a pad.
Analysis of the *Tampax Health Kit Video* through the Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Symbolism

The *Kids to Kids* video is perhaps the best example of the links forged between images and beliefs with Tampax brand products in the kit. The focal point of this examination is the section in the video entitled *How to find the right feminine protection without even blushing*. Right from the title screen we can see that feminine protection products, discussion about feminine protection products and use of feminine protection products is associated with personal embarrassment. Like the other components in the kit, there are two types of images present in the video—literal images (photographs, illustrations, and diagrams) and symbolic images (beliefs, notions and values).

The literal images in the video range from product shots to product use illustrations and videotaped demonstrations. These types of images tend to take centre stage at this point in the kit because the video is able to show things that a simple drawing on paper cannot. It is important to note that these literal images are often coupled with a symbolic image. The major component to this section of the video is the use of girls, who have just started puberty, as spokespeople for tampons. These girls are not that much older than the target audience of the video. There is an immediate familiarity created between the girls in the video and the girls watching the video, if for no other reasons than similarities in age and school setting. The symbolic images, or beliefs, concepts, notions, and values surrounding the products in the video are used in conjunction with the
literal images to make a stronger appeal in favour of tampons. While there are elements of persuasion in this appeal, the claims made by the video about tampons are of the greatest importance. In the video, the notions associated with tampons include privacy, cleanliness or hygiene, reliability or trust, personal freedom, maturity, and association with authority or authority endorsement. It is upon these claims, according to the advertising as a form of symbolism perspective, that product purchase will or will not take place.

The stills and animations used in this section of the video demonstrate the use of pads and tampons, the packages in which they are sold, and some of the features of each type of feminine protection. The first animation consists of a continuously building collage of feminine protection product packages. The composition of the shot consists of 7 packages of Tampax brand tampons, 3 packages of Always brand feminine pads, 1 package of Playtex tampons, 1 package of o.b. tampons and 1 package of Kotex pads. (Tampax, 1998b) The images are used, in this case, to introduce girls to the wide range of product packaging and products types that are available. The domination of Tampax products on the screen is used as a tool of repetition, in order to breed visual familiarity with the real world Tampax brand packaging.

Just as the packaging demonstration was used to familiarize girls with the outer appearance of various feminine protection products, the next series of demonstrations familiarize girls with the actual look and application of each type of product. Girls are introduced to feminine pads, how to use them, and the different kinds that are available. In order to familiarize girls with pads, a
demonstration of the application of a feminine pad to a pair of underwear is shown. (Tampax, 1998b) Following the demonstration is a still shot of three different types of feminine pads. (Tampax, 1998b) There are also two very important notions attached to the use of pads. As is illustrated by the following passage, the notions of reliability or trust, privacy and cleanliness are all dealt with in a very simple statement. On the choice of feminine pads, the narrator states, "which ever you choose, pads should be changed frequently to prevent accidents and odour." (Tampax, 1998b) The reliability (trust one can have in their choice of feminine protection) of pads is questioned because they must be changed on a frequent basis in order to prevent problems. The privacy and cleanliness issue is also addressed through the fear of potential personal odour. If one has an odour, as noted in other sections of this symbolic analysis, it most likely cannot be kept from being detected by others. The result is that others may be able to recognize that a girl has her period. Adding to this difficulty is the North American belief that unpleasant personal odour is also associated with being unclean.

The next demonstration begins with a still shot of three different types of tampons, complete with their applicators. (Tampax, 1998b) A demonstration is used to illustrate how a tampon is pushed out of its applicator. In the demonstration, a woman slides the applicator off of a tampon, leaving it exposed in her hand. (Tampax, 1998b) Once again, the actual product shot is used to create familiarity with tampons in general.
The next series of shots is comprised of girls playing and swimming in a public pool. The dialogue of the narrator further addresses the beliefs made in the section on feminine pads. According to the narrator, tampons absorb “blood before it leaves the body, giving full protection that helps prevent accidents. Internal protection means natural odour protection. Nothing is visible. Nothing gets in the way.” (Tampax, 1998b) This time the ability of the tampon to uphold cleanliness and privacy is the focus, however, there are also two other ideas that are equally important. Personal freedom is another concept introduced through the visuals of the girls in the pool as well as the narrator’s claim that nothing will obstruct a girl from her daily activities. The concept of nature is further injected into the dialogue through the narrator’s statement about natural odour protection. In other words, the use of tampons is a natural way to prevent odour, therefore, the use of tampons is part of nature.

Maturity and approval of authority are two very important concepts used to further the beliefs and values surrounding tampons. In a series of isolated head shots, as described in other sections of this analysis, four girls elude to the two notions of maturity and approval of authority figures.

**Girl 1:** When my mom first bought me pads, she bought the same... she bought the same ones as she used because she relied on them and she like them. So I use those too.

**Girl 2:** I use pads.
Girl 3: I use pads because they’re… I mean they’re not easier but…

Girl 4: After a while… you know you start, uh… kind of… shift over to tampons. (Tampax, 1998b)

[Section on Tampons]

Girl 5: The first time I used a tampon was when I was thirteen, and that was my first period.

Girl 6: I like using tampons better.

Girl 7: Definitely tampons because, ummm… it’s just so much easier.

Girl 8: Well, my sister came… you know, she’s in the Army… she came to visit. And I was still using pads. She told me… you know… that the tampons are better. She told me to come to Brantford and she showed me how to use it. (Tampax, 1998b)

While this dialogue was crucial to the advertising as a form of persuasion perspective, it is also vital to the symbolic perspective. We see, through a small progression, the use of tampons as a sign of maturity. The passage begins with a
girl talking about the use of pads strictly because that is what her mother uses. A progression takes place between the second and fourth girl. The dialogue moves from the use of pads to uncertainty about the ease of use to a change to tampons with age. The next four girls affirm the use of tampons in a wide range of applications, demonstrating that they may be used for a first period (instant maturity) to someone possessing a genuine preference of tampons to someone with an absolute preference of tampons. Finally, the use of the association with an older sister who is in the army places tampons in the “endorsed by and authority figure” bracket. The cultural baggage associated with the army, including discipline, technical superiority and precision, and the need to be prepared at all times under any circumstances, leads to the legitimization of tampons. This is achieved through attaching the attributes associated with the army to tampons.

The reliability and trust associated with the use of tampons is further affirmed through a demonstration involving the tampon removal cord. The video shows a close-up of a woman holding the cotton end of the tampon in one hand, gripping the removal cord in the other hand, and tugging firmly on the cord. (Tampax, 1998b) This video segment is accompanied by a voice-over of a girl proclaiming, “don’t worry, it won’t come off!” (Tampax, 1998b) The notions of reliability and trust are proven when the reader observes that the cord does not break, nor become detached from the tampon.

In order to place Tampax brand of tampons within a familiar context, the video uses a series of isolated shots of girls in a locker room who are performing
various activities. These activities include brushing their hair, applying lipstick, applying eye makeup, getting dressed, pulling things out of lockers, and other general movements. In this montage, there is a single isolated shot of a girl who removes an article of clothing from her locker, only to reveal a face-on product shot of a package of Tampax Satin touch tampons. Although they are in a bigger package, these tampons are identical to the product sample found in the kit.

Finally, the specific instructions dealing with menstrual flow amounts, absorbency rates of tampons, and product packaging are linked together in a series of narrated still shots. Four packages of Tampax tampons appear on screen, accompanied by the narrator’s instructions for their use. “So on heavy flow days, you might try Super of Super Plus. On days with a more moderate flow, try Regular or Slender Regular. And as your flow tapers off, Junior Absorbency Tampax Lites may be all you need.” (Tampax, 1998b) While each type of absorbency is mentioned, the reader is drawn to a specific product package through its revelation on the screen. While the same thing is done with two packages of Always brand pads, the reasoning is different, leading to a secondary role ascribed by pads. It is important to remember that Always is the parent company of Tambrands, makers of Tampax products, and that the narrator instructs the audience to use pads as "a tampon back-up." (Tampax, 1998b) In this case, regardless of choice, the product images and packaging images have been securely linked not only in favour of tampons, but also in favour of Tampax brand tampons.

218
Summary of the Analysis of the Tampax Health Kit through the Perspective that Advertising is a Form of Symbolism

The Tampax Health Kit contains the essential ingredients noted in the perspective that sees advertising as a form of symbolism. Instead of the qualities of Tampax tampons being presented based on their utility value, or being used as constituents of an argument, they are used as points of consumption. Notions of environmentalism, maturity, cleanliness, privacy, and personal freedom are all represented by Tampax brand of tampons. In effect, the only way one can ensure that one matures, acts in an environmentally friendly manner, and maintains personal privacy, cleanliness, and freedom is to use Tampax tampons. Brand familiarity is also generated throughout the kit via the use of product shots, as well as stills and images. Other images and drawings in the kit present Tampax tampons as a purveyor of physical activity. Again, there is no way to tell if Tampax tampons will be able to fulfill their ascribed notions until they are actually used. Then again, that is the most important aspect—some type of purchase must take place, generating revenue for Tampax brands before one can determine if Tampax lives up to its claims.
Analysis of the Tampax Health Kit through the Critical Perspective of Advertising

The two fundamental arguments made by the critical theorists are that advertisements contain and create ideologies, and that advertisements create a problem within the consumer in order to sell a commodity (that will supposedly fix the created problem). Obviously there are other ingredients, such as: the claim that advertised ideologies assume the role of and replace traditional ideologies, or that advertisements create and maintain individualism as well as free-market mentality, thereby fragmenting the consumer. For this analysis, we will look at the first to two components (ideology and problem creation) in detail. To a much lesser extent, we will also examine the last two aspects (meaning replacement and free-market ideology). Once again, the analysis will essentially be restricted to the sections of the kit that focus on menstrual protection products.

Analysis of the Tampax Health Kit Teaching Guide through the Critical Perspective of Advertising

In terms of the actual ideological sale of Tampax tampons, the chapter that focuses on Menstrual Protection Products, is the most important section of the teacher's guide. The rest of the guide is useful in developing some of the ideological beliefs surrounding tampons, puberty and body care, but this chapter
emphasizes and ties together all of the crucial ideological values. What ideologies are at work in the teacher's guide? For a start, the underlying ideology is one of feminine protection product consumption—specifically, the products advertised belong to Tampax brand. The sponsor's name can be immediately observed in at least four distinct ways. First, the teacher's guide is designed by and credited to Tampax. Second, every page has the phrase "Tampax Teaching Guide To Puberty And Menstrual Health" (Tampax, 1998a, pp. 1-55) located at the bottom of it. Third, the chapter called Menstrual Protection Products mentions only Tampax as a brand name. Fourth, every drawing about menstrual protection contains a picture of a tampon that resembles a Tampax tampon and its applicator. The product pitch is couched within an introductory discussion about puberty. Once girls have learned about menstruation, they are then taught about feminine protection products. The ideology about purchasing and using feminine protection products is never questioned—it appears as a natural practice.

From the critical perspective, it is important to address the need for so-called "feminine protection." In this guide there is no debate about the choice to use or choice not to use feminine protection. In fact, there is no questioning of the term "feminine protection" itself.17 From a completely pragmatic point of view, it is clear that the use of some form of feminine protection is a necessity if a woman does not want to get her clothes soiled. However, the association with "protection" is a very interesting construction. In the end, the protection is not really for the woman, but for her clothing. Through the use of feminine protection products, a woman's clothes are protected from her natural bodily function. A
woman's clothing and outward appearance take precedence over her body. Something the woman does, that is completely involuntary, as part of her existence turns into a negative event. It has the potential to destroy her material possessions. In the end, feminine protection really prevents the woman for doing damage to her social-self.

In order to illustrate the assertion that using feminine protection product is a natural practice, we will look at several statements made in the teacher’s guide. First, let it be noted that there is no specific reason stated in the teacher’s guide that tells the reader why feminine protection is necessary. Rather than discuss the option to use or not use feminine protection products, the teacher’s guide focuses upon the reasons to select from among feminine pads and tampons. *Menstrual Protection Products* explains the characteristics of pads and tampons, as well as the benefits of each. The characteristics of pads include ease of use, the fact that they are an external form of protection, inability to accommodate active lifestyles, that they must be disposed of in the garbage. (Tampax, 1998a) Tampons, on the other hand, come with an applicator, are an internal form of protection, provide natural odour protection, are a great way to keep a period private because they cannot be detected, are environmentally friendly, provide a high level of personal freedom and choice, and they are also easy to use. (Tampax, 1998a) Tampons enable a girl to do more with her life while at the same time, provide more personal security and privacy.

As we have seen so far, the debate between feminine protection products is limited to a choice between pads or tampons. While there are other methods of
feminine protection products available, such as a reusable rubber cup or feminine pads made out of reusable cloth, none are ever mentioned. Coupled with this non-information are the claims made by Tampax about their own brand as well as tampons in general. The same claims are not made by the recognized alternative—feminine pads. "TAMPAX Tampons have been used by more women than any other brand of tampons." (Tampax, 1998a, p. 19) There are several advantages to using tampons including "convenience, discretion, and comfort." (Tampax, 1998a, p. 19) Tampax also claims that, "many girls, especially those who are active in sports, use tampons from their very first period." (Tampax, 1998a, p. 21) "Tampons are also popular with younger girls because they are small and easily hidden in a pocket or purse." (Tampax, 1998a, p. 21) All of this information is used to buttress the argument in favour of tampons and pushes the argument in favour of the use of Tampax brand tampons.

The argument made in favour of both tampon use and use of Tampax brand of tampons is by no means absolute. Even in the teaching guidebook, the competition, feminine pads, is mentioned as a viable alternative choice to tampons. The importance of this is a two-fold probable outcome. First, the amount of information about tampons out-weighs the information about feminine pads dramatically. Second, it is specifically because there is information about pads that there appears to be a balance of information. The information provided about pads does a great disservice to their ability to function as a feminine protection product. In a very slick way, the characteristics of pads, "do's" and
“don’ts” are provided to the reader. These characteristics are struck down as the reader encounters the benefits associated with tampons. Using appeals like environmentalism, false hygiene, odour protection as a form of privacy, privacy in the form of the ability to conceal a tampon, nature, and personal freedom and choice, tampons are demonstrated to be superior to pads.

The other vital component to the ideology of an advertisement is that it creates a problem within the reader in order to create a niche for the advertised commodity. The teacher’s guide in the Tampax kit creates several problems through the previously mentioned appeals. More or less, these appeals are based on different manifestations of the same kind of fear—non-conforming behaviour leading to personal disdain, social rejection and/or punishment. The issue of environmentalism is addressed through the statement, “Tampax Flushable Applicator tampons are flushable and biodegradable. This means that the tampon, the cardboard applicator, and the wrapper can all be flushed away.” (Tampax, 1998a, p. 19) The guide also states that pads are not environmentally friendly because, “used pads must be folded up and wrapped in the plastic wrapper, or toilet paper, and thrown away in the trash—not flushed down the toilet.” (Tampax, 1998a. p. 18) The manifestation, in this case, is fear of not conforming to environmental standards resulting in possible punishment for destroying the environment or being rejected by others for lack of environmental responsibility.

Although Tampax tampons are biodegradable, there is no mention of the high levels of marine pollution associated with disposed tampons. Based on
Tampax's own statistics, a woman will use over 7, 500 tampons (or pads) in a lifetime, and they certainly do not biodegrade in an instant. Furthermore, according to Éco Logique Incorporated, makers of an internal gum-rubber menstrual cup:

Each woman throws away an average of 10,000 to 15,000 menstrual products in her lifetime. More than half of used tampons, including applicators, are flushed down the toilet, where they cause problems in the sewage systems, or are dumped directly into the oceans. The applicators litter our beaches in huge numbers, and are swallowed by fish and marine mammals, often killing them. And billions of pads are incinerated each year. (Éco Logique Inc., c1999)

As has been noted above, there is obviously another side to Tampax's claims of ecological altruism. Tampax fails to mention the environmental problems associated not only with their own flushable product, but the ecological ramifications of feminine pad disposal and incineration.

Another key component in the ideology surrounding tampons and Tampax brand is that of personal cleanliness and hygiene. The fear factor in this case is based on the North American practice of the virtual sanitization of one's body and bodily functions. The teacher's guide explains the difference between pads and tampons through a comparison of their respective abilities to keep one clean. In a sub-section labeled Tampax Tampons, the use of Tampax flushable applicator
tampons is justified as a means of practicing good personal hygiene. "It is also hygienic, since the fingers do [not] touch the tampon or the vagina."20 (Tampax, 1998a, p. 19) Another North American sign of being unclean is personal odour. Tampax also makes the claim that tampons can prevent odour. "And with tampons, internal protection means natural odor protection." (Tampax, 1998a, p. 19) In the first case, the underlying assumption is that it is wrong, even considered dirty, for a woman to come in contact with her menstrual flow. The reader is never told why it is wrong, but from a critical standpoint it is difficult to reason that menstrual flow is on par with something such as toxic waste.

According to the kit, menstrual flow consists mainly of blood matter—hardly a menacing or lethal material. Girls are potentially made to feel unclean (if they do not use tampons) through terms coupled with tampons such as "hygienic practice" and "not touching the tampon or vagina." In effect, Tampax says in the reverse of their own words, it is not sanitary to have your fingers touch your vagina during menstruation. This is a direct move against other brands, such as o.b., that produced some tampons that do not use an applicator for insertion. It is also an argument against other forms of internal menstrual protection devices such as reusable cups.

The issue of personal odour control is also placed in a similar context as cleanliness. Tampax tampons claim they stop blood from coming into contact with the air because they are an internal method of protection. The terminology associated in the teacher's guide that accompanies this claim is "natural odor protection." (Tampax, 1998a, p. 19) When blood come into contact with air, there
is potential for odour. The same claim cannot be made for pads because they are an external form of protection. Tampons, therefore, are used to mask the fact that there is an odour associated with menstrual flow. It becomes evident that the fear of being unclean translates into the possibility of others knowing that one is unclean. Personal odour plays into the issue of personal privacy because people can use their senses to detect the origin of the odour.

The ability to conceal one's period from others is a high-touted ideal associated with Tampax tampons. Privacy and secrecy are sought after as important qualities because of the fear of others knowledge of your period. Aside from the potential fear of odour recognition, Tampax makes claims about the ease with which one can hide their tampons from others. "Tampons are also popular with younger girls because they are small and easily hidden in a pocket or purse." (Tampax, 1998a, p.21) Associating personal embarrassment and shame with a girl's period is yet another way in which Tampax attempts to ensure that tampons are seen as problem solving devices. Another fear of detection factor is introduced through coupling personal freedom and choice with privacy. "As tampons are worn internally, women can wear snug clothing and go swimming with confidence." (Tampax, 1998a, p. 19) Since this claim appears right after other claims of "convenience, discretion, and comfort" (Tampax, 1998a, p. 19) it is hard not to surmise that active tampons are undetectable to others. The application and use of a tampon becomes the user's own secret.

The tampon as purveyor of personal freedom and choice is yet another type of value that is introduced in the teacher's guidebook. Tampons claim to
provide girls with ultimate personal freedom and choice. The personal freedom
and choice comes in the form of wearing any type clothing and performing any
type of activity. The same piece of information noted above also applies to this
situation. "As tampons are worn internally, women can wear snug clothing and go
swimming with confidence." (Tampax, 1998a, p. 19) Furthering the active lifestyle
argument, Tampax claims "many girls, especially those who are active in sports,
use tampons for their very first period." (Tampax, 1998a, p. 21) The reverse
argument to all of this would state that a girl does not have the ability to wear any
type of clothing or perform any type of activity unless she is wearing a tampon.
Loss of personal freedom and choice heavily undermines the keystones of
democratic beliefs and free-market systems.

The teacher's guide seems to place the final product decision in the hands
of the girl. "Once teens understand how both of these feminine protection
products work, they can make their own choices about which to use based on
personal needs and lifestyle." (Tampax, 1998a, p. 18) While the introductory
passage to this chapter does state that women have to make their own choice
among the types of feminine protection products, by the end of the chapter (as
we will see later), the choice has virtually been made for them.

At the end of the chapter, after much promotion of the use tampons over
the use of pads has taken place, the ideological choice of feminine protection
products is performed. The final section before the sample questions and
answers is entitled Choices for Beginners. It is this section in which the decision
to use tampons is made on behalf of the girls who are supposed to be deciding for themselves.

In most cases, a young girl can use a tampon from her first period on, if she chooses. Many girls, especially those who are active in sports, use tampons from their very first period. Often they have been advised about the benefits of tampon use by an older sister, a friend, or Mom. Tampons are also popular with younger girls because they are small and easily hidden in a pocket or purse. In addition, tampons with applicators are recommended for beginners because they are easy to place in the correct position and because the applicator assures that hands stay clean.

(Tampax, 1998a, p. 21)

While the individual has the ultimate choice in whether of not to buy a particular product, the choice is certainly slanted in favour of the use of tampons. Tampons are associated with the idealistic elements of privacy, cleanliness, maturity, personal freedom, and conformity. Pads are not associated with these ideals. When coupled with the fact that there is familiarity with Tampax brand tampons, which claim to be able to accommodate all of these ideals, brand choice is practically automatic.
Analysis of the Tampax Health Kit Student Handbook through the Critical Perspective of Advertising

The student handbook, *A Time For Answers*, provides much of the same information as is found in the teacher's guide. The ideology that is entwined within the teacher's guide is extended through the student handbook. Many of the same topics are dealt with, however there are a few additional pieces of information passed along. Identical values and problems are utilized as part of the product pitch in the student handbook. These values include cleanliness, environmentalism, and personal freedom, however, the problem of personal privacy is largely missing.

*A Time For Answers* provides a definition of the term *feminine protection*. It is interesting to note that the explanation in the handbooks says, "Protection for what, you want to know?" (Tampax, 1995, p. 23) Why is this interesting? As was stated in the last section, the protection is not for the person who is using the pad or tampon. Instead, the protection is for something external to the person. The way in which the chapter on feminine protection is structured is also quite significant. It begins, as mentioned above, by creating a sense of urgency. The urgency is that of potential harm or damage because one is not currently using feminine protection. This calls in to question the real fundamental need for pads and tampons. In other words, it is not natural to use pads or tampons, yet they are used because women do not want to have stains on their clothes. The use of the term *protection* adds to fears of personal safety and security. The phrase
"you need something...before it gets on your clothes," (Tampax, 1995, p. 23) creates a sense of absolute necessity. There may be other reasons as to while pads and tampons are used, but they are not covered by the handbook.

The next part of the chapter explains what feminine pads are and how to use them. While it does recommend experimenting with pads until a girl is familiar with her fluid amounts, it also raises or creates another problem. This problem is one of fear of not being clean because of menstrual odour.

If you decide to use pads, remember to change your pad every two to four hours to avoid developing an odor. When menstrual fluid is inside your body, it has no odor. But it does have an odor after it comes in contact with air. (Tampax, 1995, pp. 24-25)

Like the teacher's guide, there is strong emphasis on cleanliness, however, there is no mention of hygiene associated with not touching one's body. Instead, the focus of cleanliness is freedom from menstrual odour. The use of pads cannot accommodate the requirements of an odour-free period, so it is to Tampax tampons that girls must turn to solve the problem. "Unlike pads, tampons absorb your menstrual flow before it leaves the body—so you don't have to worry about odor." (Tampax, 1995, p. 25) Once again, the claim is made that tampons can maintain personal cleanliness better than pads.

The question of personal freedom is also addressed by the handbook. This section is virtually identical to the teacher's guide. According to the
handbook, tampons eliminate the problem of limited clothing selection and limited participation in activities.

...a tampon is placed inside, it doesn't get in the way or shift like a pad can. That means you can do anything you do the rest of the month like swim, ride your bike, and do gymnastics. You can also wear whatever you want, including bike shorts, leggings, and jeans. (Tampax, 1995, p. 26)

According to the statement, when one uses pads, they restrict the types of activities they can perform and the types of clothes one can wear. Quite simply, pads have limitations and tampons provide ultimate freedom. Tampons make a girl's life during menstruation virtually identical to the rest of her life when she is not menstruating.

The inability to flush pads down the toilet is also raised as another potential problem in this chapter. "When you change your pad or panty shield, you'll need to wrap it in tissue and dispose of it in the trash. Never flush your pad or wrapper. They aren't flushable and can clog up the plumbing." (Tampax, 1995, p. 25) Garbage is not recyclable. Tampons, on the other hand, are made of biodegradable materials, so they are said to be environmentally friendly. "And, since the tampon, applicator, and wrapper are all biodegradable, you can simply flush them away. That helps the environment." (Tampax, 1995, p. 27) There are several inferences that may be drawn from the above statement. Tampons are biodegradable so using them helps the environment. This is not possible with
pads. Tampons are convenient because one can flush them down the toilet. This is also not possible with pads. When these are combined, we see that using tampons is an important way to help the environment. Using pads is a way to destroy the environment.

The only time the issue of personal privacy is examined is in the statement following the information of the biodegradable nature of Tampax Flushable Applicator tampons. "And it's a good way to help keep you period private." (Tampax, 1995, p. 27) According to this statement, periods are a private matter and the use of tampons can facilitate this privacy. Once again, this is something that pads cannot accommodate. The ability to flush the tampon away provides sure-fire means to conceal the fact that a girl is menstruating.

Like the teacher's guide, problems are created by and solved through the use of tampons. The real problem here is that issues of cleanliness, privacy, personal freedom, and environmentalism are not properly acknowledged. In other words, Tampax (in conjunction with society), has taken the natural phenomenon of menstruation and made it a problem. We might ask ourselves what is true cleanliness? Does personal odour really matter in the grand scheme of life and the universe? As was noted in the section on the teacher's guide, the environmentalism preached by Tampax is really a false environmentalism that creates more problems than it solves. Real personal freedom would question the need for using any type of menstrual protection at all. According to Tampax, personal freedom revolves around choice of pads, choice of clothes, and ability
to perform any activity. The handbook reflects the ideology of the teacher's guide as much as it fosters and maintains that ideology.

Analysis of the Tampax Health Kit Video through the Critical Perspective of Advertising

Kids to Kids is a clever piece of marketing. Like the other components of the kit, the video covers the topic of puberty. Situated right in the middle, is what amounts to a short infomercial about Tampax tampons. The section entitled How to find the right feminine protection without even blushing, uses girls of a similar age to the age of the girls who are supposed to be watching the video to talk about feminine protection. There are several ideological values and beliefs that are created and perpetuated through these girls and through various demonstrations in the video. These include shame surrounding one's period, gaining maturity through the use of tampons, and necessity to keep one's period private. In the end, this section of the video is nothing short of a training session on the benefits of tampons and how to use tampons—all tied in to Tampax brand names.

The association of embarrassment with menstruation is present from the start of this section. The title, How to find the right feminine protection without even blushing, creates the foundation for the discussion about pads and tampons. The foundation is one of personal humiliation. It is created through
suggesting, rather factually, that there is blushing associated with feminine protection. Blushing refers to some type of level of embarrassment or shame. In reality, menstruation is a natural phenomenon that is beyond the control of women. Creating an argument based on the predefined terms of embarrassment leads to the creation of other problems, such as the need to keep a period private. Rephrased, we can look at this title in terms of, “feminine protection is embarrassing, but let’s talk about it anyway.” There is no discussion as to why it is cause for blushing. Again, this is a natural function of a woman’s body, so why should discussion about it be embarrassing. It is not evident that this problem is created solely by Tampax, but the video certainly does maintain the problem. It can be argued, however, that girls who never knew there was a level of embarrassment surrounding their period might learn to be embarrassed through the ideological framework of the video. In the end, the ideological value that is born out of embarrassment is a need for personal privacy or to hide one’s period from others.

In order to examine the notion that the use of tampons is a sign of maturity, we must once again address the segment of the video that involves the testimony of the eight girls.

**Girl 1:** When my mom first bought me pads, she bought the same... she bought the same ones as she used because she relied on them and she like them. So I use those too.
Girl 2: I use pads.

Girl 3: I use pads because they’re... I mean they’re not easier but...

Girl 4: After a while... you know you start, uh... kind of... shift over to tampons. (Tampax, 1998b)

[Section on Tampons]

Girl 5: The first time I used a tampon was when I was thirteen, and that was my first period.

Girl 6: I like using tampons better.

Girl 7: Definitely tampons because, ummm... it’s just so much easier.

Girl 8: Well, my sister came... you know, she’s in the Army... she came to visit. And I was still using pads. She told me... you know... that the tampons are better. She told me to come to Brantford and she showed me how to use it. (Tampax, 1998b)
While this dialogue is important to other aspects of different theories, a critical evaluation of it would arrive at one important outcome. That outcome is the creation of a problem based on immaturity because one uses feminine pads instead of tampons. First, there is a progression from using pads to using tampons. As the video moves through the series of girls, we see a logical shift in feminine protection choice that parallels the handbook and the teacher’s guide. We also see at the beginning, a reliance on one’s mother for advice because the girl uses the same method as her mother. The reliance of the girl on her mother demonstrates her immaturity because she lives at home and she allows her mother to make her decisions for her. In the end, we see the exact opposite through the girl who employs the same protection method as her grown-up sister. Her sister does not live at home and she is also in the army. In other words, her sister has detached herself from her family and is now self-supporting or mature.

In the video, maturity is defined as the ability to free oneself from the choices of others through making one’s own choices about feminine protection. Even though the sister in the army has made the choice for her younger sister, the fact that she is external to the household carries great weight. The older sister is seen as an independent because she was raised in the same house, but has moved on with her life and engages in self-supported, external activities. The same type of personal independence and maturity can be attained through the purchase and use tampons.

The last problem that is created within this video is that of the need to hide one’s period from others. There are several factors that contribute to this
problem. These factors include the prevention of personal odour, the prevention of clothing stains, and the ability to conceal the tampon. Only tampons are able to make the claim that they can prevent odour and accidents. “It fits in the vagina where it expands, absorbing blood before it leaves the body, giving full protection that helps prevent accidents. Internal protection, means natural odor protection. Nothing is visible.” (Tampax, 1998b) This statement sums up the ability of tampons to provide absolute secrecy of one’s period rather nicely. Only tampons can prevent odours because pads are an external form of protection. Only tampons can prevent stains on clothes because pads can leak. Only tampons are invisible to others because pads are bigger. All of these assertions help to maintain (and in some cases create) the belief that girls must keep their period private.

There is also an extreme lack of balance in this section of the video. The montage that displays different product packages (7 packages of Tampax brand tampons, 3 packages of Always brand feminine pads, 1 package of Playtex tampons, 1 package of o.b. tampons and 1 package of Kotex pads. (Tampax, 1998b)) is generous with its space for Tampax products. The pad used for the demonstration on how to use feminine pads is made by Always. (Tampax, 1998b) The three tampons in the tampon product shot all resemble the sample tampons in the kit, although only one is labelled “Tampax Satin” (the others are labelled “flushable” and “plastic.”) (Tampax, 1998b). Not only does Tampax have its products prominently displayed and discussed in the video, there are few (3) competing alternatives shown. Although other brand names are used, one
competing brand belongs to the same umbrella corporation. Always is the parent company of Tampax. That leaves only three product packages, buried in the montage, that do not belong in some way to Always or Tampax. Furthermore, there is no mention of viable alternative protection methods other than disposable pads and tampons. Things such as re-usable feminine napkins, menstrual cups, and even the argument to use nothing are absent from the debate.

*How to find the right feminine protection without even blushing* does little more than associate a level of shame with menstruation that can be overcome with the use of Tampax tampons. As a secondary notion, the video asserts that maturity can be achieved through the use of tampons. The requirement that one should hide one's period from others is based on nothing more than pure embarrassment. The product pitch in this video is a classic example of problem creation that can be solved through product purchase. The ideological values surrounding Tampax tampons also uphold and promote notions of consumption as a means to solve problems.

**Summary of the Analysis of the Tampax Health Kit through the Critical Perspective of Advertising**

It is clear that Tampax would like girls to purchase and use their brand of tampons as a means of feminine protection. Through use of various fear and
problem associated tactics, the necessity of using Tampax tampons becomes quite strong. The underlying statement, one that is never said, but is certainly at the forefront of the ideology surrounding tampons, is that a girl's period causes problems that Tampax tampons can fix. Girls are made to feel ashamed of their menstrual cycle through the fear of being unclean, the fear of personal odour, and the fear of others knowing about their period. Shame, in this case, is a constructed ideology because it places standards, beliefs, associations and practices upon a natural bodily function, turning it into an event. Furthermore, false notions of environmentalism are strapped on to the messages in order to add another reason to use Tampax tampons over all other methods.

Individualism is fostered through the secrecy, personal freedom, and the near-sterile health requirements associated with one's period. Girls are trained to keep their period a secret from everyone else, while at the same time they learn that Tampax tampons can fulfill such a need. Individualism and the free-market ideology are also maintained through the assertion that one must consume in order to have a successful menstruation phase of their cycle. Again, these assertions are all predicated on the problems created by this kit. These problems can be solved on a personal level provided that Tampax brand of products are purchased and used by the student.

Finally, in an interesting twist, meaning replacement does not occur at the level of traditional methods of feminine protection being substituted for modern methods. Meaning replacement takes place with the removal of traditional or biological views of the menstrual cycle and replacing them with notions of
personal freedom, cleanliness, privacy, environmentalism, product consumption and a variation of maturity. From a pure biological standpoint, none of these replacement meanings is entwined with menstruation. Menstruation serves a functional purpose—it is part of the female reproductive cycle. Menstruation is not about freedom, environmentalism, privacy, embarrassment, cleanliness, nor product consumption. These notions are all attached through external environmental interactions with people and things. In the text, these ideas are introduced as necessity during the menstruation period of a woman's cycle. All the notions are achievable through the use of Tampax tampons. The definition of maturity is even changed to a great extent. Maturity, instead of being about the ability to reproduce, becomes the ability to successfully use tampons instead of pads. Rather than maintain a functional public sense and understanding of menstruation, Tampax elects to change the meaning (or at least continue the altered view) of a woman's period. It is clear that Tampax is trying to replace and introduce new meanings for their products in the desire to sell more products.
CHAPTER FIVE

PUBLIC EDUCATION THEORIES AND PRACTICES VERSUS THE DESIRES
OF THE MARKETERS

Corporate sponsored curriculum does not amount to very much if it is never used. In order for the messages to be taught, there must be an outlet for the curriculum. The public school system is where we will find this type of curriculum being used. In order to understand the philosophical and historical role of the public school system, we will examine three crucial perspectives on public education through John Stuart Mill, John Dewey and Antonio Gramsci. Through a fourth perspective, that of Stuart Ewen, we will encounter the how the school system was changed during the early period of mass production and mass consumption era. Opposing these points of view are the marketers, who simply desire essentially two things. The first desire is to maintain, and in some cases create, notions of consumerism in young people. The second desire is to sell commodities to young consumers. Marketers have been trying to reach the elusive audience demographic of young children for a long time. Since there is an increase on corporate sponsored curriculum and other corporate involvement within the classroom, this task has become much easier. We will examine what marketers have to say about their desire to market to school children. Finally, we will take a look at what current state of public education in various regions in Canada, and examine some specific examples of private initiatives in Ontario.
Philosophical and Political Commentaries on the Roles of Public Education

John Stuart Mill, noted political economist, tackled the topic of mass education from a very critical political economic framework. Mill placed great emphasis on state—*not private*—financial assistance for the education of the public, as well as for independent research and scholarship.

It is not endurable that a government should, either *de lure* [sic] or *de facto*, have a complete control over the education of the people... A government which can mold the opinions and sentiments of the people from their youth upwards can do with them whatever it pleases. (Mill, 1965, p. 950). 21

In his inaugural address at the University of St. Andrew's in 1867, Mill warned against employing a system of public education that creates and enables a monopoly of public thought. He advocated the use of critical political economic theory and practice in order to keep people aware of the society in which they lived. He saw education, although at the university level, as a means by which people could create and maintain a progressive, humanistic, and socially responsible society. Education prepared students for their future roles as citizens.
[Pupils] should be taught the outlines of the civil and political institutions of their own country, and in a more general way, of the more advanced of the other civilised nations... I need not enlarge on the important lessons which it affords for the guidance of life and for the estimation of laws and institutions, or on the necessity of knowing all that it can teach in order to have true views of the course of human affairs or form plans for their improvement which will stand actual trial. (Mill, 1867, p. 206)

Although Mill 's argument is aimed at a university audience, there is no reason why political economic criticism should not be extended to government-funded public education at both the primary and secondary school levels. Mill's emphasis on independent scholarship—not government or business controlled scholarship—is the key to allowing critical political economic thought to flourish within a system of public education. He argues that it is the duty of the future citizen to become aware of the society in which he or she lives, and take action to improve that society.

[The systems of justice and rights] are not only the chief part of business of government, but the vital concern of every citizen; and their improvement affords a wide scope for the energies of any duly prepared mind, ambitious of contributing towards the better condition of the human race. (Mill, 1867, p. 207)
John Dewey, one of the more renowned education philosophers, examined the education of the public from a more sheltered context. While some of his ideas were revolutionary, he was not critical of the political-economic system in which public education is embedded. He may have written The School and Society (1900) and The Child and The Curriculum (1902) at the turn of the twentieth century, but some of his suggestions for public education are still important today. His writings were ground-breaking because they argued for a transformation from the traditional school system of headmasters and fixed desks to an integrated and egalitarian small-sized, student-centred classroom.

We must conceive of [courses of study] in their social significance, as types of the process by which society keeps itself going, as agencies for bringing home to the child some of the primal necessities of community life, and as ways in which these needs have been met by the growing insight and ingenuity of man; in short, as instrumentalities though which the school itself shall be made a genuine form of active community life, instead of a place set apart in which to learn lessons. (Dewey, 1900, p. 14)

Dewey (1900) wanted to see a school system that reflected the larger society as a whole. He argued that school was seen as a small community located in larger society, and that the introduction of practical studies and shifting abstract courses to a minor role would create a better society.
The introduction of active occupations, of nature-study, of elementary science, of art, of history; the relegation of the merely symbolic and formal to a secondary position; the change in the moral school atmosphere, in the relation of pupils and teachers—of discipline; the introduction of more active, expressive, and self-directing factors—all these are not mere accidents, they are necessities of the larger social evolution. (Dewey, 1900, p. 29)

The school must provide each student with enough tools and information so that they can be “effectively self-directed,” (Dewey, 1900, p. 29) in the hope that they can guide and improve upon society as a whole.

His desire that the school ideology should shift from merely intellectual teachings, to a much more earthy and pragmatic model, is an important point that must be carefully examined. While the current school system does reflect society as a whole, the factor that is missing from the model is the equal relationship between the teachers and the students. There is still an existing system of power, in which a struggle takes place between the teachers, who force material down upon students and the students who must learn it. Teachers, in this position, become authority figures, but at the same time they become advocates for the materials they teach.

Dewey (1902) argued against the system of “old education,” (p. 34) on the basis that it taught children *en masse*, in a passive mode, with a universal
curriculum. The limitation of this system is that it saw all children as raw objects which had to be molded into identical shapes. He envisioned a school system in which the interests of the child directed his or her pursuits. The tools of education were not there to simply teach the student, but to be used by the student to achieve personal goals. To help achieve this, Dewey (1902) also insisted upon designing the school so that it more closely resembled the child's home.

If we take an example from an ideal home, where the parent is intelligent enough to recognize what is best for the child, and is able to supply what is needed, we find the child learning through the social converse and constitution of the family. There are certain points of interest and value to him in the conversation carried on; statements are made, inquiries arise, topics are discussed, and the child continually learns. He states his experiences, his misconceptions are corrected. Again the child participates in the household occupations, and thereby gets the habits of industry, order, and regard for the rights and ideas of others, and the fundamental habit of subordinating his activities to the general interest of the household...He would have his excursions, his walks and talks, in which the larger world out of doors would open up to him. (Dewey, 1902, p.35)

We can see a few important changes between the old system and Dewey's new design. First, there is an increase in or an injection of the dialectic.
Children participate in and inform new conversations between teachers and students. Second, there is a distinct shift from a top-down method of dictation and regurgitation, to a bottom-up approach, where the child is informed and directed by the questions he or she may have. Finally, the notion of a complete or holistic view of the world is paramount to the success of the new teaching model. It allows the student to be informed by contemporary information and arguments in addition to those found in textbooks and traditional uniform lesson plans. In order to facilitate the learning of culture, contemporary information, and various disciplines, the impulses of the child must be directed into appropriate activities and exercises. Dewey (1902) referred to this process as “realizing [an interest] through its direction.” (p. 40)

Dewey (1902) also argued that children possessed four distinct interests: communication, inquiry, creativity, and construction. In order for a child to grow properly, all of these qualities must be inspired and exercised.

There should be organic connection between the school and business life, it is not meant that the school is to prepare the child for any particular business, but that there should be a natural connection of the everyday life of the child with the business environment about him, and that it is the affair of the school to clarify and liberalize this connection, to bring it to consciousness, not by introducing special studies, like commercial geography and arithmetic, but by keeping alive the ordinary bonds of relation. (Dewey, 1902, p. 76)
Mill and Dewey both argue that education is a form of empowerment; however, Mill saw it as a force for change and Dewey saw it as a preparatory tool for society. Mill argued that education should be used to teach people about the society in which they live, to be critical of it, and to make improvements upon those areas which were problematic. For Dewey, education prepared the student to fit in with society as a whole; however, his emphasis on student-centred learning gives his perspective at least one great strength. The connection between the business community and the school is the area where Dewey’s communitarian/theories of education weaken. I do not suggest that business is not an integral part of society, but there are possibilities for conflict when public and private interests attempt to work together.

Antonio Gramsci, a political and philosophical theorist during the early decades of the twentieth century, argued that the education system forced most students into the social and economic system as workers. He was critical of the way in which professional or vocational schools were taking over in Italy to the point where only the élite could afford to attend intellectual schools.

The tendency today is abolish every type of schooling that is “disinterested” (not serving immediate interests) or “formative”—keeping at most only a small-scale version to serve a tiny élite of ladies and gentlemen who do not have to worry about assuring themselves of a future career. (Gramsci, 1971, p. 27)
Gramsci (1971) also saw that the social system was determined by the elite because of the types of schools they attended. The school system prepared the future generations for adulthood, but only those who attended a superior school would be able to rule because the subordinate schools only created workers. The ruling class could potentially be the ruling class forever because of the higher education they received, thus reinforcing the old adage that knowledge is power.

If one wishes to break this pattern one needs, instead of multiplying and grading different types of vocational school, to create a single type of formative school (primary-secondary) which would take the child up to the threshold of his choice of job, forming him during this time as a person capable of thinking, studying, ruling—or controlling those who rule.

(Gramsci, 1971, p. 40)

Gramsci (1971) wanted to create a common school which would integrate both vocational instruction and intellectual instruction, providing students with a solid foundation. Upon completion of the common school, students would be able to choose to pursue either university or vocational training. The barrier to entry of university for the common person would be eradicated through universal intellectual education. The opportunity for employment would also be present due to the inclusion of skills training at the primary and secondary levels. What is even more interesting about Gramsci’s common school, is that it integrates
something that Mill argued for—critical political economic thought. Gramsci (1971) wanted the teaching of critical social thought to begin from the moment the pupil entered the common school system.

The first, primary grade should not last longer than three or four years, and in addition to imparting the first "instrumental" notions of schooling—reading, writing, sums, geography, history—ought in particular to deal with an aspect of education that is now neglected—i.e. with "rights and duties," with the first notions of the State and society as primordial elements of a new conception of the world which challenges the conceptions that are imparted by the various traditional social environments, i.e. those conceptions which can be termed folkloristic. (Gramsci, 1971, p. 30)

In other words, Gramsci (1971) wanted to expose the framework of society and its seemingly natural elements (hence the use of the term "folkloristic"). Common school education would be designed to make students evaluate and rethink elements of society. This new school was also intended for the whole of society, not just people who lived in the cities of Italy.

The desire to educate future generations for adult roles in society is a common thread among Dewey, Mill, and Gramsci. While Dewey’s view is hardly critical, it has value in its suggestion that learning must be student centred, not teacher or textbook centred, nor should curriculum be universal. For Dewey, the role of the student effectively changed from a passive recipient of information to
an active agent in the creation and discovery of knowledge. The limitation of Dewey was that he saw the role of public education as preparatory tool for students and their place in larger society. In Dewey’s model, the student may have his or her energies directed into disciplines and lessons, but there is no guarantee that the student will think critically about what he or she is learning.

Mill’s emphasis on critical political economy plays an important part in directing a student’s energies toward reflective evaluation of curriculum content. For Mill, students should be taught everything about the political economic state in which they live so that they may question and remedy problems within society as a whole, and in the process, become better citizens. Gramsci brings the process of critical analysis into early childhood education through his common school system. He argues that the more schools there are which suit the needs of business increases the likelihood that the social and economic system will stay in the hands of the ruling élite. People become fragmented into specialized groups, lacking formative education, because they have been educated and trained for a specific field of work.

While students are part of the institution of the public school system, the public school system is part of a larger social and economic system. The ideology that governs these systems, should therefore, govern the schools within the systems. In Captains of Consciousness (1976), Stuart Ewen discusses the major institutional changes that occurred in religion, education, legislation and the military in order to facilitate the learning of the free-market system. Let us examine the area of public education in depth. Ewen (1976) noted the changes in
the desired goals of public education that occurred at the time of the emergence of the mass production and mass consumption phase of the industrial revolution. Ewen (1976) asserts that people had to be taught how to consume. In other words, the industrial revolution had created a surplus of mass produced commodities that remained untouched by the people because they were accustomed to an agrarian lifestyle. A process of re-socialization had to take place in order to make people consume goods that were of little or no use in terms of their traditional lifestyle, but critical to the survival of the emerging free market economy. Ewen (1976) discusses the role that education and schools played in the creation of a consumer mentality in North American society by looking at the desires of those who were behind its creation—businessmen of the 1920s.

Edward Filene, owner of a Boston department store, was an internationally renowned promoter of processes used for the "consumerizing" (Ewen, 1976, p. 54) the masses. Filene saw education as the key to teaching the new values of consumerism to people who had zero knowledge of its importance. In order to create a "unified cultural around the social bond of consumerism...[it] would require a selective education which limited the concept of social change and betterment to those commodified answers rolling off American conveyor belts." (Ewen, 1976, p. 54) This type of education clearly limits the ability of the student to think about perspectives that differ from those of those in charge of big business. Filene recognized a potential conflict between the interests of labour and the interests of management over the limited view of education that was to
be presented in classrooms. In order to combat this problem, Filene argued that education should be concerned with teaching, and not concerned with questioning.

Just looking at the given "facts" about what is being produced rather than questioning the social bases upon which those facts lay was what modern education should be all about. Education should be a process of acclimating and adjusting the population to that world of facts, to make it their own. (Ewen, 1976, p. 55)

The importance of the use of the term facts becomes evident when we look at the desires of business to provide workers and future workers within the new model with some type of personal satisfaction. The traditional production process, that of craftsmanship and apprenticeship on a small scale was no longer feasible under the mass production model. "Consumption was but a reinforcement of the basic transformation that had increasingly characterized the world of work—a response to things rather than people, the time extended into daily life and leisure." (Ewen, 1976, p. 56) The effective removal of craftsmanship from the production process created a void in the workers involved in commodity manufacturing. Education had to bring people into the new mode of thinking in such a way that they did not question the social ramifications of the mass production process. Emphasis had to shift from need fulfillment through traditional means of production to need fulfillment through mass consumption.
The new set of facts emphasized informing people about the roles each person had to play in the free market economy.

The whole system had to take root quickly, so business targeted both adults and children with its message. Of great concern here is the transformation of the public school into an institution designed to reform the culture. Once education changed people, its duty expanded to the secondary role of belief maintenance. Due to new work protection laws for children, more children were free to attend school. Children were now seen as a financial liability to their families because of the amount of childhood-related goods they consumed. (Ewen, 1976, p. 137) At school, modern children were socialized with a new set of values. "Working-class families...spoke of how children carried into the home the messages of growing industrial authority and the industrialized moralities of home economics, movies, Y's, and education in general." (Ewen, 1976, p. 137) The creation of home economics as a course of study is perhaps the most obvious of the school changes that took place during this period of transition.

From this assessment of the system of public education, we can see some important transformations. First, the foundation of modern production and reformation of public thought and education was facilitated by the leaders of big business. Second, the initial re-education of the public took place at all age levels in order to change social values on the whole. Third, the educational system created new courses such as home economics, and reformed old courses to bring the schooling of the future generations in line with the values of the mass production system. Finally, all of these reformations were made so that the free
market system could operate, in an unquestioning society. The significance of these transformations is that the orientation of a society on all levels was altered in order to suit the needs of a few rich people. Public education became a tool for the use of big business to not only create, but maintain belief in the free market economy as though it were the *natural way to live*.

This vision of the reformed school does not align itself very well with Mill, Dewey or Gramsci. Gone is the notion of the pure-student centred learning model, as the needs of business become ultimate goal. The eradication of the questioning of the social ramifications of the free market system limits the ability of the student to prepare him or herself for the role of citizen. In Mill's view, criticism was of utmost importance in improving not only the citizen, but society as a whole. Without truly questioning the system, including its fundamental beliefs, one cannot improve as a person within that system, nor can they improve upon the system. Gramsci's system of critical and fundamental skill learning at the primary level would also have no place under this framework. The critical aspects of the common school would call into question a mere *fact based* society, something business probably would not be able to survive. Regardless of the differences in perspective, none of these models suggests that business is directly involved with everyday class work. While the end goal of Ewen's model of education is to produce consumers and workers, the ideas and advertisements of specific corporations are absent from the classroom.
The Aims and Desires of the Marketers

Quite simply, marketers want to advertise their products in order to generate commodity sales. What is so important about the school system that advertisers need to get their messages in there? By law, up until a certain age (this varies with different provinces), children must attend school. As Apple (1992) argues, this creates a captive audience because children are forced to listen to the messages that are delivered in the classroom. Another reason marketers want to reach the youth market is because of its huge amount of disposable income. Finally, marketers realize that they have a chance to have their messages legitimized through the school system. They can continue to create young consumers who will grow up to be future workers and consumers. Let us examine some of the views that corporations have about their desired role within the system of public education.

Corporations such as the Cunningham Gregory + Company are quite explicit in their intention to invade the public school system in Canada and use it as a tool for increasing corporate profit. Two important notions are addressed in Cunningham Gregory's marketing brochure. First, there is the recognition of a shift in the funding toward public education and emphasizes exploitation of desperate schools.

The educational community is currently reaching out for partners. It has been changing the curriculum to develop the employability skills needed
by corporations, but its ability to make these changes is being diminished by budget cuts and other constraints. This provides an opportunity for the corporations to play a pivotal role in Canada’s education system.

(Cunningham Gregory, 1996, p. 1)

Presumably the “other constraints” are policy restrictions placed on corporations preventing them from overrunning schools through complete dependence on corporate funding and corporate assistance. There is also a strong contrast to Gramsci’s demand for critical thought teaching within the school system. According to Cunningham Gregory, schools should be a training ground for future workers. Clearly it is in the interest of the corporations to take initiatives that will facilitate the necessary changes to the role of the public school system in Canadian society.

The second desire of Cunningham Gregory is to increase and influence consumerism, while at the same time increase the public profile of a corporation. According to this perspective, schools can also assist in the marketing of products and services to children while making themselves look like wonderful philanthropists.

A well-designed educational initiative is a vital cornerstone of a corporation’s communication and marketing strategy. It increases the corporation’s profile in the community and it allows the corporation to
directly influence today's consumer and the future work force.

(Cunningham Gregory, 1996, p. 1)

Cunningham Gregory also claims that these educational programs "position sponsors as being caring, corporate citizens." (Cunningham Gregory, 1996, p. 3)

Schools not only legitimize corporations, they have the potential to directly increase the revenue earned by corporations.

By reaching the next generation with accurate up-to-date information, educational programs ensure that vital messages can be delivered where they most effectively change behaviour or attitudes. (Cunningham Gregory, 1996, p. 3)

There is no mention of educational value, concern for critical thought, or even for social development beyond the consumer/corporate requirements. What is evident from this marketing perspective is that future workers and consumers can be created through corporate involvement with public schools. The corporation will appear to be on the side of assisting the system of public education, when in reality they are only trying to make money off of students.

As an example of some of the work done by Cunningham Gregory, let us look at a package created in conjunction with Ontario Hydro. Using Energy Wisely is a program designed to teach energy management and is aimed at students in grades four, five and six. (Cunningham Gregory, 1996) The two
reasons why this project was put into implementation, according to Ontario Hydro's own objectives, were:

1) to maintain current demand for electricity through teaching children and their parents good energy management
2) to increase its customer satisfaction index by raising its profile in the community as supporting public education (Cunningham Gregory, 1996, p. 10)

Once again we see a stark contrast between the philosophical and theoretical views of public education and the aims of Cunningham Gregory and Ontario Hydro. The focus is clearly to maintain revenue and increase public profile of a corporation through educating children about Ontario Hydro's own values. This corporation is not alone in the fight to improve their corporate image in order to help increase sales.

Computer and electronics manufacturer Hewlett-Packard (Canada) Limited created a math program out of a desire to improve its public image as a supporter of women in math and science. (Cunningham Gregory, 1996) The results of the study of the new curriculum, tracked by Cunningham Gregory, demonstrated "a trend in the math curriculum toward expanded use of calculators in the classroom." (Cunningham Gregory, 1996, p. 13)

Another example of Cunningham Gregory's work is the program they created in association with the Canadian Banker's Association (CBA). The CBA
implemented a program called *The Personal Finance Portfolio*. This program was designed to be used in conjunction with CBC Television's weekly show, *Street Cents*, in order to "help students with personal finance planning skills in the classroom." (Cunningham Gregory, 1996, p. 14) The subjects covered in the program included cheque cashing, monthly budgets, cross border shopping, and salary raises. (Cunningham Gregory, 1996) The desired outcome of the project was to give students a fundamental understanding of finance management for future applications later on in life.

The amount of target marketing toward children has been on the increase for some time. One might question the importance of marketing to children on two levels. First, does advertising and consumerism have that much impact in a child's life? Second, how important are children as a financial market? To answer the first question, we will examine the research of Texas A&M marketing professor, Jim McNeal. The development of the child as a consumer is well documented in the academic realm and the advertising industry. In a 1993 Financial Post article, Scotland has cited McNeal's five key stages in consumer development.

- Between two and six months, children are taken on their first outing to a store, typically a supermarket. They take in the sights, sounds and smells and begin to build impressions of the marketplace.
- By 24 months, children are pointing to and asking for products from store shelves. Cereals and candy are the most requested items.
• By 42 months, they are picking up products they want their parents to buy for them. At this age, they begin broadening their demands to include toys, snacks, books and clothes.

• Between the years of four to six, children buy their first item—usually a toy—with money from parents or grandparents.

• Around age eight, children being making their first independent purchase—typically pop or a snack—at the local corner store.

(Scotland, 1993, p. 21)

As the passage illustrates, children are a significant part of the consumer market. They are able to recognize specific commodity brands, form brand loyalties, exercise wants and needs, and even make purchasing decisions by the age of eight. In Canada, by age eight, most students are in grade two or three in the public school system. The Bank of Montreal’s my money Investment Kit was targeted at this vary same group—ages 8 and up. Carol Green Long of Children’s Creative Marketing notes in Scotland’s article that “one recent study tells us that kids six to 11 learn about new products 50% [of the time] from advertising, 30% from friends and 20% from parents and teachers.” (Scotland, 1993, p. 21) These statistics indicate that a potential 90% of product learning occurs between direct advertising, friends and teachers—all of which are components of the marketers’ desired school environment.

Does it matter that children have such strong notions of consumerism when they do not have a regular income? Actually, children as a collective group
possess an enormous amount of money. It is only recently that many corporations have realized the dollar value of the youth market (13-24 year olds). In reality, how much money do school children have to spend? The answer is surprising. According to Youth Target 1995, a group who tracks youth spending, in 1992 the “discretionary income of Canada’s 13 to 24 year olds is almost 200 million dollars per week!” (Youth Target, 1995, p. 4) Youth Target also found that children aged thirteen to fourteen have approximately twenty-five dollars per week of discretionary income. (Youth Target, 1995) This evidence is reinforced by the findings of Jim McNeal. According to Robertson, McNeal states that “children not only control enviable amounts of their own money, approaching $100 billion (U.S.), but influence $1 trillion of their parents’ spending on everything from breakfast cereal to cars.” (Robertson, 1998, p. 200) While the statistics of McNeal are American, there is some degree of congruence with the Canadian findings. The importance of this evidence is that attitude toward children as meaningless penny-candy consumers has changed dramatically to that of children as a large market force. There is significant revenue to be made from the youth market even if children meet the minimum the potential of their spending capability (twenty-five dollars per week).

An example of a marketing forum that specifically targets education is the annual Canadian Consumers Kids Conference. This event provides corporations with information on how to target students with advertising messages and products. “[We give you] innovative and dynamic presentations designed to give you the tools you need to market to this powerful consumer group!” (Institute for
International Research (IIR), 1996a, sec.1) The concepts introduced at the 1998 conference included: "Trends Update: Identifying What's Hot and Understand How to Predict Trends in Order to Spot the Next Hit" (sec. 3); "Assessing Child & Youth Attitudes, Values and Brand Choices Specific to the Canadian Market in Order to Understand the Complexities of Targeting this Sector" (sec. 4); "Effectively Targeting Your Market Through an Integrated Media Strategy" (sec 5); "Age Segmenting the Canadian Child & Youth Markets in Order to Evaluate Consumer Behaviour" (sec. 6); "Developing Best Practices for Targeting the Teen Market: Understanding Adolescent Purchasing Behaviours" (sec. 7); "Developing a Comprehensive Event marketing and Sponsorship Program Focusing Youth Activities in Order to Build Brand Identity" (sec. 11) The final seminar was hosted by the creators of the Jr. Jays program.

In their seminar, Terry Greenwood, Eric Conroy, David Boothby, and Paul Markle of the Jr. Jays, Wrigley, and Metro Police Group (1996a) boast of "direct delivery of product' three times a year to the tune of "1.5 million cereal samples, 1 million gum, [and] 1 million chocolate bars.' (IIR, 1996b, p. 10) The Jr. Jays magazine is distributed by uniformed police officers to public school classrooms. The program was originally designed to raise safety awareness levels among young children. Now it is also used to distribute Jr. Jays magazine and various commercial products. The magazine itself is a comic book containing various product ads and cleverly disguised articles and contests. These articles and contests are really promotions for products, music groups, television shows and movies. Some of the commodities featured in the Fall 1998 issue include the
Nintendo game Pokémon (inside of cover), the music album for cleopatra zyc (p. 1), a public service announcement for milk (p. 51), Kellogg’s Pop Tarts (p. 53), Kellogg’s Corn Pops (p. 54), the Bank of Montreal’s My Money Investment Kit (p. 67), Imperial Oil and Esso (p. 71), and Canadian Airlines. (p. 73) There are also many product give-away contests throughout the magazine. Various commodities are promoted through prize-winning contests. The contest prizes include a t-shirt from the television show Dawson’s Creek (p. 5), a compact disc from the McAuley Boys (pp. 8-9), free passes to see Warner-Brothers re-release of the Wizard of Oz (p. 11), various prizes from Nintendo’s Pokémon (pp. 42-43), backpacks from Canadian Airlines (pp. 44-45), and a prize package involving the Toronto Blue Jays and Hubba Bubba (pp. 64-65). Even some of the comics are used to promote various products. For example, the Fall 1998 issue also contains a short comic about financial investment and the Bank of Montreal my money investment plans that are available to young people. (pp. 68-70)

The use of police officers to distribute curriculum materials and product samples to public schools in Canada is very important to Jr. Jays. It gives them the ability to “find out the names of the schools, the number of kids that go there and even the languages spoken. This gives [them] SPECIFIC ACCURATE TARGETING [capitalization theirs].” (IIR, 1996a, sec. 11) If the desired goal of this program is product targeting to children’s markets, then it appears that the program works. It is interesting to note that there is no mention of the efficacy or importance of the learning materials beyond the ability to market and distribute to
commodities to students. The primary focus of Jr. Jays is to market products. The secondary focus is any additional learning that may take place.

The Jr. Jays group uses terms such as "exclusivity" of involvement, maximization of "media coverage," and opportunities for "sampling or trade tie-in possibilities" (IIR, 1996a, sec. 10) to describe their practices. The term exclusivity means that Jr. Jays has a lock on a particular sector of the education market that other organizations cannot touch. The desire here is to have control over the school market. The maximization of media coverage refers to the creation of a high public profile. A corporation will receive this profile as a direct result of its involvement with a public school. Finally, the term trade tie-in possibilities means nothing more than being able to distribute one's product or corporate belief with the learning materials.

While linking advertising with curriculum is a very popular method used by many corporations, a slightly different approach is offered by a corporation called ScreenAd. ScreenAd Digital Billboards Incorporated has removed the curriculum, but still manages to maintain high levels of advertising through the use of computer screensavers. According to an article in Marketing Online, ScreenAd has been employed in the Peel, Durham, Elgin, Oxford and Lincoln regions of Ontario. (Lahey, 1997) The potential audience for ScreenAd is 150,000 students in Ontario, "with message appearing on-screen as often as 15 times per day." (Lahey, 1997) The advertisers involved in the pilot project included Pizza Pizza, Gatorade, Trident gum, Irwin Toys, YTV, and Burger King. The actual cost of placing an advertisement in these venues was approximately $12,000 for a four-
week period. (Lahey, 1997) There is no supporting curriculum attached with ScreenAd, making the only value the advertising itself.

Modern is another giant education marketing group that assists firms with the creation of marketing campaigns for use in schools. Even though this is an American firm, their approach is congruent with Canadian firms. There is also the possibility that with free trade Canada would have to allow Modern in schools if a corporation was to enlist their services.

In the mid-1990s the Madison avenue corporation created a series of three advertisements aimed at drawing corporations into the potentially lucrative public school market. The first advertisement has a picture of a pre-teenage boy carrying a school bag in it and is accompanied by the slogan, "how to reach puberty." (Modern, c1995a) The copy at the bottom of this advertisement states, "we can help you deliver a message to his classroom that he'll carry into adulthood. If he's in your target market, call us at (800) 237-7114." (Modern, c1995a) The second advertisement contains a picture of a teenage girl carrying a number of schoolbooks, accompanied by the slogan, "reach her before she gets credit." (Modern, c1995b) The copy written at the bottom of the advertisement states, "modern product sampling can help you develop brand loyalty before she becomes a serious shopper. To put your product in her hands, call us at (800) 237-7114." (Modern, c1995b) Finally, the third advertisement contains a picture of a very young boy, dressed in a suit with a brief case at his side. The slogan for this advertisement reads, "reach him at the office." (Modern, c1995c) The copy at the bottom of this advertisement states, "his first day job is kindergarten. Modern
can put your sponsored educational materials in the lesson plan. If he's in your
target market, call us at (800) 237-7114.” (Modern, c1995c) Modern does not
attempt to hide its aims from its prospective clients. The only reason any of
Modern's materials are used in the classroom is to promote one of their client's
products and to manufacture consumers for that product.

The goals of these corporations include target marketing, profit
maximization through sales and spinoffs, creating and maintaining customer
loyalty, creating and increasing market share. There is little (if any) concern for
the educational value of the materials—that is beyond their ability to educate
children about new and existing products. The bottom line for these corporations
is indeed, a fiscal bottom line written in black ink. The return on their investment
is not a thinking child, but a child who has been educated to consume and a child
that will grow up, enter the work force and continue to consume. This model is
quite a contrast from each of those proposed by Mill, Dewey, and Gramsci. While
Ewen's reformation model does acknowledge that schools changed in order to
teach the values of mass consumption and mass production, it does not speak of
direct commodity marketing to students. The aim of the reformation of the public
school system during the 1920s was to create future consumers and workers.
There was no mention of direct marketing and product sales to children. In fact,
children were not even seen as a potential market. According to Ewen, children
were thought of as leeches who fed off of their parents' income. The desire for
immediate monetary return on the marketing of chewing gum, sports clothes, and
other products in schools is part of a much more radical vision—one far beyond the desires of even Mr. Filene.

The Situation of Public Education in Ontario

There has been very little academic work performed on assessing corporate involvement with the Ontario public school system. Most of the existing academic research on the commercialization of public schools is American. Many of these analyses deal specifically with Channel One, an American, in-class commercial television network for youth. The existing research on Ontario is comprised of reports, print articles, and books, but they do not necessarily fall in the genre of academic analysis. Various groups, including the Ontario Secondary School Teachers’ Federation (OSSTF), the Canadian Teachers Federation (CTF), and the Ontario English Catholic Teachers’ Association (OECTA) have all commissioned and provided funding for several of these projects. These studies provide a good point of entry into the current situation of corporate involvement with public schools in Ontario.

The system of public education in Ontario has set up mandates for the teaching of its students. The various boards of education and regions of the province place priorities on different types of objectives. While the primary foci of the boards may differ, their objectives on the whole are not that different. For example, the Ottawa-Carleton District School Board (OCDSB) has set a mandate to “make students the primary focus,” (OCDSB, 1998, p. 1) in all decisions made
by the board. Some boards, such as the Waterloo Region District School Board do not have a primary focus. Instead, WRDSB employs a defined set of values. An example of one of these values is the desire to provide students with "the opportunity to develop the skills which will provide a foundation for living and learning, today and in the future," (Waterloo Region District School Board (WRDSB), 1998, p. 1) as well as a "safe, secure, and positive environment in which to learn and develop." (WRDSB, 1998, p. 1)

Other board objectives maintain that the public school system should "recognize and value the diversity of [a school's] community by ensuring equity, accessibility and fairness of learning opportunities," (OCDSB, p. 1, 1998), foster success through "community support" and caring through "valuing and recognizing individual contributions and talent," (Peel Region District School Board (PRDSB), p. 1, 1998), and "enable [students] to enjoy life as creative, contributing, responsible members of society." (Hamilton District School Board (HDSB), p. 1, 1997) There is also a desire to "foster vital and mutually beneficial relationships between schools, the populations they serve and the communities in which they are situated." (OCDSB, p. 1, 1998)

The basic common thread of the above objectives is that they are all driven by the notion of student learning. While the goals of specific public boards and specific public schools may differ even within Ontario, one important underlying principle is that none of these schools have an end desire of making a financial profit. The reverse of publicly structured education is privately structured education. In the private model schools are considered to be profit making
institutions. We can already see potential conflict between the “for profit” aims of corporations and the non-profit role ascribed to public schools.

The Ontario Secondary School Teachers’ Federation (1995) released a document addressing the commercialization of the Canadian classroom. The research report examines three aspects of the privatization of public education in Ontario. First, it examines the way in which the empowered conservative government was proclaiming and creating “negative opinions” of the public school system. At the same time, the government was promoting the business community “as the only viable means to salvage [Ontario’s] failing schools.” (OSSTF, 1995, p. 1) Second, it examines the role that private curriculum plays in the classroom. “Sponsored educational materials must be examined for bias, inaccuracies and self-serving promotions — just as any other political document.” (OSSTF, 1995, p. 1) Third, the report addresses the partnerships created between public schools and business. “Is it the job of schools to mold students into future workers and consumers, or is the role of education something quite different?” (OSSTF, 1995, p. 1)

In regard to the area of interest for this thesis—corporate sponsored curriculum—the report made several interesting conclusions. First, schools are more frequently tagged as a viable environment in which to market products to children. Second, it suggests that when a school uses sponsored course materials, there is a link formed between the product associated with the curriculum and the school in the form of a product endorsement. Third, it raises the question of the ideological values associated with corporate sponsorships

271
and corporate sponsored materials. Do the values of corporate sponsored curriculum eradicate ideas that run contradictory to the corporate sponsor's philosophy? (OSSTF, 1995, p. 22) Any assessment of the ideology of advertising in the classroom and the ideology of corporate sponsored materials must include the question of one set of values replacing others. As was demonstrated by the analysis in this thesis, there is strong evidence that indicates the values of the corporate sponsor take precedence above all else.

Shaker (1995a) examined many of the sponsored materials produced by corporations in *Customers in the Classroom*. While her report, for the most part, merely lists the types of corporate sponsored programs available, she does make two important assertions. First, she suggests that "often, corporate-sponsored material is little more than an in-class vehicle for advertising." (Shaker, 1995a, p. 2) For example, Kraft had a package that included recipes for ""healthy"" (Shaker, 1995a, p. 2) eating; but all of these recipes advocated the use of Kraft products in order to make them. Second, corporations often forget about including the term "educational." (Shaker, 1995a, p. 2) Instead they employ terms such as "‘pro-social' messages," that have more to do with promoting a social mindset than teaching children fundamental skills; let alone critical thinking. (Shaker, 1995a, p. 2) This was also demonstrated through the examination of the desires of marketers. The educational value of the materials was never addressed.

Shaker (1995a) warns us that "corporate involvement must not lead to the development of an unbalanced school system, or a system fitted exclusively to the needs and mentality of business." (p. 6) To help combat this, she suggests
several possible rules that schools should follow when deciding to adopt corporate sponsorships or curriculum.

1. Corporate-sponsored materials must be us noncommercial as possible, with any identification kept to a minimum. Company logos should not be used. Student hand-outs should have no corporate identification, or it should be positioned so it may be easily removed.

2. Sponsored materials must be closely examined for corporate bias by department heads, teachers, the principal (school administration), trustee and a representative of the Home and Schools Association or other parental representative. Materials should not be used or distributed until it has been determined that the information is accurate and educational.

3. Corporate sampling or product distribution will not take place on school premises or at school functions.

4. Advertising-based magazines must be authorized by the principal before distribution to students. Sample-free magazines should be requested by school administration from publishers.

5. It must be made clear to parents and students that by using [corporate sponsored materials] or corporate hand-outs the school does not endorse either the corporate products or messages.

6. A formal statement regarding corporate involvement (sponsorship, advertising) in schools should be sent to parents at the beginning of each school year. (Shaker, 1995a, p. 8)
Shaker's (1995a) insights and analyses prove to be valuable in terms of examining the various corporations who are involved with curriculum creation. The two important suggestions she makes are; we should return to the use of the term "educational" and create properly balancing content.

Shaker's (1995b) second article is much more critical of the ideology of the public education system. Shaker (1995b) suggests that the goals set by the Ontario ministry for high school education reform ("to provide courses that are both challenging and relevant to students' post-secondary goals." (p. 3)) may in fact, be determined by business. "One can safely assume that the expertise for advancing curricula will come from the sector with the most corporate backing and financial security." (Shaker, 1995b, p. 3) She also questions the existence (if any) of teaching critical thought and critical analysis to students once the private sector becomes the dominant information provider within the system of public education. Indeed, why would students be encouraged to think critically of business if; a) business was in charge of the curriculum, and b) business was trying to win the approval of students? "The stark message is that, if school districts do not reform educational standards according to corporate needs, those students will not be hired, and business will not locate in those communities." (Shaker, 1995b, p. 4)

In response to the criticism that sponsored course materials in the classroom encourage brand loyalty and increase the desire to consume, Shaker (1995b) provides the perspective of a former Ontario Minister of Education.
[John Snobelen] and the business community dismiss concerns about the increasing commercialization of education by impatiently explaining that kids are bombarded with commercials every day, and that a logo on the corner of their [corporate sponsored materials] will have no effect.

(Shaker, 1995b, p. 4)

From these remarks alone, it is clear that the public education perspective has been merged with the perspective business on the basis of non-critical thought. Snobelen is extremely dismissive of the intent of corporations and the power that they hold within the system of public education. To suggest that advertising has no effect on students because they are bombarded with advertising every day is ridiculous. In reality, does the ideological context of a school book or course curricula change when a corporation places its logo on the front cover or is the creator of its informational content? The analysis of the *my money Investment Kit* and the *Tampax Teaching Kit* demonstrated that the ideological context does change.

The Ontario English Catholic Teachers Association (OECTA) released a report, *Corporate Involvement in Ontario's Catholic Schools* (1996), detailing the changes that have occurred in the public education financial model. Although OECTA is a part of the separate school system, its schools are still funded through public tax money and fall under the guidelines of the Ministry of Ontario. They are considered to be public schools. Phillip Hill and Brian McGowan
discuss the increase in corporate funding, the decrease in Ontario’s public school budgets, and the increasing role business is playing, specifically within the public school classroom. In regard to corporate involvement and funding, OECTA’s stance appears to be much the same as that of the OSSTF. Both federations desire that a code of conduct be created in order to deal with private involvement with public schools. Furthermore, “OECTA does not support partnerships with corporations who exploit students, conduct operations in countries which consistently violate human rights or which continuously disregard local and national environmental standards.” (Hill & McGowan, 1996, p. 1) We must question the use of the terms “consistently” and “continuously.” Are we supposed to believe that corporations who do these things on a limited basis are really considered to be partners?

OECTA’s intent was for “the Catholic educational community [to] create a provincial committee to establish a corporate code of conduct that would provide a structure for business-education partnerships.” (Hill & McGowan, 1996, p. 2) Although OECTA does not seem to question the reasons why corporations are becoming involved with a public service, Hill and McGowan (1996) do advocate other kinds of partnerships. “OECTA encourages programs with small business, parents, labour, and community-based non-profit organizations designed to enhance the quality of education. [Italics mine]” (p. 3) While there is a ray of hope in the above statement, in terms of balancing corporate ideology with some representatives of labour and communitarian based organizations, there is a
problem with the notion of *enhancing* education. The OECTA report fails to
define how and why partnerships *enhance* education.

Hill and McGowan (1996) address the Learning Partnership program that
was created in 1993. While this project did not deal with sponsored course
materials *per se* it did change curriculum and school programs on the whole. One
of the projects within the Learning Partnership program was the *Entrepreneurial
Adventure Project* (EAP). Young children, from kindergarten to 8th grade, were
partnered with a person in the business community in order to develop the skills
required to start a business. (Hill & McGowan, 1996, p. 4) Another project in the
program was the *Teacher Professional Development Program* (TPDP). Teachers
were invited to forge business connections and examine how the business world
works on a day-to-day basis. “The program offers teachers an opportunity to
‘establish valuable contacts for future exchange programs or school visits by the
host company.’” (Hill & McGowan, 1996, p. 4) A third notable program was
entitled *Take Our Kids to Work*. Students in grade 9 were encouraged to go to
work with a family member or friend in order to see how the *real* world operates.
The Learning Partnership project “provides the private sector with ‘a first hand
look at future employees and consumers.’” (Hill & McGowan, 1996, p. 4)

It appears as though these projects serve businesses much more than the
students and teachers involved. All three projects are designed to familiarize and
indoctrinate (as is the case of the *Take Our Kids to Work* program) future
consumers and workers into the methods of the free market system. Teachers
are also part of the package as they can be used to promote business through
the "valuable links" created with certain members of the business community. The Learning Partnership does not question the relationships between business and education, but instead promotes them as an educational bonus. The OECTA report notes that "teachers are concerned that the Learning Partnership's Financial Post 500 [sic] membership list of corporations and financial institutions implies that the organization condones the corporate take-over of publicly-funded education." (Hill & McGowan, 1996, p. 4)

Another significant change to public education system in Ontario occurred in 1997 when the Ontario government opened up contract bidding for a massive curriculum revision program. The MERX website (maintained by the Bank of Montreal) was used in order to facilitate electronic contract bids. (Shaker, 1998) While the bidding process was open to any organization, overwhelming financial costs made it virtually impossible for all but wealthy organizations to bid for curriculum contracts. In order to place a bid, clients had to pay a fee of CDN$500,000 and have liability insurance of CDN$1,000,000. (Shaker, 1998) Another concern of many outsiders was that the bidding process was accessible to groups from the United States as well as Canada. Fortunately, when the bidding was completed, only Canadian corporations and organizations were allowed to create their respective curriculum. A wide range of groups won the bidding, but it is interesting to note that the contracts in the fields of science, math, and technology were all won by corporations. Bay Consulting, a management consulting group of senior members from Coopers & Lybrand Consulting Group, won the science bid. (OSSTF, 1999) The Fields Institute, a
non-profit corporation, won the contract for mathematics curriculum. (OSSTF, 1999) Finally, the technology bid was won by K & V Stief and Associates, a private sector business organization. (OSSTF, 1999)

It is clear from this assessment that there has been, and continues to be, an increase of corporate involvement in the public education system in Ontario. Citing a lack of funding as the major problem, the reports suggest that public and separate schools are turning to business for both financial assistance and supplemental curriculum services. As funding cuts increase, the corporate sector will likely play a larger role in public school classrooms on several fronts. With this in mind, we need to be far more critical and far more aware of the structure and role of public education in our society—not only on a pragmatic level, but on an ideological level as well.

Changes to the Public Education System in Canada

Ontario is not alone in the changes that are taking place in public education. Centralization of power and decentralization of responsibility in the public school system is occurring all over Canada. Parents and community groups have been given a greater mandated role to play in the running of schools without any funding to do so, and often with very little experience. Additionally, governments are changing the taxation system through which education is funded. There is a shift toward a model where students receive the same amount of per capita
funding regardless of individual or specialized needs. Corporations are beginning to recognize the voids created by funding cuts and are trying to take advantage of the situation. These are the same conditions which have enabled the Education Industry in the United States to promote and profit from the dismantling and privatizing of the public education system. In addition to corporate sponsored curriculum, new private initiatives such as school-business partnerships, charter schools, P3 schools or lease-back schools, potential voucher systems and traditional schools are beginning to appear in the rest Canada.

In *Class Warfare* (1994), Maude Barlow and Heather-jane Robertson examine the increasing role business is playing in the public school system in Canada. They suggest that the goal of businesses’ re-tooling of public schools is to harmonize public (social) policy with that of the free market, global economy. Business is attempting to rework the ideology through changing all of the principles of education to those of business. “Under the guise of ‘reforming’ or even ‘supporting’ schools, there is a great deal of activity in education advancing the interests of the competitive-corporate ideology of the right-wing.” (Barlow & Robertson, 1994, p. vii) Although they suggest that blatant forms of manipulation, such as sponsored curriculum, may stand out as a demonstration of the reshaping process, the real problem is right-wing ideology on the whole.

Barlow and Robertson (1994) warn us of a serious problem surrounding the education-as-business philosophy. The contemporary belief that injecting schools with business dollars and business ideals in order to better prepare
students for their future is a weak one at best. This type of ideology serves to create people who are willing to live and work in an environment that is great for business, but also personally oppressive. Children are taught to fit into the existing world, not to fix its limitations and problems.

The process of the marketplace is to sort the winners from the losers as efficiently as possible. Can we focus on ‘excellence’ stimulated by competition, and avoid the educational equivalents of ‘just in time’ manufacturing, capital-risk management, sunset clauses and acceptable levels of toxic waste? For when business enters education, it sells something more than brand names. It sells a way of looking at oneself and society. (Barlow & Robertson, 1994, p. 144)

A very important characteristic of Barlow and Robertson’s (1994) work is that it acknowledges the context of the public school system as a part of the consciousness industry (although they do not use that term). The school system is just as much a part of consciousness creation as the home, the television, and the local store. The school is a key constituent of the free market system. Barlow and Robertson (1994) assert that schools once acted as an information filter, one that was extremely sensitive to the fundamental needs of children. (p. 149) When big business (Ewen’s (1976) captains of consciousness) took over, the school system underwent a major reformation. As was asserted by Ewen (1976), education was redesigned in order to prepare children to become future workers
and consumers. Activities such as thinking and critical evaluation skills, dialectical group discussion, and even pure artistic license were not eliminated from our classrooms during the formative years of the mass-production and mass-consumption era, so much as they were merely overlooked.

Barlow and Robertson (1994) use the example of a school-business partnership involving IBM's and Burnaby South High School in British Columbia in order to demonstrate some of their points. IBM (and a host of other companies) provided the school with 500 networked computers and 185 networked video monitors linked to a media center all connected via fibre optics cables. (Barlow & Robertson, 1994, p. 149) Barlow and Robertson (1994) argue that IBM's focus became information gathering instead of knowledge building because the program stressed values of individualistic fact-finding skills though use of the network. The major problem that existed in the model was that there was no room for group discussion, nor critical evaluation of the information obtained. (p. 150) What is even more dangerous is that IBM promoted the idea that information gathering was the same thing as building knowledge. In the process, IBM had redefined the definition of knowledge to suit corporate needs. Barlow and Robertson (1994) suggest that in the case of IBM, their goal was purely to increase profit for a giant multinational corporation.

For IBM to exploit educational opportunities requires stimulating an exaggerated demand for IBM's goods and services but it also requires a strategic reformulation of the purposes and practices of education in ways
that will increase demand for IBM’s products. (Barlow & Robertson, 1994, p. 151)

Barlow and Robertson (1994) provide several other examples of corporations involved with sponsored curriculum such as McDonald’s Restaurants’ Christmas song contest (the reward is that the student is featured in a McDonald’s commercial), the Pizza Hut Book It! program, Proctor & Gamble, Imperial Oil, Kellogg’s, NutraSweet, and countless others. (p. 160) In reality, is there a difference between Pizza Hut’s Book It! program and IBM’s fibre optics network? According to Barlow and Robertson (1994), “business is not prepared to stop providing classroom materials and cultivating brand loyalty. Some want to shape the basic assumptions that drive the curriculum, [as well as]...the curriculum itself.” (p. 161) According to the marketers, business has its sights set on students for two reasons. The first reason is to make students brand loyal consumers of specific products. The second, more fundamental reason, is to promote the free market system to the point where it is whole-heartedly and instinctively endorsed by future consumers. The ultimate goal is to make students see the free market system as not only the best system in the world, but also make it appear to be the law of nature.

School-business partnerships are one of many ways win which corporations are becoming increasingly involved with public education. Charter schools are a relatively new creation that involve some extremely controversial
components. Basically, a charter school is a publicly funded, privately operated school that has an education specialty such as art, music, or technology. (Dobbin, 1997) According to Dobbin (1997), the motivation behind the creation of charter schools includes the desire to save money, increase in parental involvement, and the trimming of bureaucracy while maintaining an open-door policy. As has been demonstrated by studies of the United Kingdom, New Zealand and the United States, many charter schools have not been able to show any significant saving of public funds, thinning of bureaucracy, or increase in parental involvement. (Dobbin, 1997) In the United Kingdom, approximately 1,000 schools have been provided with grants to create schools similar to the charter school model. These results do not uphold the arguments made in favour of charter schools.

Principles have accumulated more power at the expense of staff and parental involvement in planning and decision making, and then spend increasing time on budgetary and entrepreneurial activities and dealing with the new bureaucracies that have sprung up to administer the grant-maintained schools. (Dobbin, 1997, p. 1)

Dobbin (1997) also contends that many charter schools "pick their students," (p. 1) and do not maintain their egalitarian entry principles. There are other problems that have arisen out of the implementation of charter schools. These include an extreme lack of space to the point where students cannot
attend local schools because they are full of out-of-area students. (Dobbin, 1997) Charter school funding is also based on localized economic class standing. This results in the under-funding of schools located in poor neighbourhoods and over-funding of schools located in rich neighbourhoods. (Dobbin, 1997) Charter schools also try to cut costs through the use of “uncertified teachers” (Dobbin, 1997), and non-union service staff. Finally, the promotion of charter schools (both financial and ideological) has been conducted in Canada through right-wing, anti-union groups such as the Donner Foundation, Teachers for Excellence and the National Citizens’ Coalition. (Dobbin, 1997) In Canada, Alberta was the first province to adopt charter schools. To date, there have been no in-depth studies pertaining to these schools.

A similar type of school to the charter school model is the traditional school, currently establish in British Columbia. The major difference between traditional schools and charter schools is that there is a strong emphasis on religion. (McLaren, 1998) According to a recent study, traditional schools emphasize teacher-centred learning, moral character, regimented codes of conduct. (CCPA, 1998) While traditional schools first appeared during the 1970s, the emphasis on religion has changed a great deal over time. The study notes that the programs are virtually identical, but the rhetoric has changed from Christian fundamentalism to traditionalism in order to include a much broader variety of students. (CCPA, 1998)

Another type of school, found in the Maritime provinces, is the P3 or lease-back school. These schools are constructed on privately owned land (in
some cases the schools are also constructed by private firms) which is then leased (long-term with a buy out option at the end) to a public school board or other governing body. (Shaker, 1999) Upon completion of the lease, all school maintenance and management duties are turned over to the individual school. (Shaker, 1999) The incentive behind such a move appears to be a better interest rate as a result of cheaper operating costs. A 1998 press release by the Auditor General of Nova Scotia, Roy Salmon, revealed quite the opposite. The rate of interest in the lease of O’Connell Drive Elementary School was no better than what the province could have received if it borrowed money directly. (Shaker, 1999) The school was also left to cover upgrades and operating costs, while the leasing company recovered “88% of its investment in the property at the end of the lease.” (Shaker, 1999) Furthermore, because leasing company has exclusive rights to the school buildings after hours, they are able to rent the schools for after hours events. (Shaker, 1999) Under the public school system, after-hours events often require special permits, but these are provided at no additional cost. In an effort to reduce operating costs, lease-back schools may be forced to reduce staff, increase contracting-out of positions and services, and cut non-profit making areas of the school. (Shaker, 1999)

The voucher system, under consideration in a number of provinces, is another example of a shift in public school funding philosophy. The voucher system is method that provides families with a coupon based on per-student annual expenditures. (Robertson, 1998) The coupon can be redeemed for one year of education at any school, public or private, of the recipient’s choice.22
Robertson (1998) notes that vouchers were used by many communities as a tool of racism in Virginia during the 1950s. In the 1980s, Ronald Reagan made several attempts to move toward a voucher system, but each time his appeals were rejected on the basis that vouchers had the potential to be racist, to serve the elite, and to serve the religious community. (Robertson, 1998) Eventually, this rejection led to the birth of the charter school model. Rather than use individual vouchers for students, Robertson (1998) argues that charter schools obtain one large voucher, plus they have the ability to seek additional revenue through private partnerships.

The elementary and secondary levels of public education are not the only areas that are being restructured in Canada. Post-secondary institutions are also in the process of receiving enormous funding cutbacks and increases in corporate involvement in many areas. There has been a sharp increase in corporate-university partnerships in the university service sector during the last several years. Many companies have sought and won deals with universities that ensure that their products will have campus exclusivity. Two advertising firms, Zoom Media and New Media, have exclusive rights with many universities to place product and movie advertisements in university washrooms.

Corporations have also created exclusive deals with university departments and professors in order to secure their research skills. An example of the ill effects of combining corporations with university research in Canada occurred between the University of Toronto and The Hospital for Sick Children in Toronto. Professor of pediatrics, Nancy Olivieri, was demoted from her position
as director of Sick Children’s hemoglobinopathy program as a result of a conflict between her research and Apotex pharmaceutical company. (Rolston, 1999) According to Rolston (1999), a contract between Olivieri and Apotex, manufacturer of the drug deferiprone, prevented Olivieri from releasing any research results without permission from Apotex. In her research, Olivieri found that treatment with the drug caused adverse reactions in some patients. In the ensuing legal battle, the hospital refused to pay for Olivieri’s legal fees, citing the fact that they were not involved in the contract agreement. (Rolston, 1999) Eventually a settlement was reached, and the hospital agreed to pay all of Olivieri’s legal bills. Although Olivieri’s program was discontinued, she was reinstated “as head of the clinical and research programs on hemoglobinopathy.” (Rolston, 1999) The hospital also “agreed not to restrict or appear to restrict the exercise of academic freedom by any U of T faculty member.” (Rolston, 1999) While this matter was resolved, it demonstrates the problems associated with exercising academic freedom when restricted by corporate contract requirements.

**Summary of Public Education versus the Desires of the Marketers**

What can be seen from our brief examination of public education and the role played by private interests in public education? The goals of the public system and the goals of private enterprise differ to a great extent on both a
philosophical and pragmatic level. In the case of the public system, while the desired goals may vary from board to board, none of them have desire for financial or material profit as an outcome. Another important difference is the supposed neutrality of teachers. While corporations and teachers both have a financial interest in teaching, teachers do not necessarily profit directly from the material that they teach. In other words, corporations hope to see direct financial returns from their advertising in terms of product purchase, use of services, or even the expansion of the knowledge about a given commodity. Teachers earn their paycheck through teaching, not from financial returns from the ideas they have taught.

The public school system is supposed to create students. The private system seeks to create workers and consumers. We must also ask if it is possible for corporate sponsored curriculum to meet both the objectives of the public school system and the objectives of business. In many cases the answer might be “yes.” What is of more importance is what happens when the interests of public schools and the interests of business conflict with one another. Which side would take precedence over the other?
CONCLUSIONS

This thesis examined corporate sponsored curriculum as a form of communication (advertising) and placed it within the context of the current system of public education in Canada. While these two fields may not seem that far apart, they are informed by extremely different theoretical backgrounds. Communication, however, is at the root of all disciplines, institutions, and structures. Education is predicated on communication. Schools are a place of knowledge exchange. Knowledge is based on information. Information is transmitted and interpreted through communication. The way in which the majority of knowledge is gained by students in the public school system is through teaching of course curricula. School curriculum can consist of many things, but it is primarily comprised of textbooks and teacher lessons. As was demonstrated through the analysis, corporate sponsored curriculum changes the foci of the messages. In some cases, corporate sponsored curriculum replaces the traditional messages and meanings found in non-corporate curriculum with its own market based messages.

We can see from the analysis of the materials, all of the perspectives of advertising employed in this thesis would view corporate sponsored curriculum as a form of advertising. Obviously the degree to which each research tradition would make such a claim differs depending upon the foundation of their beliefs. Regardless of the differences between each school of thought, there is strong
indication that corporate sponsored curriculum is designed to educate about brands rather than traditional, corporate free ideas. It must be stressed that the curriculum does teach about things other than consumption. The *my money Investment Kit* examines some basic principles of the free-market financial system. The *Tampax* health kit teaches about hygiene, puberty, and social issues. On the surface, these two subject areas could be regarded as being free of corporate bias. Given that the advertising is couched in a topic that is analogous to the featured commodity, corporate sponsored curriculum can be compared to an infomercial. As was demonstrated by the analyses, the connections with brands and services are certainly the most important part of the curriculum.

A closer look at the Bank of Montreal's *my money Investment Kit* revealed several things. Within the framework that views advertising as a form of information, we can see several things. The factual information presented in the kit that deals with the banking industry and its services is clearly a piece of advertising. The kit promoted the banking industry as a means to satisfy the assumed need for money. The information became connected with the Bank of Montreal through trade name associations with Bank of Montreal services. This kit also conformed to the perspective that sees advertising as a form of persuasion. Various arguments were used in an attempt to persuade students that banks were the best place to keep their money. These arguments included the guaranteed safety of one's money and the fact that a bank gives one more
money in the form of interest. Finally, these ideals are coupled with real world Bank of Montreal services in order to promote brand familiarity and brand loyalty.

The third group of theories, advertising as a form of symbolism, found many different images surrounding the my money Investment Club kit. The underlying message of the kit is that money makes people happy. The imagery surrounding banking suggested that the use of banking services will increase one’s wealth, leading to personal happiness. Finally, the critical perspective questioned the ideological framework of the kit. The kit failed to address the necessity of wealth, nor did it question the foundations of consumerism. Instead, it potentially creates problems of inadequate wealth and unhappiness in the students who use the kit and argues that banking services can fix these problems. The Bank of Montreal was careful to use brand names and brand slogans as a means of linking the information taught in the kit to the real world services of the Bank of Montreal.

The second analysis, of the Tampax Health Education Program on Puberty and Menstrual Health, demonstrated many of the same principles as those found in the my money Investment Club case. The advertising as a form of information perspective found evidence of product information surrounding Tampax brand tampons. The utility value of many different aspects of Tampax tampons were documented in order to provide the readers with consumer product information. The advertising as a form of persuasion perspective found a series of structured arguments in favour of the use of tampons as method of feminine protection. Tampax effectively argued that tampons were more
technologically advanced than other feminine protection methods, provided greater security, provided greater personal privacy. Tampax also argued that the use of tampons was a sign of maturity. Finally, the arguments in favour of tampons were used to degrade the ability of pads to fulfill protection claims.

The images and notions surrounding tampons were addressed in the analysis under the perspective that advertising is a form of symbolism. The notions that are connected with Tampax tampon use include the need for cleanliness, need for privacy, need to be environmentally conscious, association with maturity, and the need for personal freedom. On a critical level, these ideas and images are not automatically associated with Tampax tampons. The kit creates problems within the reader through suggesting that any method of feminine protection other than Tampax tampons will not be able to provide the necessary ideals. The kit contains so much unbalanced information that it seriously misinforms its users. For example, false notions of environmentalism are used to make girls feel guilty if they do not use Tampax Flushable Applicator tampons. Like the my money kit, the end desire of the corporations is to create consumers for their products and services, without concern for the educational value of the materials.
Advertising and the Public School System

If we are to assume the models proposed by Mill (1867, 1965), Dewey (1900, 1902) and Gramsci (1971) are the ideals for public education, then the direction in which Canadian public education is headed today is not going be able to achieve these ideals. Under Mill (1867, 1965), education is a tool by which people learn to become future citizens. Citizenship for Mill (1867, 1965) entails much more responsibility than merely belonging to a given community. It is the duty of the citizen to scrutinize customs, norms, beliefs, and practices, determine the problems, and fix them for the betterment of the society as a whole. For Dewey (1900, 1902), student centred learning is the key. Dewey (1900, 1902) also recognized that schools are part of a larger community. His encouragement of forging ties with the business community is not the same as it is today. According to Dewey (1900, 1902), business must be involved at a distant level and should be used only to balance the education of student. For Gramsci (1971), public schools should be used as a means of teaching critical thinking skills. Public schools should also provide a solid foundation in many different areas of knowledge. This would provide students with a choice of extended education or vocational training upon completion of the first few education levels.

The type of public education that is present in Canada today is a combination of these perspectives, although as Bernays (1928) and Ewen (1976) note, it is framed within the capitalist paradigm. If the school is used to train and

294
prepare people for the world they live in, then this can already be achieved through the current system. Traditionally, however, schools have been under the supervision of governments and citizens. The increasing presence of private interests, specifically corporations, poses a danger to the existence of democratic thought. Instead of opening up debate, we run the risk of narrowing thought to fact finding and repetition of a limited scope of information. Even Sandage (1961), a non-critical theorist, noted that an important part of education is that it is supposed to be an open forum for the presentation and debate of ideas. The significance of both proponents and critics of advertising finding that corporate sponsored curriculum is another form of advertising is illustrated through Sandage's (1961) comments on advertising.

Compare [advertising] with the process of education in our schools where we insist on presenting students with conflicting ideologies, hypotheses, theories, and descriptive matter with the knowledge that will help to develop discrimination, enhance judgment, and sharpen intellect. (Sandage, 1961, p. 152)

Not only do the proponents agree that advertising is not the same as curriculum, in effect, they argue that schools should present children with a diverse range of ideas. Changing the curriculum to include messages that accommodate the demands of marketers will not allow the presentation of a diverse collection of perspectives. Corporate sponsored curriculum packages certainly do not foster
debate on their own merit. The curriculum packages do not contain questions related to their own worthiness or validity. The packages are a narrow-cast text designed to promote a given commodity—otherwise known as an advertisement.

The restructuring of public education has changed the way in which funding for public schools is provided. As school budgets and teaching supplies decrease, corporate sponsored curriculum becomes more attractive to teachers. This is due to the fact that most corporate sponsored curriculum is provided free of charge, often without even being requested by the teacher. Corporate sponsored curriculum is frequently used in addition to traditional teaching materials. These materials take class time away from the rest of the curriculum. Furthermore, in order to properly balance the messages presented in the corporate curriculum packages, a teacher must set aside additional class time for debate. Education restructuring has also dramatically changed teaching time so that there is less time to prepare for one's classes. It is difficult to see how any critical debate could take place in such a regimented school system. This model is a tragic example of the corporate desire to take money from children and manipulate their thoughts in the name of short term profits.

We must ask ourselves if we really need to teach kids about advanced financial concepts when they should be learning basics of math, reading, and citizenship? Is it really necessary that eight year olds know about the three basic classes of assets, the practice of dollar cost averaging, or the benefits of a balanced investment portfolio? The discussion of mutual funds does not even apply to children. Instead, it is designed to send kids home with specific
knowledge in order to educate their parents about this type of financial investment.\textsuperscript{23} Is it also necessary to make young girls feel ashamed of themselves during the menstrual phase of their cycle in order to sell tampons? Is rewarding a child with pizza really the best way to ensure that they are improving their reading skills? Why do M&M's have to be an integral part of teaching children about counting and graphing data? Again, these exercises shift the role of education from building critical citizens, to creating consumers.

Applying the theories of Smythe (1981) to the case of advertising in the public classroom demonstrates several of his ideas. Students are performing unpaid labour as a source of work for the advertisers. Indeed, so are the teachers who must learn and teach the curriculum to the students. In this instance, teachers and the school system carry \textit{star power} because they have government and public authority ascribed to them. The teacher and school further legitimize the advertising content because of their authoritative relationship with the students.

The school, in part, becomes a marketing medium. It produces an audience of Apple's (1992) captive students and delivers them to marketers. The free lunch model that is crucial to Smythe's (1981) perspective is evident in the corporate curriculum used public classroom. As was noted in the introduction, there is a shift in the composition of the free lunch. The actual work performed by the students consists of the class activities that must be completed in conjunction with the corporate sponsored curriculum. The free lunch becomes the advertising itself, as well as its respective commodity. Corporate sponsored curriculum seeks
to produce as limited type of consciousness in its users. This consciousness is comprised of knowledge about consumerism and free market ideology. Of course this model of consciousness is by no means closed. There is always the possibility that corporate sponsored curriculum will be used incorrectly, or as a tool by which critical evaluation takes place. The likelihood of such criticisms occurring is not very great due to the restructuring of the focus of education. Another filter that could prevent critical discussion is the fact that any criticism of a corporation could result in the removal of its curriculum, and in extreme cases, corporate funding for the school.

**Future Considerations and Implications**

The system of public education, governments, and people of Canada are at a really important crossroad. What is happening with education is nothing new. Education in other countries and other times, such as Italy (at the turn of the century), has previously experimented with a privatized, vocational training model. People recognized the degree to which it limited their society, only after the model had been fully implemented. The result was a pendulum swing back toward a model of education that was designed to serve the interest of the public.

As was stated earlier, we have a choice. We can choose to allow private interests to become increasingly involved in the education of our children to the point where the public system becomes directly dependent upon corporate
funding. We can also choose to reverse the decisions we have already made and remove all traces of direct corporate involvement from the public school system. If our desire is to pursue a system that will create workers and consumers who are fully brand and commodity conscious, then the road we should take includes corporate involvement with education. If our desire is to produce critical, thinking people, then we must remove all corporate involvement from our public school system.

Does the answer to this question have to be so absolute, can it not be a shade of grey? No, the answer cannot reside somewhere in the middle. Let me illustrate with a few simple points. Corporations are accountable to their shareholders and some laws, but they are not accountable to the public. If a corporation goes bankrupt or decides to pull its funding from a school, what happens to the school? The school would more than likely have to close due to public funding cut backs. Increasingly under the restructured model, it is assumed that corporations will compensate for budget shortfalls. A new funding model cannot be produced overnight from public budget money that does not exist. Corporations also must make money in order to survive. There are a limited number of ways that a corporation can make money off of a school. The most prominent of these includes cutting the cost of services through contracting out, renting the school during off-hours, selling products to students, and charging tuition fees. If the school is to stay public, it cannot charge tuition fees. If a corporation is not making enough money through after hour school rentals, the possibility exists that the corporation will cut the number of hours in a school day.
in order to increase rental opportunities. If the corporation decides to cut back on services, lunch programs could be provided by fast food companies, janitorial services could be cut back to a minimum, and teachers could possibly lose their positions in favour of uncertified instructors.

The suggestion has been made that the way to ensure that schools maintain high standards under the corporate model would be to create and enforce guidelines. There is an extreme danger associated with this practice. Once we allow guidelines to govern corporate involvement in our schools, we essentially condone the intrusion of corporations into public education. Guidelines may work as long as they are enforced, but there is always the possibility that they will be altered through lobbying. The use of guidelines places the system of education on a slippery slope toward complete corporate ownership.

The creation of citizens who are aware of the limitations of society, its system of governance, and its economic framework allows a society to grow. The goals of our society must be re-defined in order for us to escape the free market cycle. It is at this point that the ideas of Csikszentmihalyi and Rochberg-Halton (1981) are connected to this argument. They assert that one’s sense of self can be developed much more thoroughly and accurately through interaction with others; this can be described as a community based reading of the self. North American capitalism focuses on the development of the private self or the individual through consumption. A commodity will fix any problem one has, but most of the problems that are to be fixed all are based on a lack of self-esteem. If
one's self esteem is in question, a supportive community will do far more intrinsic good than private consumption.

Under the model of a public sense of self, Csikszentmihalyi and Rochberg-Halton (1981) assert that the commodification of one's being would not exist. Personal problems would be addressed at the level of feeling and interpretation as opposed to the level of advertising (which suggests that one has a problem when they really may not have one). The goal then, is not to fragment society further, but develop a social responsibility to and for one another. Societal growth, in this sense, is not one of fiscal growth or population explosion, but is a growth toward a much more humanitarian, equitable, compassionate and just society. Humanitarianism and democracy are not, in themselves, achievements. Instead, these ideals are processes that must be continuously scrutinized and improved upon in order to benefit the greatest number of people. The implementation of a critical model of education would lead to the improvement of many areas of society, not just those that exist based on the accumulation of wealth.
APPENDIX
SELECTED CORPORATE SPONSORED CURRICULUM PACKAGES

This list is by no means complete. It is merely a selection of some of the corporate sponsored curriculum packages that are available for use in Canadian schools. Not all of these kits are exclusive to Canada as some are designed for an international audience. The global implications have been developed further in my research.

Title: Active-8
Producer: Royal Bank of Canada
Description: This program is produced in conjunction with OPHEA (Ontario Physical Heath Education Association) to encourage fitness among children, and receives a good deal of public support and media attention.

Title: BASF Technology Challenge
Producer: Children’s Creative Marketing and BASF Canada Inc. (http://www.childrenscreativemkt.com/clients.html)
Description: This package, which includes teacher curriculum guides, a student contest and a fundraising program focused on endearing audiotapes, videotapes and computer diskettes to students by teaching “cool” facts about audio-visual technology. According to the programs creator, this package was designed “to help augment the funding decreases to the education sector, to provide audio-visual technology information that was not readily available to Educators, and to raise awareness of the quality BASF products.”

Title: "Beat the Clock" - Lessons in Time Management for Middle School Students
Description: Day Runner teaches students (grades 5-8) about time management “through games, exercises and role play,” to encourage prioritization and project planning. Students also learn “how to use time management tools such as to do lists and calendars.”
Title: Book It!
Producer: Pizza Hut
Description: Rewards students with free Pizza Hut pizza for achieving reading goals.

Title: Calculator Connections
Producer: Hewlett-Packard Company Canada
Description: Used by children in grades 4 through 6, contains a new math curriculum package including advanced HP graphing calculators with overhead display units, training and materials for teachers are also provided. Desired outcome was to encourage girls to explore fields of maths and sciences.

Title: Cat Care
Producer: Ralston Purina Canada Inc.
Description: Teaches responsible pet ownership and care. Kit includes sample boxes (empty) of Ralston Purina products as well as Ralston Purina advertisements. The major project for grades 5 to 8 is develop an ad campaign for Ralston Purina with the best campaign to be featured in Pop! Magazine.

Title: Changing
Producer: Proctor and Gamble
Description: Kit contains teacher's guide, student handbook, booklets for parents, sample P&G products and a video. Designed to inform students about puberty.

Title: Cookie Math
Producer: Christie Brown and Company
Description: Uses OREO cookies to help students learn about math. One activity instructs students to use the "non-standard measure" of a cookie to estimate their height.

Title: Count Your Chips
Producer: US National Potato Board and Snack Food Association
Description: Teaches math through counting potato chips.
Title: Creating Confidence
Producer: Business Depot and Staples Business Depot
Description: Uses drama and visual art activities to inspire confidence and self-esteem in children through learning about time management. Commercial components include a Business Depot write-on board, calendar, fund raising plan, and rebate offers.

Title: "Decisions, Decisions"
Producer: Dow Chemical Company
Description: This 20 minute video was produced in conjunction Elk Island Public schools, the Curriculum Resources bank, Sherwood Park Catholic schools, Fort Saskatchewan Catholic schools, and Dow. It was designed to "support the Environmental Quality curriculum for ninth grade science" in Alberta, by demonstrating "the many alternatives students can research during the formal decision-making process."

Title: Decision: Earth
Producer: Procter and Gamble
Description: Students learn how consumer demand controls environmental concerns—for example, clear cutting is environmentally friendly and ecologically sound.

Title: Looking Good...Feeling Great Lifestyle Dairy
Producer: Gillette Canada
Description: Health curriculum for teenagers that teaches students how to avoid a bad hair day, how to floss teeth, and what deodorant is right to use.

Title: Great Chocolate Experience
Producer: Glenda Bequette
Description: Students learn mathematical techniques by counting M&Ms and Hershey's Kisses.

Title: Jr. Jays Magazine and Kids Club
Producer: Jr. Jays
Description: Comic book style magazine designed to promote community safety and other issues. Within the pages are numerous ads and contests for various products. Jr. Jays also distributes candy and gum to students in conjunction with their magazine. Sponsors include Health Canada, the Bank of Montreal, Hubba Bubba, Kellogg's, Nestle, and the Toronto Blue Jays Major League baseball club.
Title: Kernels of Knowledge
Producer: Hunt-Wesson Corporation
Description: Children learn about inventors who “made a difference,” including Gregor Mendel, Louis Pasteur and Orville Redenbacher.

Title: kidsworld Magazine
Producer: kidsworld Marketing and Publishing Company
Description: Similar to Jr. Jays, but much more glossy and directed at an elementary to middle school audience. Lots of product placement for music, movies, and food.

Title: Literacy Connections
Producer: Sears Canada
Description: Workshop program that teaches parent how to help their children with reading skills. The kit contains a video and resource materials, and promotes Sears’ Born to Read booklet by Ben Wicks.

Title: Lookin’ Good
Producer: Armor All and Modern Educational Services
Description: Argues that auto safety is enhanced by properly waxing one’s vehicle with Armor All products. The kit includes product samples of Armor All for class distribution.

Title: Math in My World/The 5 A Day Challenge
Producer: McGraw-Hill School Division and Dole Foods
Description: This McGraw Hill math program, called “Math in My World” links to the 5 A Day Challenge site where children use the commercial site “to read about healthful foods, to write addition sentences and to solve problems including those involving addition.”

Title: Math in My World and Better Buys
Description: This lesson is designed to familiarize students with a rail pass, and teach them “to find unit prices for various travel options, to compare values and find best buys, to make travel choices and determine the best buy”

305
Title: Math in My World and Everyone Counts
Producer: McGraw Hill School Division and Ty Web Site
(http://www.mhschool.com/teach/math/mathinmyworld/teachres/weblesson/weblesson.php3?program=1&grade=1&chapter=6&lesson=1
and http://www.ty.com/)
Description: This program is designed to teach numbers and basic graphic principles to children in grade one by having them count Beanie Babies from the official Ty Web Site. Students are asked to speculate why these animals are called “Country Cousins.”

Title: Money and Banking
Producer: Royal Bank
Description: Provides basic information about banking services such as writing cheques, using a bank card and registering an account. As images of banking materials contain Royal Bank logos and trade names. Originally, this kit was supposed to be aimed at girls as a form of personal empowerment through fiscal means. This package is also designed to meet the new requirements of the Ontario Ministry of Education and Training.

Title: My Money Investment Club kit
Producer: Bank of Montreal, in conjunction with Jr. Jays
Description: Kit teaches basic principles of finance and the banking industry to students, connects themes with Bank of Montreal logos and brand names.

Title: Personal Finance Portfolio
Producer: Canadian Bankers Association
Description: Classroom activities designed to help students develop personal finance planning skills. Was created to support an episode of CBC’s Street Cents television program.

Title: Pop! (Protecting Our Planet)
Producer: Scholastic
Description: An activity and experiment based, factoid, ad-filled magazine aimed at elementary students. In one issue, there was a marketing survey asking question about product recall in the magazine.
Title: Scientists and the Alaska Oil Spill
Producer: Exxon Corporation
Description: A classroom video produced after the Exxon Valdez oil disaster; suggests that the environmental impact was negligible.

Title: ScreenAd
Producer: ScreenAd
Description: Not really curriculum. Screen saver program is placed on all of the computers in a school. The program displays rotating ads and factoids when the computer is not in use.

Title: Tale of the Great Bunny
Producer: Cadbury Chocolate Co.
Description: This package includes a teacher's kit, games, poem, web site, suggested activities, poster (resembling the in-store Cadbury display) and corresponds to a YTV special, “The Tale of the Great Bunny,” all designed to teach children in elementary school about the importance of Cadbury and Cadbury's products to Easter.

Title: Tampax Health Education Program on Puberty and Menstrual Health
Producer: Tambrands Inc.
Description: Teaches students about puberty, with a specific focus on girls and menstruation. Contains a video, lessons, a student handbook, and product samples.

Title: Traces of Today
Producer: Dow Chemical and Modern Educational Services
Description: Premise of the video suggest that it is an environmentally friend practice to burn combustible materials as a means of recycling.

Title: Trans Canada Trail – “I'm a proud trail blazer.”
Producer: Tetra Pak Canada
Description: Students create trail leaf logos designed to be used in a trail poster which can be sold to raise money for the school and for the Trans Canada Trail. Trans Canada Trail activities, such as walking the trail, as suggested as possible classroom activities. Other activities include making word searches or crosswords based on the trail.
Title: Using Energy Wisely  
Producer: Ontario Hydro  
Description: Teaches students in grades 4 to 6 concepts of energy management. Desired outcome was to maintain current demand for electricity and to increase customer satisfaction.

Title: When Everything Old is New Again  
Producer: Binney and Smith  
Description: Students learn different painting techniques and product familiarity as they "invent" a dinosaur of the future using the required Crayola products.

Title: Youth News Network (YNN)  
Producer: Athena Educational Partners  
Description: Not fully instituted—still in pilot stages. Closed circuit, satellite broadcast of current events news and advertisements to enrolled schools. Compensation includes equipment and a computer lab, but these materials remain the property of YNN, not the school.
REFERENCES


312


http://www.library.utoronto.ca/bulletin/feb8_99/art2.htm


ENDNOTES

1 This has recently changed. Glencoe, a division of McGraw-Hill, has created a 6th-grade math textbook containing questions that employ commodity brand names including Nike, M&M's and Oreo Cookies.

2 Italics are part of the original quotation.

3 Italics are part of the original quotation.

4 Italics are part of the original quotation.

5 Italics are part of the original quotation.

6 The only choice one really has is to consume. The alternative is to ignore the entire system on which our society is predicated. One must break off ties from the system, move to a place where they are free (which is difficult to do in a country that monitors where most of its inhabitants live via a number of systems—e.g.: census, taxes, health care, etc.) to ignore the system of commodities and consumption. Truly though, how does one even obtain the seeds for vegetables which have been unaltered by science? How does one obtain animals for husbandry without purchase from someone within the system? In practice one could not utilize any tools created by the consciousness industry—monetary systems could not exist as we know them now, thus eradicating wage labour.

7 Italics are part of the original quotation.

8 Data current as of December 6, 1999.

9 This information was provided by Proctor and Gamble Incorporated, which purchased Tambrands in 1997. Questions regarding the Tampax teaching kit can be directed to kopel.ci@pg.com.

10 This information can be found on the instruction leaflet in boxes of o.b. brand tampons by Johnson and Johnson.


12 Information about O.B. brand tampons can be found on the world wide web at http://www.obtampons.com.

13 KY jelly is a product of Johnson and Johnson.

14 Please see http://www.pg.com on the world wide web for more information on Proctor and Gamble.

15 Even if it is not true, it is true for the information presented here. The object is to build an argument in favour of one method over all others. Omitting information leads to the belief that pads cannot do the same things as tampons.

16 The actual quote here is, "It is also hygienic, since the fingers do touch the tampon or the vagina," but it is clear that Tampax meant to write "do not" based on the rest of their claims.

17 The topic is not really addressed until one reads the student handbook.

18 There are several different types of non-disposable feminine protection products available, including the other methods use by women for thousands of years!

19 This figure is based on the following equation (using the kit's average of a period length 4-5 days (median of 4.5) and a tampon change every 4 to 8 hours (median of 6 hours) is 4 tampons per day plus 2 for the half day: 18 tampons per period times 12 months times 35 years = 7,560.

20 Once again, the intent was to claim that fingers "do not" touch, but a printing error makes the sentence read "do" touch. Argumentatively speaking, the sentence does not make sense unless it says "do not."

21 This has now been contemporized as "de jure or de facto" meaning "whether by right or not."

22 At private institutions, students would have to pay additional tuition fees.

23 In Canada, one must be 18 in order to register for a mutual fund program.
**VITA AUCTORIS**

**NAME:** Jeremy Stewart Gillies

**PLACE OF BIRTH:** Scarborough, Ontario, Canada

**YEAR OF BIRTH:** 1973

**EDUCATION:**
- R. H. King Academy
  Scarborough, Ontario, Canada
  1987-1992

- University of Windsor
  Windsor, Ontario, Canada
  B.A. (Honours) in Communication Studies
  1992-1996

- University of Windsor
  Windsor, Ontario, Canada
  M.A. in Communication Studies
  1996-1999